

Decision of the FIBAA Accreditation Committee for Programmes



110th Meeting on 21 March 2019

Project Number: 15/117
Higher Education Institution: KAZGUU University, Business School
Location: Astana, Kazakhstan
Study Programme: Doctor of Business Administration
Type of Accreditation: Initial Accreditation

The FIBAA Accreditation Committee for Programmes has taken the following decisions:

According to § 12 (2) in conjunction with § 16 (1) of the “Special Conditions for awarding the FIBAA Quality Seal for Programme Accreditation “FIBAA Programme Accreditation””, the study programme is accredited.

Period of Accreditation: 21 March 2019 until the end of spring semester 2024

The FIBAA Quality Seal is awarded.



**FOUNDATION FOR INTERNATIONAL
BUSINESS ADMINISTRATION ACCREDITATION**

FIBAA – BERLINER FREIHEIT 20-24 – D-53111 BONN

Assessment Report

Higher Education Institution (HEI):
KAZGUU University, Business School
Astana, Kazakhstan

Doctoral programme:
Doctor of Business Administration

Brief description of the doctoral programme:

The study programme Doctor of Business Administration (DBA) aims at educating students in management and research. Students shall be enabled to pursue positions of leadership in research, in business, industry or government or positions of teachers and researchers in scientific institutions. The study programme consists of theoretical training in the first year and writing a dissertation as well as scientific articles for two more years. The DBA programme has a special focus on the combination of practice and research on a national and international basis.

Date of filing the self-documentation: September 6, 2018

Date of On-Site Assessment: September 18 / 19, 2018

Type of accreditation: Initial accreditation

Accredited with study programme: Master of Business Administration (MBA)

Duration of Study: 3 years

Starting Date of the Doctoral Programmes: 2014

Programme cycle starts in: Winter semester and summer semester

Date of the Meeting of FIBAA-Accreditation Commission: March 21, 2019

Resolution:

The panel members recommend: The accreditation of the doctoral programme Doctor of Business Administration is valid for five years.

Duration of Accreditation period: March 21, 2019 until the end of spring semester 2024.

Project Manager:

Dr. Birger Hendriks

Panel members:**Prof. Dr. Meruyert Narenova**

University of International Business, Almaty, Kazakhstan
Academic Director of the MSc and PhD programmes on Economics and Management,
expert for MBA programmes

Prof. Dr. Thomas Peisl

University of Applied Sciences Munich, Germany
Professor for Business Administration and Management,
expert for MBA and DBA programmes

Dr. Loretta O'Donnell

Nazarbayev University
Vice Provost Academic Affairs
(Leadership, Managerial skills, Change Management, Human capital Analysis in Financial
Markets, Corporate Sustainability)

Dr. Ekkehard Hermsdorf

AutoVision GmbH, Hannover, Germany
Project Manager for quality assurance (Certification, Business Administration)

Sebastian Kuch

University of Hohenheim, Germany
Research assistant and doctoral student

Summary

The panels' assessment considers the self-assessment, the results of the on-site visit and the statement of the KAZGUU University to the assessment report.

Procedural it should be noted, that the doctoral programme has been assessed as a programme which has been already started.

The doctoral programme Doctor of Business Administration (DBA) of the KAZGUU University fulfils the FIBAA quality requirements for doctoral programmes and can be accredited by the Foundation for International Business Administration Accreditation (FIBAA). It is in accordance with the National and the European Qualifications Framework in their applicable version valid at the time of opening of the procedure. It has a modular structure and has been assigned ECTS points. The degree is awarded by the higher education institution.

The panel members identify development potential for the programme in:

- a stronger focus on research-methodology within the curriculum (see chapter 3.2),
- including digital research and digital expertise into the curriculum (see chapter 3.2),
- intensifying foreign experience (see chapter 4.1).

The measures the KAZGUU University eventually takes in order to implement the recommendations of the panel members are to be considered in the context of the re-accreditation.

Furthermore, a set of criteria exists, which exceed the quality requirements:

- equipment for the library (see chapter 4.4),
- evaluation by doctoral students (see chapter 5.3)
- evaluation by third parties (see chapter 5.5).

For the overall assessment please refer to the quality profile at the end of this report.

Information on the Institution

The Kazakh State Law Institute was established by the Decree of the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan N.A. Nazarbayev on March 14, 1994. The Institute set an objective to prepare highly qualified lawyers, capable in terms of socio-economic reforms to ensure legal reform in the country.

By the Decree of the Government Kazakh State Law Institute was renamed as Kazakh State Law University and transferred to the jurisdiction under the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan on 5 November 1996. After a merger with the Institute of State and Law of National Academy of Sciences of the Republic of Kazakhstan the university was renamed on February 14, 2000 to Kazakh State Academy of Law. In 2015 it was renamed as " M. Narikbayev KAZGUU University", which is now a joint-stock company.

Located in Kazakhstan's capital, KAZGUU is one of the largest humanitarian universities of Kazakhstan with more than 5 000 students, 1000 academic and research staff.

KAZGUU comprises four Schools: The Higher School of Law, the Higher School of Economics, the Higher School of General Education and the Business School. It offers a wide range of Bachelor's degree programmes at 17 fields of studies in law, economics and business, human services and social sciences. Furthermore, KAZGUU organizes Master's degree programmes in law, economics and translation services including an MBA programme and Doctoral programmes in law and in Business Administration programme (DBA).

The mission of the University is to contribute to the development of the society through the pursuit of education, learning and research at the highest international levels of excellence. The aim of the University is to equip students with the necessary knowledge for leading positions in the sphere of law, economics and humanities in the Republic of Kazakhstan and abroad.

On December 26, 2013 KAZGUU has been accredited as a subject of state-funded scientific and (or) scientific-technical activities (certificate No. 003645 issued by the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan).

The MBA and DBA study programmes are organized by the KAZGUU Business School (KBS).

In 2017, the first 11 doctoral students graduated from the DBA programme.

Description and appraisal in Detail

1. Goals and Strategy

1.1 Objectives of the Doctoral Programme

The DBA degree programme focuses on training students at an advanced level in specific fields of study in order to enable them to pursue positions of leadership in research, in business, industry and government. Indirectly the programme can have an impact on further developments of national business and public administration.

The DBA programme is designed to be in line with the criteria of level 8 of the European Qualification Framework (EQF). This requires for the graduates to have

- demonstrated knowledge and understanding at the most advanced frontier of a field of work or study and at the interface between fields,
- the most advanced and specialised skills and techniques, including synthesis and evaluation, required to solve critical problems in research and/or innovation and to extend and redefine existing knowledge or professional practice,
- to communicate information, ideas, problems and solutions to both specialist and non-specialist audiences and
- to demonstrate substantial authority, innovation, autonomy, scholarly and professional integrity and sustained commitment to the development of new ideas or processes at the forefront of work or study contexts including research.

The DBA programme of KBS aims at providing doctoral candidates with knowledge and skills, which will be demonstrated in the following learning outcomes:

- to demonstrate advanced knowledge and systematic understanding of the business theories and the ability to critically apply to contemporary business issues;
- to synthesize fundamental crucial issues related to the local business equipped with a comparative analysis of international experience;
- to identify and communicate research problems and apply quantitative and qualitative research methods implemented in business research to solve business issues;
- to identify new methods of research and their implementation and application in business and to coordinate them with current managerial experience;
- to apply legal critical thinking analyses, evaluation and synthesis of new findings into researches and to apply this experience to their workplace;
- to implement these skills in independent research in the field of leadership, management, business, innovation, organizational behaviour and integrity.

Appraisal:

Comparing the intended learning outcomes of the study programme with the descriptors of the EQF the doctoral programme corresponds to the goals of both frameworks. The doctoral programme and the pursued qualification and competency goals are matched with each other.

Quality Ratings		Excellent	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
1.	STRATEGY AND OBJECTIVES					
1.1	Objectives of the Doctoral Programme			X		

1.2 Positioning of the Doctoral Programme in the education market

The DBA Programme of KAZGUU University was launched in 2014 and remains the only DBA programme in Astana with State Diploma. It became popular among public service staff and managers of national companies who want to make theory-based research using their empirical data and implement changes in their current local industries or public service institution. KBS gives the opportunity to implement research activities under supervision of international professionals with academic and practical experience and local researches. Thereby this programme provides opportunities to conduct researches on business with business law and practice in economics.

Appraisal:

The DBA study programme is positioned convincingly in the postgraduate education market due to the described profile and the pursued qualification and competency goals.

Quality Ratings		Excellent	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
1.	STRATEGY AND OBJECTIVES					
1.2	Positioning of the Doctoral Programme in the educational market			X		

1.3 Positioning of the Doctoral Programme in the Job Market for Graduates

The DBA programme has a special focus on the professional qualification for practice and research. In Kazakhstan because of the lack of DBA graduates and researchers in management and business the DBA programme as such became very popular. The job market has strong demands for scholars who will be able to contribute to the business-making process. Due to the demand of the job market the doctoral programmes mostly focused on the spheres of state administration and big companies. The graduates of this study programme are employed in the following fields:

Employments	No of Graduates	%
KAZGUU University	2	19%
Other HEIs	1	9%
Public Sector (Ministries, State Agencies)	3	27%
Private Sector	5	45%
Total	11	100%

Employment of the DBA graduates

Appraisal:

Starting point for the panel of experts is the general concept of a DBA study programme: In contrast to a theory-oriented PhD the significant orientation of a DBA is the use of theoretical knowledge in practice. A DBA study programme is addressed to managerial professionals with management experience.

