

YOUR PARTNER FOR EXCELLENCE
IN HIGHER EDUCATION



**FOUNDATION FOR INTERNATIONAL
BUSINESS ADMINISTRATION ACCREDITATION**

FIBAA – BERLINER FREIHEIT 20-24 – D-53111 BONN

Assessment Report

Higher Education Institution:

L.N. Gumilyov Eurasian National University,
Kazakhstan

Doctoral programme:

1. Doctoral Programme of Economics
2. Doctoral Programme of Finance
3. Doctoral Programme of Tourism

Qualification awarded on completion:

Doctor in Philosophy

Decision of the FIBAA Accreditation and Certification Committee

22nd Meeting on June 19, 2026

PROGRAMME ACCREDITATION

Project Number:	24/097 Cl. 1
Higher Education Institution:	L.N. Gumilyov Eurasian National University
Location:	Astana, Kazakhstan
Study programmes:	Tourism (Doctor) Economics (Doctor) Finance (Doctor)
Type of accreditation:	re-accreditation

The FIBAA Accreditation and Certification Committee has taken the following decision:

According to § 7 (6) in conjunction with § 9 (1) of the FIBAA General Terms and Conditions within the framework of procedures for the award of the FIBAA Quality Seal for Programmes from March 1, 2025, the study programmes are re-accredited with five conditions.

Conditions:

- **Condition 1** (see chapter 3.1.3):
- **The University develops a comprehensive institutional policy on the use of Artificial Intelligence (AI) in teaching and learning. This policy should provide clear guidance for students and staff on the appropriate and responsible use of AI tools within the academic environment.**

Doctoral Programme in Economics, Doctoral Programme in Finance:

- **Condition 2** (see chapter 4.4.2):
The HEI obtains access to relevant financial and economic databases.

Proof of meeting these conditions/this condition is to be supplied by March 18, 2027.

Tourism (Doctor) and Economics (Doctor): Period of Accreditation: March 1, 2027, until February 28, 2034.

Finance (Doctor): Period of Accreditation: March 1, 2025, until February 29, 2032.

The FIBAA Quality Seal is awarded.

This decision will be published in accordance with FIBAA's publication policy. The accreditation applies to the programme as described in the documentation submitted; any substantive changes require prior notification.

Table of Contents

Inhalt

Procedure.....	6
Accreditation Data at a Glance	7
General Information on the Study Programmes.....	8
General Information on the Study Programmes.....	Fehler! Textmarke nicht definiert.
Summary.....	14
Quality Profile.....	17
Information	23
Information on the Institution.....	23
Statistical Data.....	27
Programme Description and Appraisal in Detail.....	30
1. OBJECTIVES.....	30
1.1 Objectives of the Doctoral Programme (Asterisk Criterion)	30
1.2 Positioning of the Doctoral Programme on the Education Market	34
1.3 Positioning of the Doctoral Programme in the Strategic Concept of the Higher Education Institution	36
1.4 Inclusive and Equitable Education (Asterisk Criterion)	37
2. ADMISSION	40
2.1 Admission Conditions and Procedures (Asterisk Criterion)	40
2.2 Selection Procedure	41
3. IMPLEMENTATION	43
3.1 Structure.....	43
3.1.1 Structural Setup of the Doctoral Programme (Asterisk Criterion).....	43
3.1.2 Scientific Supervision (Asterisk Criterion)	44
3.1.3 Doctoral Degree Regulations (Asterisk Criterion)	44
3.2 Contents	47
3.2.1 Logic and Conceptual Consistency (Asterisk Criterion)	47
3.2.2 Science and Research Based Teaching (Asterisk Criterion).....	47
3.2.3 Multidisciplinary Qualifications (Asterisk Criterion)	48
3.2.4 Examinations (Asterisk Criterion)	50
3.3 Teaching and Learning Methodology	51
3.3.1 Logic and Comprehensibility of the Didactic Concept (Asterisk Criterion).....	51
3.3.2 Course Materials and Recommended Literature	53

4. SCIENTIFIC ENVIRONMENT AND FRAMEWORK CONDITIONS.....	55
4.1 Teaching staff	55
4.1.1 Structure and Number of Teaching Staff (Asterisk Criterion)	55
4.1.2 Scientific Qualification of Teaching Staff (Asterisk Criterion)	58
4.1.3 Pedagogical Qualification of Teaching Staff (Asterisk Criterion)	61
4.1.4 Internationality of Teaching Staff	63
4.1.5 Internal Cooperation within the Faculty (Asterisk Criterion)	64
4.2 Cooperation and Partnerships	66
4.2.1 Scientific Integration of the Doctoral Students (Asterisk Criterion)	66
4.2.2 Networking of the Scientists	68
4.2.3 Networking of the Doctoral Students	69
4.3 Programme Management	70
4.3.1 Structural Organisation (Asterisk Criterion)	70
4.3.2 Management Support.....	71
4.4 Material Resources	72
4.4.1 Quality of the Classrooms and Working Places (Asterisk Criterion).....	72
4.4.2 Equipment (Literature, Magazines, Databases) for the Library (Asterisk Criterion)	73
4.5 Finance Planning and Financing.....	75
4.5.1 Finance Planning and Financing of the Doctoral Programme (Asterisk Criterion)	75
4.5.2 Financial Support and Scholarship Programmes.....	76
5. QUALITY ASSURANCE	78
5.1 Quality Assurance in terms of Contents, Processes and Research (Asterisk Criterion)	78
5.2 Inclusion of Quality Assurance in a Superordinate Quality Concept (Asterisk Criterion)	79
5.3 Evaluation by Doctoral Students	79
5.4 Evaluation by Supervisors and Faculty	80
5.5 Evaluation by Third Parties (Graduates, and other external Stakeholders)	80
Appendices	83

The Doctoral Programme of Tourism, Doctoral Programme of Economics and Doctoral Programme of Finance offered by L.N. Gumilyov Eurasian National University fulfil with few exceptions the FIBAA quality requirements for doctoral programmes and can be re-accredited by the Foundation for International Business Administration Accreditation (FIBAA) for seven years starting on March 1, 2025, and finishing on February 29, 2032, under conditions. The programmes are in accordance with the national and the European Qualification Frameworks and the European Standards and Guidelines in their applicable version valid as of the time of the opening of the procedure, and in accordance with the Bologna Declaration.

Procedure

An agreement for the re-accreditation of the Doctoral Programme of Tourism, Doctoral Programme of Economics and Doctoral Programme of Finance was concluded between FIBAA and L.N. Gumilyov Eurasian National University on February 17, 2025. On November 28, 2025 the HEI submitted a self-evaluation report, which included a detailed description of the programme and additional documents to demonstrate that the criteria for programme accreditation are met.

At the same time, FIBAA appointed a review panel¹, which was approved by the HEI. The panel consisted of:

Prof. Dr. Bibiana Grassinger

IU International University GmbH Bad Reichenhall
Professor of Marketing and Tourism Management

Prof. Dr. Andreas Grüner

University of St. Gallen
Professor of Finance and Accounting

Inna Sidorova

Business Manager
BGC Partners LP

Feria Sturm

University of Innsbruck
PHD; Management of Tourism and the Service Sector, Marketing Qualitative Research
Project Researcher

Prof. Dr. Stefan Veith

Bremen University of Applied Sciences
Professor of Business Administration, in particular Accounting & Controlling

Dr. Stanislav Yugay

Maqsut Narikbayev University
Teaching Professor, Head of the Finance, Economics and Accounting Programmes

FIBAA project manager:
Dr Rebekka Welker

¹ The panel is presented in alphabetical order.

Accreditation Data at a Glance

Mode of the site visit	at the HEI's premises in Astana, Kazakhstan At the end of the visit, the panel provided brief feedback on its first impressions to representatives of the HEI.
Date of the site visit	on March 11., 12. & 13 2026
Accreditation period (if applicable)	Tourism (Doctor) and Economics (Doctor): March 1, 2027, until February 28, 2034. Finance (Doctor): March 1, 2025, until February 29, 2032.
Extension of the accreditation period (if applicable)	(For Finance (Doctor)) Accreditation period provisionally extended until 28 February 2026, with further extension until 30 June 2026.
Groups interviewed	Management board of ENU, Programme Management, lecturers, Students and graduates, business partners, employers, graduate users, administrative staff
Facilities and equipment inspected (optional, if relevant)	Department of Economy, Department of Tourism, Department of Finance In the departments: classrooms, rooms for teaching staff, auditorium, Reading rooms, periodicals room, laboratories for students
Use of virtual learning platforms/tools demonstrated (optional, if relevant)	yes
Documents reviewed additionally on-site: (e.g., exam samples, internal QA reports, thesis examples)	Yes lecture slides, exercise sheets, exams, theses, and case studies
Date Report Delivered to HEI for Statement	June 1, 2026
Date of HEI Statement	June 5, 2026
Programme(s) reviewed in the same cluster (if applicable)	1. Accounting and Audit (Bachelor) 2. Accounting and Audit (Master) 3. Finance (Bachelor) 4. Finance (Master) 5. Tourism (Bachelor) 6. Tourism (Master)

General Information on the Doctoral Programme in Economics

General Information

Type of study programme:

Doctoral programme

Name of the study programme (in original language and English translation):

8D04102 (6D050600) – Экономика (In Kazakh)

8D04102 (6D050600) – Экономика (in Russian)

8D04102 (6D050600) – Economics
Degree title awarded

«8D04102 – Экономика» білім бағдарламасы бойынша философия докторы (PhD) (In Kazakh)

Доктор философии (PhD) по образовательной программе «8D04102 – Экономика» (in Russian)

Doctor of Philosophy (PhD) in education programme 8D04102 – Economics

Projected study time

3 years

Number of ECTS credits & national credits assigned to the study programme

180 ECTS credits /180 national credits

Type of accreditation:

Re-accreditation

Mode of study:

Full-time

Methodological approach:

Study programme with obligatory class attendance / optional: Blended learning

Language of instruction:

Russian

Double/Joint Degree programme:

no

Implementation

Dates and Scope

Initial start of the programme:

2005

Programme cycle starts in:

fall and winter semesters

Scope (planned number of parallel classes) and enrolment capacity

Total number of students: 23

1st year – 9

1st year (winter intake) – 3

2nd year – 7

3rd year – 4

Total number of groups: 4

General Information on the Doctoral Programme in Finance

General Information

Type of study programme:

Doctoral programme

Name of the study programme (in original language and English translation):

8D04114 (6D050900) – Қаржы

8D04114 (6D050900) – Финансы

8D04114 (6D050900) – Finance

Degree title awarded

8D04114 (6D050900) – Қаржы білім беру бағдарламасы бойынша философия докторы (PhD)

Доктор философии (PhD) по образовательной программе 8D04114 (6D050900) – Финансы.

Doctor of Philosophy (PhD) on the education programme 8D04114 (6D050900) – Finance.

Projected study time

3 years

Number of ECTS credits & national credits assigned to the study programme

180 ECTS credits /180 national credits

Type of accreditation:

Re-accreditation

Mode of study:

Full-time

Methodological approach:

Study programme with obligatory class attendance / optional: Blended learning

Language of instruction:

Russian

Double/Joint Degree programme:

no

Implementation

Dates and Scope

Initial start of the programme:

2015

Programme cycle starts in:

fall and winter semesters

Scope (planned number of parallel classes) and enrolment capacity

Total – 20 people.

1st year – 6

1st year (winter admission) - 3

2nd year – 6

3rd year – 5

There are 4 groups in total

General Information on the Doctoral Programme in Tourism

General Information

Type of study programme:

Doctoral programme

Name of the study programme (in original language and English translation):

8D11105 (6D090200) – Туризм (in Kazakh)

8D11105 (6D090200) – Туризм (in Russian)

8D11105 (6D090200) – Tourism

Degree title awarded

8D11105 (6D090200) – Туризм білім беру бағдарламасы бойынша PhD докторы (in Kazakh)

Доктор PhD по образовательной программе 8D11105 (6D090200) – Туризм» (in Russian)

PhD doctor in the education programme "8D11105 (6D090200) – Tourism

Projected study time

3 years

Number of ECTS credits & national credits assigned to the study programme

180 ECTS credits /180 national credits

Type of accreditation:

Re-accreditation

Mode of study:

Full-time

Methodological approach:

Study programme with obligatory class attendance / optional: Blended learning

Language of instruction:

Russian

Double/Joint Degree programme:

no

Implementation

Dates and Scope

Initial start of the programme:

2011

Programme cycle starts in:

fall and winter semesters

Scope (planned number of parallel classes) and enrolment capacity

Total number: 25 people

1st year of studies – 13 persons, number of groups - 2

2nd year of studies – 6, number of groups – 1

3rd year of studies – 6, number of groups – 1

Summary

Brief description of the study programme:

Doctoral Programme in Tourism

The programme follows an interdisciplinary approach, integrating economic, environmental, sociocultural, and technological aspects of tourism. Particular emphasis is placed on sustainable development and international integration. The curriculum is structured into three core components: theoretical training, research activities, and a final assessment phase. Its strong international orientation is reflected in the involvement of foreign professors and consultants, as well as in established cooperation with universities in Turkey, Georgia, Bulgaria, Great Britain, Pakistan, and New Zealand. Graduates of the programme are well prepared to conduct scientific research, teach at higher education institutions, advise tourism authorities, and develop practical recommendations for sustainable and digital tourism development.

Doctoral Programme in Economics

The qualification aim of the Doctoral Programme in Economics is to prepare research- and practice-oriented economists capable of conducting independent scientific research, performing advanced analytical work, making informed managerial decisions, and addressing complex professional challenges. Graduates will acquire comprehensive knowledge, skills, and competencies in production and economic activities, organisational and managerial practice, scientific research, analytical work, and scientific and pedagogical activities. The curriculum is designed to ensure a balanced integration of theoretical training, research activity, and the preparation and completion of the doctoral dissertation.

Doctoral Programme in Finance

The qualification objective of the Doctoral Programme in Finance is to prepare PhD graduates and financial researchers with advanced expertise in contemporary scientific research methodologies and higher education practices, as well as the ability to apply innovative financial technologies in support of evidence-based decision-making within the financial sector. In 2025, the programme's qualification objective was updated to align with contemporary developments in financial science, digitalisation, and labour market needs. The curriculum integrates theoretical education, independent research activity, and the preparation and defense of a doctoral dissertation. Graduates of the programme pursue careers in academic and research institutions, higher education organisations, analytical and consulting centres, and public-sector bodies, where they contribute to research, policy analysis, teaching, and strategic decision-making.

Highlights of the programmes/the site-visit

The doctoral programmes are delivered at ENU, which was granted the status of a research university in 2022. A major part of the workload in the three Doctoral programmes is devoted to research, starting from the first semester.

Furthermore, the programmes stand out for their strong practical focus. The second year of the Finance and Tourism programme is dedicated to practice-oriented components like a teaching internship and research internship. In the Economics programme, doctoral students of the third year undertake an international research internship of at least 30 days to enhance their competencies and establish international academic connections.

Additionally, academic supervision is provided by two consultants—one domestic and one international—giving students access to both local expertise and global academic perspectives. This dual supervision model enhances the quality of research guidance, strengthens methodological rigor, promotes international academic standards, and supports the development of globally relevant research outcomes.

Across all three doctoral programmes, multidisciplinary qualifications are strong because doctoral candidates systematically integrate methods and perspectives from multiple disciplines within coursework, research topics, and applied projects. This structured interdisciplinarity enables doctoral students to address complex real-world problems, communicate research to diverse audiences, and develop systemic, critical, and practice-oriented thinking aligned with academic and professional demands.

The Doctoral Degree Regulations are clearly fulfilled, as ENU has established transparent, publicly available procedures for doctoral studies, dissertation preparation, ethical review, and degree awarding that are fully aligned with national legal requirements, ensure academic integrity and originality, and guarantee rigorous, standardised evaluation through Dissertation Councils and external peer review.

The site visit was well-structured and provided comprehensive insights into the academic and organisational framework. The site visit took place on-site and included in-depth discussions with programme management, teaching staff, students, alumni, and administrative representatives as well as graduate employers and business cooperations. The site visit was well-structured and provided comprehensive insights into the academic and organisational framework.

