

# Decision of the FIBAA Accreditation Committee for Programmes



**100<sup>th</sup> Meeting on 29/30 September 2016**

**Project Number:** 15/041  
**Higher Education Institution:** KAZGUU University Astana  
**Study Programme:** Doctor of Philosophy in Law (PhD)

The FIBAA Accreditation Committee for Programmes has taken the following decisions:

According to § 7 (2) in conjunction with § 10 (1) of the “Special Conditions for awarding the FIBAA Quality Seal for Programmes”, the study programme Doctor of Philosophy in Law (PhD) is accredited.

Period of Accreditation: September 30<sup>th</sup>, 2016 until September 30<sup>th</sup>, 2021



**FOUNDATION FOR INTERNATIONAL  
BUSINESS ADMINISTRATION ACCREDITATION**

FIBAA – BERLINER FREIHEIT 20-24 – D-53111 BONN

---

## Assessment Report

---

---

**Higher Education Institution (HEI):**

KAZGUU University  
Astana (Kazakhstan)

---

**Doctoral programme:**

Doctor of Philosophy in Law (PhD)

---

**Brief description of the doctoral programme:**

The programme focuses on training students at an advanced level in specific fields of study in order for them to assume positions of leadership in research, teaching, and service in industry, business, and government. Another main objective of this programme is to make influence on the development of national legislation.

---

**Date of opening of the procedure:**

September 30<sup>th</sup> , 2016

---

**Date of filing the self-documentation:**

December 21<sup>st</sup>, 2015

---

**Date of On Site Assessment:**

March 15<sup>th</sup>/16<sup>th</sup>/17<sup>th</sup>, 2016

---

**Type of accreditation:**

Accreditation

---

**Accredited in Cluster 1 with:****Cluster 1:**

Bachelor of Laws (LL.B.), Master of Laws (LL.M.), Bachelor in International Law (LL.B.), Master in International Law (LL.M.), Doctor of Philosophy in International Law (PhD) and Bachelor in Law Enforcement Activity (LL.B).

**Cluster 2:**

Bachelor of Economics, Bachelor of Finance, Master of Finance, Bachelor of Management, Bachelor of Accounting and Audit, Bachelor of Tourism and Bachelor of Psychology.

---

**Duration of Study:**

3 years, 180 credit points

---

**Starting Date of the Doctoral Programmes:**

2009

---

**Capacity Load:**

10

---

**Programme cycle starts in:**

Winter semester

---

**Date of the Meeting of FIBAA-Accreditation Commission:**

September 30<sup>th</sup>, 2016

---

**Resolution:**

Recommendation of the panel members: The accreditation of the programme is granted without conditions and is valid for five years.

---

**Duration of Accreditation / retention period:**

September 30<sup>th</sup>, 2016 until September 30<sup>th</sup>, 2021

---

**Project Manager:**

Karin Legerlotz/ Nora Winckel

---

**Panel members:**

**Prof. Dr. jur. Dr. h.c. Thomas Schomerus**  
Leuphana University Lüneburg  
Professor for Public Law  
(Public Law, Energy Law, Environmental Law)

**Prof. i.R. Dr. jur. Wolfgang Voegeli**  
University of Hamburg  
Professor for Civil and Commercial Law  
(Family Law, Family Policy, General Civil Law, Competition Law, European and International Commercial Law)

**Mansiya Kainazarova**  
KIMEP University  
Director of Institutional Research Department  
(Institutional Research KIMEP University)

**LL.M. Julia Titze**  
Municipal Utilities Herne AG  
Corporate Development  
(Commercial Lawyer)

**Jan-Gero Alexander Hannemann**  
Göttingen University  
Student of Law

# Summary

The panels' assessment takes into account the self-assessment and the results of the on-site visit (and the statement of the HEI to the assessment report).

The doctoral programme **Doctor of Philosophy in Law (PhD)** of KAZGUU University fulfils without exception the FIBAA quality requirements for **doctoral programmes** and can be accredited by the Foundation for International Business Administration Accreditation (FIBAA) without conditions. It is in accordance with the National and the European Qualifications Framework in their applicable version valid at the time of opening of the procedure. It has a modular structure and has been assigned ECTS points. The degree is awarded by the higher education institution.

Furthermore a set of criteria exists, which exceed the quality requirements:

- Positioning of the Doctoral programme in the education market (s. chapter 1.2),
- Positioning of the Doctoral programme in the job market of graduates in the research fields (s. chapter 1.3.1)
- Positioning of the Doctoral programme in the job market of graduates outside the research fields (s. chapter 1.3.2)
- Positioning of the Doctoral programme in the Strategic Concept of the HEI (s. chapter 1.4)
- Gender Equality and Equal Opportunities (s. chapter 1.5)
- Admission conditions and procedures (s. chapter 2.1)
- Selection procedure (s. chapter 2.2)
- Transparency of the Decision on Admission (s. chapter 2.3)
- Logic and Conceptual Coherency (s. chapter 3.2.1)
- Science and Research based training (s. chapter 3.2.2)
- Focus on the curriculum on Qualification and Competency development (s. chapter 3.2.3)
- Examinations (s. chapter 3.3.1)
- Logic and Comprehensibility of the didactic concept (s. chapter 3.4.1)
- Internal cooperation within the faculty (s. chapter 4.1.5)
- Financial support and scholarship programmes (s. chapter 4.5.2)

For the overall assessment please refer to the quality profile at the end of this report.

## Institutions Details

Kazakh State Law Institute by the Ministry of Justice of the Republic of Kazakhstan was established by the Decree of the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan N.A. Nazarbayev on March 14, 1994. The Institute set an objective to prepare highly qualified lawyers, capable in terms of socio-economic reforms to ensure legal reform in the country.

By the Decree of the Government Kazakh State Law Institute was renamed as Kazakh State Law University and transferred to the jurisdiction under the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan on 5 November 1996. After the merging with the Institute of State and Law of National Academy of Sciences of the RoK the university was renamed as Kazakh State Academy of Law (KSAL) on February 14, 2000. On October 24, 2001 the university, established as a Republican State Enterprise, was transformed into a private company and renamed as "Kazakh Humanities and Law University" (KazHLU). In 2002 KazHLU moved from Almaty to Astana, the young capital of Kazakhstan. On 16 January, 2003 "KazHLU" PC was transformed into "KazHLU" PLC, on May 19, 2004 to "KazHLU" JSC and then renamed as "KAZGUU University" in 2015.

Under the decision of the IQAA Accreditation Council, KAZGUU had been accredited for 5 years (certificate of institutional accreditation issued under No.0013 dated 01.03.2013).

In addition, on December 26, 2013 KAZGUU had been accredited as a subject of state-funded scientific and (or) scientific-technical activities (certificate No. 003645 issued by the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan).

Located in the heart of Kazakhstan's capital, KAZGUU is one of the largest and fastest growing humanitarian universities of Kazakhstan with more than 5 000 students, 1000 academic and research staff.

KAZGUU University comprises three Schools that are Higher School of Law, Higher School of Economics as well as Higher School of General Education<sup>4</sup>. All students study during their first year at the Higher School General Studies and Language Training (Foundation), where the obligatory subjects named by the Ministry of Education are comprised together.

The Higher School of Law offers three degree programmes in law, international law and law enforcement activity.

The Higher School of Economics offers seven programmes in economics, management, finance, accounting and audit, tourism, psychology, and translation studies.

The Department of Postgraduate Education offers five Master's Degree Programmes in Law, in International Law, in Translation Studies, in Economics and in Finance.

The mission of the University is to contribute to the development of the society through the pursuit of education, learning, and research at the highest international levels of excellence. The aim of the University is to equip students with the necessary knowledge for leading positions in the sphere of law, economics and humanities in the Republic of Kazakhstan and abroad.

## Statistical data and evaluation results

	2010	2011	2012	2013	2014	2015
applicants	44	27	25	15	9	11
first year students	12	3	3	1	3	2
Female students	8	1	2	0	2	1
Male students	4	2	1	1	1	1
Grade of final point average	3,46	3,62	3,62	3,68	3,58	3,63
Success rate	-	-	-	30%	50%	70%
Average length of study	3 year	3 year	3 year	3 year	3 year	3 year

# Description and appraisal in Detail

## 1. Goals and Strategy

### 1.1 Objectives of the Doctoral Programme

Initially the educational programme on Law was aiming at the realisation of the objectives set by the state to KAZGUU University at the year of its formation in 1994. The main goal was then to educate highly-qualified lawyers, who would be able to ensure legal reforms in the country during its social and economic transformation. This objective is reflected in its mission until today. Since a lot of areas of law were considerably changed or even newly introduced after Kazakhstan's independency the law programmes had to be frequently reformed and adjusted to the new realities. Reforms usually did not occur step by step but were quickly implemented and often result oriented. These developments caused a series of difficulties, which are until today unfortunately reflected in the educational programmes of legal studies such as a lack of educational books, commentaries, a uniform approach to methodology and case-solving in academia and at the courts and the difficulty to reflect areas of law at a university level which are not yet or fully regulated such as administrative law or which are under permanent reform or/and without a Court System but a the Highest Council giving non-binding opinions on questions on constitutional law. The programme should therefore be seen in this context taking all the above mentioned aspects into account and the fact that Kazakhstan's legal system is still in a transitional stage.