Against this backdrop the DBA programme of KBS has on one hand a focus on professional qualification for science and research; it is positioned convincingly due to the described profile and the pursued focus of research. On the other hand, it is also strongly positioned outside the science and research field by considering the professional qualification for employment due to the described profile and the pursued focus of research.

Quality Ratings		Excellent	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
1.3	Positioning of the Doctoral Programme in the Job Market for Graduates					
1.3.1	in the research fields			X		
1.3.2	outside the research fields			X		

1.4 Positioning of the Doctoral Programme in the Strategic Concept of the Higher Education Institution

The DBA programme has been developed in coherence with the University Strategy 2013-2020, which is a cornerstone for development of KBS as well. KAZGUU University is building on its reputation for resilience and flexibility to cement a research-driven culture at the core of its development.

Following the mission and the university strategy the programme's objectives explicitly consider the need of the educational market. Some of the goals of the University strategy underline providing international standards of education as well as establishing strong relations with international universities.

KAZGUU University intends to be a research University and as the DBA is the only doctoral programme in the field of business, its development and success have a priority for the University. Therefore, DBA students are strongly encouraged to work as assistants to professors in connection with their dissertation thesis research.

Ultimately, the DBA programme has the mission to realize a central goal of the KAZGUU Strategy – namely to educate and prepare professional scholars for the state in advanced business abilities that allow the graduates to take responsibility for and to contribute to the implementation of business development in Kazakhstan as a country with an emerging economy.

Appraisal:

The goal-oriented integration of the programme in the strategic concept of KAZGUU University is described and presented in a comprehensive manner. The study programme's qualification goals correspond to the University concept and are sustainably implemented.

Quality Ratings		Excellent	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
1.4	The Positioning of the Doctoral Programme in the Strategic Concept of the Higher Education Institution			X		

1.5 Gender Equality and Equal Opportunities

KAZGUU offers courses to an internationally diverse student body taught by diverse faculty. A special attention is given to foreign students and those with disabilities, especially regarding extra measures and organisational activities. KAZGUU and its admission department identify any special educational needs for students including the students with disabilities and make appropriate provisions for meeting those needs.

KAZGUU's core values include a commitment to the care for the well-being of all members of the KAZGUU community – including students, faculty, and staff – regardless of their nationality, religion, gender or other factors, such as physical disability, special needs, or capacity to pay the required tuition. KAZGUU adopted the following core values:

- Honesty, integrity, professionalism, and personal responsibility;
- Respecting diversity and appreciating cross-cultural perspectives;
- Learner-centred teaching and student engagement that fosters intellectual vitality, critical thinking for learning and continuing professional development.

KAZGUU University provides transparent policies and equal opportunities to all students including the DBA students. Carrying out the programme up to now there have been no students with disabilities. But KAZGUU is ready to offer all necessary equal opportunities for those with disabilities. This includes the possibility of compensations for disabled students in terms of temporal and formal requirements as well as for testing procedures.

KAZGUU does not discriminate any students regardless of the individual's race, colour, religion, religious creed, ancestry, national origin, age, sexual orientation, marital status, medical condition and disability, and otherwise as permitted by the legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan. The University will try to accommodate those with disabilities, if possible, within the constraints of the operating budget.

Appraisal:

The higher education institution fulfils its tasks in this doctoral programme by promoting gender equality and the enforcement of general prohibitions on discrimination. The DBA programme along with other programmes of KAZGUU University provides transparent policies and offers equal opportunities to all students. A claim for disadvantage compensation for disabled students in terms of temporal and formal requirements in the programme as well as for all concluding or accompanied certificates of achievement and within the framework of aptitude testing procedures is ensured.

Quality Ratings		Excellent	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
1.5	Gender Equality and Equal Opportunities			X		

2. ADMISSION

The general rules of admission of applicants are laid down in chapter 3 of the “Academic Policy of KAZGUU University”. These rules and examination procedures are regularly updated, published and described on the University website. The admission requirements are implemented in accordance with the normative and legislative document “The Standard Rules of Admission to Educational Institutions”, adopted by the decree of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan on January 19, 2012 as well as with the educational guidance for higher education published on the official legislative website.

KBS seeks prospective students who have demonstrated academic excellence, personal and professional leadership potential to succeed. Admitted are students irrespective of color, national or ethnic origin, sex, age, disability, religion, sexual orientation and gender identity to all the rights, privileges, programmes and activities generally accorded or made available to students at the university.

The candidate must apply directly to the University Admission Office. To register for the DBA programme the applicant must submit several documents to the Admission Committee, among others:

- an application addressed to the Rector of the University,
- an individual study plan to be discussed and signed by a national or international research advisor,
- a copy of an MBA or diploma certificate confirming a scientific degree,
- a copy of an international language certificate (if acquired),
- a list of scientific papers and instructive researches,
- a personal record sheet of employment,
- a curriculum vitae.

The admission is also based on entry examinations results. They include a foreign language examination and a subject examination. In 2018 the Ministry of Education and Science (MES) changed the entry regulations for the programmes taught in Kazakh or Russian and English. For the English language the examination in the format of IELTS was implemented.

The MES issues a certificate with the grade received based on the test-results. To be admitted to the second entry subject examination, an applicant should have received results of not less than 50 points. Citizens of the Republic of Kazakhstan, who have international language certificates with the results of 100 points according to a 100-point-grade scale, are exempted from passing the foreign language examination.

In the second stage applicants must write an essay. An interview with the applicant is conducted by the Director of the school together with the Coordinator of the Programme. Candidates should justify their intention to study the DBA programme. A structured interview guideline with defined questions has not been elaborated.

Proceeded studies abroad or at other universities in Kazakhstan shall be recognised as far as the Admission Committee agrees based on a nostrification procedure.

The KBS staff offers a Student Counselling Service for prospective students on all relevant issues starting from admission to outcomes of the programme. They aim at helping them to handle any difficulties they may be experiencing, to develop academic and personal potential. The service offers free and confidential support and guidance to optimize the applicants' chances for obtaining admission to the University. The applicants can make an appointment for a one-to-one service or make enquiries about the admission procedure. They will be advised by experienced professionals. The respective telephone numbers are published on the

University's website, also. Applicants can ask questions via email and will get an immediate answer. This is possible during the period from April to June. The KBS staff will give informative presentations on the admission requirements, on entry examinations as well as on programmes for staff of companies and for final-year students.

The admission decision is based on the above-mentioned criteria. Admitted and rejected students receive an official letter from the KAZGUU administration. The applicant can receive a consultation by phone or have an online consultancy.

In case, an applicant hesitates about his or her choice of the programme, he or she is advised to change to a different one. In case, an applicant is not confident about his or her abilities to complete the chosen programme successfully, he or she may withdraw the documents without any penalties.

Appraisal:

The Admission conditions and procedures of KAZGUU University are properly defined and transparent. The selection procedure satisfies the legal requirements. The decision on admission is based on transparent criteria and is clearly communicated; rejections are reasoned. The responsibilities are clearly regulated. The quality criteria are met.

Quality Ratings		Excellent	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
2.	ADMISSION					
2.1	Admission conditions and procedures			X		
2.2	Selection Procedure			X		
2.3	Transparency of the Decision on Admission			X		

3. Implementation

3.1 Structure

The DBA programme consists of two main parts: the first part with different educational courses and the second part with research and writing a dissertation.

Based on the Government Regulation on The Doctoral Degree (as of February 3, 2010) the doctoral study programme is seen as a postgraduate education aimed at personal training for scientific, pedagogical and / or professional activities. Those who completed the DBA study programme with all requirements are awarded a state diploma with an academic degree "Doctor of Business Administration" and an appendix to the diploma indicating a list of studied disciplines with assessment and number of disbursed loans according to the work curriculum.

Based on the MES-Order dating October 24, 2014 No. 441, the essential legal requirements for the DBA study programme are the following:

- The programme is designed to train managers and senior managers with practical experience as well as those who are interested in conducting applied research to develop modern management concepts and models.
- It has a duration of at least 3 years.
- The structure of the DBA programme contains two equivalent components: studies and research.
- The programme must be offered in a modular format. The educational and research work is measured in credits.
- It must cover two or more disciplines.
- Students must absolve a module abroad with a visit to a foreign university, which can also be a partner university of KAZGUU.
- The curriculum of the educational part considers the features and principles of business and management in Kazakhstan as well as of international businesses and foreign management experience.
- This part should include computer simulations, business games, case studies, psychological and other trainings, consultations and discussions on the results of applied projects for developing managerial skills.
- The research work should make a significant contribution to the development of the business environment and of the economy of the country.
- The research component of the DBA programme is derived from the applied research work of the doctoral candidate, which should influence the publications and the doctoral thesis.
- The results of the candidate's research must be published in at least seven scientific publications in journals, at least three of them in scientific journals of foreign countries. They also should be presented at international scientific conferences.
- Research work should be based on modern theoretical, methodological and technological achievements of science and practice.