The Doctoral Programme in Tourism was praised for its methodological depth and the high level of English proficiency demonstrated by both lecturers and doctoral candidates. The doctoral programmes in Economics and Finance showed significant challenges with regard to English language skills, which might hinder effective supervision of dissertations conducted in English. Moreover, structured methodological training was lacking in these programmes and has so far only been offered on an optional basis.

Across all three study programmes, weaknesses were identified in the clarity and accessibility of information provided on the university website, as prospective applicants do not always receive sufficiently clear guidance on programme structure, requirements, and academic expectations. In addition, general subject areas such as artificial intelligence and information technology are not yet systematically aligned with the specific profiles of the programmes, and the international research and teaching experience of doctoral supervisors could be further strengthened. Further weaknesses include limited use of quantitative workload data for quality assurance purposes and the absence of a continuous, systematic process for tracking graduate employment outcomes and work placements.

In the doctoral programmes Economics and Finance, further weaknesses relate to the alignment between doctoral research topics and the supervisors' own areas of expertise and active research, as well as the systematic integration of current developments from international research into doctoral supervision. In addition, the availability of English-language textbooks and core literature—particularly in the Doctoral Programme in Economics—should be expanded to strengthen international academic standards, research quality, and access to contemporary global scholarship.

General impressions of the panel members

The expert panel formed an overall favourable impression of the programmes, particularly regarding the institution's commitment to ensuring quality and pursuing continual enhancement. The site visit was marked by openness and constructive exchange, which the panel greatly appreciated. Stakeholders across all groups demonstrated a high degree of engagement and were actively involved in the discussions.

The panel was particularly impressed by the professionalism of the teaching staff and the effectiveness of the student support services across the programmes. Doctoral students benefit from strong support structures, including regular feedback on their progress, and both they and the lecturers conveyed that supervision is close, approachable, and highly responsive. In addition, students are organised into groups with an assigned tutor, which fosters continuous peer interaction, facilitates the exchange of experiences, and encourages mutual motivation and learning.

Furthermore, the objectives of the programmes appeared well aligned with both academic standards and the evolving requirements of the labour market. The learning environment was perceived as inclusive and supportive, contributing to a positive student experience. Throughout the visit, the institution's willingness to respond to feedback and to align its practices with international standards was clearly evident.

Quality Profile

HEI: L.N. Gumilyov Eurasian National University

PhD programme:

1. Doctoral Programme of Tourism (DT)
2. Doctoral Programme of Economics (DE)
- 3 Doctoral Programme of Finance (DF)

		Exceptional	Exceeds ²	Meets ³	Does not meet ⁴	n.r.	Recommendation ⁵
1	Objectives						
1.1*	Objectives of the Doctoral Programme (Asterisk Criterion)			X			
1.2	Positioning of the Doctoral Programme on the Education Market			X			
1.3	Positioning of the Doctoral Programme in the Strategic Concept of the Higher Education Institution			X			
1.4*	Inclusive and Equitable Education (Asterisk Criterion)			X			
2	Admission						
2.1*	Admission Conditions and Procedures (Asterisk Criterion)			X			X
2.2	Selection Procedure			X			
3	Implementation						
3.1	Structure						
3.1.1*	Structural Setup of the Doctoral Programme (Asterisk Criterion)			X			
3.1.2*	Scientific Supervision (Asterisk Criterion)		DT	DE, DF			X
3.1.3*	Doctoral Degree Regulations (Asterisk Criterion)			X			
3.2	Contents						
3.2.1*	Logic and Conceptual Consistency (Asterisk Criterion)			X			X
3.2.2*	Science and Research Based Teaching (Asterisk Criterion)			X			
3.2.3*	Multidisciplinary Qualifications (Asterisk Criterion)			X			

² quality requirements.

³ quality requirements.

⁴ quality requirements leading to condition or recommendation.

⁵ The measures that the HEI takes in order to implement the recommendations of the panel members will have to be considered during the re-accreditation.

		Exceptional	Exceeds ²	Meets ³	Does not meet ⁴	n.r.	Recommendation ⁵
3.2.4*	Examinations (Asterisk Criterion)			X			
3.3	Teaching and Learning Methodology						
3.3.1*	Logic and Comprehensibility of the Didactic Concept (Asterisk Criterion)			X			
3.3.2	Course Materials and Recommended Literature			X			X
4	Scientific Environment and Framework Conditions						
4.1	Teaching Staff						
4.1.1*	Structure and Number of Teaching Staff (Asterisk Criterion)			X			
4.1.2*	Scientific Qualification of Teaching Staff (Asterisk Criterion)			X			
4.1.3*	Pedagogical Qualification of Teaching Staff (Asterisk Criterion)			X			
4.1.4	Internationality of Teaching Staff			DT	DE, DF		X
4.1.5*	Internal Cooperation within the Faculty (Asterisk Criterion)			X			
4.2	Cooperation and Partnerships						
4.2.1*	Scientific Integration of the Doctoral Students (Asterisk Criterion)			X			
4.2.2	Networking of the Scientists			X			
4.2.3	Networking of the Doctoral Students			X			
4.3	Programme Management						
4.3.1*	Structural Organisation (Asterisk Criterion)			X			
4.3.2	Management Support			X			
4.4	Material Resources						
4.4.1*	Quality of the Classrooms and Working Places (Asterisk Criterion)			X			
4.4.2*	Equipment (Literature, Magazines, Databases) for the Library (Asterisk Criterion)			DT	Con: DE, DF		
4.5	Finance Planning and Financing						
4.5.1*	Finance Planning and Financing of the Doctoral Programme (Asterisk Criterion)			X			

		Exceptional	Exceeds ²	Meets ³	Does not meet ⁴	n.r.	Recommendation ⁵
4.5.2	Financial Support and Scholarship Programmes			X			
5	Quality Assurance						
5.1*	Quality Assurance in terms of Contents, Processes and Research (Asterisk Criterion)			X			X
5.2*	Inclusion of Quality Assurance in a Superordinate Quality Concept (Asterisk Criterion)			X			
5.3	Evaluation by Doctoral Students			X			
5.4	Evaluation by Supervisors and Faculty			X			
5.5	Evaluation by Third Parties (Graduates, and other external Stakeholders)			X			X

Conditions

The panel members identified a need for improvement in the following aspects⁶ Doctoral Degree Regulations, Quality of the Classrooms and Working Places, Equipment (Literature, Magazines, Databases) for the Library and Science and Research Based Teaching. Therefore, they recommend accreditation on condition of meeting the following requirements:

All programmes:

- **Condition 1** (see chapter 3.1.3):
- **A) The University develops a comprehensive institutional policy on the use of Artificial Intelligence (AI) in teaching and learning. This policy should provide clear guidance for students and staff on the appropriate and responsible use of AI tools within the academic environment.**

Doctoral Programme in Economics, Doctoral Programme in Finance:

- **Condition 2** (see chapter 4.4.2):
The HEI obtains access to relevant financial and economic databases.

Proof of fulfilment of the above-mentioned conditions must be submitted by March 18, 2027.

Furthermore, the quality requirement that has not been fulfilled – Internationality of the Teaching Staff for the Economy and Finance programmes – does not represent an Asterisk Criterion and therefore does not result in a condition. The measures the HEI takes to solve the identified problem are to be reviewed as part of the re-accreditation process.

⁶ These aspects are Asterisk Criteria which means that they are essential for the study programme.

Recommendations

The panel members identified several areas where improvements could further strengthen the programmes and recommend:

- improving and clarifying the information provided on the university website regarding so that prospective and eligible applicants clearly understand the programme structure, requirements, and academic expectations before applying (chapter 2.1).
- shifting progressively toward paper-based dissertations, with paper writing firmly integrated into doctoral and Brown Bag seminars, and supported by active conference participation and international mobility opportunities (chapter 3.1.3).
- aligning general subject areas, such as artificial intelligence and information technology, more closely with the specific profile of each study programme (chapter 3.2.1).
- strengthening the international research and teaching experience of doctoral supervisors through increased engagement in global academic activities (see chapter 4.1.4).
- complementing the existing workload survey by systematically collecting quantitative data on students' actual time investment in order to enable a more accurate, comparable, and outcome-oriented assessment of whether the intended workload aligns with the real study demands (see chapter 5.1).
- establishing a continuous and systematic process for monitoring the employment outcomes and work placements of graduates in order to better assess labour market relevance and inform ongoing programme development (see chapter 5.5).

Doctoral programmes Economics and Finance

- ensuring a closer alignment between the research topics of doctoral candidates and the supervisors' own areas of expertise and active research (chapter 3.1.2).
- supervisors systematically incorporating current topics and developments from international research into the scientific supervision of doctoral students (chapter 3.1.2).
- encouraging doctoral supervisors to further enhance their international research and teaching experience, for example through academic mobility, international research collaboration, and visiting professorships, in order to strengthen the quality and international orientation of doctoral supervision (see chapter 4.1.4).

Doctoral programmes Economics

- expanding the availability of English-language textbooks and core literature in the Doctoral Programme in Economics in order to strengthen international academic standards, research quality, and access to current international scholarship (chapter 3.3.2).

Exceeding

In addition to the conditions and recommendations, the panel members recognised a strength of the Doctoral programme of Tourism that exceed the required standards:

- Scientific Supervision (see chapter 3.1.2)

Information

Information on the Institution

L.N. Gumilyov Eurasian National University (hereafter: ENU) was founded in 1996 by the Decree of N.A. Nazarbayev, the first President of the Republic of Kazakhstan. In 2022, ENU was granted the status of a research university.

The University's mission, vision, and values were determined based on an analysis of global and national trends in higher education and the results of the previous strategy.

ENU's mission is to generate new knowledge and innovation in the Eurasian space, developing competitive individuals to serve the state and society. Its vision is to become a globally competitive national research university built on an innovative ecosystem and digital technologies. The University's values are quality, trust and openness, professionalism and responsibility, academic honesty, tolerance and patriotism.

ENU consists of eleven faculties, the Institute of Physical and Technical Sciences, the Higher School of Education, and the Dutch Business School (Eurasian Netherlands Business School). There is also a military department in two military accounting specialties. Study programmes are offered at the Bachelor, Master and PhD levels. The courses are conducted in Kazakh, Russian and English.

Currently, the University continues to strengthen its reputation and develop its research potential. ENU's research activities are developing along a cluster approach and are aimed at advancing fundamental and applied scientific research, as well as innovative activities. The six priority scientific clusters are: Physical Sciences and Nuclear Technologies; Mathematics and Information Technology; Biology, Biomedicine and Biotechnology; Engineering; Chemistry and Earth Sciences; Social Sciences and Humanities.

All three doctoral programmes are located at the Faculty of Economics, which was established in 1996 and comprises six academic chairs. The Doctoral Programme in Economics is implemented by the Department of Economics and Entrepreneurship since 2005. At the undergraduate level, the department implements two educational programs the Bachelor of Economics and the Bachelor's in economics of Entrepreneurship and Business. At the master's level, the department implements two educational programs: Master's of Economics and Master's in International business and strategic trade control. The Doctoral Programme in Finance is part of ENU's doctoral portfolio and is implemented by the Department of Finance, which offers education at all three levels: Bachelor's programmes in Finance, Master's programmes in Finance, and the Doctoral Programme in Finance. The Doctoral Programme in Tourism is the only doctoral programme in this field at ENU and is implemented by the Department of Tourism since 2011. At the Bachelor's level, the Department of Tourism offers the Bachelor's programme in Tourism, the Bachelor's programme in Restaurant and Hotel Business, and the Bachelor's programme in Organisation of Tourist Services. At the Master's level, the Department offers the Master's programme in Tourism and the Master's programme in Restaurant and Hotel Business.

Further Development of the Programme, Implementation of Recommendations from Previous Accreditation

Doctoral Programme in Tourism

The Doctoral programme Tourism is offered by the Department of Tourism in the Faculty of Economics. The department places emphasis on developing its education programmes: The curriculum is being revised based on input from key stakeholders and labour market trends; measures are being implemented to increase the labour market demand of graduates; the quality of the faculty is being improved, professors from leading international universities are being attracted, and the geography of research internships is being expanded.

Between 2020 and 2025, the education programme was updated to include courses focused on research and digital competencies, including the use of artificial intelligence tools. Learning outcomes were also aligned with the professional standards approved by the National Chamber of Entrepreneurs “Atameken.”

Over the past five years, the programme has been delivered by faculty with experience in tourism education and research. All participating faculty hold PhD degrees, publish in Scopus- and Web of Science-indexed journals ($h\text{-index} \geq 2$), and are involved in nationally and internationally funded research projects.

Professors from leading foreign universities are involved, like United Kingdom, Pakistan, Russia and Germany.

In the Independent Ranking of Demand for Universities of the Republic of Kazakhstan conducted by the Independent Agency for Accreditation and Rating (IAAR), the Doctoral Programme in Tourism ranked 2nd in 2021 and 2022, and 1st from 2023 to 2025.

In 2025, tourism education programmes entered the QS subject ranking in Hospitality and Leisure Management, placing in the TOP 101–150 range at 119th position. In the same subject area, ENU also received the highest rating of five stars in the QS Stars ranking.

In recent years, there has been a steady increase in demand for doctoral programmes.

Following the 2019 accreditation, the FIBAA Assessment Report identified areas for improvement (see below).

Doctoral Programme in Economics

The Doctoral Programme in Economics is implemented by the Department of Economics and Entrepreneurship of the Faculty of Economics. The academic staff of the department consists of 23 faculty members. A total of twelve faculty members deliver the doctoral educational programme, with 100% holding academic degrees.

The programme demonstrates leading positions in both national and international rankings. In the Independent Ranking of Kazakhstan Universities, conducted by the Independent Agency for Accreditation and Rating (IAAR), the programme consistently holds top positions: 1st place in 2020–2021, 2nd place in 2022–2025. The disciplines of the educational programme are included in the QS World University Rankings by Subject: 2021 – TOP 451–500, 2022 – TOP 351–400, 2023 – TOP 301–350, 2024 – TOP 251–300, 2025 – TOP 301–350.

During 2020–2025, several modifications were introduced into the educational programme:

- In the 2022 admission cycle, the courses “The Course of the Kazakhstan Scientific Consultant” / “Special Course from the Foreign Supervisor” (Profile Disciplines of the Elective Component) were replaced with the disciplines “Comprehensive Analysis of the Economic System” and “Integration Economics” (Profile Disciplines of the Elective Component).
- Based on the recommendations of the department’s teaching staff, in the 2023 admission cycle, the discipline “Integration Economics” was replaced by “Knowledge-

Intensive Economy”, aimed at an in-depth study of the interaction between science and the economy in the context of technological change and innovation processes.

Doctoral Programme in Finance

The Doctoral Programme in Finance is offered by the Department of Finance of the Faculty of Economics. Between 2020 and 2025, the programme was updated based on recommendations from employers and faculty, in particular:

- the following disciplines were introduced into the education programme for the 2020 admission cycle: “Academic Writing”, “National Financial Development Institutions”, “Methods of Scientific Research”, “Financial Technologies”, “Trends in the Development of the Insurance System”;
- the following disciplines were introduced into the education programme for the 2021 admission cycle: “Risk management in the financial market”, “Anti-crisis financial regulation”, “Informatisation of the financial sector”, “Methods and models of investment design”, “Risk-oriented regulation in financial markets”;
- the discipline “Financial Sector Research” was introduced into the education programme for the 2022 admission cycle;
- the following disciplines were introduced into the education programme for the 2023 admission cycle: “Methods and Models in Financial Research”, “Investment Design”, and “Financial Stability: Assessment Methods”.

These changes strengthened learning outcomes, improving the quality of student training. Twenty-one doctoral students graduated from the programme between 2020 and 2025. Graduates are working in research centres, universities, and government agencies (ministries and departments). The employment rate for the programme is 100%.