The programme focuses on training students at an advanced level in specific fields of study in order for them to assume positions of leadership in research, teaching, and service in industry, business, and government. Another main objective of this programme is to make influence on the development of national legislation.

The programme is equipping doctoral candidates with knowledge and skills which will be demonstrated in the following learning outcomes:

- to demonstrate systematic understanding of the legal knowledge and ability to critically apply in-depth theories, methodologies;
- to synthesise fundamental crucial issues related to the national law equipped with comparative analyze of international experience;
- to demonstrate advanced knowledge in certain field of law (Civil Law, Public Law, Criminal Law, Comparative Law);
- to identify certain research problem in certain field of Law and implement it in a process of research;
- to identify new methods of researches and its implementation and application in independent research activity in legal sphere;
- to apply legal critical thinking analyses, evaluation and synthesis of new findings into researches;
- to demonstrate a mastery of skills and knowledge at a level required for teaching in their discipline.

### Appraisal:

The objectives of the programme are set out consistently in relation for the students to reach leadership positions in research, teaching, and service in industry, business, and government. The panel assesses the aim of the programme as very comprehensible and considers the explanations of the objectives as clear and intelligible. Furthermore, the pursued qualification and competency goals are matched with each other. The panel also comes to the conclusion that the areas: empowerment, employability and personality/personal development are taken into account by the objectives of the programme.



In the view of the panel the Dublin Descriptors are adequately covered by the intended learning outcomes. Also, the requirements of academic abilities are fulfilled. Hence, the panel considers the learning outcomes of the programme to be at the appropriate level for PhD degrees.

The University analyses the findings of alumni tracking studies. The findings of the studies are considered within the developing process of the programme.

Quality Ratings		Excellent	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
<b>1.</b>	<b>STRATEGY AND OBJECTIVES</b>					
1.1	Objectives of the Doctoral Programme			x		

## 1.2 Positioning of the Doctoral Programme in the education market

In Kazakhstan there are only twelve Higher Educational Institutions which have licenses for realisation of PhD programmes in Law. Among them KAZGUU takes a leading because it is the only specialised legal University and consultant to state agencies.

Kazakhstan legal system is still transforming and scholars of KAZGUU significantly lead or participate in special working groups responsible for developing various legal acts and codes. Professors and Scholars of KAZGUU are recognised as the founders of National Constitution, National Legal Codes and Comments to Codes that defined special place of KAZGUU Research Schools and PhD programmes in Kazakhstan.

Within its frame KAZGUU has initiated the opening of Academy of Fundamental and Applied Sciences named after S. Zimanov which unites all researches in the field of national and international law. The Academy closely collaborates with the Department of Postgraduate Programmes in enhancing the quality of educational process of the PhD programmes as well as supervises doctoral candidates.

The Academic content of the PhD programme focus on advanced knowledge in certain spheres of law, which is needed in the national level and is starting to develop new fields of law such as Trade Law, Anglo Saxon Law, Economic Arbitration, Intellectual Property Law, Corporate Law and International Law. Furthermore, KAZGUU emphasises the international orientation of the programme which includes two advisors among which one is supposed to be with international background. The programme also include internships abroad enabling students to study at partner-universities.

The Ministry of Education and Science selects one University in the country which will be responsible for defining obligatory subjects in the PhD programmes. Since 2008 KAZGUU was honoured with the right to define changes and make recommendations for PhD in Law programmes.

### Appraisal:

KAZGUU has thoroughly examined the educational market and used the results in establishing its own unique and competitive profile with regard to the pursued qualification and competency goals. Moreover, the panel is impressed that KAZGUU uses its good reputation to make an impact on the mandatory standard curricula for "Law" PhD programmes at other HEIs in Kazakhstan as well as on the development of legal acts and codes in Kazakhstan.

Quality Ratings		Excellent	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
1.	<b>STRATEGY AND OBJECTIVES</b>					
1.2	Positioning of the Doctoral Programme in the educational market		X			

### 1.3 Positioning of the Doctoral Programme in the Job Market for Graduates

The PhD programme has a special focus on professional qualification for science and research. In Kazakhstan because of the lack of PhD graduates majoring in Law HEIs have a strong demand for scholars who will be able to contribute to the law-making process. The topics of the research of KAZGUU students is approved in accordance with current research topics, which are of importance for state legislation defined by University Research Centers.

Outside of research fields PhD graduates are employed in two sectors:

- In State Agencies that are involved into the law-making process. Graduates work in the Ministry of Justice, Parliament and other State Agencies responsible for Legal Expertise and preparing projects concerning amendments to current legislation and its improvement
- In the private sector the PhD graduates are working in national private organisations and firms.

Thus, there is a great demand in PhD graduates who will be committed to make rigorous empirical research and contribute to the scientific world as well as to develop leadership skill and competencies to lead research community in Kazakhstan.

To demonstrate the employability of the PhD graduates KAZGUU provided the following illustration:

Employability	Nº of Graduates	%
<b>KAZGUU University</b>	<b>9</b>	<b>43%</b>
<b>Other HEIs</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>5%</b>
<b>Public Sector (Ministries, State Agencies)</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>34%</b>
<b>Private Sector</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>19%</b>
<b>Total</b>	<b>21</b>	<b>100%</b>

#### Appraisal:

The panel formed the view that the PhD programmes are focused on training future scientists who can work both in scientific institutions and in positions in the public and private sector. KAZGUU is well connected to other HEIs and research institutes, the national legislation system, the administration and public organisations as well as private organisations and compa-

nies and pays a lot of attention to their feedback, which the panel greatly welcomes. Also they do systematic alumni-tracking studies to analyse the current positioning of the graduates on the labour market. The profile, the figures and the lack of PhD graduates lead the panel to the conclusion that the positioning of the programme in the job market for graduates exceeds the quality requirements.

Quality Ratings		Excellent	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
1.3	Positioning of the Doctoral Programme in the Job Market for Graduates					
1.3.1	in the research fields		X			
1.3.2	outside the research fields		X			

#### 1.4 Positioning of the Doctoral Programme in the Strategic Concept of the Higher Education Institution

The programme is being developed in coherence with University Strategy 2013-2020, a cornerstone of institution development. KAZGUU is implementing a student-centred and research-led culture. The programme underlines KAZGUU's strategy providing international standards of education as well as establishing strong relations with international universities. KAZGUU intends to be a research University and the PhD in Law and International Law are the only doctorate programmes of the University. Thus, the development of this PhD programme is a priority for the University.

The main goal of KAZGUU's Strategic Concept is to develop empirical research trajectory within the educational process in the framework of the KAZGUU Research Institutes. The research emphasis of KAZGUU can be achieved only in strong connection with PhD programmes. That is why PhD students are strongly encouraged to work as assistants of Professors of the Research Institutes connecting with their Dissertation Thesis research.

Furthermore, the programme has the mission to realise central goal of KAZGUU Strategy - namely to educate and prepare professional scholars for the state with fundamental legal knowledge responsible for the justice and legal development in Kazakhstan as a country with emerging economy.

#### Appraisal:

Since the implementation of a research-led culture is one of the main goals of KAZGUU, the integration of the programme in the strategic concept was convincingly substantiated. The programme presents a consequent continuation of the higher education strategy in the focus of research. The corresponding setting of priorities of the higher education institutions are verified.

Quality Ratings		Excellent	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
1.4	The Positioning of the Doctoral Programme in the Strategic Concept of the Higher Education Institution		X			

## 1.5 Gender Equality and Equal Opportunities

KAZGUU's core values include a commitment to the care for the well-being of all members of the KAZGUU community – including students, faculty, and staff - regardless of their nationality, religion, gender or other factors, such as physical disability, special needs, or capacity to pay the required tuition. KAZGUU adopted the following core values:

- Honesty, integrity, professionalism, and personal responsibility;
- Respecting diversity and appreciating cross-cultural perspectives;
- Learner-centered teaching and student engagement that fosters intellectual vitality, critical thinking for learning and continuing professional development;

KAZGUU does not discriminate in employment, educational services and academic programmes regardless individual's race, colour, religion, religious creed, ancestry, national origin, age, sexual orientation, marital status, medical condition and disability, and otherwise as permitted by the legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

KAZGUU provides transparent policies and equal opportunities to all student including PhD students. In the programme there were no students with disabilities so far but in case there will be applicants KAZGUU is ready to offer all necessary equal opportunities for those with disabilities.

For example an opportunity to study on individual schedule with the use of online and offline consultations through special programmes is given to students with disabilities. Depending on the type and degree of disability exams for such students and graduates can be administered in the form of tests, which they pass using programme AIS "Platon" and in oral form (in case of weak-eyed students). Other forms of exams, depending on the abilities and capabilities of disabled students can be used. In addition, there is a special audio (audiovisual) content helping students and graduates to master course content as part of the curriculum.