In addition, the MES-Order defines 21 required learning outcomes for the DBA study programme. These detailed outcomes refer to the following subjects:

- Management
- Marketing
- Finance
- Financial and management accounting.

The DBA programme of KBS has all in all a workload of 180 ECTS¹ credits and a duration of 3 years. The educational courses are designed for the first year and with a workload of 60 ECTS credits. They have been developed with reference to the ECTS, linked in the programme's objectives. The programme is structured in modules / courses, which aim at learning outcomes. The courses are divided into core and elective ones. All of them have a workload of 6 credits each. Some of these courses with theoretical studies are focused on research, including 6 ECTS credits that are allocated for an international internship at a foreign partner university. Furthermore, they are oriented at the development of skills in the field of business research, as well as of personal leadership qualities.

Core courses are on:

- Research Methods
- Quantitative and Qualitative Methods of Business Research
- Leadership and Motivation
- Advanced Topics in Strategic Management

Elective courses are on:

- Advanced Topics in Management

¹ European Credit Transfer and Accumulation System

- Advanced Topic in Business Law
- Advanced Topics in Global Marketing
- Advanced Topics in Financial Management
- Advanced Topics in Organizational Behaviour

	Semester	ECTS credits
Core Courses (18)		
Research Methods	1	6
Quantitative and Qualitative methods of Business Research	1	6
Leadership and Motivation	1	6
Elective courses (12 ECTS)		
Advanced Topic in Business Law	1	6
Advanced Topics in Global Marketing	1	6
Core Courses (6 ECTS)		
Advanced Topics in Strategic Management	2	6
Elective courses (24 ECTS)		
Advanced Topics in Financial Management	2	6
Advanced Topics in Management	2	6
Advanced Topics in Organizational Behaviour	2	6
International Internship	2	6
Total Theoretical Training		60
Research work, including doctoral dissertation	(1,2,)3,4,5,6	110
Final certification		10
Comprehensive exam	6	2
Design and defence of doctoral dissertation	6	8
Total		180

Structural setup of DBA programme

The second and the third year are dedicated to research and contain the main load in writing the doctoral thesis with a workload of 110 credits. The final exam with the presentation of the doctoral dissertation is calculated with 10 credits.

The candidate starts elaborating the dissertation from the beginning of the study programme onwards. This happens in coordination with a local supervisor and an international advisor. The candidate also goes on an overseas research internship be it to work with an overseas consultant or for other research activities. This can be in Russia, Switzerland, Malaysia or

another country. For the international Internship the students search country and institution themselves.

After the end of the second year of study, candidates are required to submit the first draft of the doctoral dissertation to the Dissertation Council. In the third year, the candidate is fully working on the completion of the thesis. Not later than 3 months before the expected date of the defence the reviews of the research supervisor, of the foreign advisor and of the Dissertation Council of KBS are provided. After a successful completion of the state exam and the defence procedure, the doctoral student receives a degree of Doctor of Business Administration. It was not possible to clarify whether the MES-requirement of publishing seven scientific articles in journals is a prerequisite for receiving this degree.

The course / module descriptions and learning objectives correlate with the learning objectives of the programme. These contain detailed information on the learning outcomes and the acquisition of skills. The learning objectives guide students to manage their workloads and help acquire the necessary skills to be a professional in the relevant field of business work and management.

The module descriptions designed for the programme are employability oriented: The intended learning outcomes develop employment skills. The DBA programme aims at closing the gap between academic and research competences. Recent studies and alumni interviews showed that programme graduates help each other via networking and share business knowledge even beyond the borders of KAZGUU. Part of the curriculum are case-studies.

The programme shall enable the students to actively apply the acquired skills in new areas of work and to develop them further. It is systematically oriented towards meeting the anticipated requirements of the dynamic job market. For this KBS makes use of the results of graduate evaluations.

Appraisal:

The panel of experts has the opinion, that in general a DBA-programme is addressed to professional decision-makers with rich management experience. The graduate will be able to publish in academic journals. The students learn methodological tools that are necessary to generate new knowledge as an academic. Other than an MBA student a DBA student creates rather than reads a case-study. This means that the theoretical part of the DBA study programme should be focused on methodological aspects, on writing techniques, on broadening and extending the capability profile of students rather than deepening their existing knowledge. This will enable the students to successfully write a dissertation.

Having this in mind the structure of the DBA programme of KBS is properly in accordance with the Kazakh legal requirements as described above. KBS has covered the main learning outcomes required by the MES in the above-mentioned order No. 441, which defines the requirements of a doctoral programme. In the first year the university offers theoretical courses, the following two years are dedicated to research activities and the dissertation.

The range of courses in the modules are described according to content, scope/ duration, required reading, degree and the qualifications/ competencies (outcome oriented) to be achieved.

However, the panel of experts has the view, that the MES-requirements described above are overloaded with additional theoretical learning outcomes in several subjects rather than focussing on research techniques in the fields of management and business. Furthermore, the experts see the obligation of students to publish seven articles within a short time as not real-

istic. This requirement for DBA students to publish seven articles is likely to encourage them to focus on quantity rather than quality.

In the statement on this assessment report KBS confirms the appraisal of the panel that publishing seven articles within a short time is very difficult for the DBA students.

After all the experts recommend that the MES adjusts the DBA requirements to a focus on research-oriented outcomes. The obligation to publish seven articles while writing the dissertation should be reduced. This will also enable students to absolve their state exam and to receive the academic degree of a Doctor of Business Administration which is by now not possible in every case.

Quality Ratings		Excellent	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
3.	PROGRAMME DESIGN					
3.1	Structure					
3.1.1	Structural Setup of the Doctoral Programme			X		
3.1.2	Doctoral Degree Regulations			X		
3.1.3	Status of the Doctoral Students			X		
3.1.4	Module Description			X		

3.2 Content

At the beginning of their study students start working on their individual work plan for three years. In the first year the courses of the DBA programme are conducted as part of a series of training modules on specific topics and are structured around the independent and individual research projects. Following the module-descriptions and the curriculum the first semester starts with courses on

- “Research Methods”, which includes a seminar on writing a doctoral dissertation and research, an analysis and a training on writing articles in the relevant field of scientific research. This course gives students understanding of what research is and how it is done. It also introduces some of the key issues associated with doctoral research and writing;
- “Quantitative and Qualitative Methods of Business Research”; the module focuses on the application of research methodology to solve complex problems for business in practice. The objective of this module is to present various research methods and examples of how they can be applied to management issues and issues related to the collection and analysis of qualitative and quantitative data;
- “Leadership and Motivation”; the aim of the course is very practical: to help students become more effective managers and leaders in any professional and social situation. Students shall be able to plan and implement the development of their leadership skills required in any business, public administration and the non-governmental sector;
- Advanced Topics in Business Law; this course allows participants being non-lawyers to obtain knowledge and understanding of the legal coordinates system in which en-

trepreneurial activity is carried out, and violation of the established rules leads to negative consequences;

- Global Marketing; this course examines several factors that contribute to or require the use of globalization strategies for large companies, especially transnational companies.

In the second semester these modules are followed by courses dealing with Advanced Topics in

- Strategic Management; the content of the course reflects a variety of strategy frameworks and methodologies. The main task of this course is to drill the doctoral students in the methods of crafting a well-conceived strategy and executing it competently;
- Financial Management as a general management, which is considered from the point of view of specific management actions;
- Organizational Behaviour; this course deals with the interaction of individuals and groups: how do they interact in organizations to reach goals and objectives. Special attention is paid to problems faced by business organizations;
- Management: the application of modern methods of management creates new opportunities of efficiency and competitiveness.

Curriculum of the DBA programme

Modul No	title of Module/ course Unit	credit points						workload		method of teaching i.e. lecture course, seminar	form and duration of Examinations	weight of exam related to final grade
		1	2	3	4	5	6	Hous in Class	Hous Self-Study			
Core Course -12 ECTS credits												
MMI7201	Research Methods	6						40	120	L/S	Exam Paper (120 min)	
KKMBI7203	Quantitative and Qualitative methods of Business Research	6						40	120	L/S	Exam Paper (120 min)	
LM7301	Leadership and Motivation	6						40	120	L/S	Exam Paper (120 min)	
Electives- 6 ECTS credits												
PSB7208	Advanced Topic in Business Law	6						40	120	L/S	Exam Paper (120 min)	
GM7204	Advanced Topics in Global Marketing	6						40	120	L/S	Project	
2 semester												
Core Course -12 ECTS credits												
SmenISP7202	Advanced Topics in Strategic Management	6						40	120	L/S	Project	
Electives- 23 ECTS credits												
FM7205	Advanced Topics in Financial Management	6						40	120	L/S	Project	
Men7207	Advanced Topics in Management	6						40	120	L/S	Project	
OP7302	Advanced Topics in Organizational Behavior	6						40	120	L/S	Project	
ZM7206	International Internship	6						40	120		Project	
	Research work, including doctoral dissertation			27	28	28	27					
	Final examination (5)							10				
	Comprehensive exam (2)							2			Exam Paper	100/100
	Design and defines of doctoral dissertation							8			Doctoral dissertation	100/100

L Lecture 400

S Seminar 1200

For the theoretical educational training during the first two semesters, the curriculum overview shows a workload of 60 ECTS credits. This training is followed by writing the doctoral thesis during the semesters 3 to 6 with a workload of overall 110 ECTS credits. The examination finalises the studies with 10 ECTS credits.