Recommendations from last accreditation of all three programmes

During their initial accreditation, the all three programmes had the following recommendations, which were addressed by the programmes:

1. The expert group recommends that the University consider revising the curricula of doctoral programmes and adjusting their structure to ensure the feasibility of the teaching load. Implement this credit system in full compliance with the ECTS User Guide.

The programmes considered factors, which influences the teaching load. For this the programme tackled the usage of artificial intelligence. Furthermore, the ECTS credits are now distributed evenly across all semesters. The credits system used as being evaluated in 2026 is in full compliance with the ECTS user’s guide.

2. The University shall submit internal regulations for doctoral degrees/doctoral programmes that would define the rules for organising the educational process in PhD programmes, including requirements for research work, scientific supervision, publications, dissertations, etc

Regarding doctoral studies, the following provisions have been updated: Regulation on doctoral studies at the L.N. Gumilyov Eurasian National University, approved on December 26, 2023

3. The expert group recommends paying more attention to the level of English proficiency of teachers both through professional development for existing teachers and through competitive selection procedures for new teachers.

The English level of the teachers was improved through a systematic focus by ENU, the "Easy English " online project and the integration of international professors into the faculty. For instance, "Academic Writing" and "Research Methods," are taught in English. However, the level of English of the interview partners in the course of the visitation was higher in the Tourism study programme than in the other two programmes. Therefore, the panel issued a recommendation for Economy and Finance in chapter 4.1.4 about the internationality of the Teaching Staff.

4. The expert panel recommends revising the questionnaire items and, if necessary, adjusting the projected workload accordingly. The expert panel recommends conducting systematic studies aimed at tracking graduates.

The feedback questionnaire was improved by ENU, however, the panel still issues another recommendation (see chapter 5.1). Every year, in collaboration with the Careers and Business Partnerships Department, the employment status of doctoral students is monitored. A Financial Center has been established under the Ministry of Science and Higher Education to monitor the employment status of doctoral students who received a grant. However, the panel did not see such a tracer study even after asking for it several times. Therefore, they issue another recommendation in chapter 5.1.

5. Conduct an internal or external assessment of the conformity of the elements of the quality control system (EMW, KPIs, surveys, etc.), with particular attention to monitoring the needs of the external environment and relevant internal approvals.

The processes of Quality Assurance were convincingly presented in regulations and through the answers given in the course of the interview sessions.

6. The Commission recommends conducting regular reviews of the University's websites in all three languages (Kazakh, Russian, and English), ensuring that each website is reviewed every three years. Website content should adequately address the needs of external stakeholders and potential students.

Even though the programme worked on the website, the panel still found room for improvement. Therefore, the panel gives a recommendation in chapter 4.2.3 on public information.

Statistical Data

Doctoral Programme in Economics

	2020	2021	2022	2023	2024	2025
# Study Places offered by HEI	<i>no data</i>	8	12	12	5	10
# Applicants						
Σ	<i>no data</i>	<i>no data</i>	<i>no data</i>	5	9	9
f	<i>no data</i>	<i>no data</i>	<i>no data</i>	<i>no data</i>	<i>no data</i>	<i>no data</i>
m	<i>no data</i>	<i>no data</i>	<i>no data</i>	<i>no data</i>	<i>no data</i>	<i>no data</i>
Application	<i>no data</i>	<i>no data</i>	<i>no data</i>	41,67%	112,50%	90,0
# First-Year Students	Σ 13	8	4	4	10	9
f	8	6	3	1	7	7
m	5	2	1	3	3	2
Rate of female students	61,54%	75,00%	75,00%	25,00%	70,00%	77,78%
# Foreign Students	Σ 0	0	0	0	0	0
f	0	0	0	0	0	0
m	0	0	0	0	0	0
Rate of foreign students	0	0	0	0	0	0
Percentage of occupied study places	<i>no data</i>	<i>no data</i>	<i>no data</i>	33,33%	125,00%	90,00%
# Graduates	Σ 2	0	0	Graduate in 2026	Graduate in 2027	Graduate in 2028
f	1	0	0	0	0	0
m	1	0	0	0	0	0
Success rate (students who finished their studies)	15,40%	0,00%	0,00%	Graduate in 2026	Graduate in 2027	Graduate in 2028
Dropout rate (students who dropped their studies)	11 students (completed 3 years full academic course, but still in the process of preparing for defense PhD dissertation)	8 students (completed 3 years full academic course, but still in the process of preparing for defense PhD dissertation)	4 students (completed 3 years full academic course, but still in the process of preparing for defense PhD dissertation)	0,00%	10% (-1 student)	0,00%
Average duration of study	3 years (6 semesters) +	3 years (6 semesters) +	3 years (6 semesters) +	3 years (6 semesters) +	3 years (6 semesters) +	3 years (6 semesters) +
Average grade of final degree	3,5 GPA					

From 2020 to 2025, between five and twelve study places offered. The number of doctoral students has remained stable. The number of first year students fluctuated between four and 13. The rate of female students was mostly at around 75%. As was explained to the experts on site, the doctoral students have three years and two further years' time for publication of the thesis. This leads to the low success rate of 15% of the cohort from 2020 and 0% in 2021 and 2022, because students still need to publish. However, between 2020 and 2025, there were 50 students in total graduating from earlier cohorts. At present, the programme enrolls 23 doctoral students in total.

Doctoral Programme in Finance

	1. Cohort 2020-2021	2. Cohort 2021-2022	3. Cohort 2022-2023	4. Cohort 2023-2024	5. Cohort 2024-2025	6. Cohort 2025-2026
# Study Places offered by HEI	6	4	12	12	6	6
# Applicants	no data	no data	no data			
Σ				5	6	6
f	no data	no data	no data	no data	no data	no data
m	no data	no data	no data	no data	no data	no data
Application	no data	no data	no data	41,67%	100,00%	100,00%
# First-Year Students (accepted applicants)	Σ 2	3	9	5	9	6
f	2	0	7	3	5	4
m	0	3	2	2	4	2
Rate of female students	100,00%	0,00%	77,78%	60,00%	55,56%	66,67%
# Foreign Students	Σ 0	0	0	0	0	0
f	0	0	0	0	0	0
m	0	0	0	0	0	0
Rate of foreign students	0	0	0	0	0	0
Percentage of occupied study places	no data	no data	no data	41,67%	150,00%	100,00%
# Graduates	Σ 1	0	0	5	Graduation in 2028	Graduation in 2029
f	1	0	0	3		
m	0		0	2		
Success rate (students who finished their studies)	50,00%	0,00%	0,00%	release expected	release expected	release expected
Dropout rate (students who dropped their studies)	1 students(completed 3 years full academic course, but still in the process of preparing for defense	1 students(completed 3 years full academic course, but still in the process of preparing for defense PhD dissertation) and 2 drop	9 students(completed 3 years full academic course, but still in the process of preparing for defense			
Average duration of study	3 years (6 semester)	3 years (6 semester)	3 years (6 semester)	3 years (6 semester)	3 years (6 semester)	3 years (6 semester)
Average grade of final degree	3,7			release expected	release expected	release expected

The programme offers between four and twelve study places per year. Usually, they accept less students than there are applicants, between two and nine individuals. As in the Economics programme above, there are no graduates from the cohorts 2021 and later, because of the three years for research and the plus 2-year rule for publication. However, there were 24 graduates from previous cohorts of the doctoral programme in total from 2020 to 2025.

Doctoral Programme in Tourism

	2020	2021	2022	2023	2024	2025
# Study Places	no data	4	10	12	8	10
# Applicants	no data	no data	no data	6		
Σ					7	10
f	no data	no data	no data	no data	no data	no data
m	no data	no data	no data	no data	no data	no data
Application	no data	no data	no data	143.00%	167.00%	240.00%
# First-Year Students	no data	6	11	6	9	10
f	no data	4	9	5	6	7
(accepted applicant)	no data					
m	no data	2	2	1	3	3
Rate of female	no data	66,7	71,4	83,3	66,7	70.00%
# Foreign Students	no data	0	0	0	0	0
f	no data	0		0	0	0
m	no data					
Rate of foreign	no data	0	0	0	0	0
Percentage of occupied study	no data	no data	no data	50.00%	112.50%	100.00%
Σ	no data	1	0	Graduate 2026	Graduate 2027	Graduate 2028
# Graduates	no data	0	0			
f	no data	0	0			
m	no data	1	0			
Success rate (students who)	no data	1.60%	0.00%	Graduate 2026	Graduate 2027	Graduate 2028
Dropout rate (students who dropped their study)	no data	5 students(completed 3 years full academic course, but still in the process of preparing for defense PhD dissertation)	students(completed 3 years full academic course, but still in the process of preparing for defense PhD dissertation)	0.00%	0.00%	0.00%
Average duration of	no data	3 years (6 semester) +	3 years (6 semester) +	3 years (6 semester) +	3 years (6 semester) +	3 years (6 semester) +
Average grade of	no data			Graduate 2026	Graduate 2027	Graduate 2028

The Doctoral Programme in Tourism offers between four and twelve study places per year. There are between six and twelve first year students every year. The rate of female students differs between 66 and 83%. In the cohort from 2021, five from the six students, completed the three years of full academic courses but they are still in the process of preparing for the defense of the PhD dissertation. However, from 2021 until 2025, between six till eleven students graduated per year from earlier cohorts, which are 42 PhD graduates in total in this timeframe.

The indicators for applicants for all three programmes were formed on the basis of the data base of the National Testing Center based on the results of receiving applications from applicants who chose ENU. Acceptance of applications for participation in the competition is carried out by groups of educational programmes. Each programme is part of a Group of educational programmes with the same titles and approximately the same content.

Programme Description and Appraisal in Detail

1. OBJECTIVES

1.1 Objectives of the Doctoral Programme (Asterisk Criterion)

All study programmes

The programmes are implemented in accordance with the national regulatory legal acts of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the National Qualifications Framework of the Republic of Kazakhstan (NQF) Level 8, the European Qualifications Framework (EQF) Level 8, the State Compulsory Standards of Higher and Postgraduate Education, the Professional Standard for Teaching Staff, and for State Audit, with the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan “On State Audit and Financial Control”, and the Professional Standard “Accountant”.

NQF / EQF Level 8 assumes the presence of conceptual knowledge in the field of science and professional activity, the creation of new applied knowledge in the professional field, for work in the field of organisational and technological, production and management, project, research, pedagogical, environmental and other types of activities.

After graduation, the programmes award the degree Doctor of Philosophy (PhD).

Doctoral Programme in Economics

The Doctoral Programme in Economics aims to prepare highly qualified scientist-economists and practicing professionals capable of conducting independent scientific research, performing advanced economic analysis, and making well-founded managerial and strategic decisions. The programme is designed to develop researchers and experts who can address complex economic challenges in both academic and applied contexts.

The educational concept is based on an interdisciplinary approach to economic theory and applied economics, combining advanced scientific methods, modern analytical tools, and innovative teaching and research technologies. Special emphasis is placed on the effective integration of theoretical knowledge with practical skills, as well as on the application of modern digital technologies, including artificial intelligence, in economic research and decision-making. Graduates of the programme are prepared for professional positions such as economist, economist-analyst, economist-researcher, and scientific researcher. They may work in national companies and the quasi-public sector, small, medium, and large private enterprises, analytical and research centres, universities, research institutes, and government bodies. Professional activities include economic planning and budgeting, organisational and managerial decision-making, development and implementation of innovative research projects, economic forecasting and analysis, and teaching using modern pedagogical methods in higher education.

General professional competences of the Economic programme

1. To have an idea of the main stages of development and the change of paradigms in the evolution of economic science; on the subject, ideological methodological specifics of economic sciences; about scientific concepts of world and Kazakhstan economics.

- a. Express and justify your thoughts through a short, sufficiently convincing scientific text.
 - b. Able to analyse and adapt the achievements of world and Kazakhstan science within the framework of the dissertation research
2. have the skills of a responsible and creative attitude to scientific and scientific-pedagogical activity, conducting a patent search and experience in transferring scientific information using modern information and innovative technologies. Protection of intellectual property right to scientific discoveries and developments.
 - a. Analyse relevant static data and develop an economic model for the study of integrated structures
3. Ability to organise, plan, explore, generate their own new scientific ideas, knowledge, expanding the boundaries of scientific knowledge.
 - a. Organise the process of conducting scientific research and generate scientific ideas, argue their point of view in order to study a doctoral dissertation
4. Select and effectively use modern research methodology process information from various sources
 - a. Analyse source information and select research methods to identify problems of an economic nature in the analysis of specific situations, suggest ways to solve them taking into account the action of economic laws at the micro, macro and mega levels
5. ability to make system decisions in specific situations of creating innovative products or services, in accordance with the values and policies of the organisation
 - a. Process information using modern computer tools, analyse methods and tools of planning and market impact applied using AI models at different phases of the economic cycle, identify problems and determine the prospects for economic development of Kazakhstan
 - b. Find non-standard solutions to unstructured problems in the professional and scientific fields by modelling research objects and using software products and information and communication technologies also methods and tools of AI

Doctoral Programme in Finance

The Doctoral Programme in Finance aims to train highly qualified PhD specialists and financial researchers capable of performing advanced educational and research activities and making well-grounded managerial decisions using modern financial technologies. The programme prepares experts who can respond effectively to the challenges of the global financial system and the ongoing digital transformation of the financial sector.

The educational concept is based on state educational standards and focuses on developing strong fundamental knowledge, advanced analytical skills, and the ability to conduct independent scientific research. Particular emphasis is placed on the application of innovative information and communication technologies, including digital finance tools and artificial intelligence, to solve theoretical and applied research problems and support the modernisation of the financial sector.

Graduates are prepared for professional positions such as financial director, financial analyst, expert, head of innovation development, researcher, and lecturer. Areas of professional activity include financial resource management, financial markets, financial institutions, and taxation.

The objects of professional activity include research institutes, higher education institutions, government bodies, enterprises, and financial and analytical services. Professional functions encompass financial and managerial decision-making, analytical and forecasting activities, consulting, scientific research, and teaching in higher education institutions with a financial profile.

General professional competences of the Finance programme:

1. The ability to implement scientific research in practical activities, master the methodology of scientific knowledge, be able to choose and effectively use modern research methodology in practice.
 - a. To involve students in research work in order to increase publication activity, to express and argue their thoughts through a short, sufficiently convincing scientific text. Apply strategies to develop and support research, including publication activities of undergraduate and graduate students.
 - b. Master the methodology of preparing scientific texts for articles, doctoral dissertations and monographs. To participate in the implementation of research and development work / creative projects. To increase scientific effectiveness and publication activity. Work with national and international databases.
 - c. Choose and effectively use methods for assessing financial stability and the complex level of risks. Determine profitability, payback, probable risks compared to potential profit, overall effectiveness of the project.
 - d. To organise and conduct training sessions based on the principles of student-centred learning and assessment. To develop educational and methodological materials on the subjects taught, taking into account the integration of education, science and innovation. Observe the principles of academic integrity.
2. Ability to organise, plan and implement the research process; analyse, evaluate and compare various theoretical concepts in the field of research and draw conclusions; analyse and process information from various sources; conduct independent scientific research, characterised by academic integrity, on the basis of modern theories and methods of analysis; generate your own new scientific ideas.
 - a. Apply methods of assessing the economic efficiency of the industry within the framework of an investment project, artificial intelligence tools for monitoring and assessing financial market volatility. Evaluate and analyse plans, projects, situations, possible risks and results throughout the life cycle, the effectiveness of individual business processes, procedures, and work packages during the life cycle and its performers.
 - b. To investigate innovative processes in the international and Kazakh labour market. Analyse and evaluate financial sector information, market trends, and financial performance forecasting based on artificial intelligence technologies, and apply the results in scientific research. To diagnose the research skills of undergraduate and graduate students.
3. Ability to organise, manage and ensure financial activities of financial and analytical, organisational and managerial nature, orientation in the system of legislation and regulations governing in the field of finance based on the analysis of foreign experience in the organisation of the financial system and its application to subjects of the financial sector.