Students and visitors with disabilities can use There is a special ramp installed near the service entrance of the University equipped with handrails and non-slip cover. Besides, taxis for disabled people is available and people with private vehicles can use elevator located in the garage. The width of hallways, corridors, doorways classrooms correspond to the requirements. There are wheelchair accessible toilets equipped with handrails and hooks for crutches. In order to move between the floors people with disabilities can use three passenger elevators. Special places for wheelchair users meeting all requirements are available in the auditorium, event hall, reading room and other places. Furthermore, KAZGUU provides disabled people with desks of appropriate high.

### Appraisal:

The panel members come to the conclusion that gender equality and the implementation of general bans on discrimination are actively promoted by KAZGUU. Moreover, KAZGUU has put effort to ensure equality throughout the whole study programme and on campus. Students in particular life situations are nurtured. An entitlement to compensation for disabilities for disabled students with regard to requirements in terms of time and form on the programme as well as any final performance evidence or evidence of the latter during studies and as part of suitability determination procedures is ensured. Furthermore, the physical layout of the building at present does allow unhindered access for disabled students. The panel also likes to point out, that the fact that the department of postgraduate programmes is currently lead by a woman which is a positive sign on a way to gender equality.

Quality Ratings		Excellent	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
1.5	Gender Equality and Equal Opportunities		X			

## 2. ADMISSION

The admission procedure is regulated according to the “The Standard Rules of Admission to Educational Institutions”, which was adopted by the decree of the government of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated on January 19th, 2012, No. 109.

To apply for the PhD programme, the applicants must submit to the Admission Committee the following documents:

- confirmation of completion a corresponding Master degree programme with no less than 60 ECTS;
- application addressed to the Rector of the university;
- an individual study plan to be discussed and signed by national or international research advisor;
- a copy of an identity card;
- a copy of an education certificate;
- a copy of an international language certificate;
- a list of scientific papers and instructional researches;
- six photos of 3x4 cm;
- a medical certificate of special 086-Y type;
- a record book of employment (for those who have work experience).

Students from other universities must provide the Admission Committee with all the required documents identical with domestic students.

For the admission of international students a recognition procedure is obligatory. All copies of the documents should be officially notarised and translated into one of the following languages: Kazakh, Russian, or English.

The admission is also based on the entry examinations results. The entry examinations for the Republic of Kazakhstan include a foreign language examination and subject examination. For international applicants the entry examinations include Kazakh or Russian language examination and subject examination.

The foreign language entry examinations (Russian/Kazakh for international students) are held according to the technology and methodology developed by The National Testing Centre of the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan. The examination takes 180 minutes and is represented in the form of test. The whole test consists of three modules: listening, writing and reading. The results are then processed by means of the special scanning machine.

The citizens of the Republic of Kazakhstan, who have international language certificates with the results of 100 points according to 100-point-grading scale, are exempted from passing the foreign language examination provided by the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

The subject examination is set in the written form. The examination paper consists of 2 questions: the first one covers theoretical issues and the second one is oriented on a case-problem solution. The subject examination takes 120 minutes. To make the examination pro-

cess more objective the format of examination paper is the same for all applicants who have chosen one and the same specialty.

Candidates are admitted to the PhD programme only if they get 50 points in each examination.

Part of the selection procedure for the PhD Programme is also an obligatory interview. During the interview between the Director or a Coordinator of the programme and a potential enrollee the following selection criteria are taken into account:

- obvious motivation of an enrollee to study at the chosen programme;
- clear professional aims, which are to be achieved as a result of the study;
- critical thinking and open-mindedness;
- readiness to overcome academic challenges;
- an enrollee's achievements and success in professional life.

The interview is recorded and the results and the Director's decision are reported to an enrollee right after the interview is finished.

Furthermore, a foreign language examination held by the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan tests the English skills of the applicants. The certificate with the result of examination of 50 points corresponds to the Pre-intermediate language level. The applicants are exempt from entry language examination if they already have international language certificate on such as:

- Test of English as a Foreign Language Institutional Testing Programm (TOEFL ITP – no less than 460 points);
- Test of English as a Foreign Language Internet-based Test (TOEFL IBT - no less than 87);
- Test of English as a Foreign Language Paper-based Test (TOEFL - no less than 560);
- International English Language Tests System (IELTS - no less than 6.0).

Candidates are admitted to the PhD programme only if they get 50 points in each examination. Candidates, who get the highest points in the sum of two entry examinations of not less than 150 points, are awarded a state grant. In case the applicants have equal examination results, the one who got the highest points on the subject examination takes advantage.

Besides the results of examinations Admission Committee also takes into account student academic achievements including publications of scientific articles, certificates on scientific innovations, scientific scholarships, grants, certificates of achievements, certificates of participation in the scientific conferences and competitions and work experience on the specialty.

The Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan provides a financial aid by allocating state educational grants for candidates who meet all the required criteria and demonstrated high academic performance. For international applicants scholarships are granted based on international agreements of the Republic of Kazakhstan with countries.

To make the evaluation procedure more objective and fair, all the applicants' works are coded by the Institution staff since it is considered as criminal breach of trust. Only the members of the examination commission are given answer codes for exam papers. It provides the selection procedure with unbiased and objective evaluation. After the evaluation all the examination papers are decoded.

The overall result of selection procedure is based on two entry examinations that are foreign language examination and subject examination. If there is a controversial issue to be resolved the special Board of Review is created. The members of the board of review consider the issues of those who disagree with the results of the examinations. In this case an applicant's paper goes through thorough review. Only the Board of Review is responsible to make a decision to add points to the applicant's exam paper if the reasons for that are confirmed. The members of the Board of Review come to their decisions by the majority of votes. If the amount of votes is equal the vote of the Director is considered as a final. The decisions made

by the Board of Review are in the form of a record signed by the Director and all the members.

All appropriate information on admission rules and procedures is available in the Academic Policy and regularly updated at the university website. In addition, booklets and brochures containing this information are distributed among participants of the KAZGUU during Open House Days. The Open House Days usually take place three times within an academic year. The date, time and venue are announced on the website.

Moreover, the University offers Student Counselling Service for prospective students to help them to handle any difficulties they may be experiencing, to develop academic and personal potential. The Service offers free and confidential support and guidance to optimise their chances to obtain admission into the University.

The results of the entry examinations of applicants who are awarded with a grant are posted on the University website and also the detailed information board of the Department of Post-graduate Education. The points on each section of the exam of every applicant are given in the score chart where the last names of candidates are given in the descending order according to the overall result. The applicant has the opportunity to receive a consultation by phone or have an online consultant via the website. The admission decision is based on above-mentioned transparent criteria, and communicated to applicants on the website and by e-mail/phone.

## Appraisal:

The admission conditions and procedures are properly defined and transparent and correspond to the profile development goals of the KAZGUU, because the students do not only have to have a corresponding master degree, but also have to hand in an individual study plan to be discussed and signed by a national or international research advisor and a list of scientific papers and instructional researches.

The panel considers the selection procedure as targeted to the programme goals. The selection procedure, which includes two entrance exams, is carried out in accordance with Kazakh laws and therefore satisfies the legal requirements. Moreover, the panel appreciates that KAZGUU additionally examines the personal suitability of the applicants within an interview.

The decision on admission is based on transparent criteria and it is clearly communicated; rejections are reasoned. The responsibilities are clearly regulated.

Quality Ratings		Excellent	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
<b>2.</b>	<b>ADMISSION</b>					
2.1	Admission conditions and procedures		X			
2.2	Selection Procedure		X			
2.3	Transparency of the Decision on Admission			X		

## 3. Implementation

### 3.1 Structure

The programme consists of 180 ECTS credits and proceeds in during 6 semesters. 52% of the student workload is dedicated to research, 18% to courses on legal study, 17% to the courses on research and 13 % to the final qualification examination.

The modules in the first year modules focus on research and developing skills necessary to introduce students to the doctorate research activity. In addition they can choose electives related to the area of their study and get advanced knowledge in certain topics.

During the second year the doctoral students write a dissertation synopsis in consultation with his advisors. They can also accomplish a foreign research internship and work with a foreign advisor. Doctoral students also engage in first teaching experience and start to publish his research articles. After the completion of the second year of study the doctoral students are required to submit the first draft of their Doctoral dissertation to the Academic Council. On the third year the doctoral students work on their dissertation. They go to seminars, prepare for Final State Qualification Examination, complete their dissertation, and take the Final State Qualification Examination administrated by the State Committee. After the 3 month the doctoral students are allowed to present their dissertation to the Dissertation Committee. Once approved by the Dissertation Committee, the dissertation is submitted to the Ph.D. State Committee of the Ministry of Education and Science for the final approval. After the approval the doctoral students are awarded a degree PhD in law.

The doctoral degree regulations of KAZGUU rely on the rules specified the requirements of the State Standards on Doctorate Programmes of relevant levels of education, approved by the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated August 23, 2012 №1080 and State Regulations on Awarding Doctorate Degree (with amendments from 30 May 2013, №214), which were integrated KAZGUU's "Regulations on the PhD program" which regulates the procedure for admission to a PhD, the rights and obligations of doctoral students, the academic process and the final attestation.