The teachers reflect and include the current status of scientific knowledge in the different courses, oriented to the objectives of the DBA programme that are described above (in chap-

ter 1.1). In October 2018 KBS has decided to increase the training on the methodology of research in some of the courses.

During the on-site visit individual alumni reported, that they had not received enough training on writing techniques and on writing scientific articles. On the other hand, KBS underlines that DBA students can count on the assistance of their supervisors, specifically during the second and third year of study. Supervisors are in close contact with the students and monitoring and giving support while students are preparing their works for scientific journals. All DBA students are usually informed about the specific requirements on the number of articles and the scope of work in general before their study begins. During the course "Research Methods" students learn how to analyse and collect data for the research and for articles, how to write the articles and how to use the methods of research. In addition, during the first year of study students have access to non-obligatory courses such as "Academic Writing". Furthermore, in every semester KAZGUU organizes seminars and workshops for doctoral students on publishing articles in international journals as well as on training for using citations correctly.

In the statement on this report KBS gives the following information: The structure of the DBA programme has undergone some changes since October 2018 (after the onsite-visit) in terms of the content of elective courses. In some of them, such as Advanced Business Law, Advanced Topics in Strategic Management and in Global Marketing KBS will increase the focus on research methodology in specific fields. Obligatory courses such as Leadership and Motivation cannot be changed in a sense of more research.

Multidisciplinary qualifications are reflected in the general curriculum. In the first and second semester of the DBA programme students are introduced to a variety of subjects of their choice, such as advanced topics in the field of financial management and advanced topics in business law.

Appraisal:

The concept of the doctoral programme (profile elements, unique selling points etc.) and the concrete implementation of the learning objectives are matched with each other. The competency concerning enhanced participation in the research field is an important issue of the implementation.

As described in chapter 3.1, in the eyes of the panel of experts the focus of the DBA study programme is in general on knowledge, research and innovation combined with practical orientation. Students learn the methodological tools necessary to generate knowledge as an academic. This allows up to a certain extent that students build up specific knowledge in the course period.

The panel of experts acknowledges the fact that some modules deal with research-oriented aspects such as "Research Methods", "Quantitative and Qualitative Methods of Business Research". These courses on different research methods and approaches to science are part of the curriculum. The intention of KBS of intensifying the focus of some other courses on research methodology finds the full support of the panel, also. In this respect the teaching presents the current status of scientific knowledge in accordance with objectives and it considers the associated relevant research. Furthermore, the experts recommend including elements into the curriculum that increase the students' competencies in digital research and digital expertise.

However, based on the curriculum the modules for research techniques comprise only 12 ECTS out of 60. In accordance with the MES Order, this should be modified as mentioned in chapter 3.1. The panel of experts recommends that KBS focusses a larger part of the study

modules (up to 30 ECTS credits) on research. For writing a dissertation of high quality the students need to get acquainted with methodological research techniques more into depth.

Considering the present legal situation, the modules/courses are aimed at qualification and competency development and are sensibly linked to one another. The goals of a doctoral degree according to the national qualification framework are overall fulfilled.

Despite the complaints uttered by some DBA alumni during the onsite-visit about the question of missing support on writing scientific articles the panel of experts acknowledges the detailed opposite information given by KBS: During the first year of study KAZGUU and KBS offer students several courses and workshops as well as individual support on writing publications for national and international scientific journals.

Multidisciplinary qualifications in the doctoral programme are communicated in a target appropriate manner. This especially enables the doctoral students to discuss the knowledge gained in specialised fields with their colleagues, to present it in front of an academic audience and to communicate it to laymen. It promotes the ability to manage a team and to carry forward the social, scientific or cultural progress in their respective professional environment.

Quality Ratings		Excellent	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
3.	PROGRAMME DESIGN					
3.2	Content					
3.2.1	Logic and Conceptual Consistency			X		
3.2.2	Science and Research Based Teaching			X		
3.2.3	Focus of the Curriculum on Qualification and Competency Development			X		
3.2.4	Technical Offers			X		
3.2.5	Multidisciplinary Qualifications			X		

3.3 Examination Procedures

Courses-contents and learning outcomes have been developed in line with the programme's learning outcomes. The types of evaluations and examination procedures are included in the respective syllabus and depend on the subjects. The examples of the assessment methods are:

- Written / oral projects;
- Home or in-class individual / group assignments;
- Team projects and essays;
- Case-solving;
- Final assessment / exam (with increasing frequency case-solving)

The student performances follow the syllabus requirements, including assessment types and duration. The student performance and given grades are evaluated by achieving the learning outcomes and their overall programme performance.

The dissertation but also the other contributions such as case studies must fulfil the requirement of expanding the frontiers of knowledge and by that to withstand national/international assessment carried out by scientists.

The examinations are clearly announced and organized in terms of number, distribution, process, form registration etc. The examination procedure follows the State Compulsory Standard for Doctorate program adopted by the decree of the government of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated on 23rd of August, №1080 2012.

Appraisal:

The examinations are composed in such a manner that the achieved qualifications and competencies can be determined and assessed. This includes, above all, that the certificates of achievement aim for a systematic understanding of the research discipline and the control of the research methods which are applied in this field of research. In addition, the certificates of achievement are aimed at a contribution of research which expands the frontiers of knowledge and withstands a national/ international assessment carried out by scientists.

The examinations are properly organised in terms of number, distribution, process, form registration etc. The disadvantage compensation is regulated.

Quality Ratings		Excellent	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
3.	PROGRAMME DESIGN					
3.3	Examination Procedures					
3.3.1	Examinations			X		
3.3.2	Organisation of the Examination Procedure			X		

3.4 Didactic Concept

The teaching function can be expressed by providing students with knowledge, skills and abilities they need in their future professional activities. All the disciplines of the programme are closely related to each other and arranged in such way that the students receive specialized (professional) knowledge. The task of the professor is to acquaint students with actual scientific standards for their independent work.

The practical class work is carried out using various methods. The teacher is not limited in the choice of methods. As part of the variety of interactive methods are being used:

- Discussions involve posing the issue, followed by a discussion, including work in small groups. This method helps student master critical thinking skills in dealing with specific business issues, business reasoning and make independent decisions.
- Case-studies involve solving different types of situational problems (case studies with simulation description of real situations, with closed and open story; case illustrations, case problems, case evaluation). This method forms students' skills in solving the situation. Commenting on this assessment report KBS announces that the DBA programme will be changed by adding new real situation cases for every discipline, based on local and foreign experiences.
- The method of presentation of an essay or of a research project forms the students' ability to engage in scientific activities. Priority is given to research work in order to

create a new research product, not only when student analyses the theoretical and practical material, but when he or she is also able to offer and share their vision of the disputed issue.

- Individual work of students has a significant role in the process of education; the results of such work can be in different forms:
 - traditional (writing creative essays, participating in colloquia, reviewing additional literature and articles, making presentations);
 - specific (writing projects, analysis of statistical information).

All these methods are implemented including the elements of ethics of research that are considered throughout the whole course of DBA programme.

The courses incorporate contemporary theories, practices and tools, transferable skills, competence and latest knowledge with a view at the dynamics of changing markets. International teaching components add value to the students for the labour market and thus improve their employability in terms of learning experience from an international perspective.

The foreign internships offer the students the opportunity to visit companies, institutions of other countries along with experience for the doctoral thesis. Knowledge of the interrelation and interdependence of one's own language, culture, and learning in the construction of concepts, values and beliefs contribute to ways of perceiving things variably and diversely across languages and cultures. DBA students are provided with opportunities to get in touch not only with scholars but also with doctoral students of partner-universities.

The DBA students can work closely together and keep communications among each other during the classes and out of their academic classes. In accordance with the objectives the programme includes participation of the students in round tables and conferences organized by KAZGUU University. Usually 2-3 conferences or round tables per year are held in KAZGUU. The DBA students obligatory participate as speakers. DBA students also have their Academic Club held once per month to discuss research experience and knowledge, discuss changes and issues in national and international business environment. Members of the Academic Club are DBA and PhD students and graduates.

At the beginning of the DBA study-programme the students must define and discuss their dissertation thesis topic both with the local supervisor and the foreign advisor. DBA students are supervised by a PhD or by one of the DBA professors of KBS. The KAZGUU Academic Council approves the local supervisor and the foreign advisor from a partner-University. Supervisor and advisor must be scholars in the field of the DBA student's research-topic and have previous experience in DBA supervision. The foreign advisor should contribute foreign experience and broad international foreign research experience. The local supervisor takes the main role in supervision of the research and the foreign advisor makes contribution by adding the international aspect to the research. Most of the students have a fixed and agreed schedule of meetings with the local supervisor.