- a. Apply models of effective financial resource management, identify and analyse changes in the complex level of risks in dynamics, use methods and tools for analysing the consequences of risks, develop risk management plans, and apply scoring as one of the areas of artificial intelligence. Explain and apply risk management techniques in business.
- b. To substantiate financial and economic indicators, apply a methodology for developing financial research tools, financial planning and forecasting models. To involve undergraduate and graduate students in research and development work
- c. Develop risk maps and action plans for risk management using artificial intelligence technologies. Conduct an effective investment assessment. Identify and evaluate alternative sources of business financing and apply business and asset valuation principles.
- d. To make system decisions in specific situations of creating innovative products/services. in accordance with the values and policies of the organisation (in the area of responsibility). Conduct a critical analysis of the organisation's innovation activities throughout the life cycle in various situations.

Doctoral Programme in Tourism

The programme aims to prepare highly qualified scientific, pedagogical, and managerial professionals capable of conducting independent research in the field of tourism development. Graduates are trained to identify effective measures to stimulate the tourism industry and to develop well-founded management decisions based on research results, as well as to implement these decisions in practice. The educational concept is based on strong scientific and professional training, ensuring that specialists contribute to the tourism sector at an international level.

The programme prepares graduates for a wide range of professional positions, including lecturers in higher education institutions, researchers in scientific and research-production organisations, and managers or heads of research groups in administrative, expert, and professional institutions. Graduates may work in research and educational organisations, government bodies, international and public organisations, as well as enterprises and associations within the tourism industry.

The main objects of professional activity include research institutes and centres, higher education institutions accredited at the international level, government authorities, and tourism-related organisations. Professional functions encompass the collection, processing, and analysis of scientific information, the development and application of research results, participation in research and experimental activities, strategic planning, and teaching in higher education.

General professional competences of the Tourism programme:

1. To have an idea about the mechanism of implementation of scientific research on practical activities; know and understand the methodology of scientific knowledge; be able to choose and effectively use modern research methodology in practice.
 - a. Use science metric methods of analysing the results of scientific activity, analyse scientific research, have an idea of the history of tourism, use

- theoretical models and knowledge to analyse specific stages of research work to prepare scientific publications, apply artificial intelligence technologies in accordance with the principles of academic integrity
- b. Be able to work national and international databases, apply strategies for the development and support of research, including publication activity, and effectively use artificial intelligence technologies in organising scientific activities
2. Organisation of high-quality scientific and research process and development of communicative skills in professional activities
 - a. Be able to develop teaching materials in the disciplines taught, taking into account the integration of education, science and innovation
 3. Ability to conduct and compare research results, manage information and monitor the development of the tourist market.
 4. To know the methodology of theoretical,
 - a. empirical, fundamental, applied, socio-economic, interdisciplinary research within the framework of the study of the tourist sphere
 - b. Be able to analyse the organisational structures of innovative tourism zones using cluster initiatives, have skills in researching the business climate in the tourism sector
 5. Organisation of high-quality scientific -and pedagogical process and development of communicative skills in professional activities
 - a. Ability to use acquired skills in organising tourism activities, taking into account ensuring sustainable development of the environment and maintaining environmental attractiveness

Appraisal:

The subject-specific qualification objectives of the study programmes are convincingly defined and correspond with the intended academic level at graduation. The objectives consider the requirements of the national qualification framework and the individual student's personal development. The graduation profiles are aligned with the targeted professional fields, with an emphasis on developing the employability skills necessary for the students' chosen careers.

		Exceptional	Exceed	Meet	Does not meet	n.r.	Recommendation
1.1*	Objectives of the Doctoral Programme (Asterisk Criterion)			X			

1.2 Positioning of the Doctoral Programme on the Education Market

All study programmes

In national rankings, the University regularly takes a position at the very top. In the last five years, ENU has been ranked first or second every single of IAAR's National Ranking on

Demand for HEIs in Kazakhstan. Internationally, ENU is ranked 317th in the QS World University Ranking 2025.

Doctoral Programme in Economics

In the postgraduate education market of Kazakhstan, several universities offer doctoral programmes in Economics, including Al-Farabi Kazakh National University, NARXOZ University, and Turan University. Within this competitive environment, the Doctoral Programme in Economics at ENU is characterised by a clearly defined academic profile, strong research orientation, and close integration with public-sector and analytical institutions. Cooperation with national economic and policy-oriented organisations ensures that doctoral research remains relevant to current economic challenges and policy development. The programme's strategic orientation is reinforced through active cooperation with national research institutes, analytical centres, and international universities, enabling doctoral students to engage in joint research projects and international scientific exchange. Partners include the Kazakhstan Institute for Strategic Studies under the President of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the Institute of Economics of the Science Committee of the Ministry of Science and Higher Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan, Research Center "Jupiter" LLP, the University of Economics in Bratislava (Slovakia), and the Warsaw University of Technology. A comprehensive support system promotes doctoral research through access to state research grants, academic mobility, international research internships, and participation in international conferences.

A distinctive feature of the programme is the long-standing Dissertation Council, which has been operating since 2014 and has supported a substantial number of successful doctoral defences, demonstrating academic maturity and institutional stability. The steady number of applications and admissions over recent years indicates sustained interest and a stable doctoral cohort. Regular expert feedback from practitioners and employers further supports continuous alignment with developments in economic science and applied research, reinforcing the programme's clear positioning within the postgraduate education landscape.

Doctoral Programme in Finance

The Doctoral Programme in Finance is well established within the postgraduate education landscape of Kazakhstan and attracts doctoral candidates due to its strong academic profile and practice-oriented content. The programme curriculum reflects current developments in financial science and professional practice, with a particular focus on financial stability, risk-based regulation and digitalisation. New courses introduced in recent years, including Methods and Models in Financial Research, Informatisation of the Financial Sector, and Research Methods, strengthen doctoral students' analytical and research competencies and respond to feedback from external stakeholders and labour-market representatives.

The programme operates in a competitive environment alongside leading national universities but benefits from ENU's status as a national research university, its extensive international partnerships, and opportunities for academic mobility. A long-standing Dissertation Council, active since 2015, has supported multiple successful doctoral defences, demonstrating academic continuity and effectiveness. Stable application and enrolment figures indicate sustained interest, while strong research supervision, publication opportunities, and international internships further reinforce the programme's clear academic and professional profile.

Doctoral Programme in Tourism

The doctoral programme Tourism occupies a distinctive position in postgraduate education in Kazakhstan and Central Asia due to its strong research orientation and international focus. The programme is dedicated to training researchers and managers capable of advancing sustainable, digital, and cultural tourism at both national and international levels. Its academic continuity is supported by a dedicated Dissertation Council, which accompanies doctoral candidates from admission through to successful dissertation defence.

The programme benefits from extensive international cooperation with partner universities across Europe, Asia, and the Caucasus, enabling doctoral students to participate in research internships, academic mobility, and joint research projects abroad. The curriculum is built on interdisciplinary and innovative approaches and includes courses addressing sustainability, green economy, tourism business climate analysis, and academic research skills. Stable demand for doctoral places, competitive grant allocation, and strong engagement with stakeholders from public authorities and professional associations underline the programme's relevance. Overall, the programme serves as a research platform that contributes to the development of tourism science and professional expertise in Kazakhstan and the wider region.

Appraisal:

The doctoral programmes are positioned convincingly in the postgraduate education market based on the described profile, the pursued qualification and competency goals.

		Exceptional	Exceed	Meet	Does not meet	n.r.	Recommendation
1.2	Positioning of the Doctoral Programme on the Education Market			X			

1.3 Positioning of the Doctoral Programme in the Strategic Concept of the Higher Education Institution

All study programmes

The programmes, both at the stage of development and during their implementation, are integrated into the overall concept of ENU's Strategy. They consider the mission, vision, and institutional values, and are aimed at harmonising their content with comparable programmes offered by foreign universities, as well as at incorporating the results of scientific research. The programmes Economy, Finance and Tourism correspond to the sixth priority scientific cluster with regional impact – Social Sciences and Humanities:

- Contribution to the development of the country and the capital,
- Strengthening ENU's global standing,
- Autonomisation and expansion of managerial and financial autonomy,
- Creating a Science and Education Ecosystem,
- Computerisation and digitalisation of core activities and management.

When formulating the programmes' objectives and defining competencies, consideration is given to the specific nature of ENU as a multidisciplinary research university and its links with the real sector of the economy and international partners. Specific procedures for planning and implementing educational activities are outlined in the Academic Policy.

As a research university, the institution requires doctoral students to publish their research results and actively participate in scientific seminars and conferences, including at the international level. In accordance with the Strategy, the programmes are implemented on the basis of innovative technologies, including distance learning technologies, open online courses, digital educational resources and the necessary software.

Appraisal:

The doctoral programmes are convincingly integrated into the HEI's overall strategic concept. The doctoral programmes' qualification objectives are in line with ENU's mission and vision.

		Exceptional	Exceed	Meet	Does not meet	n.r.	Recommendation
1.3	Positioning of the Doctoral Programme in the Strategic Concept of the Higher Education Institution			X			

1.4 Inclusive and Equitable Education (Asterisk Criterion)

All programmes

The University has approved a Roadmap for the Development of Inclusive Education at ENU for 2023 to 2025. The educational process is carried out in accordance with the "Methodological Recommendations for Teachers and Staff on Working with Students with Special Educational Needs".

ENU operates a Centre for Inclusive Support and has implemented measures to develop an inclusive educational environment through infrastructure improvements such as ramps, lifts, elevators, tactile boards, call buttons, anti-slip flooring, and others. If a student with special educational needs requires an individualised educational process, teachers develop individual assessment criteria for the subject, taking into account the student's perception, pace of learning and specific interaction style. ENU offers a 30% tuition discount for students with special educational needs. Additional support is provided through the ENU Endowment Fund scholarship programme in the "Inclusion" category. Students may also receive social scholarships, financial aid and benefits in accordance with the legislation of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

At the Scientific Library, an Inclusive Information and Resource Room is set up, equipped with personal computers and a scanner, with screen-reading software installed to facilitate access to information for students with visual impairments.

There is a Centre for Psychological Support, and an Ombudsperson has been appointed to protect students' rights. Social support is provided to all categories of students. In 2022, the University launched the Silver University programme through the Institute of Continuing Education, offering courses for citizens aged 50+.

In 2024, the University approved a Sustainable Development Policy. The document was developed considering requirements and provisions in the field of ESG (environmental, social, and corporate governance).

ENU pays special attention to international students studying on joint programmes and academic mobility programmes, within which free tuition and free accommodation are provided.

The University has an Academic Policy. Clause 4 of the Policy outlines the University's values, including academic integrity, tolerance, and patriotism. Clause 26 states that the organisation of the educational process is based on the principles of openness, transparency, objectivity, accessibility, and ethical norms. Any form of discrimination at the University is prohibited, including on social, racial, gender, ethnic, and religious grounds.

Information on the principles of equality and inclusiveness is communicated to students and staff through:

orientation meetings and advisor hours;

the Platonus system;

ENU official web resources (<https://enu.kz/ru/page/student-life>);

the Centre for Inclusive Support (<https://enu.kz/ru/page/inclusive-enu/the-center-for-inclusive-support>).

Appraisal:

The study programmes comply with principles of inclusive and equitable education, or non-discrimination policies. There is assistance and support for students in special circumstances, such as students with impairments or disabilities, with children, foreign students, economically disadvantaged students and students from non-academic backgrounds. They have a legitimate claim in terms of temporal and formal requirements in the programme as well as for all concluding or accompanied certificates of achievement. Within the framework of aptitude testing, procedures in place.

		Exceptional	Exceed	Meet	Does not meet	n.r.	Recommendation
1.4*	Inclusive and Equitable Education (Asterisk Criterion)			X			

2. ADMISSION

2.1 Admission Conditions and Procedures (Asterisk Criterion)

All programmes

Admission to doctoral programmes at ENU is performed according to the “Admission Rules for Higher and Postgraduate Education Programs at ENU”. These rules conform to the Model regulations of admission to the educational organisations implementing study programmes of higher and postgraduate education” issued by the Ministry of Science and Higher Education. All information about admission rules is posted on ENU’s website.

Admission is based on a state educational grant or on a fee-paying basis. Individuals with general secondary, technical and vocational, or postsecondary education may apply. Applicants must also successfully complete the Unified National Test and achieve the passing score of 75 points, consisting of an essay, a programme-specific exam, and an interview.

Mandatory admission requirements are:

- possession of a master’s degree in the relevant field;
- passing entrance exams in the specialty and a foreign language (English/German/French);
- Acceptable documents for English include:
 - IELTS Academic (not lower than 5.0),
 - TOEFL IBT (from 35 points),
 - TOEFL ITP (from 417 points),
 - TOEIC (from 550 points),
 - Duolingo English Test (from 80 points) or corresponding exams in German or French at a level of at least B1.
- Acceptable documents for German include:
 - German: DSH – Level B1 or higher;
 - TestDaF – Level B1 or higher
- Acceptable documents for French include:
 - French: TFI – Level B1 or higher in reading and listening sections;
 - DELF – Level B1 or higher; DALF – Level B1 or higher;
 - TCF – Level B1 or higher.
- submission of a preliminary research proposal reflecting the candidate’s research interests and compliance with the profile of the doctoral programme;
- passing an interview with the prospective supervisor and members of the department.

Students are enrolled until August 25 for doctoral programmes until August 28 and from December 26 to January 10 of the calendar year.

Admission of foreign applicants to the fee-paying department of doctoral studies is carried out based on the results of an interview.

2.2 Selection Procedure

All study programmes

The selection stage includes a computer-based test at the National Testing Centre, consisting of an essay and specialised exam questions. An interview is also held to assess academic motivation, research potential, and the relevance of the research topic to the priorities of the respective study programme. Analytical skills, critical thinking, and the ability to formulate scientific hypotheses are focussed. This way, the assessment process encompasses both the applicant's formal knowledge and personal competencies.

Based on the results of testing, examinations, and interviews, a final ranking of applicants is determined. Only those candidates who meet the minimum threshold (75 points) are admitted to the competition for a state educational grant. Priority is given to applicants with proven scientific experience, publications, and participation in research projects. The admission decision is made by the ENU's Admissions Committee, approved by order of the rector, and officially communicated to applicants.

Doctoral Programme in Economics

Applicants to the Doctoral programme Economics must hold a master's degree and have at least one year of work experience. At present, the total number of doctoral students is 23. All doctoral students are enrolled under the state educational grant, with the exception of one individual, admitted in 2021, who studied on a fee-paying basis.

Doctoral Programme in Finance

All doctoral students are trained on the basis of a state grant.

Between the 2019 and 2025 academic years, a total of 38 doctoral students were admitted to the programme among them one doctoral student was lecturer of the Department of Finance and five doctoral students were employees of the University.

There is clear continuity in student progression across the bachelor's, master's, and doctoral levels. Doctoral students in the programme are mostly graduates of the bachelor's and master's programmes of the Finance Department.

Grants

The Ministry of Science and Higher Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan awards educational grants on a competitive basis, based on the number of grants awarded and the number of applicants participating. This mechanism ensures transparency and fairness of the selection process and facilitates the attraction of the most qualified candidates to tertiary education programs.

The selection procedure at the University is documented, and publicly available on the university website.

Appraisal:

The admission requirements are defined and comprehensible. The national requirements are presented and taken into account. The panel **recommends** improving and clarifying the information provided on the university website regarding so that prospective and eligible applicants clearly understand the programme structure, requirements, and academic

expectations before applying. The admission requirements and procedure are described, documented, and accessible to interested parties. The selection procedure is based on transparent criteria and ensures that appropriately qualified students are admitted. The selection procedure is described, documented, and accessible to interested parties. The selection decision is communicated; rejections are reasoned.