The doctoral thesis must meet the following requirements:

- include new evidence-based theoretical and (or) experimental results allowing to solve theoretical or applied problem or a major achievement in the development of specific scientific fields; correspond to basic problems of the specialty on the theme of the thesis defended;
- be relevant, contain scientific novelty and practical significance; based on modern theoretical, methodological and technological achievements of science, technology and production, contain specific practical recommendations, independent findings and decision of administrative problems of integrated, cross-functional nature;
- be based on modern methods of processing and interpretation of data;
- be performed by modern methods scientific research and advanced information technologies;
- contain (methodological and practical) sections on basic protective position;
- be based on the best international practices in the field of knowledge.

The main results of the doctoral thesis to be defended, must be submitted at least seven publications, including at least three scientific publications, recommended by the Committee, one in the international scientific journal, which has according to information base of Thomson Reuters (ISI Web of Thomson Reuters) non-zero impact factor, or is part of the Scopus company's database and three papers in scientific conferences, including one paper in an international conference.



The doctoral thesis is carried out under the guidance of an advisory committee of not less than two persons appointed from among the doctors and candidates of sciences, doctors of philosophy (PhD), of which one is a scientist from a foreign university.

The procedure of presentation and submission of a doctoral thesis for the defense is governed by internal Regulations on the Doctoral Thesis

The status of the doctoral students is defined in Law «On Education» from 27th of July 2007, Law on Science from 18 February 2011, State Standard on Doctorate Programme and Regulation on PhD programme. While applicant enters PhD programme after edict signed by Rector he gets the status of PhD student. After the first-year of when academic study is finished the PhD students start their research and become research assistants to Research Institutes, in the third year of study the PhD students continue their research activity and can become consultants together with an advisor to the Master students' research activity. Due to the State Standard on Doctorate Programme State Qualification Examination is held after the 3 year. After this examination the PhD students turn their status to PhD candidates as persons who have finished the whole PhD programme without completing their Dissertation Thesis.

All modules have been described in module descriptions enclosing information on the year of study, the semester when the course is delivered seminars and self-study, allocated credits, pre requisites, post requisites, recommended literature, content, lecturers, methods of teaching and learning outcomes.

## Appraisal:

The structure corresponds with the objectives of the doctoral programme and it properly connects the range of courses with the research tasks of the doctoral students. The panel appreciates the high proportion the research takes up in the curriculum as well as the teaching experience the doctoral students gain during the programme, which prepares them very well for a potential career at HEIs. Furthermore, the research is accompanied by courses on research to strengthen the theoretical foundation of the doctoral students and help them to deal with difficulties they might face during the academic process.

The structural requirements of the doctoral programme are accounted for by taking into account the national and higher education specific requirements in a doctoral degree regulation. This document regulates in detail, the goals, the degree, duration, mentoring, examination and doctoral thesis. Further explanation are given by the Doctoral Thesis. The panel considers these regulations as comprehensive and transparent.

The same applies to the status of the doctoral students which is defined by law.

All modules have been described in module descriptions enclosing information of hours of lecturers, the year of study, the semester when the course is delivered seminars and self-study, allocated credits, pre requisites, post requisites, recommended literature, content, lecturers, methods of teaching and learning outcomes.

The programme consists of modules and assigns ECTS-Points per module on the basis of the necessary student workload. The module descriptions provide detailed descriptions of intended learning outcomes and the information defined in the ECTS Users' Guide.

Quality Ratings		Excellent	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
<b>3.</b>	<b>PROGRAMME DESIGN</b>					
3.1	Structure					
3.1.1	Structural Setup of the Doctoral Programme			X		
3.1.2	Doctoral Degree Regulations			X		
3.1.3	Status of the Doctoral Students			X		
3.1.4	Module Description			X		

### 3.2 Content

The programmes content is research oriented. Started with courses providing students with research competencies and skills programme leads to the research implementation directly after the 1<sup>st</sup> year and enhances it with foreign research internships and the opportunity to integrate international experience. The courses allow doctoral students to deepen the knowledge acquired in elective courses, and to acquire additional skills and competencies required for a successful scientific activity.

The first semester of the PhD programme in Law comprises of seven sub modules incorporated into two large modules: general education disciplines and one module of the elective courses. The general education disciplines are based on the state general educational standards of higher education, in accordance with it the general courses are considered as mandatory subjects with the same value but with different workload. The area of focus of the general disciplines is oriented to the development of leadership, management and research skills with advanced knowledge of legal English since it implies they embrace the framework of the field of law.

Ultimately the schedule of the programmes is planned well in advance and available for each cohort in the electronic format (from the programme's website) and a hard copy of the timetable is also given to students along with other course materials. Every syllabus of a course provided to the students clearly states the subject matter, goals, learning outcomes, topics and requirements of each class and chapter. The classes are scheduled on days of the week including weekends. The learning objectives guide students to manage their workloads and help to acquire the essential skills to be professional in related job field.

The curriculum is shown in the following illustration:

## Curriculum Overview PhD in Law programme, 6 Semesters



FIBAA

1 <sup>st</sup> Semester												
Modul No.	Title of Module / Course Unit	Credit Points per Semester						Workload		Method of Teaching <small>i.e. lecture course, seminar</small>	Form and Duration of Examinations	weight of exam related to final grade
		1.	2.	3.	4.	5.	6.	Hours in Class	Hours Self-Study			
<b>Core courses 18 ECTS</b>		<b>18</b>						<b>120</b>	<b>360</b>			<b>40 / 100</b>
TSL7201	<i>Methodology of Legal Science</i>	6						40	120	L/T/S	Exam Paper (120 Min)	
RSL 7201	<i>Doctoral Thesis Seminar</i>	6						40	120	L/T/S	Exam Paper (120 Min)	
LNL 7201	<i>English For Legal Studies</i>	6						40	120	T	Exam Paper (120 Min)	
<b>Electives - 12 ECTS (2 courses out of 4)</b>		<b>12</b>						<b>80</b>	<b>240</b>			<b>40 / 100</b>
RSL 7202	<i>Research, Analysis and Writing in Civil Law</i>	6						40	120	L/T/S	Exam Paper (120 Min)	
RSL 7203	<i>Research, Analysis and Writing in Criminal Law</i>	6						40	120	L/T/S	Exam Paper (120 Min)	
RSL 7204	<i>Research, Analysis and Writing in Public Law</i>	6						40	120	L/T/S	Exam Paper (120 Min)	
RSL 7205	<i>Research, Analysis and Writing in Comparative Law</i>	6						40	120	L/T/S	Exam Paper (120 Min)	

<b>2<sup>nd</sup> Semester</b>											
<b>Core Courses - Electives - 30 ECTS (6 courses out of 11)</b>			<b>30</b>					<b>180</b>	<b>630</b>		<b>40 / 100</b>
PBL7201	<i>Advanced Topics in Administrative Law</i>		5					30	105		Exam Paper (120 Min)
PBL7202	<i>Advanced Topics in Constitutional Law</i>		5					30	105		Exam Paper (120 Min)
FL7201	<i>Advanced Topics in Financial Law</i>		5					30	105		Exam Paper (120 Min)
PRL7201	<i>Advanced Topics in Civil and Civil Procedure Law</i>		5					30	105		Exam Paper (120 Min)
PRL7202	<i>Advanced Topics in Antitrust and Intellectual Property Law</i>		5					30	105		Exam Paper (120 Min)
PRL7203	<i>Advanced Topics in Corporate Law</i>		5					30	105		Exam Paper (120 Min)
IL7201	<i>Advanced Topics in International Private Law</i>		5					30	105		Exam Paper (120 Min)
CRL7201	<i>Advanced Topics in Criminal and Criminal Procedure Law</i>		5					30	105		Exam Paper (120 Min)
IL7202	<i>Advanced Topics in International Litigation and Arbitration</i>		5					30	105		Exam Paper (120 Min)
TSL7202	<i>English Common Law II</i>		5					30	105		Exam Paper (120 Min)
RSL 7206	<i>Legal Case-Study: German Experience</i>		5					30	105		Exam Paper (120 Min)

	<b>3<sup>rd</sup> Semester</b>											
C	Seminar			2			25	45				1 / 210
	Research (including foreign research internship)			25			60	810				11 / 210
	Teaching practice/experience			3			45	180				
	<b>4<sup>th</sup> Semester</b>											
C	Seminar			2			25	45				
	Research (including foreign research internship)			25			60	810				
	Teaching practice/experience			3			45	180				
	<b>5<sup>th</sup> Semester</b>											
	Research					25	60	810				
	Seminars on final state exam					5	25	135				
	<b>6<sup>th</sup> Semester</b>											
	Seminars on final state exam						13	30	420			
	Final state exam						4	25	110			
	Thesis preparation						13	50	340			
	<b>total</b>			<b>30</b>	<b>30</b>	<b>30</b>	<b>30</b>	<b>30</b>	<b>30</b>	<b>830</b>	<b>5115</b>	

The modules are aimed at qualification and competency development and are sensible linked to one another. The systematic methodology for competence based curriculum development includes six phases: a) conceptualization; b) planning; c) analysis; d) creation course catalog of competences. Thus, the methodology promotes continuous improvement through the consideration of the university strategic plans.