No	Doctorate students	Foreign Advisors	Foreign Partners
1	Kudaybergenov Galymzhan	Prof. Faisal Ahmad, DBA, Doctor in Leadership	Asian Metropolitan University
2	Ramazanova Aliya	Prof. Bagautdinova Nailya, PhD of Economics	Kazan Federal University
3	Bayseitova Zhanna	Prof. Bogomolova Irina, Doctor in Economics	Voronezh State University of Engineering Technologies

4	Zholayev Rakymbek	Prof. Faisal Ahmad, DBA, PhD in Leadership	Asian Metropolitan University

Foreign advisors

The local supervisor and the foreign advisor both secure a continual and intensive professional, methodological and scientific supervision of the doctoral students. A corresponding planning in the time budget is ensured. The cooperation between scientific supervisor and foreign advisor is conducted through e-mail and Skype-discussions. They send the recommendations to each other and then discuss questions via Skype.

Appraisal:

In the view of the panel of experts the didactic concept of KBS with different methods used is adequate to the DBA programme. This concept has been developed in accordance with the objectives. It is particularly aimed at enabling doctoral students to be able to carry out critical analyses, evaluations and syntheses of new and complex ideas. The modules/ courses are executed according to the didactic concept, with a mix of different methods.

The students have the opportunity of meeting other students and collaborating with each other, be it for discussions or for the exchange of experiences and research results. They can meet in the Academic Club or at conferences held in the University. They also can communicate with students and alumni from foreign universities by means of the internships. These communications contribute towards the broadening of the research-based knowledge.

Every student working on a dissertation is formally and in fact assigned to a supervisor and an advisor. In their cooperation they guarantee an intensive professional, methodological and scientific supervision of the doctoral students. During the onsite visit the experts got the impression that the combination of a foreign advisor and a local supervisor opens interesting chances to the students. They can get foreign and international impacts alongside with the local / national orientation and experience.

The panel of experts welcomes that every supervisor and advisor must be well experienced in own research.

Quality Ratings		Excellent	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
3.	PROGRAMME DESIGN					
3.4	Didactic Concept					
3.4.1	Logic and Comprehensibility of the Didactic Concept			X		
3.4.2	Diversity of the Teaching Methods			X		
3.4.3	Networking of the Doctoral Students			X		
3.4.4	Scientific Supervision			X		

3.5 Professional Competencies / Employability

The intended graduates' skills for employment follow the programme's objectives and strategy. The DBA programme provides steps and opportunities that are correlated with the intended learning outcomes described in Section 1.1. and illustrated in Section 3.2 The doctoral programme aims at conveying the doctoral students with professional qualification in the scientific and research- oriented fields of activity.

The course-descriptions designed for the programme are employability-oriented: the intended learning outcomes are relevant for developing employment skills. The program administration aligns the learning outcomes regarding the student needs and implementing the steps to improve the employability of the participants, and certain qualifications. Recent studies and alumni interviews showed that programme graduates help each other via networking and share business knowledge even beyond the borders of KAZGUU.

The modules "Research Methods" and "Quantitative and Qualitative Methods of Business Research" as well as the dissertation itself aim at conveying research-oriented capacity to the students, whereas the modules on "Management" and "Business and Law" shall prepare the students for practical work as managers in the industry.

Appraisal:

The experts have the view, that the doctoral programme is intended to provide the doctoral students with professional qualification in the scientific and research-oriented fields of activities. In doing so, the professional qualification is aimed both at a research-oriented activity (including teaching) as well as a practical vocational activity.

Quality Ratings		Excellent	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
3.	PROGRAMME DESIGN					
3.5	Professional Competencies / Employability			X		

4. Scientific Environment and Framework conditions

4.1 Teaching Staff

There are nine fulltime faculty members at the KBS, who oversee the DBA programme. Five of them are local faculty members and another four teachers are foreign guest lecturers. All of them have a Doctor of Economics or PhD degrees, depending on the course requirements. In some cases, faculty involves DBA candidates or DBA graduates for assistance. Teaching faculty go through a selection process in line with the programme's qualifications and the university's strategic goals. In order to develop scholars' research activities KAZGUU founded research institutes.

Each faculty member is expected to maintain high personal and professional standards and to keep abreast academic discipline through continuing study, research and participation in variety of activities at the University. The Academic Development Committee is responsible to make sure that teaching faculty meets all required academic qualifications and the students reach the intended qualification objectives of the programme. The issue of full-time

versus part-time lecturers is not particularly relevant since classes are organized during the week and weekends.

Teaching staff's academic and scientific qualifications at the University are provided according to the relevant Orders of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan (dated July 13, 2009 No. 338 "On approval of Standard qualification frameworks for pedagogical employees and equal to them persons"; October 24, 2014 No 441. «On the approval of minimum content requirements and the level of faculty within the framework of educational professional programs MBA and DBA»; April 23, 2015 No. 230 "On approval of Rules for placing vacancies for teaching staff and researchers in higher educational institutions").

In accordance with these regulations the members of teaching staff must fulfil several requirements for teaching in the DBA programme:

- At least 90 % of the teaching staff must have a PhD degree in the relevant subject.
- At least 25 % of the teaching staff must have practical experience in business for min. 7 years.
- At least 40 % of them must be foreign teachers or those who have completed a foreign internship or training with own research experience in the field of business development. The supervisors should have experience in supervising postgraduate students (at least 5)
- They also should have published articles in certain Business and Economics journals that are enumerated:
 - Business Life
 - National Business
 - Economics and Law in Kazakhstan
 - Expert. Kazakhstan.

As far as the scientific experience and activity of the KBS supervisors is concerned 80 % of them are professors in Economics and Business studies. KBS has described their scientific activities in terms of the publication of scientific articles and books as follows:

Scientific supervisor	Scope of scientific works
Mizanbekova Salima, Doctor of Economic Sciences, Professor	Doctor of Economics of the Republic of Kazakhstan, Doctor of Economics of the Russian Federation, 30 years of scientific supervision of doctoral students. Published more than 100 scientific works (research reviews, monographs, research articles).
Kaziyeva Raisa, Doctor of Economic Sciences, Professor	Member of the Kazakhstan Association of Educational Researchers KERA (Identical Number - R0016) (KERA as part of the European Association of Educational Researchers) www.kera.kz , Academician of the International Academy of Informatization (MAIN), http://www.academy.kz/ , 25 years of scientific supervision of doctoral students. Published more than 120 scientific works, specialized in the subject – Business research and Analytical technology research. Business Research and Project Management, Certified Project Manager (IPMA).

Bagautdinova Nailya, Doctor of Economic Sciences, Professor	<p>Unique identifier in the Web of Science (Researcher ID): http://www.researcherid.com/rid/O-4764-2016</p> <p>The unique identifier in Scopus (Author ID): http://www.scopus.com/authid/detail.url?authorId=55694617500</p> <p>Number of publications in the Scopus database: 72 Number of links to publications in the Scopus database: 503 Personal Hirsch Index: 12</p> <p>The unique identifier in the ORCID (ORCID ID): http://orcid.org/0000-0003-3959-7134</p> <p>16 years of scientific supervision of doctorate students.</p>
Bogomolova Irina, Doctor of Economic Sciences, Professor	<p>Published over 120 scientific papers, including more than 50 monographs, textbooks, including those with a ministry of education mark, a patent was obtained "Scenario approach to the distribution of profits of a horizontally integrated structure".</p>
Algiyev Saken, PhD	<p>22 articles, among them articles for Scopus Journals, foreign and national scientific journals, 1 monography (in process).</p>

Local supervisors

Since 2018 teaching staff and supervisors of the DBA programme will have to publish at least one scientific article per year in one of internationally recognized journals, that are enumerated on a KBS-internal list. In addition to these requirements, each Professor is asked to provide an open-door class once a year where all faculty members are invited to participate. The teaching staff is encouraged to promote research, case-studies, open discussions and diversity of teaching methods.

In the frame of national educational development for internationalization and integration of research the University actively involves international faculty as follows:

	Foreign Lectures Name	The Name of Course	Period
	Alexander Pulte, (M.B.A.) and Doctor of Law (J.D.), UBIS University (he is working in the Russian Federation full-time since 2017)	Advanced Topics in Business Law	2014-2017
	Ahmad Faisal, DBA Malaysia	Research Design	2014-2017
	Guillaume Finck, DBA, Paris School of Business, (he is working full-time since 2017)	Advanced business strategies	2014-2017
	Phillip A. Cartwright, PhD PSB Paris School of Business, France	Research methods and design	2017-2018

	Bagautdinova Nailya, Doctor of Economic Sciences, Kazan State University, Russian Federation	Modern methods of transformation in man- agement	2014-2018
	Bogomolova Irina, Doctor of Economic Sciences, Voronezh State University of Engineering Technologies, Rus- sian Federation	Integrated research in global marketing	2015-2018

Lectures of foreign faculty

The internal collaboration, coordination and overall administration are systematically ensured by the programme director, who is responsible among other duties for academic aspects with regards to the courses of modules as well as for the communication among staff members including the evaluation of the team teaching. The programme coordinator addresses the issues and supports the students regarding organisational issues.