		Exceptional	Exceed	Meet	Does not meet	n.r.	Recommendation
2.1*	Admission Conditions and Procedures (Asterisk Criterion)			X			X
2.2	Selection Procedure			X			

3. IMPLEMENTATION

3.1 Structure

3.1.1 Structural Setup of the Doctoral Programme (Asterisk Criterion)

All programmes

Projected study time (semesters, years)	Six semesters / three years
Number of credits (national credits and ECTS credits)	180 National credits / ECTS credits
Workload per National / ECTS credit	30 academic hours per credit
Conversion from national credits to ECTS credits, if applicable	1 National credits = 1 ECTS credit
Weeks per semester	15
Credits for the dissertation	12 National / ECTS credits
Time allocated for writing the dissertation (weeks and/or months)	12 weeks

The structure of the programmes follows the general default structure provided by the “State Compulsory Standard of Higher Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan” (the “GOSO”, approved by Order of the Minister of Science and Higher Education No. 2, 2022) for the postgraduate (doctoral) level of study, a normative framework for designing PhD programmes at the HEIs in Kazakhstan. At the same time, the status of the National University makes it possible for the ENU to develop experimental educational programmes, which can deviate from the GOSO.

In accordance with the GOSO, the structure of the PhD programmes comprises the following components:

- the educational component, including the cycles of basic and major modules (the cycles contain obligatory and elective modules, the pedagogical and the research internship) (45 ECTS),
- the scientific component, enclosing the scientific and research work, the scientific internship abroad and the preparation of the PhD thesis (123 ECTS);
- the final attestation including the defence of the PhD thesis (12 ECTS).

See also chapter 3.2.1 on the Logic and Conceptual consistency of the programmes.

3.1.2 Scientific Supervision (Asterisk Criterion)

Regulations regarding scientific advisors and doctoral dissertation topics are defined in the GOSO and are approved by order of the Rector of the University based on the decision of the Academic Council. The academic supervision of PhD students is provided by at least two advisors, one of whom is a scholar from a foreign university. Section 7.3 of the “Doctoral Studies Regulations” sets forth the appointment and replacement of academic advisors. In accordance with subsection 7.3.1, academic advisor nominations must be discussed at meetings of the graduating departments and the Faculty Council no later than the fifteenth day of the second month of study.

Scientific supervision is assigned to scholars in the relevant scientific field corresponding to the doctoral training profile. A scientific supervisor must hold one of the following academic degrees: Candidate of Sciences, Doctor of Sciences, PhD, or Doctor in Profile, and must have at least three years of scientific and teaching experience. In addition, the supervisor must be the author of at least five scientific articles in publications included in the list of scientific journals recommended by the authorised body in the field of higher and postgraduate education, as well as at least one article in an international peer-reviewed journal.

Foreign supervisors are recruited from leading foreign universities and scientific organisations and must hold a PhD (or equivalent) in the field of the dissertation and relevant scientific publications on the topic over the last five years. One foreign scientific supervisor in doctoral studies is assigned no more than two doctoral students simultaneously within one academic period, and no more than four over three years. The mandatory involvement of a foreign consultant for each doctoral student expands the international context of research and networking opportunities for doctoral students.

Scientific advisors perform a full range of duties related to supporting doctoral students. They jointly plan research work, conduct regular consultations, and monitor the progress and quality of dissertation research. An important principle is the selection of supervisors based on the topic of the dissertation. The professor’s specialisation corresponds to the doctoral student’s field of research.

3.1.3 Doctoral Degree Regulations (Asterisk Criterion)

All programmes

The doctoral programme has established rules and procedures for awarding PhD degrees. The preparation of the dissertation complies with the requirements established by the regulatory legal acts of the Republic of Kazakhstan and the University’s internal documents. In particular, the process of awarding degrees is regulated by the Order of the Ministry of Science and Higher Education “Rules for Awarding Degrees” and the “Regulations on Doctoral Studies”, and the “Regulations on the Dissertation Council”. The documents are publicly available.

The study and examination regulations for the ENU are based on the rules specified in the Decrees of the Ministry of Science and Higher Education, which were incorporated into the University's Academic Policy.

To be awarded the PhD degree, a doctoral student has to meet the following criteria:

to fully master all components of the study programme and successfully pass the module examinations;

to publish the results of the research work in scientific publications in accordance with the state rules for awarding academic degrees;

to pass a comprehensive examination and to complete and successfully defend a PhD thesis in due time.

Dissertations must demonstrate internal coherence, scientific novelty, reliability and practical significance. To safeguard these principles, ENU has introduced measures. Before submitting their dissertation to the Dissertation Council, doctoral students must undergo an ethics review at ENU. The procedure is set out in the “Regulations for the Ethical Review Committee for Dissertation (PhD) Research” from 2022. The Ethics Committee evaluates the establishment of integrity standards (checking the originality of the text, correct citations, and copyright compliance), requirements for ethical approval of research with sensitive data/empirical data. All dissertations undergo plagiarism checks conducted by the National Centre for State Scientific and Technical Expertise, which issues an official report on the originality. Additionally, doctoral candidates are required to comply with ethical standards when using the latest technologies, such as the use of artificial intelligence tools in the research process, which is only permitted with the prior approval of scientific supervisors and the ethics committee, with mandatory disclosure of the fact and nature of the use of artificial intelligence in the text of the dissertation. This requirement is based on the updated degree-awarding regulations and ensures that the principles of independence and authenticity of results are upheld.

The defence of doctoral dissertations is carried out at a meeting of the Dissertation Council. The defence of a doctoral dissertation is carried out in the presence of:

- positive feedback from scientific consultants;
- a series of at least two articles and one review, or three articles published in journals ranked in the first and/or second quartile by impact factor according to Journal Citation data Reports of the company Clarivate Analytics. In one of the articles, the doctoral student is the first author or corresponding author;
- decisions on recommendations for defence (extract from the minutes of the department meeting);
- reviews by two official reviewers whose qualifications (academic or scientific degree) correspond to the profile of the work being defended, which provide a comprehensive description of the dissertation and a reasoned conclusion, with the possibility of awarding the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in the relevant speciality.

Appraisal:

The structure of each programme corresponds to the qualification objectives and effectively connects the courses with the research tasks of doctoral students. The study programmes assign credits on the basis of the necessary student workload. The course descriptions provide detailed descriptions of intended learning outcomes and the information defined in the ECTS Users' Guide 2015.

The research focus of the supervising scientists corresponds to the student's dissertation subject. Being allocated to a supervisor both in fact and in law secures the continual and intensive professional, methodological and scientific supervision of doctoral students. Appropriate time planning for this supervision is also guaranteed. However, the panel sees room for improvement and **recommends** ensuring a closer alignment between the research topics of doctoral candidates and the supervisors' own areas of expertise and active research. The panel further **recommends** that supervisors systematically incorporate current topics and developments from international research into the scientific supervision of doctoral students.

There are handbooks which contain all necessary rules and procedures for teaching, studies and dissertation taking into account AI developments. The HEI has established and implements clear procedures to detect, document, and respond to unscientific behaviour in doctoral research, including but not limited to plagiarism, data manipulation, unethical research practices, and the misuse of AI tools. However, although ENU is in the process of developing an AI policy, it has not yet been finalised and therefore could not be provided.

Therefore, the Panel states the **condition**:

The University develops a comprehensive institutional policy on the use of Artificial Intelligence (AI) in teaching and learning. This policy should provide clear guidance for students and staff on the appropriate and responsible use of AI tools within the academic environment.

Where applicable, regulations take into account national requirements.

The requirements in terms of content, structure, design, duration, study process and examinations are recognised through suitable documentation and publication.

While both dissertation paths—monographs and paper-based dissertations (i.e., theses composed of several publishable research articles framed by an overarching introduction and conclusion)—should remain available, the panel notes that international trends increasingly favour the latter format. A gradual shift toward paper-based dissertations would align the programmes more closely with these standards and offer clear benefits, including enhanced opportunities for doctoral candidates to present their work at conferences and strengthened support for participation in academic mobility programmes. Embedding paper writing more systematically into doctoral training structures, such as doctoral seminars and Brown Bag seminars, would further reinforce this development and provide an effective framework for continuous feedback and skill development.

Therefore, the panel **strongly recommends** shifting progressively toward paper-based dissertations, with paper writing firmly integrated into doctoral and Brown Bag seminars, and supported by active conference participation and international mobility opportunities.

		Exceptional	Exceed	Meet	Does not meet	n.r.	Recommendation
3.1	Structure and content						
3.1.1*	Structural Setup of the Doctoral Programme (Asterisk Criterion)			X			
3.1.2*	Scientific Supervision (Asterisk Criterion)			X			X
3.1.3*	Doctoral Regulations Degree (Asterisk Criterion)				Con		X

3.2 Contents

3.2.1 Logic and Conceptual Consistency (Asterisk Criterion)

All programmes

The programmes are structured to ensure the progressive development of advanced theoretical knowledge, methodological competence, and independent research capacity. They begin with a coursework phase focused on core and specialised disciplines such as academic writing, research methods, and advanced analysis methods. This initial stage provides doctoral candidates with a strong methodological foundation and equips them with the analytical tools required for high-level economic research. The programmes then move into an integrated practice-oriented phase that includes teaching and research internships. The teaching practicum, conducted within the respective department, develops pedagogical and methodological skills in higher education and strengthens the link between research and teaching. The research practicum enables doctoral candidates to apply independent analytical and research skills in real-world settings. In the final phase, doctoral candidates focus on completing their dissertation and undertake an international research internship to deepen expertise and establish academic networks. Research activities continue throughout all semesters and are monitored through regular progress reports under close academic supervision, ensuring steady advancement toward independent scholarly contribution. Integration of interdisciplinary seminars, research workshops, and scientific clubs supports enhanced participation in the academic community and exposure to current economic challenges. Faculty involvement in active research projects ensures that teaching remains connected to contemporary economic inquiry and policy-relevant analysis, fostering systematic disciplinary understanding and sustained engagement in the research field.

3.2.2 Science and Research Based Teaching (Asterisk Criterion)

All programmes

The doctoral programmes combine coursework with contemporary scientific research. Core courses for all three programmes are Academic Writing and Scientific Research Methods. Furthermore, the curricula include several courses specifically dedicated to research methodology, which reflect the current state of knowledge in the respective field. These courses are designed to ensure that the theories, models, and analytical approaches studied correspond to internationally recognised research standards and support the programmes' qualification objectives. Teaching incorporates recent scientific developments. Courses draw on current academic publications, leading international journals, and official statistical data, enabling doctoral candidates to engage with up-to-date research material. Beyond coursework, doctoral candidates shall participate in departmental research projects, seminars, and conferences. Their research results are incorporated into dissertations, publications, and teaching materials, ensuring a continuous and meaningful link between teaching and current scientific research.

Doctoral Programme in Economics

Statistical Analysis in Economics combines theoretical instruction on modern methods of analysing relationships between economic variables with practical application using real economic data. Doctoral candidates calculate indicators, construct models, and interpret results in a research-oriented context. Research-based learning methods are applied across the curriculum, including case studies, economic-mathematical modelling, and project-based assignments in courses such as Research Methods and Organisation and Methodology of Teaching Economic Disciplines.

Doctoral Programme in Finance

Courses on financial stability and financial research methods combine theoretical instruction with practical application, including modelling financial processes, analysing systemic risks, and assessing regulatory frameworks using real datasets. Research-based learning methods such as case studies, quantitative and econometric modelling, project assignments, and stress-testing exercises are applied throughout the programme.

Doctoral Programme in Tourism

Core courses such as Sustainable Tourism Development and the Circular Economy, Modern Tourism in a Green Economy, and Researching the Business Climate in Tourism are aligned with current developments in tourism science and focus on contemporary research approaches. These courses draw on international academic literature, real-world case studies, and modern data analysis techniques, including the use of digital tools, big data, and artificial intelligence applications in tourism research. Research-based learning methods such as case analysis, project-based assignments, and applied policy evaluation are used to link theory with empirical investigation.

3.2.3 Multidisciplinary Qualifications (Asterisk Criterion)

Doctoral Programme in Economics

The programme emphasises doctoral candidates' ability to exchange knowledge within specialised fields, present research to academic audiences, and communicate complex findings in accessible ways. Interdisciplinary coursework such as Statistical Analysis in Economics, Econometrics and Modelling of Economic Processes, Knowledge-Intensive Economics, Research Methods, and Academic Writing equips doctoral students with analytical tools and communication skills necessary for academic discussion and public presentation. These courses encourage students to integrate perspectives from economics, technology, logistics, ecology, and social sciences, fostering systemic and critical thinking.

Doctoral research topics further demonstrate this interdisciplinary and communicative focus. Dissertation themes such as Economic Mechanisms for Ensuring Environmental Safety in the Atyrau Region, Impact of Logistics Systems on the Efficiency of Kazakhstan's Economy, Legislative Regulation of Housing Construction, Improving the Functioning of the Healthcare System, and Investment Impact on Tourism Development illustrate how doctoral candidates address socially relevant issues and translate research outcomes into policy- and practice-oriented insights.

Active participation in scientific conferences, interdisciplinary seminars, roundtables, and scientific clubs enables doctoral students to present research results, engage in scholarly debate, and receive peer feedback. These formats also promote teamwork, leadership, and

moderation skills. Through sustained involvement in research projects and academic discussion platforms, doctoral candidates develop the capacity to advance scientific, social, and economic progress within their professional environments.

Doctoral Programme in Finance

The programme intends to enable doctoral candidates to discuss specialised knowledge with peers, present research results to academic audiences, and communicate complex financial issues in an accessible manner. Interdisciplinary coursework such as Informatization of the Financial Sector, Financial Stability: Assessment Methods, Risk-Based Regulation in Financial Markets, Academic Writing, and Research Methods develops both analytical competence and scientific communication skills. These courses train doctoral candidates to apply methods from economics, digital technologies, and risk management and to present research outcomes to academic, professional, and public audiences.

The interdisciplinary nature of doctoral research is reflected in dissertation topics such as Financing Mechanisms for Small and Medium-Sized Businesses in Agriculture, Budget Regulation of Financial Security in the Context of Global Challenges, Digitalisation of Public-Private Partnership Financing for Sustainable Economic Development, Green Financing Based on an Investment-Budget Approach, and Development of Financing Systems for Integrated Enterprises in the Agro-Industrial Complex. These topics demonstrate the ability to integrate finance with digitalisation, sustainability, public policy, and sectoral analysis.

Doctoral candidates present their research at scientific conferences, departmental seminars, and roundtables, where interdisciplinary discussion and peer feedback are encouraged. Participation in these academic forums develops leadership, teamwork, and moderation skills and supports the ability to advance scientific, social, and economic progress within the professional financial environment.

Doctoral Programme in Tourism

The programme is designed to develop doctoral candidates' ability to discuss specialised knowledge with academic peers, present research results to scholarly audiences, and communicate research findings to broader professional and public audiences. Interdisciplinary coursework such as Research Methods, Sustainable Tourism Development and the Circular Economy, and Modern Tourism in a Green Economy equips doctoral students with analytical, methodological, and communication skills necessary for academic dialogue and public dissemination of research.

The programme encourages doctoral candidates to integrate perspectives from economics, ecology, sociology, management, and digital technologies, fostering a systemic understanding of tourism processes. Elective modules allow doctoral students to align their learning trajectory with individual research interests in areas such as sustainable development, business climate analysis in tourism, and innovation in leisure and recreation. This flexibility supports coherent research communication tailored to different audiences.

Doctoral candidates participate in departmental research projects, scientific seminars, and discussion forums where research results are presented, critically discussed, and refined. Dissertation topics address socially and economically relevant issues such as ecosystem service assessment in tourist regions, digitalisation of tourism management, sustainable regional development, and inclusive tourism practices. These formats develop skills in

teamwork, moderation, and leadership and enable doctoral candidates to contribute meaningfully to scientific, social, and cultural progress within the tourism sector.

3.2.4 Examinations (Asterisk Criterion)

All programmes

Rules for studying and examinations are regulated by the “Rules for the Organisation of the Educational Process of ENU”, dated 30.05.2025, particularly §§ 8-10, in accordance with the rules specified in the Decrees of the Ministry of Science and Higher Education.

Various forms of assessment are used: written and oral exams, midterm assessments, and project and research report defences.

Exams are held twice a year during the interim assessment period at the end of each semester, according to the approved schedule. The midterm assessment serves as the basis for admitting the doctoral student to the final exam in the course. Assessment criteria are approved by the head of the department and communicated to doctoral students in advance.