Starting from the first semester the programme makes an accent on the development of research skills and competencies. Graduates are involved into the courses such as Methodology of International Law or Legal Science, Doctoral Thesis Seminar and Research, Analysis and Writing in the related field of study. In the second semester by taking courses of their choice such as Advanced Topics in International Law, Advanced Topics in Administrative Law or Commercial Law, PhD candidates expand their focus of learning from diverse angle of outlook. The following semesters are completely committed to making empirical research that finally reveals graduates competences:

- to demonstrate systematic understanding of the legal knowledge and ability to critically apply in-depth theories, methodologies;
- to synthesize fundamental crucial issues related to the national law equipped with comparative analyze of international experience;
- to demonstrate advanced knowledge in certain field of law (Civil Law, Public Law, Criminal Law, Comparative Law);
- to identify certain research problem in certain field of Law and implement it in a process of research;
- to identify new methods of researches and its implementation and application in independent research activity in legal sphere;
- to apply legal critical thinking analyses, evaluation and synthesis of new findings into researches;
- to demonstrate a mastery of skills and knowledge at a level required for teaching in their discipline.

PhD students are encouraged to publish their researches during the study. They rapidly become experts in handling large amounts of information and demonstrate a comprehensive mastery of the field of law. The Department of Postgraduate Programmes also provides PhD students with supervisors who are eligible to guide them. The Supervisors are helpful in encouraging a clear and specific focus in an article publication.

Since the first year of study Doctorate students have to start to publish articles in law reviews. During the study period the main research results have to be published in no less than seven publications on the topic of the thesis including:

- three publications in National Law Reviews ranked by MES;
- three publications in the Reviews or Journals of International Conferences;
- one publication in the International Law Review from the list of Thomson Reuters (ISI Web of Knowledge, Thomson Reuters) with non-zero impact factor, or listed in Scopus.

From the entry to the doctorate programme PhD student together with local and foreign advisor works on Individual Work Plan for 3 years (during the study PhD student can make changes) including research and publications, presentation of their speeches on conferences or due to the research topics participation in some law-making projects. Supervisors can also play a useful role in helping students work to specific journal styles, and in guiding them through the submission process, including helping them to re-write articles in response to publishing Center's reports, and in some cases, helping them handle outright rejection.

Multidisciplinary qualifications are cross reflected in overall curriculum of the programme. In the second semester of the programme PhD students are introduced to be involved into different subjects field of their choice. For example, courses like Advanced Topics in Human Rights in Contemporary Context, Antitrust and Intellectual Property Law, International Litigation and Arbitration, Legal Case-Study: German Experience, etc., show that PhD graduate

can acquire and deepen their qualifications that may be beyond of their research focus. Graduates can be highly competitive in a job market.

Multidisciplinary qualifications in the doctoral programme are communicated in a target appropriate manner. It especially enables the doctoral students to discuss the knowledge gained in the specialized fields with their colleagues, to present it in front of an academic audience and to communicate it to laymen. It promotes the ability to manage a team and to carry forward the social, scientific or cultural progress in their respective professional environment.

## Appraisal:

The experts find that the curricula of the study PhD programme reflects the programme objectives, as described in chapter 1.1, in a unique way so that students are allowed to develop their research abilities reflecting on their individual setting of priorities by using actual research developments. The teaching presents the current status of scientific knowledge in accordance with the learning objectives, and it takes into account the associated relevant research. There is a balanced mixture of modules in terms of content and they are arranged in a logical sequence. The individual study trajectories included in the programme enable students to acquire in-depth theoretical and methodological knowledge in accordance with their own preferences.

The experts find that the University aims at defining relevant research questions and at qualifying their students to solve them independently. Current issues with relevance for the national and international law are translated into research questions, so that research resolves the real problems of society. The programmes ensure that graduates have methodological competence, are empowered to conduct academic work and can understand and assimilate specialist literature. Methodological competences of an adequate level are described as learning outcomes in the curricula of all study programmes. The experts got the impression that students are made familiar with relevant scientific methods.

Multidisciplinary aspects are included in the doctoral programmes. The communicative competences are also trained.

Quality Ratings		Excellent	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
<b>3.</b>	<b>PROGRAMME DESIGN</b>					
3.2	Content					
3.2.1	Logic and Conceptual Consistency		X			
3.2.2	Science and Research Based Teaching		X			
3.2.3	Focus of the Curriculum on Qualification and Competency Development		X			
3.2.4	Technical Offers			X		
3.2.5	Multidisciplinary Qualifications			X		

### 3.3 Examination Procedures

All courses and modules are followed by written and oral exams which could be a combination of two subjects that have an interrelated content and context. Courses or module content and learning outcomes are developed in line with the programmes' learning outcomes.

The types of evaluation, procedures and course performance or module performance are included in the respective syllabus along with the employed teaching methods and studies duration. Student performance follows the syllabus requirements, including assessment types, duration and respective requirements as academically approved including the Doctoral Thesis. Thus, a required quality assessment level at Doctoral level is in line with the third cycle of the Dublin Descriptors.

The student performance and given grades are evaluated by achieving the learning outcomes and their overall program performance. Tasks, questions, problems and assessments of the final examination of the courses are defined by the involved team of teaching faculty, taking into account not only knowledge but also learning outcomes.

The type of evaluation depends on the subjects. Academic freedom of the teaching faculty drives the choice of the assessments types, though. The examples of the assessments methods are:

- Written / oral projects;
- Home or in-class individual / group assignments;
- Term projects;
- Case-solving;
- Final assessment / exam (with increasing frequency case-solving)

All exams, as they are defined for the modules, are suited in format and content to ascertain the intended learning outcomes.

The examinations are composed in such a manner that the achieved qualifications and competencies can be determined and assessed. This includes, above all, that the certificates of achievement aim for a systematic understanding of the research discipline and the control of the research methods which are applied in this field of research. In addition, the certificates of achievement are aimed at a contribution of research which expands the frontiers of knowledge and withstands a national/international assessment carried out by scientists.

The examinations are properly organized in terms of number, distribution, process, form registration etc. Examination Procedure follows the State Compulsory Standard for PhD programme adopted by the decree of the government of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated on 23rd of August, №1080 2012.

#### Appraisal:

The examinations are suitable to determine and assess the learning outcomes. The Independent Work performances aim at proving a systematic understanding of the research field and the applied research methods as well as at controlling the progress of the doctoral thesis. Moreover the panel highly appreciates the wide variance of examinations KAZGUU offers. When awarding grades for the scientific work the final assessment also ensures that the PhD graduates have in-depth knowledge in their field of research and can carry out independent research activities. The requirements for being admitted to the final examination (publication in a journal with impact factor, in national journals and conference papers) also ensure that the PhD students are experienced in doing research work on an appropriate level. Furthermore, the organisation of the examination procedures is properly organised and defined in the Academic Policy.

Furthermore, the certificates of achievement take into account the results of enhanced participation in the research fields with special focus placed on form and content.



The examinations are properly organised in terms of number, distribution, process, form registration etc. The disadvantage compensation is regulated.

Quality Ratings		Excellent	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
<b>3.</b>	<b>PROGRAMME DESIGN</b>					
3.3	Examination Procedures					
3.3.1	Examinations		X			
3.3.2	Organisation of the Examination Procedure			X		

### 3.4 Didactic Concept

The teaching function can be expressed in providing students with knowledge, skills and abilities they need in their future professional activities. All the disciplines of the programme are closely related to each other and arranged in such way that the students receive basic knowledge at first, and then specialised (professional) knowledge. The task of the professor is to acquaint students with new scientific knowledge to help them realise their potential in independent work. In-class work is a practical class work, which is carried out using various methods. The teacher is not particularly limited in the choice of the method. As part of the education variety of interactive methods is being used:

- The method of discussion involves posing the issue, followed by a discussion, including work in small groups. This method helps student master critical thinking skills in dealing with specific legal issues, legal reasoning and make independent legal decisions.
- Case method (regularly used by teachers of the programme "InternationalLaw") involves solving the cases and different types of situational problems (case studies with simulation description of real situations, with closed and open story; case illustrations, case problems, case evaluation). This method forms the students' skills in determining the applicable law, legal reasoning. Also, the method allows gaining a number of social skills.
- Method of Playing legal and arbitral proceedings based on the models of International Court of Justice, the European Court of Human Rights, the UN Committee on Human Rights, the Dispute Settlement Body of the WTO, or ICSID arbitration. Method involves two rounds: writing, when students have to prepare memoranda of the parties and speaking, involving legal speech of each party under certain procedural rules (practiced in the disciplines Public International Law, Law of Treaties, Cases on Public International Law, International Human Rights Law). Such method provides considerable amount of skills and social competence.
- The method of presentation of an essay or of a research project forms the students' ability to engage in scientific activities. Priority is given to research work in order to create a new research product, not only when student analyzes the theoretical and practical material, but when he or she is also able to offer and share their vision of the disputed issue.