Appraisal:

The structure and number of teaching staff corresponds with the requirements of the doctoral programme. The necessary professional breadth and depth in scientific education and the research sponsorship of the doctoral students is ensured. The contractual situation of the teaching staff guarantees a continuous execution of the doctoral programme. A balanced gender ratio is pursued among the teaching staff.

The scientific qualification of the teaching staff corresponds to the national requirements. The scientific qualifications are consistent with the focal points of this programme and the strategic planning of higher education institutions. The research activities correspond with the orientation of the doctoral programme and they support the scientific education of the doctoral students. The panel of experts welcomes the fact that all supervisors, advisors and lecturers have an adequate qualification with PhD or DBA. They also have an expertise for the subjects involved. A considerable number of teachers have relevant experience in international research and/or teaching abroad. Nevertheless, the experts recommend KBS to intensify the foreign experience and research expertise of the local academic staff in order to improve the international research base of supervisors for DBA students, also.

The pedagogical qualification of the teaching staff corresponds to the task and it has been proven. Regular events concerning programme coordination in the faculty take place.

Quality Ratings		Excellent	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
4.	ACADEMIC ENVIRONMENT AND FRAMEWORK CONDITIONS					
4.1	Teaching Staff					
4.1.1	Structure and Number of Teaching Staff			X		
4.1.2	Scientific Qualification of the Teaching Staff			X		
4.1.3	Pedagogical Qualification of the Teaching Staff			X		
4.1.4	Internationality of the Teaching Staff			X		
4.1.5	Internal Cooperation within the Faculty			X		

4.2 Cooperation and Partnership

Partnership with academic institutions is part of the strategic goals of KAZGUU to increase staff and students exchange. Thus, KAZGUU has signed partnership agreements with more than 160 universities, mainly abroad. KAZGUU works actively in the fields of academic mobility of students, professors, and staff members, research, summer schools, short-term business programmes, joint conferences and seminars, dual degrees, qualification programmes, etc.

KAZGUU successfully implemented an academic mobility programme with more than 20 other universities in Finland, Belgium, France, Germany, Latvia and other countries. This includes the Erasmus Plus mobility programme, with universities

KAZGUU University, supporting the Bologna Process, carries out a transfer of the credits received in the partner institution. The KAZGUU International Office and KBS welcome foreign guests, including foreign exchange of students, and provide all administrative support during their stay at the University in Kazakhstan.

The main partners for KBS activities are in each case based on a cooperation agreement or a memorandum of understanding:

- SolBridge International School of Business, Korea
- Corvinus University of Budapest, Hungary
- European University Viadrina, Germany
- Anyang University, Korea
- Eastern Mediterranean University, Cyprus

Every year around 2 to 3 research conferences are organized by the KAZGUU University. The DBA students are encouraged to take part in these conferences as well as in other foreign scientific conferences. The DBA students must absolve a module abroad with a visit to a foreign university, in particular a partner university. This recognisable work with foreign experience can give input into the dissertation.

Members of the academic staff of the DBA programme who are recognized scholars practice a cooperation with scientists from other universities in Kazakhstan and abroad, especially

from Russia, Switzerland, France. Every month faculty of the DBA programme holds an online-conference with scholars from other Business Schools, such as Kazan Federal State University (Russian Federation) and UBIS (University of Business and International Studies, Switzerland). The DBA programme focuses on the development of international orientation. Visits of foreign professor and supervisors are highly encouraged and stimulate the strengths of mutually beneficially integration.

Appraisal:

The scope and nature of cooperation with universities abroad relevant for the programme are plausibly presented and documented as well as aligned with the strategy of the study programme. They are integral part of the programme. The cooperation is actively pursued and has a clear impact on the conception and implementation of the study programme. The doctoral students are encouraged to participate in relevant conferences and / or other scientific events and establishments. The scientific networking with conferences and the work abroad at another university has a recognisable benefit for doctoral students.

Quality Ratings		Excellent	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
4.	ACADEMIC ENVIRONMENT AND FRAMEWORK CONDITIONS					
4.2	Cooperation and Partnership					
4.2.1	Scientific Integration of the Doctoral Students			X		
4.2.2	Networking the Scientists			X		

4.3 Programme Management

The management of the programme is carried out by the Director of the programme and the KBS in close cooperation with the Academy.

KBS was especially established to increase and ensure quality management and administrative organization/ coordination of the DBA programme. The Director of the programme together with Academic Development Committee (ADC) is responsible for

- developing the curriculum,
- qualitatively determining the list and content of the disciplines of the programme
- all documentations
- coordinating the activities of everyone involved in the programme and ensuring that the programme runs smoothly.

Director of the programme should attract employers, external leading scientists and practitioners as well as graduates of the programme of previous years. These external persons give recommendations to further developing the programme, considering the current state of the labour market. The proven curriculum is submitted for evaluation and approval to the Quality Committee.

The Director collaborates with all departments and units of the University, mostly with the ADC for solving scientific and organizational tasks, for monitoring the work of the teaching

staff. He /she participates in the meetings of the Business School to resolve problems identified through the feedback from students and teaching staff.

The Director is committed to enhance the quality of the programme, to ensure effective implementation of the programme delivery and to evaluate its organizational performance as well as to hit further discussions. This happens in a way that KBS includes all its relevant groups.

Administrative support to the students and teaching staff under the programme is implemented by the administrative staff of the KBS. The administrative staff consists of the Director of Business School, Vice-Director of the Business School, Manager of International Relations and Academic Manager (Manager tutor). The decision-making processes and responsibilities are defined. Teachers and students are included in the decision-making processes where their areas of work are involved. The administration staff provides professional support in operational management and strategic direction of the graduate administration team. This includes class scheduling, providing reception and enquiries for students and faculty, preparing letters, memorandum, reports, final examinations, preparing class handouts and syllabi, preparing and posting class cancellations and class assignments for faculty, notifying students of class assignments, room changes, and class cancellations, making arrangements (i.e., room and food accommodations, maintenance services, etc.) for committee meetings and conferences, making internship arrangements for students, including visa support, providing technical support to faculty in using the e-learning equipment. Thus, administration staff serves as liaison between students and faculty in organising and implementing effective learning processes.

The academic management provides advice and information support on all matters of students, foreign students as well, and potential applicants. The manager of International Relations Office is responsible for searching foreign internship programmes for students as well as organising international conferences and projects, including short-term educational programs. All these activities of the KBS are aimed at ensuring the quality of services provided. Contact with the managers of the Business School is possible through a personal appeal during visiting hours, via e-mail or calling the Call-centre or by addressing on the website. For academic support of the students, since 2018 the intranet-platform Canvas operates in the University. Through this system, students can choose their learning, path by editing the individual curriculum; track their progress, participate in the survey to evaluate teaching staff.

Appraisal:

The structural organisation, the decision-making processes, competencies and responsibilities are established and implemented accordingly. Those involved are included in the decision-making process.

Management support concerning the allocation of tasks and persons are transparent and efficiently guaranteed both qualitatively and quantitatively.

The requirements in terms of content, structure, design, duration, study process and examinations are recognised through suitable documentation and publication. The interested parties also have access to the documentation in electronic form and it provides transparency.

Quality Ratings		Excellent	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
4.	ACADEMIC ENVIRONMENT AND FRAMEWORK CONDITIONS					
4.3	Programm Management					
4.3.1	Structural Organisation			X		
4.3.2	Management Support			X		
4.3.3	Documentation of the Doctoral Programme			X		

4.4 Material Resources

There are currently available 10 classrooms with accommodations for 120 students, three large halls, some group study rooms, lab classes, group study rooms at the library and multimedia classes. KAZGUU University's general assignment classrooms are supported by a team of administrative service who are committed to offering high-quality learning environments. All these rooms and labs have internet access and multimedia capabilities with regards to the needs of the study programme. They are appropriately equipped for disabled students and give them barrier-free access. In addition, the rooms allow videoconferences. Students get access to a network of local databases. The group rooms allow making research and discussions in a more informal ambience than in the lecture rooms. The lab classes are equipped with the latest technologies and equipment as well as Wi-Fi coverage available across the whole University.

The administration team values and encourages input and comments from faculty and students regarding the quality of rooms and the support services provided.

The university has in total 673 computers at its disposal. There are 300 in the computer and multimedia classrooms, 366 computers are in use of the administrative and academic teaching staff. Personal computers are connected via network infrastructure Gigabit Ethernet. The computer network is routed into virtual subnets. Server hardware was entirely renewed, and the whole system was switched to virtualization technology. The Online portal of the University has the address www.kazguu.kz. The website gives a link to the education process platform Platonus /Canvas, and the system of electronic documents management Documentolog. Both serve the students to administrate their studies and to access all necessary documents online.