The final grade for a course is calculated based on the total score for the current semester’s academic performance, the results of interim assessments, and the exam assignment. The exam accounts for up to 40% of the total score, aiming for a balanced consideration of both the doctoral student’s current work and their final knowledge.

A key element of the examination system is the use of the Platonus automated information system, which records all grades and automatically calculates exam eligibility. Only doctoral students who have achieved at least 50% of the maximum score for the semester are admitted to the exam, aiming to guarantee their readiness for the final knowledge assessment.

For computer-based exams, ENU uses a standardised system that includes pre-loaded test questions. Corrections are permitted only before the exam, ensuring academic integrity and equal conditions for all students. Testing time is 40 minutes per subject. The software automatically records the results and transfers them to the Platonus automated information system, eliminating any possibility of interference with the process after the exam.

Doctoral students who have fully completed the educational process and have met all the requirements for admission to the defence, as stipulated in the University’s “Regulations on Doctoral Studies” (§ 11), may publicly defend their doctoral dissertation. A doctoral student may submit a doctoral dissertation for defence within two years after completing their studies, free of charge, and in subsequent years on a paid basis, amounting to at least eight and four credits respectively. The rules provide for an appeal procedure. Doctoral students have the right to appeal against their assessment, for which an appeals committee is set up.

Appraisal:

The programme follows a clear sequential logic from theory to practice and advanced research and is aligned with doctoral-level qualification requirements defined in the national framework. The doctoral programmes adequately reflect the qualification objectives and takes the national qualification framework into account. The programmes aim for a systematic understanding of the research discipline and the application of research methods. The competency concerning enhanced participation in the research field is at the heart of the implementation. However, the panel saw room for improvement and **recommends** aligning general subject areas, such as artificial intelligence and information technology, more closely with the specific profile of each study programme. In particular, programme-oriented applications (for example, artificial

intelligence in accounting or finance-specific information systems) should be systematically integrated into existing courses to strengthen relevance, coherence, and employability.

Courses on different research methods and approaches to science form part of the curricula of each programme. Teaching reflects the current state of scientific knowledge in accordance with the qualification objectives. It incorporates the most recent developments in research. The doctoral programmes enable their students to discuss the knowledge gained in the specialised fields with their colleagues, to present it before an academic audience and to communicate it to laymen. The programmes promote the ability to manage a team and to advance social, scientific or cultural progress in the respective professional environment. In cases where there are course examinations, they are aligned in format and content to achieve the intended learning outcomes. The dissertation aims at research contribution which expands the state of knowledge and research and stands robust against any national/international assessment carried out by scientists. The evaluation is transparently organised following to international standards.

		Exceptional	Exceed	Meet	Does not meet	n.r.	Recommendation
3.2	Intended competences and skills						
3.2.1*	Logic and Conceptual Consistency (Asterisk Criterion)			X			X
3.2.2*	Science and Research Based Teaching (Asterisk Criterion)			X			
3.2.3*	Multidisciplinary Qualifications (Asterisk Criterion)			X			
3.2.4*	Examinations (Asterisk Criterion)			X			

3.3 Teaching and Learning Methodology

3.3.1 Logic and Comprehensibility of the Didactic Concept (Asterisk Criterion)

All three programmes

The three doctoral study programmes are characterised by the systematic integration of empirical data into the research process, ensuring that theoretical approaches are firmly grounded in real-world evidence. They are further based on a strong scientific foundation, incorporating current research developments and fostering advanced analytical and critical thinking skills. The programmes place particular emphasis on academic independence and personal responsibility, encouraging doctoral candidates to pursue self-directed research and develop original solutions to complex problems.

In addition, individual research paths are supported by taking into account the diverse academic backgrounds and needs of the candidates. Continuous academic supervision, feedback, and opportunities for reflection are integral components of the programmes. The overall design aims to ensure the sustainability of research outcomes by promoting their long-term relevance, dissemination, and contribution to the respective fields of study.

Doctoral Programme in Economics

The teaching and learning methodology of the programme is designed to support the achievement of its qualification objectives through a research-oriented didactic concept. The programme follows pedagogical principles that ensure consistency between learning objectives, teaching methods, and assessment. Doctoral candidates progress systematically from theoretical foundations to advanced research and finally to independent scholarly work culminating in the dissertation.

A wide range of active and research-based teaching methods is applied, including inquiry-based learning, case studies, problem-based tasks, analytical assignments, and project work. These methods enable doctoral candidates to critically analyse, evaluate, and synthesise complex scientific ideas and apply theoretical approaches to real research problems. Assessment focuses on research performance, argumentation, and academic presentation rather than knowledge reproduction.

Each course is supported by syllabi that describe learning outcomes, teaching methods, and assessment formats, ensuring clarity and orientation for doctoral candidates. The programme integrates digital tools and learning technologies, including a learning management system and online collaboration platforms, which facilitate communication, submission of assignments, and access to materials.

Blended-learning elements are applied, particularly through online lectures and supervision by visiting academics, enhancing flexibility while maintaining academic rigor. Overall, the methodology fosters independence, critical thinking, and academic maturity appropriate for doctoral-level research and professional development.

Doctoral Programme in Finance

The teaching and learning methodology of the doctoral programme in Finance is designed and aligned with the programme's qualification objectives. The didactic concept is based on research-oriented, and practice-focused principles, ensuring a progression from theoretical foundations to independent scientific work. Courses such as Research Methods, Academic Writing, Methods and Models in Financial Research, Financial Stability: Assessment Methods, and Informatisation of the Financial Sector apply varied teaching formats, including lectures, analytical workshops, case studies, project-based assignments, and research simulations.

Doctoral candidates are trained to critically analyse, evaluate, and synthesise complex financial data using modern digital and analytical tools, including econometric software, statistical packages, and artificial-intelligence-supported methods for risk assessment and forecasting. Teaching emphasises problem-based learning and the application of theory to real research questions rather than knowledge reproduction.

All teaching and assessment methods are described in course syllabi, providing information regarding learning outcomes and evaluation criteria. The programme is supported by institutional digital platforms, including a learning management system and online collaboration tools, which facilitate access to materials, supervision, and assessment. Blended-learning

elements are integrated, including online lectures and supervision, ensuring flexibility while maintaining academic rigor appropriate for doctoral-level education.

Doctoral Programme in Tourism

The teaching and learning methodology of the programme is designed and aligned with the programme's qualification objectives. The didactic concept is based on scientific, and practice-oriented principles, ensuring a progression from theoretical foundations to independent research and dissertation defence. Teaching methods are selected to support advanced analytical thinking, critical evaluation, and the synthesis of complex ideas related to sustainable and innovative tourism.

A wide range of active and research-based teaching methods is applied, including lectures, seminars, case studies, project-based learning, research workshops, scientific clubs, and fieldwork. These methods enable doctoral candidates to analyse real-world tourism challenges, evaluate research findings, and develop evidence-based solutions. Assessment focuses on research performance, argumentation, and academic presentation rather than knowledge reproduction.

Each course is supported by syllabi describing learning outcomes, teaching methods, and assessment formats. Digital platforms such as Platonus, Zoom, and Google Classroom support blended-learning elements, online supervision, and access to materials. The integration of interactive digital tools, interdisciplinary collaboration, and distance-learning formats enhances flexibility while maintaining academic rigor appropriate for doctoral-level education.

3.3.2 Course Materials and Recommended Literature

All programmes

Each course is supported by a teaching and learning package. In addition to the syllabus, this includes lecture notes, seminar materials, assignments for independent study, and sets of questions for ongoing and final assessment. Teaching and learning materials are updated annually and stored electronically in Platonus. ENU's educational process organisation department monitors the content of electronic courses in Platonus, aiming to ensure that lecturers upload updated materials in a timely manner.

Doctoral students have access to a wide range of sources. These are covering both classic fundamental works on legal theory and contemporary applied works on the state and law, theories and applied works on state audit, entrepreneurship and digital transformation. The literature is selected taking into account the latest scientific research. Lists of recommended sources are regularly updated and include the latest editions of monographs, articles from international databases (Scopus, Web of Science), reports from research centres, etc. Updates to the literature are recorded in the syllabus section on teaching and methodological support.

Digital educational resources and interactive platforms are used in the learning process. Teaching materials are posted and made available to doctoral students through the Platonus platform, as well as external systems such as Moodle, Zoom, Google Classroom, and Microsoft Teams. Video lectures on basic and specialised disciplines are used. These video materials are posted on the MOOC.enu.kz platform.

Multimedia lectures, video case studies, and electronic textbooks make the learning process more visual and flexible for adult learners. The result is a combination of research-oriented learning, a problem-oriented approach, case studies, business games, and scientific seminars.

The departments collect feedback from doctoral students on the resources provided and take it into account when updating teaching guidelines. The departments also share supporting materials with doctoral students to help them develop their academic skills, such as article templates, academic writing guides, and examples of successful dissertations by graduates.

Appraisal:

The teaching and learning methodology of the doctoral programmes are plausible and oriented towards the qualification objectives. Varied teaching and learning methods are applied, including AI. Students are enabled to carry out critical analyses, evaluations and syntheses of new and complex ideas. The teaching and learning methods are described for each course in the course descriptions.

The HEI has installed a digital platform, like a Learning Management System, as a practical tool that facilitates the delivery of the programmes. The teaching and learning methodology of the doctoral programmes is suitable for distance learning and blended-learning and corresponds to the qualification objectives of the doctoral programmes. A well-developed concept is in place to utilise appropriate formats, incorporating the latest techniques in digital education to enhance learning effectiveness.

The accompanying course materials and recommended literature are up-to-date, oriented towards the intended learning outcomes and correspond to the required qualification level. The course materials consider teaching students techniques related to digital education. They support the learning process and encourage students to engage in further independent studies.

For the Doctoral Programme in Economics the panel **recommends** expanding the availability of English-language textbooks and core literature in the Doctoral Programme in Economics in order to strengthen international academic standards, research quality, and access to current international scholarship.

		Exceptional	Exceed	Meet	Does not meet	n.r.	Recommendation
3.3	Teaching and Learning Methodology						
3.3.1*	Logic and Comprehensibility of the Didactic Concept (Asterisk Criterion)			X			
3.3.2	Course Materials and Recommended Literature			X			X

4. SCIENTIFIC ENVIRONMENT AND FRAMEWORK CONDITIONS

4.1 Teaching staff

4.1.1 Structure and Number of Teaching Staff (Asterisk Criterion)

	<i>Economics</i>	<i>Finance</i>	<i>Tourism</i>
<i>Full-time teaching staff of the department for the educational program (including doctoral supervisors and the department's teaching staff delivering lectures).</i>	12	7	13
<i>Among them: Full-time teaching staff (teaching in the doctoral program)</i>	3	2	2
<i>Full-time teaching staff (Scientific supervisors of doctoral students)</i>	12	6	13
<i>Part-time teaching staff, including invited/external lecturers</i>	0	3	3
<i>Teaching staff (foreign scientific consultants of doctoral students, not included in the staff / non-staff members)</i>	15	13	13
Total number of teaching staff	12	7	13
<i>Among them (from the total number of teaching staff):</i>			
Number of Doctors of Sciences (academic degree), Professors (academic title and position of department professor) entitled to supervise doctoral students	5	2	3
<i>Average teaching workload of Doctors of Sciences in hours</i>	<i>30 credit*</i>	<i>30 credit</i>	<i>30 credit</i>
Number of Doctors of Sciences (academic degree), Professors (academic title) lecturer-researcher (position) entitled to supervise doctoral students	1	-	-
<i>Average teaching workload of Doctors of Sciences in hours</i>	<i>15 credit</i>	-	-

Number of Doctors of Sciences (academic degree), Professors (academic title) part-time lecturer (position) entitled to supervise doctoral students	-	-	1
<i>Average teaching workload of Doctors of Sciences in hours</i>	-	-	15 credit
Number of Candidates of Sciences (academic degree), Professors (academic title and position of department professor) entitled to supervise doctoral students	1	3	1
<i>Average teaching workload in hours for Candidates of Sciences</i>	22,5 credit	30 credit	24 credit **
Number of Candidates of Sciences (academic degree), Associate Professors/Docents (academic title and position of associate professor of the department) entitled to supervise doctoral students	3	1	5
<i>Average academic load in hours for for Candidates of Sciences</i>	30 credit	30 credit	30 credit
Number of PhD (academic degree), Associate Professors/Docents (academic title and position of associate professor of the department) entitled to supervise doctoral students	2	1	6
<i>Average teaching workload in hours for PhD holders</i>	30 credit 24 credit**	30 credit	30 credit
Number of Doctors of Sciences and Professors teaching in the doctoral program	3	1	1
<i>Average teaching workload in hours for Doctors of Sciences</i>	30 credit	30 credit	30 credit
Number of Candidates of Sciences (academic degree) and Professors (academic title and position of associate professor of the department) teaching in the doctoral program	-	1	-

<i>Average teaching workload in hours for Candidates of Sciences</i>	-	30 credit	-
Number of PhD holders and Associate Professors/Docents teaching in the doctoral program	-	-	1
<i>Average PhD academic load in hours</i>	-	-	30 credit
<i>Number of foreign professors teaching in the doctoral program</i>	0	1	2
<i>Average teaching workload of senior lecturers in hours</i>	0	15 credit***	15 credit***
<i>Invited lecturers</i>		2	2
<i>Ratio of doctoral supervisors to doctoral students in the doctoral program</i>	12 scientific supervisors (+15 foreign consultants) 22 doctoral students (55%) 1:2	8 scientific supervisors (+13 foreign consultants) 19 doctoral students (42%) 1:2	13 scientific supervisors (+13 foreign consultants) 25 doctoral students (52%) 1:2

Doctoral Programme in Economics

The implementation of the programme is provided by teachers who have a basic education corresponding to the profile of the discipline taught and are systematically engaged in scientific and scientific-pedagogical activities. Teachers have a PhD or PhD degree and work experience in the relevant professional field. Management of doctoral dissertations and teaching of subjects in the educational programme is carried out by full-time teachers.

The total number of full-time teachers implementing the educational programme of doctoral studies is twelve people: six Doctors of Economics, which are professors; four Candidate of Economics, two PhD are scientific consultants of doctoral students. Out of twelve teachers, four professors of the department conduct doctoral studies, one professor is invited to give lectures on the disciplines “Academic Writing” and “Methods of Scientific Research”.

Also, 15 foreign professors participate in the implementation of the EP as scientific consultants. They are not full-time teachers. 90% of full-time teachers are female. Around 30%-54% of part-time teachers are female.

Doctoral Programme in Finance

Full-time teaching staff at the University performs a wide range of duties: teaching lectures and practical classes, conducting research and methodological work, participating in department and faculty administrative tasks, and providing academic advising to doctoral students. They are actively involved in research and have greater responsibilities, including mentoring doctoral students. Part-time teaching staff works fewer hours, primarily delivering lectures and practical classes, and engaging in research. Their responsibilities are limited to teaching and assessing doctoral student work. They do not perform administrative work or develop teaching materials. In the doctoral educational program “Finance,” 3 men (Professor, Doctor of Economic

Sciences Makysh S.B.; Professor, Doctor of Economic Sciences Ilyas A.A.; Professor, PhD Saban S.) teach out of 10 faculty members, which constitute 30%, i.e., a 3/10 gender ratio among the teaching staff.

Doctoral Programme in Tourism

The programme is delivered by an academic team consisting of full-time faculty, research-active lecturers, part-time instructors from national professional and academic institutions, and foreign consultants from partner universities abroad. Full-time faculty members are responsible for core and specialised courses such as Research of the Business Climate in Tourism in the Republic of Kazakhstan and Sustainable Tourism Development and the Circular Economy, ensuring continuity and strong alignment between teaching, research, and supervision. Part-time lecturers from relevant organisations within Kazakhstan contribute applied perspectives and practical expertise to doctoral training.