Individual work of students has a significant role in the process of education; the results of such work can be in different forms:

- Traditional (writing creative essays, participating in colloquia, reviewing additional literature and articles, making presentations);
- specific (reviewing international judicial and quasi-judicial practices, processing and analyzing of legal statistical information, preparing memoranda of the parties, decisions of international courts and tribunals, draft contracts and other international documents). These methods fully meet the objective of training highly qualified specialists with special knowledge and skills in the field of law enforcement.

The innovative teaching methods, market trading, multi-disciplinary quantitative practices along with the specialised software equips students and helps to develop skills necessary for workplace. In particular, flexible learning environment, pro-active delivery approaches have engaged students. The program offers students with rich multi-cultural and international experience. The programmes offer many specialised courses to incorporate contemporary theories, practices and tools to enhance industry specific employability, transferable skills, competence and latest knowledge with a view to equip them with dynamics of changing market. The contribution of international teaching component adds value to the students and graduates on the labour market and therefore improves their employability in terms of learning experience from an international perspective. The international composition of the faculty promotes the acquisition of international competences and skills during the learning process.

Due to the limited number of PhD students, they have very good opportunities to work closely and keep better communications among each other during the classes and out of their academic classes. In accordance with objectives the programme includes participation of the doctorate students in round tables and conferences organized by KAZGUU Research Institutes. Usually 2-3 conferences or round tables per year are held in KAZGUU. Doctorate students obligatory have to participate as speakers. In frame of work of KAZGUU Academy doctorate graduates before presenting Dissertation have to pass Discussion on the Dissertation with Committee of KAZGUU scholars and all doctorate students participate to experience exchange of views. PhD students also have their Academic Club held once per month to discuss research experience and knowledge, discuss changes and issues in National and International Legislation. Members of the Academic Club are doctorate students and graduates.

During foreign internship PhD students are provided with opportunity to get in touch not only with scholars but with doctorate students of Universities - partners.

Being allocated to a supervisor/assessor both in fact and in law secures a continual and intensive professional, methodological and scientific supervision of the doctoral students. A corresponding planning in the time budget is ensured.

State Regulations requires double supervision. In two months after enter the PhD programme student have to discuss and define Dissertation thesis topic and local supervisor and foreign advisor. Academy and University Academic Council approves local supervisor and foreign advisor from Universities partners. Supervisor/advisor has to be scholar in field of PhD student's research or have publications/ researches in certain field, have previous experience in PhD supervision. Mostly local supervisors of current PhD students are Directors of Research Institute. Foreign advisor is appointed to bring certain foreign experience and broaden international foreign research experience.

As state ensures funding of PhD students scholarships, all expenses for supervision including foreign internships of student to advisor and possible visits of foreign advisor are planned in budget for every year.

## Appraisal:

The didactical concept for the PhD programmes is fully aligned with the particular programme objectives, in the view of the panel it is particularly characterised by the systematic

derivation from the qualification objectives. This takes into account a diversity of teaching methods. International guest lecturers are partly involved in the teaching of the programmes. Most of them come from other universities and scientific institutions.

By organising events and participating in conferences and seminars in their university and throughout the foreign internship, KAZGUU promotes the exchange of experiences and research results between the doctoral students within KAZGUU and with the doctoral students from outside the University.

The system of double supervision of the PhD students is regulated in an approved document of KAZGUU. The relation between each student and the two advisors is defined in agreements between all three parties. Detailed requirements for being an advisor ensure that all PhD students receive a professional, methodological and scientific supervision which is necessary for a successful dissertation.

Quality Ratings		Excellent	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
<b>3.</b>	<b>PROGRAMME DESIGN</b>					
3.4	Didactic Concept					
3.4.1	Logic and Comprehensibility of the Didactic Concept		X			
3.4.2	Diversity of the Teaching Methods			X		
3.4.3	Networking of the Doctoral Students			X		
3.4.4	Scientific Supervision			X		

### 3.5 Professional Competencies/Employability

The doctoral programme is intended to convey the doctoral students with professional qualification in the scientific and research oriented fields of activity. The module descriptions designed for the programme are employability-oriented: the intended learning outcomes are relevant for developing employment skills as was expected when the program was developed. The program administration aligns the learning outcomes with regard to the student needs and implementing the steps to improve the employability of the participants, and certain qualifications. Especially the PhD programmes are aiming at closing the gap between academic and research competences. Recent studies and alumni interviews showed that program graduates help each other via networking and share business knowledge even beyond the borders of KAZGUU.

#### Appraisal:

The curricula of the PhD programmes clearly show that the programmes are aimed at preparing the graduates for an academic career. Especially the research practice and the research seminars intend to provide the doctoral students with a professional qualification in their scientific and research fields, which enables them to conduct both research oriented activity and teaching. By means of the theoretical modules, which include application-

oriented content, the students are also prepared for professional, research-related activities in non-academic public and private organisations.

Quality Ratings		Excellent	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
<b>3.</b>	<b>PROGRAMME DESIGN</b>					
3.5	Professional Competencies / Employability			X		

## 4. Scientific Environment and Framework conditions

### 4.1 Teaching Staff

The faculty houses about 20 lectures with Doctor of Law and PhD in Law degrees depending on the particular course requirements. In some cases faculty involve PhD Candidates (PhD graduates) for assistance. Each faculty member is expected to maintain high personal and professional standards of character, and to keep abreast academic discipline through continuing study, research and participation in variety of activities at the University. They are motivated to strive in improvement of teaching effectiveness, to take an interest in the progress and research development of each of students, to keep accurate records of academic standing of each student in classes, and to hand in promptly all reports of grades and other information required by the director or the head of department.

The HSL verifies the qualifications of the faculty members by means of state given (Decree No. 230 of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated on 17<sup>th</sup> of February, 2012 “Regulations of Competitive Hiring and Selection of Faculty and Researchers in the Institutions of Higher Education”) criteria. In addition to these, KAZGUU adopted the following requirements for academically (AQ) status:

To qualify for an AQ status and be eligible to teach in the PhD program a faculty member and supervisor of PhD student should possess

- A PhD or Doctorate degree
- Teaching experience not less than 5 years
- Experience of supervision of postgraduates students (at least 5)
- Participation in research (State Funded Research, International Research Projects, etc.) in accordance with KAZGUU Priorities of Research Development.
- To have publications at least 5 publications in following Law Reviews:
  - Legal Reform in Kazakhstan (Kazakhstan)
  - Zanger - Lawyer (Kazakhstan)
  - Law and State (KAZGUU University) (Kazakhstan)
  - State and Law (Russia)
  - Vestnik MGU. Episode 11, right (Moscow State University Russia)
  - Pravovedenie/ Jurisprudence (Russia)
  - Russian justice (Russia)
  - Computer Law & Security Review (SCOPUS)
  - Forensic Science International (SCOPUS)
  - International Comparative Jurisprudence (SCOPUS)
  - International Review of Law And Economics (SCOPUS)
  - Research In Transportation Business & Management (SCOPUS)

- Aggression And Violent Behavior (SCOPUS)
- Egyptian Journal of Forensic Sciences (SCOPUS)
- Baikal criminological journal (SCOPUS)

The teaching staff has confident international experience and KAZGUU encourage to develop international orientation of their research. Beside an international joint research group most of the lecturers of the faculty do international research, e.g. at the Max Plank Institute for Comparative and International Private Law – Hamburg, Germany. In frame of national educational development for internationalization and integration of research to the international community University actively involves international faculties to give courses in PhD programmes.

The programme management addresses the issues and supports to the students that arise with the learning process. He reacts to any students' complaints during the learning process. It provides in-depth information for students about the programme organisation, schedule, module requirements and expectations, and other necessary details. The faculty support the students within office hours and via Platonus and Email in accordance with the schedule approved. Office hours' information is given in each syllabus. Additional consultancy might be provided by the faculty by appointment if needed.

### Appraisal:

KAZGUU generally defines the structure and number as well as the necessary qualification of teaching staff in accordance with the state requirements.

The structure and number of teaching staff correspond with the requirements of the doctoral programmes. Qualifications and competencies of staff are rated well to meet the requirements for good teaching. Based on information and the CVs of the lecturers involved in the PhD programmes the panel came to the conclusion that the lecturers' research activities correspond with the requirements of the PhD programmes. During the site visit interview with the students the panel learned that the students are satisfied with the competencies of their teachers.

Appointment procedures, which take account of the state requirements as well of the strategic and professional requirements of the University, have been implemented and the procedures are transparent. Measures and mechanisms for personal development and qualification are being further developed.

Internal collaboration and coordination is ensured by the programme's coordinator and can be seen in the meetings of the teaching staff. The faculty members cooperate with each other for the purpose of tuning the modules towards the overall qualification objectives. As affirmed by students of the programme during the on-site visit, the counselling of students by teaching staff is intensive.