The University has Wi-Fi is installed in all rooms and halls. It is available free of charge for everyone at the University and enables staff and students to use the Internet resources and internal university services. The KAZGUU (database) library includes over 50,000 volumes of books, e-books, e-journals, articles, periodicals and about 393.000 items (including periodic publications). Necessary books are available in Russian and English language. During the semester the regular library service hours last from Monday to Friday 9:00 – 18:00. Qualified library staff helps students in searching necessary books, journals or access to international database. Access to relevant digital media is also available from the students' home. The KAZGUU library is a member of the International Association of Users and Designers of Digi-

tal Libraries and New Information Technologies (EBNIT Association, Moscow, Russia) and uses a lot of databases based on contracts with the Ministry of Justice etc.

Also, KBS has access to other international data-bases such as Financial Times and EBSCO. EBSCO is an academic collection of electronic books in English. Students and staff have access to the full texts of books. This growing subscription package contains a large selection of interdisciplinary e-books that represent a wide range of academic subjects. The wide availability of information accessible through this package ensures that students and scientists will have access to information appropriate to their research needs. Offering more than 170,000 e-books, this collection contains the names of leading university publications such as Oxford University Press, MIT Press, State University of New York, a press release from Cambridge University Press, the University of California Press, McGill-Queen's University Press, Harvard University Press and many others. Additional academic publishers include Elsevier, Ashgate Publishing, Taylor & Francis, Sage Publications and John Wiley & Sons. All headers are available with unlimited user access, and names are regularly added to the collection at no additional cost. It is planned to connect to the databases of Bloomberg, Oxford and HandBuck.

The online portal of the University includes the learning platforms "Platonus"/ "Canvas" and a system of electronic documents management «Documentolog».

Appraisal:

The equipment of teaching rooms and library as well as the available Wi-Fi free of charge in the whole university meet the standards required for the programme, even considering the resources needs of other study programmes. The rooms are properly equipped for disabled students and give them barrier-free access, as the panel could see during a tour of the teaching rooms, labs and the library. Enough group rooms are available.

A reference library is available. Literature, magazines and databases are up-to-date and current in terms of the study contents and research activities of the doctoral students. The opening hours of the library take students' needs sufficiently into account. Access to the literature and journals as well as to digital media (e.g. electronic media, databases) is ensured. The literature expressly required for the study programme is available in the library and kept up to date. Access to relevant digital media is available from the students' home, also. Qualified IT-staff and librarians advise the students. The most important databases are accessible free of charge.

The panel was impressed by the support given to the students for using the library, which is accessible during most of the day.

Furthermore, the financial means made available and the present personnel permanently guarantee the useful development of the portfolio. The research interests of the doctoral students are considered. There are specific consulting and research opportunities. All databases which are relevant for the doctoral programme are free of charge and are even accessible online outside the university.

Quality Ratings		Excellent	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
4.	ACADEMIC ENVIRONMENT AND FRAMEWORK CONDITIONS					
4.4	Material Resources					
4.4.1	Quality of the Classrooms and Working Places			X		
4.4.2	Equipment (Literature, Magazines, Databases) for the Library		X			

4.5 Finance Planning and Financing

KAZGUU is a non-state joint-stock company financed by own resources. 35% of university shares are owned by the Government. The financial planning is developed by the Finance Department for five years ahead. It assumes that the number of students will not decrease, as the University is not planning to increase the tuition fee except for an adjustment increment by the official inflation rate.

KAZGUU University has shown its stability over the 25 years of operations, whereas KBS has been operating for almost 10 years and has 225 graduates. KBS is an integral part of the University financial management. The auditor Crowe Horwath Nomad produced the annual account for the year 2017 with the result of 3 billion Tenge (ca. 7 million Euro) as consolidated revenue. This amount is supposed to increase during the next five years following the financial planning.

KAZGUU University serves as a guarantor for KBS continuous operations, having government grants and a commercial activities department that brings revenue from providing legal expertise and research projects to add on to the normal academic activities.

KBS is expected to grow further as the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan has made it a mandatory requirement for the top managers of any governmental body to hold the MBA degree. Thus, the KBS foresees a good opportunity to grow its business both in the English and Russian language.

The financial model supporting the Strategic Plan for 2018-2023 includes KBS operations. 5% increase of students in each consecutive academic year form the main assumptions. There is also a significant portion of government scholarships as part of the university revenue. Commercial revenue is coming from supporting commercial units aimed to invest into academic programmes. KAZGUU has an Endowment Fund which provides scholarships and fee-reductions for the tuition. In 2017 the Endowment Fund collected around 900,000 US Dollars. All the scholarships and discounts are approved and awarded by the Rector of the University.

Appraisal:

The existing system guarantees that all students, once enrolled for the programme, have the possibility to finish their studies. In accordance with the objectives, the finance planning considers the staff planning for scientific employees/doctoral positions. The necessary financial basic equipment and financing security are guaranteed for the period of accreditation.

In accordance with the objectives the higher education institution guarantees the financial protection of the doctoral students.

Quality Ratings		Excellent	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
4.	ACADEMIC ENVIRONMENT AND FRAMEWORK CONDITIONS					
4.5	Finance Planning and Financing					
4.5.1	Finance Planning and Financing of the Doctoral Programme			X		
4.5.2	Financial Support and Scholarship Programmes			X		

5. QUALITY ASSURANCE

5.1 Quality Assurance in terms of Content, Processes and Results

At the university level the Academic Council deals with quality assurance for all educational programmes, supported by the administrative department for Strategic Planning, Analysis and Corporate Development. The Academic Council has the following tasks:

- Developing and implementing quality assurance systems and procedures on the whole spectrum of educational programs;
- Quality monitoring of quality assurance procedures and processes at the university;
- Carrying out such checks that are necessary for the integrity and quality of the university's activities;
- Providing the information and analysis required to support decision-making at the university level and in academic departments;
- Advise academic units on the qualitative implications of proposals, policies and strategic plans.

The monitoring of quality assurance is conducted by managers primarily based the development of data and evaluations by students, teachers, graduates and employers.

At KBS level there are two committees responsible for quality assurance: The Quality Committee (QC) and the Academic Development Committee. They guarantee the quality of the study programs (MBA, DBA program):



The main functions of the KBS QC are:

- Quality assessment of the programmes
- Evaluation of the quality of the catalogue of elective disciplines
- Evaluation and review of programme evaluation results
- Formation of the chairman and members
- Definition of criteria for requirements for scientific management.
- Data collection and preparation of the consolidated report

The QC consists of KBS teachers, employers (from national and international companies, commercial and investment banks, private and state enterprises and organizations) and graduates. The work of the committee is coordinated by a manager appointed by the Rector. It meets twice a year. This is in August for the approval for the new school year and in December for electing the State Examination (Dissertation) Committee. In the future QC decisions must be approved by the Academic Council of the University.

The Academic Development Committee (ADC) focusses on curriculum development, the implementation of Platonus / Canvas and on attracting highly qualified foreign and domestic teachers.

Based on the evaluations with questionnaires, the ADC provides reliable data and analytical reports to the Director of KBS and to the Rector for further use.

The "Questionnaire of the assessment of quality of the teacher" is addressed to students. It comprises questions on

- Structure of the discipline
- Content of the discipline
- Assignments
- Students' progress assessment
- Motivation
- Study workload
- Communication and general culture
- Suggestions

The questionnaires are evaluated by the administration. The KBS Director asks the Chairman of the QC to call for a meeting and discuss the results of the evaluation with the corresponding members. They also include general data on success rates and student developments. The discussion is reported to the programme director, who report the results to the relevant teachers.

At the beginning of each semester, the director conducts a meeting with students in form of an open forum which the director makes a presentation on the student's evaluation results at. It also covers the results of the evaluation of learning in general. Students receive a feedback on what measures the KBS Administration is taking to address their problems.

Since 2018 the data is processed in Canvas. Business School members see the results in a consolidated format based on the course in Platonus. The results of the course evaluation are also available to interested teachers and the administration of the University.

All teachers on a voluntary basis are asked to fill out a questionnaire called the instructor's assessment of the effectiveness of program management. Results are collected and submitted to committees for further processing and inclusion in the final report and discussion of quality results. The Department and the Director review the results of the business school and present a summary for QC. They control the further development on a regular basis followed by discussions accordingly.

The surveys of the external evaluations by alumni, employers and third parties are conducted on an ongoing basis. The results are collected once a year and are considered by the QC. It includes data on employment and the level of their competences one year after graduation. The assessment of the academic quality of programs by employers is carried out through the Business club. The main objective of the Business Club is to support communication between graduates and employers and current MBA and DBA programme participants.

The deans of the Higher Schools (including KBS) are responsible for communicating the results of the surveys to the respective faculty members through the QC at school level.

The programme documentation includes the following information:

- KBS Catalogue
- Academic policy of KAZGUU (Catalogue KAZGUU)
- Diploma Supplement (Sample)
- Rules of Expertise of KAZGUU
- MBA/DBA Projects Policy
- Internship Policy
- KBS Brochure
- Course Descriptions (Platonus/Canvas)
- Results of evaluations
- Protocols of the Committees

All documents are revised annually and approved by the relevant authorities. Programme documents are published on the University's website. They are available in a printed version.

KAZGUU regularly publishes current news and information about study programme and examination scheme on the website as well as in social media. Other information related to the work of the committees are published on the internal Platonus system, on paper and / or on radio at the University.