In addition, foreign consultants from universities in Turkey, Pakistan, the United Kingdom, and other partner countries support doctoral supervision and research development. These international experts bring experience in doctoral education, research leadership, and publication in indexed journals, strengthening the global orientation of the programme. All faculty members are actively involved in research projects and demonstrate sustained scholarly output. There is one male and one female full-time teaching staff, who is delivering lectures in the doctoral programme. There is one male part-time teaching staff. Among the 13 full-time scientific supervisors, there are eleven women and two men and among the 13 Foreign scientific supervisors, there are two women and eleven men.

4.1.2 Scientific Qualification of Teaching Staff (Asterisk Criterion)

All programmes

The provision of higher education institutions with full-time teaching staff in accordance with the courses of the educational programme is stipulated by “Order of the Ministry of Science and Higher Education No. 4 of January 2024” on the approval of qualification requirements for the educational activities of organisations providing higher and/or postgraduate education, and a list of documents confirming compliance with them.

Staff recruitment for vacant positions falls within the competence of the HR department and is carried out on a competitive basis according to the HR Policy of the ENU, the Rules on the procedures for recruitment, admission, adaptation, transfer and dismissal of employees of the ENU, the staffing schedule and the job descriptions. The invitation of foreign lecturers is regulated by the Rules on attracting foreign specialists and the procedure for reimbursement of expenses for invitations.

When selecting candidates, ENU’s Competition Commission takes account of the academic degrees and titles of the potential employees, their teaching and research experience, methodical and scientific publications as well as the English language proficiency. The decision on hiring a candidate is made by the Rector of the University on the basis of the meeting minutes of the Competition Commission. For hiring visiting lecturers no formal competition procedure is necessary; the recruitment is carried out in accordance with the relevant civil law legislation.

For each of the study programmes, the University has provided an extensive staff handbook, where the qualification levels, the academic career and the main publications of each teacher are described.

According to the approved “Qualification Characteristics of Academic and Teaching Positions”, the requirements for the teaching staff include the possession of academic degrees and titles, work experience, educational background, and other competencies.

Qualification requirements for appointment to the position of Senior Lecturer:

- Higher and postgraduate education (holding an academic Master of Science degree and/or an academic degree such as Candidate/Doctor of Science, Doctor of Philosophy (PhD), or Doctor of Science in the relevant field) corresponding to the training profile.
- At least three years of experience in scientific and pedagogical activity, including a minimum of three years in a teaching position, or at least five years of practical work experience in the relevant specialty (activity profile).
- Scientific publications in domestic scientific journals recommended by the authorised body, as well as in international scientific publications, and educational or methodological works corresponding to the personnel training area.
- Possession of professional certificates in the relevant training profile within the last three years (preferred).

Appointment to the position of Associate Professor at the University is carried out after the conferment of the academic title of Associate Professor in accordance with the “Rules for Assigning Academic Titles” approved by the Ministry of Science and Higher Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan (Clause 4, Rules for Assigning Academic Titles).

Appointment to the position of Professor at the University is carried out after the conferment and confirmation of the academic title of Professor in accordance with the “Rules for Assigning Academic Titles” (Clause 5, Rules for Assigning Academic Titles). The academic title of Professor is awarded to applicants who already hold the academic title of Associate Professor and who work full-time in the organisation submitting the application for the academic title.

As part of its staff development strategy, ENU supports international internships and professional development. In recent years, the number of PhD graduates who completed their doctoral studies abroad has increased, enhancing the international expertise of the academic staff and enabling the launch of multilingual educational groups. ENU supports the professional development of academic staff, including by financial assistance for participation in conferences, research projects, and professional development courses.

For the professional development and realisation of the creative potential of all categories of employees, ENU implements mechanisms of moral and material incentives, including letters of appreciation, certificates of merit, bonuses, nomination for the honorary title “Honorary Worker of Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan”, and recommendations for participation in the “Best University Teacher” competition, which is awarded annually by the Ministry of Science and Higher Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

Doctoral Programme in Economics

The department demonstrates a stable presence in the global scientific space and an active participation in the development of national science. Every year, the faculty of the department publishes from nine to 13 articles in journals indexed in the Scopus and Web of Science databases. The maximum share of teachers' involvement in the publication process of this level was recorded in 2023, amounting to 48% of the total staff. There has been a significant increase in publications in the journals of the Republic of Kazakhstan included in the list of the Committee for Quality Assurance in the Field of Science and Higher Education. The year 2024 was particularly productive, when the number of such articles reached 37, which is more than five times higher than in 2021 (7 articles). The staff of the department regularly presents research results at international scientific conferences, releasing on average from eight to 25 collections of reports annually.

The qualifications of the teaching staff are confirmed by the effective management of the students' research activities. Over a five-year period, students of all levels prepared a significant number of papers under the guidance of teachers of the department, while the total number of publications ranged from 62 to 141 per year. Doctoral students demonstrate consistently high rates, and in 2025 they prepared 28 publications.

The results of fundamental and applied research of teaching staff are systematized in the form of monographs. During the reporting period, a significant number of works were published, while 5 monographs were published in 2024. In 2025, three monographs were published, one in Kazakh and two in Russian.

The department forms the scientific environment, acting as an organizer of events at the faculty. The greatest organisational activity occurred in 2022-2023, when 13 and eleven scientific events were held, respectively.

For the period 2021-2025, a fivefold increase in publications in the journals of the Republic of Kazakhstan included in the list of the Committee for Quality Assurance in the Field of Science and Higher Education and the stable presence in the Scopus/WoS databases indicate a high level of research maturity of the team. The variety of monographs published in several languages and the systematic work with doctoral and undergraduate students confirm the department's status as a leading scientific and educational centre.

Doctoral Programme in Finance

The number of publications in international ranking journals indexed in Web of Science and Scopus increased from five in 2021 to seven in 2022 and peaked at eleven in 2023, before slightly decreasing to ten in 2024 and two in 2025. Publications in journals recommended by the Committee for Quality Assurance in Science and Higher Education rose steadily from five in 2021 and 2022 to six in 2023, nine in 2024, and ten in 2025. The number of monographs remained stable at one per year from 2021 to 2023, increased to four in 2024, and further to five in 2025. Textbooks and teaching aids were published in increasing numbers, with two in 2022, three in 2023, one in 2024, and three in 2025.

The department participated in eleven international scientific conferences between 2021 and 2024, averaging two to three conferences per year. Conference activity covered key areas such as financial system development, banking and monetary policy, financial security, sustainable and green finance, economic modernisation, and digital financial technologies. At least five conferences focused specifically on sustainable development, green economy, or financial stability, while four events addressed currency issues, financial security, and national economic resilience. The department also participated annually in international conferences

for students and young researchers, supporting early research engagement and academic skills development.

Doctoral Programme in Tourism

The number of publications in internationally ranked journals indexed in Web of Science and Scopus has shown steady growth. After a slight decline from 16 articles in 2022 to 14 in 2023–2024, there is a significant jump to 23 publications in 2025. There is a strengthening of the position of publications in journals of the Republic of Kazakhstan included in the list of the Committee on Science, Education, and Culture of the Ministry of National Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan (KOKSONVO MNVO RK). While the level remained stable in 2021–2022 (17 publications annually), a slight decline to 12 is noted in 2023, followed by steady growth: 22 publications in 2024 and a sharp rise to 35 in 2025. Publications in RINC journals during the period under review remain at a low level and do not demonstrate sustained positive growth: after 6 publications in 2021, there is a decline to 1 in 2022, followed by minor fluctuations (3 in 2023, 1 in 2024, and 2 in 2025).

Between 2021 and 2024, the department participated in 27 international scientific conferences, averaging 6–7 conferences per year. Conference activities covered key areas such as the development of the tourism industry, government support for tourism policy, financial security, sustainable and “green” tourism, economic modernization, and digital technologies in tourism. The trend in monograph publication from 2021 to 2024 is characterized by a consistently low level (one monograph per year), but in 2025 there is a noticeable increase to seven works. Between 2021 and 2025, the Department of Tourism organized at least ten international and national academic events, including conferences, roundtables, and scientific-practical seminars. On average, two to three events were held per year, with the highest level of activity occurring in 2023–2024. The topics of the events covered a wide range of current trends in the development of tourism and hospitality. A significant portion of the academic events was dedicated to issues of sustainable development and the role of tourism in achieving the Sustainable Development Goals, including an international roundtable in 2024 and academic discussions on tourism’s contribution to a sustainable future. In 2025, the International scientific and practical conference “The Impact of Digital Technologies on the Tourism Industry” was held on the impact of digital technologies on the tourism industry, reflecting the department’s strategic interest in contemporary technological trends.

4.1.3 Pedagogical Qualification of Teaching Staff (Asterisk Criterion)

All programmes

High pedagogical standards are required for teaching positions at ENU. Besides the possession of an academic degree at the needed level, prior teaching experience is compulsory (typically three to five years for Senior Lecturer, Associate Professor or Professor positions), as is regular professional development through advanced training and retraining programmes.

ENU provides opportunities and institutional support for the professional development of academic staff through the Institute of Continuing Education, a structural division of the University that carries out educational activities to improve the qualifications of faculty and research staff. Continuous education includes participation in certified courses, for example, through the Coursera platform, covering IT competencies and modern teaching

methodologies, in conferences, joint projects with partner universities and funded access to continuing education programmes.

For both programmes, pedagogical and didactic qualifications are further demonstrated through membership in the Educational and Methodological Association of the Republican Educational and Methodological Council for Higher and Postgraduate Education in the field of “Business, Management, and Law”, as well as through the authorship of teaching and learning materials, textbooks, study guides and monographs.

During the 2023/2024 academic year, the university administration offered the department’s academic and teaching staff the opportunity to complete professional development courses on the Coursera platform. The number of faculty members who completed training amounted to 91% of the total staff.

From 2022 to 2025, the Institute of Continuing Education organised several courses to enhance pedagogical qualifications, such as a Digital Literacy courses at Silver IT University, “Smart University: digital skills, online learning, artificial intelligence”, “IT competencies and online learning methods”, “Organisation of Education for Students with Special Educational Needs in an Inclusive Education Environment”, and “Trends in Education: The Learner-Centered Approach as a Vector of Modern Education”. Furthermore, the University is implementing a training project using the unique educational platform “Easy English” to enhance the professional knowledge of its staff in English.

Doctoral programme of Economics

Scientific consultants of doctoral students are holders of the titles “Best University teacher”, “Best Researcher” of the Ministry of Science and Higher Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

26% of the teaching staff of the department have an international certificate of IELTS, TOEFL and foreign diplomas on the completion of doctoral studies, which gives them the opportunity to teach classes in English.

Doctoral Programme in Finance

Each year, the University offers advanced training courses, seminars, and professional development sessions for faculty members. As part of this ongoing development, teaching staff have completed advanced courses focused on digital pedagogy, online learning, and the application of artificial intelligence in science and education.

Building on the knowledge gained through these courses, faculty actively integrate new technologies into the teaching process, including tools such as Google Forms, Kahoot, and Quizizz, to enhance teaching effectiveness and student engagement.

Doctoral Programme in Tourism

Supervisors of doctoral students have completed advanced professional development courses covering topics such as online learning methodologies and IT competencies, time management for personal and professional productivity, sustainable tourism and environmental public health, social and emotional learning in teaching, and digital skills in the context of distance education.

Faculty members actively integrate technology into the teaching process and have received training in the use of digital tools and platforms, including the University’s distance learning system. These technologies are used to enhance teaching effectiveness by facilitating online

consultations with doctoral students related to internships and academic work, supporting the management of research materials, and delivering instruction in advanced analytical tools and data modelling relevant to dissertation research.

4.1.4 Internationality of Teaching Staff

All programmes

As part of its staff development strategy, ENU actively supports international internships and professional development, facilitating international integration and cooperation with foreign universities regarding academic mobility for students and teaching staff. ENU has academic mobility agreements with more than 500 other foreign universities. Currently, the programmes “ENU Students Ambassador”, Erasmus+, Orhun, ITEC, and Dora Plus are implemented. Students as well as academic staff can apply to them. The University finances travel and accommodation from targeted and internal budgets, and partially reimburses expenses related to visas, medical insurance and other associated services. Furthermore, academic staff members participate in international conferences.

Doctoral Programme in Economics

The Doctoral Programme in Economics incorporates elements of internationalisation through the involvement of foreign lecturers and international scientific consultants. Selected doctoral-level courses such as Academic Writing and Research Methods are delivered by visiting professors from foreign universities, providing doctoral candidates with exposure to international academic standards and research practices. In addition, doctoral students are supported by foreign scientific consultants from European universities whose research expertise aligns with dissertation topics in areas such as international trade, digital economy, migration, and human capital. These consultants contribute to dissertation supervision and strengthen the academic quality of doctoral research.

Faculty members of the department also participate in international internships, short-term teaching assignments, and research stays at universities and research centres abroad, mainly within Europe and neighbouring regions. Furthermore, foreign scholars are involved in departmental research projects, contributing to international research collaboration and joint academic output.

At the same time, while these measures demonstrate an existing level of international engagement, international teaching and research experience in English-speaking academic environments among ENU-based doctoral supervisors remains limited. Most international activities take place in non-English-speaking or regionally close academic contexts, which restricts systematic exposure to English-language doctoral supervision, teaching, and research leadership. This indicates potential for further strengthening international academic integration at supervisor level.

Doctoral Programme in Finance

The Doctoral Programme in Finance demonstrates internationalisation through the involvement of visiting foreign lecturers, international scientific consultants, and participation of faculty members in international academic activities. Foreign professors from partner universities deliver specialised doctoral-level courses in areas such as financial research methods, financial stability, and risk management, providing doctoral candidates with exposure to international research perspectives and contemporary scientific approaches. In addition,

doctoral students benefit from international scientific consultants whose research expertise supports dissertation work and enhances methodological quality.

Members of the Finance Department also participate in international internships, short-term teaching assignments, research projects, and scientific forums abroad. These activities contribute to academic exchange and strengthen links with foreign universities and research centres. International guest lectures and participation in global conferences further support the programme's international orientation.

At the same time, while these measures indicate existing international engagement, the international research and teaching experience of ENU-based doctoral supervisors remains uneven. In particular, sustained academic activity and teaching experience in English-speaking environments are limited among local supervisors, which constrains systematic English-language supervision and daily academic interaction at doctoral level. This suggests scope for further strengthening international research integration and English-medium academic practice within the supervisory team.

Doctoral Programme in Tourism

Within the Doctoral Programme in Tourism, internationalisation is oriented toward strengthening research quality, intercultural competence, and global academic integration in the field of sustainable and innovative tourism. Doctoral supervisors and teaching staff participate in international research internships, academic exchanges, and joint research projects with partner universities in Europe, Asia, and other regions. Visiting academics from foreign universities are involved as lecturers, research consultants, and co-supervisors, contributing international perspectives to doctoral training and research. In addition, faculty members engaged in the Tourism programme participate in international research projects related to cultural heritage, sustainable tourism development, and regional tourism policy, ensuring that doctoral research is embedded in international scientific discourse and aligned with global developments in tourism studies.

4.1.5 Internal Cooperation within the Faculty (Asterisk Criterion)

All programmes

Collaboration among academic staff is guided by the University's internal regulatory framework (Code of Corporate Culture of ENU Employees and ENU Doctoral Programme Regulations §§ 1, 4) and is manifested in the continuous exchange of pedagogical, methodological and research expertise. Systematic interaction occurs both within teaching activities and in the context of scientific research. Faculty members discuss coordination of syllabi, share teaching and research literature, co-author academic publications, and participate jointly in scientific competitions.

Internal interaction among faculty and department-level issues is conducted at regular and extraordinary department meetings. The department's meeting agenda regularly addresses issues related to the development and implementation of study programmes. They serve as a platform for discussing challenges in teaching, as well as academic, methodological, research, and educational work, involving the entire faculty. The results of these meetings are recorded. To share teaching experiences and improve teachers' professional skills, as well as to master modern teaching methods and techniques, mutual visits to classes are conducted according to an approved schedule. The results of these visits are analysed and discussed at department meetings and are reflected in the department journal.

A key collaboration feature of the programmes is the collaborative leadership model, implemented through a pairing of a national supervisor and a foreign academic advisor.