Quality Ratings		Excellent	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
4.	<b>ACADEMIC ENVIRONMENT AND FRAMEWORK CONDITIONS</b>					
4.1	Teaching Staff					
4.1.1	Structure and Number of Teaching Staff			X		

4.1.2	Scientific Qualification of the Teaching Staff			x		
4.1.3	Pedagogical Qualification of the Teaching Staff			x		
4.1.4	Internationality of the Teaching Staff			x		
4.1.5	Internal Cooperation within the Faculty		x			

## 4.2 Cooperation and Partnership

As a main legal University in Kazakhstan KAZGUU is the core research center and consultant to the government. KAZGUU scholars work in close cooperation with the Ministry of Justice and others Universities. Every year around 2-3 research conferences are organized in KAZGUU University. As for example, in 2015 KAZGUU organized a number of conferences:

- International Conference on “Actual problems of implementation of international economic treaties and custom regulation in frame of integration to Eurasian Economic Union together with scholars from Universities –partners from Russia, Ukraine, Belorussia, Kyrgyzstan.
- Conference “Actual Problems of State and Law” together with scholars from Universities –partners from Russia, Ukraine, Kyrgyzstan.
- International Conference “Interaction of National and International Law in Public Law: Legal Policy and Legal Regulation (national and international experience)” together with scholars from Universities –partners from Russia, Ukraine, Kyrgyzstan.
- International Conference “Human Rights Protection in Frame of Terrorism Threat” together with OSCE and Soros Foundation. Scholars from all Kazakhstan Universities and foreign universities participated.
- Conference on Legal Education Development jointly with Ministry of Justice, Ministry of Education, General Prosecutor Office and other HEIs.

Doctoral Students are more than encouraged to participate in this conferences as well as others conferences in the country. Moreover every year Doctoral Students together with their supervisor plan the participation of student in no less than one national and one international conferences to integrate scientific community. Therefore, KAZGUU has partnership agreements with more about 60 foreign partners.

### Appraisal:

Cooperation with universities and other academic institutions and networks is actively pursued, which results, among others, in finding suitable international advisors for all PhD students, organising joint study programmes, projects and events, inviting visiting lecturers and student exchanges. The experts find the system of assigning a foreign advisor to PhD students to be a good way to integrate students into the international academic community. Overall, the PhD students seem to be well integrated into the joint research activities with partner institutions.

#### Quality Ratings

Excellent	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
-----------	------------------------------	----------------------------	------------------------------------	--------------

4.	ACADEMIC ENVIRONMENT AND FRAMEWORK CONDITIONS					
4.2	Cooperation and Partnership					
4.2.1	Scientific Integration of the Doctoral Students			x		
4.2.2	Networking the Scientists			x		

### 4.3 Programme Management

The management of the program is carried out by the Director of the program and the Department of Postgraduate Programs in close cooperation with the Academy and Departments of Higher School (depending on the Thesis topic) among which are:

- Department of Civil Law and Civil Procedure
- Department of Public Law
- Department of Criminal Law
- Department of Criminal Procedure
- Department of International Law

The Department of Postgraduate Programmes was especially established to increase and ensure quality management and administrative organization/ coordination of PhD programmes.

The Director of the programme is responsible for the programme academic quality. He is assigned by the Chair of Department from the faculty members and also an AQC member with voting right. His tasks are the academic supervision of the programme, the curriculum design, the promotion and development of research in a relevant field and the development of partnerships with appropriate stakeholders. He is also responsible for the communications with the faculty members and students regarding all issues related to the programme.

Teachers and students are included in the decision-making processes where their areas of work are involved. The administration staff provides professional support in operational management and strategic direction of the graduate administration team including class scheduling, providing reception and enquiries for students and faculty, preparing letters, memoranda, reports, final examinations, preparing class handouts and syllabi, preparing and posting class cancellations and class assignments for faculty, notifying students of class assignments, room changes, and class cancellations, making arrangements for committee meetings and conferences, making internship arrangements for students, providing technical support to faculty in using the e-learning equipment. Administrative support to the students and teaching staff under the program is implemented by the Department of Postgraduate Programs. The Department consists of the Director of Postgraduate Programs, Manager of Academic Development, Manager-tutor, the Analysis and Planning Manager. The Manager of Analysis and Planning is responsible for coordinating the research activities of the students and thesis advisors, organization of work experience internship, planning and analysis of the implementation of the strategic objectives. Manager for Academic Mobility is responsible for searching and implementation of students' foreign internship programs.

The programme documentation which is annually revised and approved is published in

- KAZGUU Catalogue;
- Programme Study Plans (Registrar);
- KAZGUU Academic Policy;
- Programme Description (Platonus, KAZGUU Catalogue, Course Catalogue);
- Diploma Supplement (Registrar);

- KAZGUU Examination Regulations (all offices, Registrar, Platonus);
- Academic Calendar;
- Doctorate Thesis Guidance (all offices, website);
- Code of Conduct (website);
- Department of Postgraduate Programmes / School of Law Brochure
- Course Timetable (Platonus);
- Performance Evaluation Results (University HR);

Current news and information about the study programme are usually published online.

## Appraisal:

Through discussions on-site with with the programme`s coordinator, the staff and the students, the panel concluded that the PhD programmes are properly organised and the overall programme organisation ensures that the programmes run smoothly. Moreover, through the administrative staff, KAZGUU adequately demonstrates that the doctoral students are supported well, the opportunities of electronic service-support are used and that sufficient administrative staff is available.

The study programme is described in detail. This documentation is constantly updated and easily accessible for interested parties both in print and in digital form, which ensures a high level of transparency.

Quality Ratings		Excellent	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
<b>4.</b>	<b>ACADEMIC ENVIRONMENT AND FRAMEWORK CONDITIONS</b>					
4.3	Programm Management					
4.3.1	Structural Organisation			X		
4.3.2	Management Support			X		
4.3.3	Documentation of the Doctoral Programme			X		

## 4.4 Material Resources

KAZGUU offers 26 study rooms equipped with onsite projectors and 40 portable kits of projectors for interactive teaching and learning. 366 computers which all are connected by Intranet can be used by teaching and administrative staff of the Higher Schools. Two independent, symmetrical, unlimited, 32 Mbs/ and 16 Mbs channels provide the University with internet access and also WiFi for students and staff. Furthermore the university offers computer laboratories and multimedia rooms for the students. The whole IT infrastructure has been renewed in 2013. In this context a system of video-conferencing has been implemented which allows the HSE to conduct online lectures and to have meetings and discussions online. The online portal of the University includes a learning platform "Platonus" and a sys-



tem of electronic documents management «Documentolog». Both serve the students to administrate their studies and to access all necessary documents online.

The KAZGUU (database) library includes of over 50,000 volumes of books, e-books, e-journals, articles, periodicals and 393377 items (including periodic publications). Necessary books are available in Russian and English language. During the semester the regular library service hours during semesters are six days a week from Monday to Friday 9:00 – 18:00. Qualified library staff provides assistance to students in searching necessary books, journals or access to international database. Access to relevant digital media is also available from the students' home. The KAZGUU Library is member of the International Association of Users and Designers of Digital Libraries and New Information Technologies (EBNIT Association, Moscow, Russia) and uses a lot of databases based on contracts with the Ministry of Justice etc.

### Appraisal:

The whole equipment of teaching rooms, library and the whole HEI is state-of-the-art. Especially the IT and technical equipment of the labs which allow the students to do their work with the specific components needed impressed the panel very much.

The opening hours of the library take students' needs sufficiently into account. Access to the literature and journals as well as to digital media (e.g. electronic media, databases) is ensured. The literature expressly required for the study programme is available in the library and also kept up to date.

Quality Ratings		Excellent	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
<b>4.</b>	<b>ACADEMIC ENVIRONMENT AND FRAMEWORK CONDITIONS</b>					
4.4	Material Resources					
4.4.1	Quality of the Classrooms and Working Places		X			
4.4.2	Equipment (Literature, Magazines, Databases) for the Library			X		

## 4.5 Finance Planning and Financing

The Financial Model is developed by the Finance Department for five years ahead and reveals positive cash flows. It is based on the assumption that the number of students will not decrease, as the university is not planning to increase the tuition fee except for an adjustment increment by the official inflation rate.

The PhD programme is totally government granted including two foreign internships and visit of foreign advisors. Additionally the state finances monthly scholarships and foreign lecturers visiting the PhD programme.

### Appraisal:

As the University is state-financed, its funding (including teachers, administrative staff, rooms, library and other services) is fully covered and ensured by the Federal budget. The

existing system guarantees, regardless of eventual turnarounds in policy, that every student, once enrolled for the programme, has the possibility to finish his studies.

Furthermore, the higher education institution actively promotes the support of the doctoral students through third parties (foundations, public promotion programmes, third-party funds etc.) and ensures that the doctoral students can sufficiently concentrate on the doctoral degree.

Quality Ratings		Excellent	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
<b>4.</b>	<b>ACADEMIC ENVIRONMENT AND FRAMEWORK CONDITIONS</b>					
4.5	Finance Planning and Financing					
4.5.1	Finance Planning and Financing of the Doctoral Programme			X		
4.5.2	Financial Support and Scholarship Programmes		X			

## 5. QUALITY ASSURANCE

### 5.1 Quality Assurance in terms of Contents, Processes and Results

The Quality Assurance Manager who reports directly to the rector is responsible for the collaboration between the Registrar, Higher School of Economics, Higher School of Law and the School of General Education and the Rector. The programme contents, structures and results are reviewed, analyzed and recommended for changes and improvements by the schools authorized committees/councils and follow the QA procedures defined on the Higher School level.