Appraisal:

A quality assurance and development procedure, which systematically and continuously monitors and develops the quality of the programme with respect to its contents, processes,

and outcomes, has been set up. It considers the evaluation results and the analysis of student workloads and success rates. Faculty members and students participate in the respective committees to plan and assess the quality assurance and development procedures. Responsibilities are clearly defined.

Evaluation by the students, by the faculty and the external evaluation are carried out on a regular basis and in accordance with a prescribed procedure; the outcomes are communicated to the students and provide input for the quality development process. In addition, the evaluation results are translated into a list of measures to be taken and published on the intranet Platonus / Canvas. Within the framework of controlling the implementation, it is ensured that measures are implemented, reviewed and evaluated regarding their quality and faithfulness to the original objective, modified and adapted if necessary as well as documented.

The study programme is documented regarding content, curriculum and examination scheme. This documentation is published and constantly updated. Press relations and network communication are published regularly. This includes information on the MBA study programme both in qualitative and quantitative respects.

Quality Ratings		Excellent	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
5.	QUALITY ASSURANCE					
5.1	Quality Assurance in terms of Contents, Processes and Results			X		

5.2 Inclusion of Quality Assurance in a Superordinate Quality Concept

The quality assurance of the DBA study programme goes in line with the University Quality Assurance concept and procedure. Moreover, the doctoral programme is reviewed annually by the Committee of the KAZGUU Academy of Fundamental and Applied Studies. The DBA students must present their research activities to this Committee every year. In addition, several KAZGUU scholars have a view on these results at the end of each year.

Appraisal:

The quality assurance of the doctoral programme is systematically embedded in the quality concept for the research of the faculty and the higher education institution.

Quality Ratings		Excellent	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
5.	QUALITY ASSURANCE					
5.2	Inclusion of Quality Assurance in a Superordinate Quality Concept			X		

5.3 Evaluation by Doctoral Students

Based on the evaluations with questionnaires, the AQC provides reliable data and analytical reports to the Director of the KBS and to the Rector for further use.

The “Questionnaire of the assessment of quality of the teacher” is addressed to students. It comprises questions on

- Structure of the discipline
- Content of the discipline
- Assignments
- Students’ progress assessment
- Motivation
- Study workload
- Communication and general culture
- Suggestions

The questionnaires are evaluated by the administration. The KBS Director asks the Chairman of the AQC to call for a meeting and discuss the results of the evaluation with the corresponding members. They also include general data on success rate and student development. The discussion is reported to the program coordinators, who report the results to the relevant teachers.

At the beginning of each semester, the Director conducts a meeting with students in the form of an open forum. There the director gives a presentation on the student’s evaluation results. It also covers the results of the evaluation of learning in general. Students receive a feedback on what measures the KBS Administration is taking to address the problems of students.

Since 2018 the data is processed in the Canvas programme. KBS members see the results in a consolidated format based on Platonus / Canvas. The results of the course evaluation are also available to the teachers and the administration of the University.

Appraisal:

There is a regular evaluation concerning the implementation of the programme carried out by the doctoral students according to a predefined procedure; the results are discussed internally and find their way into the process of quality development. What exceeds the regular quality requirements in the eyes of the panel of experts is the fact, that furthermore, the evaluations, including catalogue of measures, are discussed with doctoral students, and representatives from the sector also take part. Teachers, doctoral students and representatives of the research practice participate in the evaluation procedure. These procedures can help to improve the quality of the DBA programme continuously.

Quality Ratings		Excellent	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
5.	QUALITY ASSURANCE					
5.3	Evaluation by Doctoral Students		X			

5.4 Evaluation by Supervisors

All teachers on a voluntary basis are asked to fill out a questionnaire called the instructor's assessment of the effectiveness of programme management. Results are collected and submitted to the committees for further processing and inclusion in a final report and for the discussion of quality results at university level. The Department and the Director review the results of the KBS and present a summary to the QC. They control the further development on a regular basis followed by discussions accordingly.

Appraisal:

The supervisors of dissertations evaluate the implementation of the programme on a regular basis according to a predefined procedure; the results are discussed internally and find their way into the process of quality development.

Quality Ratings		Excellent	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
5.	QUALITY ASSURANCE					
5.4	Evaluation by Supervisors			X		

5.5 Evaluation by Third Parties (Graduates, external Peers, Stakeholders etc.)

The surveys of the external evaluations by alumni, employers and third parties aim at revealing the graduates' employment data and their level the competence. The academic quality issues regarding the programme content and structure are addressed in the Alumni Club meetings, also. The Alumni Club agenda is aimed to:

- contribute to the educational programme' competitiveness;
- strengthen and further develop alumni relations;
- support the alumni in their further professional development;
- contribute to the strategic decision making;
- support students in internship and the job hunting-process;
- contribute to development of the Groups Department/Schools Endowment Fund;
- contribute to the KBS image on the market.

The results are collected once a year and are considered by QC. It includes data on employment and the level of their competences one year after graduation. The assessment of the academic quality of programs by employers is carried out through the Business Club. The main objective of the Business Club is to support communication between graduates and employers. The deans of the Higher Schools (including KBS) are responsible for communicating the results of the surveys to the respective faculty members through the AQC at school level.

Appraisal:

The panel of experts was impressed by the intensity of feedback and communication on the quality of the DBA study programme and its improvement. There is not only a regular external evaluation according to a predefined procedure; the results are discussed internally and find their way into the process of quality development. But furthermore, the evaluations, including the catalogue of measures are discussed with doctoral students, and representatives of the vocational practice take part in discussions. Teachers, doctoral students and representatives of the research practice participate in the evaluation procedure. This intensity is very helpful and exceeds the quality requirements.

Quality Ratings		Excellent	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
5.	QUALITY ASSURANCE					
5.5	Evaluation by Third Parties (Graduates, external Peers, Stakeholders etc.)		X			

Quality Profile

Institution: KAZGUU University, Business School

Doctoral programme: Doctor of Business Administration (DBA)



Quality Ratings		Excellent	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	not relevant
1.	STRATEGY AND OBJECTIVES					
1.1	Objectives of the Doctoral Programme			X		
1.2	Positioning of the Doctoral Programme in the education market			X		
1.3	Positioning of the Doctoral Programme in the Job Market for Graduates			X		
1.3.1	In the research fields			X		
1.3.2	Outside the research fields			X		
1.4	The positioning of the Doctoral Programme in the Strategic Concept of the Higher Education Institution			X		
1.5	Gender Equality and Equal Opportunities			X		
2.	ADMISSION					
2.1	Admission conditions and procedures			X		
2.2	Selection procedure			X		
2.3	Transparency of the Decision on Admission			X		

3.	IMPLEMENTATION					
3.1	Structure					
3.1.1	Structural Setup of the Doctoral Programme			X		
3.1.2	Doctoral Degree Regulation			X		
3.1.3	Status of the Doctoral Students			X		
3.1.4	Module Description			X		
3.2	Contents					
3.2.1	Logic and Conceptual Consistency			X		
3.2.2	Science and Research Based Teaching			X		
3.2.3	Focus of the Curriculum on Qualification and Competency Development			X		
3.2.4	Technical Offers			X		
3.2.5	Multidisciplinary Qualifications			X		
3.3	Examination Procedures					
3.3.1	Examination			X		
3.3.2	Organisation of the Examination Procedure			X		
3.4	Didactic Concept					
3.4.1	Logic and Comprehensibility of the Didactic Concept			X		
3.4.2	Diversity of the Teaching Methods			X		
3.4.3	Networking of the Doctoral Students			X		
3.4.4	Scientific Supervision			X		

3.5	Professional Competencies/Employability			X		
	SCIENTIFIC ENVIRONMENT AND FRAMEWORK CONDITIONS					
4.1	Teaching Staff					
4.1.1	Structure and Number of Teaching Staff			X		
4.1.2	Scientific Qualification of the Teaching Staff			X		

4.1.3	Pedagogical Qualification of the Teaching Staff			X		
4.1.4	Internationality of the Teaching Staff			X		
4.1.5	Internal Cooperation within the Faculty			X		
4.2	Cooperation and Partnership					
4.2.1	Scientific Integration of the Doctoral Students			X		
4.2.2	Networking the Scientists			X		
4.3	Programme Management					
4.3.1	Structural Organisation			X		
4.3.2	Management Support			X		
4.3.3	Documentation of the Doctoral Programme			X		

4.4	Material Resources					
4.4.1	Quality of the Classrooms and Working Places			X		
4.4.2	Equipment (Literature, Magazines, Databases) for the Library		X			
4.5	Finance Planning and Financing					
4.5.1	Finance Planning and Financing of the Doctoral Programme			X		
4.5.2	Financial Support and Scholarship Programmes			X		
5.	QUALITY ASSURANCE					
5.1	Quality Assurance in terms of Contents, Processes and Results			X		
5.2	Inclusion of Quality Assurance in a Superordinate Quality Concept			X		
5.3	Evaluation by Doctoral Students		X			
5.4	Evaluation by Supervisors			X		
5.5	Evaluation by Third Parties (Graduates, external Peers, Stakeholders etc.)		X			