The responsibilities of the QAM include

- Planning for the academic year QA activities
- Coordinating the implementation of the QA activities
- Collecting data and preparing a summary report on QA
- Communicating the summary report to the Higher Schools and School of General Education
- Forming and organizing the Quality Assurance Committee's work on the university level.

The QAC on the university level is responsible for implementing and monitoring the quality assurance systems that promote academic integrity and effectiveness of the strategy. Quality Assurance of the programmes is done at the Higher Schools levels by the authorized committees or councils. At the schools levels faculty members and students participate in the respective committees to plan and assess the quality assurance and development procedures. The surveys are conducted by the Registrar through the Platonus system. The review is conducted by the QAC. The QAM provides reliable data and analytical reports to the Rector and the Higher Schools Deans for the further use.

The deans of the Higher Schools are responsible for communicating the results of the surveys to the respective faculty members through the Academic Quality Committees/Council on the school level.

The role of the QAC Committee on the university level is

- To develop and implement quality assurance systems and procedures across the full range of the Higher School of Economics, the Higher School of Law and the School of General Education programmes
- To monitor the implementation of quality assurance procedures and processes university-wide.
- To undertake such reviews and audits that are necessary to safeguard the integrity and quality of the university's activities.
- To provide the information and analysis necessary to support decision-making at the university level and within the academic departments
- To advise the academic units on the quality implications of proposals, policies and strategic plans.

### Appraisal:

A quality assurance and development procedure, which systematically and continuously monitors and develops the quality of the programme with respect to its contents, processes, and outcomes, has been set up. It takes into account the evaluation results and the analysis on student workload, success rate, and graduate employment. Faculty members and students participate in the respective committees to plan and assess the quality assurance and development procedures. Responsibilities are clearly defined.

Quality Ratings		Excellent	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
<b>5.</b>	<b>QUALITY ASSURANCE</b>					
5.1	Quality Assurance in terms of Contents, Processes and Results			X		

## 5.2 Inclusion of Quality Assurance in a Superordinate Quality Concept

Quality Assurance of the Doctorate Programmes goes in line with University Quality Assurance Procedure. Moreover Doctorate Programmes annually review by Committee of KAZGUU Academy of Fundamental and Applied Studies, research activity of Doctorate Students presented to Committee and controlled by KAZGUU scholars at the end of each year.

### Appraisal:

The quality assurance of the doctoral programme is systematically embedded in the quality concept for the research of the faculty and the higher education institution.

Quality Ratings		Excellent	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
<b>5.</b>	<b>QUALITY ASSURANCE</b>					

5.2	Inclusion of Quality Assurance in a Superordinate Quality Concept			X		
-----	---	--	--	---	--	--

### 5.3 Evaluation by Doctoral Students

The Registrar Office conducts a teaching quality evaluation by students at the end of each semester, namely one week before the end of classes. The questionnaire called the Questionnaire of the Assessment of Quality of Work of the Teacher covers questions regarding the workload, the quality of teaching staff, learning materials etc.. quality of classes (lectures, seminars); literacy degree; extensive knowledge and preparedness of faculty; availability of materials and understanding of them by students; creative approach towards the classes; public speaking skills; content of the classes; appearance, manners, inner culture; being late for the classes and failures of classes by the faculty members.

According to the survey results of students on the quality of organization of the learning process, about 83.5% of students are satisfied with quality of learning where as 16.5% ones are not satisfied.

The survey results are processed by the Registrar and collected by the QAM. The QAM forwards the survey results to the HSL Dean who organizes a meeting and discusses the teaching evaluation results with the relevant members. The results of the committee discussion are communicated to the programmes' coordinators and the relevant faculty members. At the beginning of each semester the school dean conducts a meeting with students in the form of an open forum with a presentation which covers the teaching evaluation results and the measures taken to address the students concerns and recommendations. The results in an aggregated format are also published on the Platonus system.

#### Appraisal:

Evaluation by the students is carried out on a regular basis and in accordance with a prescribed procedure; the outcomes are communicated to the students and provide input for the quality development process.

Quality Ratings		Excellent	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
5.	<b>QUALITY ASSURANCE</b>					
5.3	Evaluation by Doctoral Students			X		

### 5.4 Evaluation by Supervisors

The faculty members can complete a questionnaire, the results are collected by the QAM to include them into the summary report and to discuss the results by the Quality Assurance Committee with the administration of the university.

## Appraisal:

Quality control by the faculty is carried out on a regular basis and in accordance with a prescribed procedure; the outcomes are communicated and provide input for the quality development process.

Quality Ratings		Excellent	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
<b>5.</b>	<b>QUALITY ASSURANCE</b>					
5.4	Evaluation by Supervisors			X		

## 5.5 Evaluation by Third Parties (Graduates, external Peers, Stakeholders etc.)

The survey for alumni is conducted on a continuous basis through the university website. The results are collected once a year by the HSE and addressed with the AQC/QAC. The survey aims to reveal the graduates' employment data. The academic quality issues with regard to the programme content and structure are also revealed through the Alumni Club meetings.

The programmes' academic quality evaluation by employers is given through the HSE Business Advisory Council.

## Appraisal:

There is a regular external evaluation according to a predefined procedure; the results are discussed internally and find their way into the process of quality development.

Quality Ratings		Excellent	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
<b>5.</b>	<b>QUALITY ASSURANCE</b>					
5.5	Evaluation by Third Parties (Graduates, external Peers, Stakeholders etc.)			X		

# Quality Profile

Institution: KAZGUU University

Doctoral programme: Doctor of Philosophy in Law (PhD)



Quality Ratings		Excellent	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
<b>1.</b>	<b>STRATEGY AND OBJECTIVES</b>					
1.1	Objectives of the Doctoral Programme			X		
1.2	Positioning of the Doctoral Programme in the education market		X			
1.3	Positioning of the Doctoral Programme in the Job Market for Graduates					
1.3.1	In the research fields		X			
1.3.2	Outside the research fields			X		
1.4	The positioning of the Doctoral Programme in the Strategic Concept of the Higher Education Institution		X			
1.5	Gender Equality and Equal Opportunities		X			
<b>2.</b>	<b>ADMISSION</b>					
2.1	Admission conditions and procedures		X			
2.2	Selection procedure					X
2.3	Transparency of the Decision on Admission			X		
<b>3.</b>	<b>IMPLEMENTATION</b>					
3.1	Structure					
3.1.1	Structural Setup of the Doctoral Programme			X		
3.1.2	Doctoral Degree Regulation			X		
3.1.3	Status of the Doctoral Students			X		
3.1.4	Module Description			X		
3.2	Contents					

3.2.1	Logic and Conceptual Consistency		x			
3.2.2	Science and Research Based Teaching		x			
3.2.3	Focus of the Curriculum on Qualification and Competency Development		x			
3.2.4	Technical Offers			x		
3.2.5	Multidisciplinary Qualifications			x		
3.3	Examination Procedures					
3.3.1	Examination		x			
3.3.2	Organisation of the Examination Procedure			x		
3.4	Didactic Concept					
3.4.1	Logic and Comprehensibility of the Didactic Concept		x			
3.4.2	Diversity of the Teaching Methods			x		
3.4.3	Networking of the Doctoral Students			x		
3.4.4	Scientific Supervision			x		
3.5	Professional Competencies / Employability		x			
<b>4.</b>	<b>SCIENTIFIC ENVIRONMENT AND FRAMEWORK CONDITIONS</b>					
4.1	Teaching Staff					
4.1.1	Structure and Number of Teaching Staff			x		
4.1.2	Scientific Qualification of the Teaching Staff			x		
4.1.3	Pedagogical Qualification of the Teaching Staff			x		
4.1.4	Internationality of the Teaching Staff			x		
4.1.5	Internal Cooperation within the Faculty		x			
4.2	Cooperation and Partnership					
4.2.1	Scientific Integration of the Doctoral Students			x		
4.2.2	Networking the Scientists			x		
4.3	Programme Management					
4.3.1	Structural Organisation			x		

4.3.2	Management Support			x		
4.3.3	Documentation of the Doctoral Programme			x		
4.4	Material Resources					
4.4.1	Quality of the Classrooms and Working Places		x			
4.4.2	Equipment (Literature, Magazines, Databases) for the Library			x		
4.5	Finance Planning and Financing					
4.5.1	Finance Planning and Financing of the Doctoral Programm			x		
4.5.2	Financial Support and Scholarship Programms		x			
<b>5.</b>	<b>QUALITY ASSURANCE</b>					
5.1	Quality Assurance in terms of Contents, Processes and Results			x		
5.2	Inclusion of Quality Assurance in a Superordinate Quality Concept			x		
5.3	Evaluation by Doctoral Students			x		
5.4	Evaluation by Supervisors			x		
5.5	Evaluation by Third Parties (Graduates, external Peers, Stakeholders etc.)			x		