The Departments collaborate with other departments of the Faculty of Economics through the organisation of preliminary defences of doctoral dissertations at an extended faculty meeting. Each dissertation undergoes an internal review by at least three faculty members from other departments. The results of the discussions are recorded in the minutes of the extended meetings and serve as the basis for admitting the doctoral candidate to defend their dissertation before the dissertation council.

Appraisal:

The structure and number of teaching staff in each doctoral programme ensure the achievement of the intended qualification objectives. ENU has established policies to ensure the continuous delivery of the doctoral programme and to promote a balanced gender ratio among teaching staff. The academic qualification of the teaching staff in the doctoral programme corresponds to the qualification objectives of the doctoral programme. The research activities correspond to the orientation of the doctoral programme and support the scientific education of doctoral students. The University verifies the qualifications of the teaching staff by means of an established procedure. Specific measures for further qualification of the teaching staff are implemented.

The pedagogical qualification of the doctoral supervisor in the programme corresponds to the qualification objectives of the doctoral programme. They support the scientific education of doctoral students. ENU verifies the pedagogical qualifications of the doctoral supervisor by means of an established procedure. The University has established an approved programme in pedagogical education and practice (also including online teaching and learning where applicable) to enhance the qualifications of doctoral supervisors. Even though one of the two doctoral supervisors are lecturers from foreign countries, lecturers with international academic degrees and/or international professional experience appropriate for the supervision of doctoral students, the supervisors from ENU in the Finance and Economy doctoral programmes lack international experience in English speaking countries, which was evident by them not being able to speak in English in the course of the interview rounds.

Although doctoral candidates benefit from having an international co-supervisor, the panel **recommends** strengthening the international research and teaching experience of doctoral supervisors through increased engagement in global academic activities. Increased participation in international research projects, academic mobility, joint publications, and teaching activities abroad would enhance supervisory capacity, align doctoral training more closely with international standards, and further improve the quality and global relevance of doctoral research. The panel therefore **recommends** the Finance and Economy programme strengthening the international research and teaching experience of doctoral supervisors through increased engagement in global academic activities.

For the Tourism programme, it can be stated that the doctoral supervisor has relevant experience in international research and/ or teaching abroad. Supervisors promote the acquisition of international competences and skills. There is a regular process for internal cooperation between doctoral supervisors and other teaching staff in the doctoral programmes. If there are courses for doctoral students, the teaching staff cooperate with each other for the

purpose of tuning the courses towards the overall qualification objectives. Meetings of all those teaching in the doctoral programme take place regularly.

		Exceptional	Exceed	Meet	Does not meet	n.r.	Recommendation
4.1	Teaching Staff						
4.1.1*	Structure and Number of Teaching Staff (Asterisk Criterion)			X			
4.1.2*	Scientific Qualification of Teaching Staff (Asterisk Criterion)			X			
4.1.3*	Pedagogical Qualification of Teaching Staff (Asterisk Criterion)			X			
4.1.4	Internationality of Teaching Staff			DT	DE, DF		X
4.1.5*	Internal Cooperation within the Faculty (Asterisk Criterion)			X			

4.2 Cooperation and Partnerships

4.2.1 Scientific Integration of the Doctoral Students (Asterisk Criterion)

All programmes

In accordance with the University Development Strategy for 2021 to 2026, within the framework of Strategic Direction 3, “Internationalisation and Development of International Cooperation,” the University is implementing a policy aimed at strengthening and developing existing international agreements and establishing new partnerships. The goal of this direction is to integrate the University into the global educational and scientific space, enhancing its international competitiveness and academic reputation.

Within the framework of cooperation agreements, the University regularly conducts joint events with partner HEIs, which are reflected in the annual development plan of ENU’s Department of International Cooperation. Furthermore, ENU promotes academic mobility, including through the Erasmus+ programme, the MEVLANA academic exchange programme, the ORHUN academic exchange programme, the UGRAD student exchange programme of the US Department of State, and the DAAD academic exchange programme.

With their international HEI cooperation partners, ENU cooperates in areas such as

- Joint scientific research;
- Exchange of specialists, internships, and academic mobility;
- Exchange of information in scientific and academic work
- Participation in scientific forums, conferences, and seminars

Joint conferences and seminars;
Access to library and informational resources.

In accordance with the Doctoral Programme Regulations, a mandatory part of the programme is a foreign research internship lasting at least 30 calendar days, which aims to ensure the inclusion of doctoral students in global academic networks and improve their research competence in the fifth semester of study. Internships take place at leading foreign universities and research centres.

Doctoral programme of Economics

Doctoral students of the programme have participated in academic mobility at universities outside the CIS. During the 2021–2022 academic year, doctoral students studied at the Estonian University of Life Sciences under the Dora Plus academic mobility programme. In autumn 2022, within the framework of the NAWA PROM 2019 Project, a doctoral student completed a research stay at the Białystok University of Technology in Poland. In addition, during the 2023–2024 academic year, doctoral students took part in a two-semester academic mobility programme at Osaka University in Japan. These international study and research stays contributed to the development of research competencies, international academic networking, and exposure to diverse scientific approaches.

Doctoral students of the programme have completed international research internships at universities in both near and far abroad. In the 2024–2025 academic year, internships were undertaken at the Russian Presidential Academy of National Economy and Public Administration in Moscow and at the University of Economics in Bratislava. In the 2025–2026 academic year, further research stays took place at the University of Economics in Bratislava and Mittweida University of Applied Sciences in Germany. Further international research internships were completed in 2023 at several partner institutions, including Samara State University of Economics, Altai State University, and the National Research Moscow State University of Civil Engineering in Russia, Unicorn University in Prague (Czech Republic), and Niğde Ömer Halisdemir University in Turkey.

Doctoral students present their research at national and international scientific conferences focusing on digital transformation, human capital development, financial systems, labour markets, transport infrastructure, macroeconomic analysis, creative economy, and social media engagement. Contributions were published in peer-reviewed conference proceedings between 2023 and 2025, including recurring participation in the international conference series “ĞYLYM JÁNE BILIM” and thematic conferences on sustainable economic development and digitalisation in Kazakhstan. These activities demonstrate regular scholarly dissemination, engagement with current socio-economic challenges, and the development of academic communication skills among doctoral students.

Doctoral Programme in Finance

Doctoral students in the education programme participate in international conferences, joint projects, and complete research internships at universities abroad – Turkey, Poland, Russia, Belarus, Kyrgyzstan, and Pakistan. For example, in 2023, doctoral student Nurullakizy Gulnar completed an academic internship at the Warsaw University of Life Sciences (Poland).

Teaching staff from international partner universities is invited to conduct classes and provide scientific consultations. Teaching staff also participate in international scientific events and projects at universities in Germany, Lithuania, Poland, and Russia, which facilitates the development of academic ties and the expansion of scientific collaboration.

Doctoral Programme in Tourism

The scientific integration of doctoral students in the programme is ensured through systematic collaboration with domestic and international universities. The programme includes doctoral students' participation in annual scientific conferences, as well as external events organised by the Astana City Akimat, the national company "KazakhTourism," and other institutions. Doctoral students actively participated in the international conference "Science and Education 2025," organised and hosted by the University. Doctoral students are actively integrated into academic and professional practice beyond the University. For example, one doctoral student contributed to the work of a municipal commission responsible for developing a master plan for urban tourism, gaining experience in policy-oriented decision-making. In addition, doctoral research is closely connected to external stakeholders, as representatives of professional organisations and associations are involved as respondents in empirical studies. This approach supports the collection of real-world data and strengthens the relevance of research outcomes. Doctoral students have also engaged representatives from the active tourism sector when preparing scientific publications on mountaineering motivations and the experiences of elite climbers. Overall, these activities demonstrate strong integration of doctoral students into professional, research, and policy environments, enhancing both the academic quality and societal relevance of their research. The department is actively expanding its international collaboration in the field of doctoral training. Doctoral students actively collaborate with international colleagues and prepare co-authored publications. In addition, the scientific integration of doctoral students is realised through scientific internships. As part of their studies, doctoral students undergo scientific internships at foreign universities.

4.2.2 Networking of the Scientists

All programmes

The development of international scientific cooperation is part of the University's strategic documents, including the ENU Development Strategy until 2030 and the Education Internationalisation Programme.

In accordance with its strategy, ENU allocates special budget funds to support international scientific cooperation, including financing business trips, organising conferences and implementing joint projects. The memorandum establishes joint supervision and scientific consultation in the writing of doctoral dissertations, conducting joint research, lectures and scientific events.

Within this framework, all doctoral programmes can benefit from scientific networking.. In the Doctoral Programme in Economics, each doctoral student works with both domestic and international supervisors, participates in joint research projects, and contributes to international publications and collective monographs with partner universities in Europe and beyond.

In the Doctoral Programme in Finance, networking is linked to professional and research cooperation with financial institutions, regulatory bodies, and international academic partners.

Doctoral students engage in applied research projects, internships, and expert discussions, which connect academic research with real financial practice.

The Doctoral Programme in Tourism emphasises international academic exchange through joint supervision, international seminars, collaborative research, and co-authored publications. Across all programmes, sustained interaction with external experts and research networks strengthens research quality, academic communication skills, and doctoral students' integration into the international scientific community.

4.2.3 Networking of the Doctoral Students

All programmes

The internal digital platform Smart.ENU is an integration platform of the University that combines educational, scientific, personnel and service processes. It allows doctoral students to exchange scientific materials, discuss research issues, plan joint events, coordinate the work of clusters, and create virtual research groups that include doctoral students and their foreign colleagues from partner universities. Google Workspace and Mendeley are used for collaborative work on doctoral articles, and discussions take place in Microsoft Teams.

Across the doctoral programmes, structured mechanisms are in place to foster regular exchange of research experience and results among doctoral students and to broaden research-based knowledge. In the Economics and Finance programmes, doctoral candidates participate in methodological and scientific seminars, where they discuss dissertation progress, publication strategies, and research methods. Joint publications and collaboration within grant-funded research projects further strengthen peer learning and collective knowledge development. Doctoral students are also involved as junior researchers in funded projects, enabling them to work closely with colleagues on shared research questions and applied studies.

In the Tourism programme, exchange is organised through regular departmental and faculty research seminars, thematic research clusters, and internal conferences, where doctoral students present their work and receive structured academic feedback. Interdisciplinary formats encourage dialogue across fields and support the development of presentation and discussion skills. Participation in international conferences, scientific clubs, and mobility programmes further expands academic perspectives.

Appraisal:

Cooperation with higher education institutions and other scientific establishments are an integral part of the programmes. The doctoral students are encouraged to participate in relevant conferences or take part in other scientific events and activities. The HEI takes measures to promote the exchange between scientists and doctoral students by supporting the mobility of doctoral students.

Doctoral students are encouraged to participate in relevant conferences or to take part in other scientific events and establishments. All measures to promote the academic integration of the doctoral students are ly designed.

Scientific networking has a recognisable benefit for doctoral students.

In accordance with the objectives, the doctoral programmes promote the exchange of experiences and research results among the doctoral students, and it contributes towards the broadening of research-based knowledge.

		Exceptional	Exceed	Meet	Does not meet	n.r.	Recommendation
4.2	Cooperation and Partnerships						
4.2.1	Scientific Integration of the Doctoral Students (Asterisk Criterion)			X			
4.2.2	Networking of the Scientists			X			
4.2.3	Networking of the Doctoral Students			X			

4.3 Programme Management

4.3.1 Structural Organisation (Asterisk Criterion)

All programmes

For the effective implementation of the doctoral educational programme, a structured management system is utilised, which includes the department, faculty, the Department of Academic Affairs, as well as the Office of Science and Scientific Staff Certification, all reporting to the university administration.

Management of the respective educational programme at the department level is carried out by the head of the department. The development of the educational programme within the department is undertaken by the faculty. The draft of the educational programme for the upcoming academic year undergoes review by the Academic Committee of the Faculty of Economics and the Academic Council of the University to ensure compliance with regulatory documents and educational quality standards.

The University's Department of Academic Affairs provides programme management support. Its responsibilities include organisational and methodological support, monitoring compliance with regulatory requirements, and ensuring the smooth operation of the programme.

The decision-making process is based on principles of collegiality and transparency. Proposals for programme updates are developed with the participation of doctoral students, teaching staff, employers, and the expert community. All changes are discussed and approved at department meetings and are also reviewed by the faculty's Academic Committee, which includes the programme director.

The programme director, in collaboration with those responsible for methodological work at the department, plans and coordinates the development of the programme to ensure the achievement of its stated educational objectives. They monitor the implementation of the educational process and the attainment of programme goals, facilitate stakeholder involvement—including employers, teaching staff, and doctoral students—in the development and revision of the programme, and ensure transparency and openness in the programme

management system. Additionally, the programme director oversees risk management related to the implementation of the programme.

4.3.2 Management Support

All programmes

ENU has established an administrative support system that provides support to doctoral students and teaching staff at all stages of the educational process, teaching and research. The process is coordinated by the Department of Academic Affairs and the Office of Postgraduate Education, and the Department of Economics and Entrepreneurship, Department of Finance and the Department of play the primary organisational role.

The Department of Academic Affairs implements the strategic development of the doctoral programmes, aims to ensure the quality of the content of educational and methodological work, and improves the standards of service provision to students and the educational process.

The Registrar's Office under the Department for Academic Affairs operates both offline and online through the "Virtual Registrar's Office" section on the University's official website. The responsibilities of the office include maintaining academic documentation, registering students for courses, forming class schedules and academic groups, recording and transferring academic credits, organising examination sessions and summer semesters, calculating GPA, and assigning scholarships and compensations. It also issues academic orders related to student status (enrolment, expulsion, academic leave, transfer, and graduation). The office ensures the preparation and issuance of educational documents, the processing of duplicates and diploma supplements, the maintenance of student personal files, and provides consultation on academic matters. To facilitate prompt communication with students, a Call Centre has been established.

The Department of Postgraduate Education helps with the preparation of scientific internships, approval of dissertation research topics, scientific advisers, and the preparation of orders for graduation.

The Career and Business Partnerships Department coordinates the professional internship and employment processes for graduates, coordinating interactions with external partners and employers.

The Department of International Cooperation coordinates work on international cooperation and the development of academic mobility, provides consultations and supports students in topics regarding international mobility.

ENU has an Ombudsman institution, whose main role is to provide advice to employees, students, and participants in labour disputes and conflicts.

The Anti-Corruption Compliance Service is responsible for ensuring transparency of activities, preventing corruption, and monitoring compliance with anti-corruption legislation and corporate standards.

Furthermore, ENU operates a Centre for Inclusive Support, a Department for Social and Civic Development, a Medical Service, Sports Club, a Centre for Psychological Assistance, as well as various student associations such as the Youth Centre, student clubs, the Student Parliament, and the volunteer movement "Qamqor".

Appraisal:

The responsibilities for programme management in academic and organisational terms are defined and ensure that the respective programme operates smoothly.

Teaching staff and students are supported by the administration in the organisation of studies, teaching and research. Decision-making processes for the administrative support services are clearly defined and consider the particular needs of students and teaching staff. The HEI offers the administrative staff opportunities for continuous professional development.

		Exceptional	Exceed	Meet	Does not meet	n.r.	Recommendation
4.3	Programme Management						
4.3.1*	Structural Organisation (Asterisk Criterion)			X			
4.3.2	Management Support			X			

4.4 Material Resources

4.4.1 Quality of the Classrooms and Working Places (Asterisk Criterion)

All programmes

ENU comprises of seven academic-laboratory and administrative buildings, seven student houses and dormitories, the House of Young Scientists, the small family dormitory for students and teaching staff, the “Eurasia” sports complex, the canteens, the sports and recreation centre “Tymar”, and the building of a scientific library.

To ensure accessibility of the educational environment, the university buildings are equipped with ramps, tactile markings, and visual indicators for persons with visual impairments. For students with limited mobility, classes are held in classrooms located on the ground floor.

Classrooms are available not only during teaching hours but can also be used by students, with the approval of faculty, for laboratory work, project preparation and research activities. Routine cosmetic repairs are carried out periodically, and they are equipped with modern furniture, ventilation and lighting systems.

Most classrooms are equipped with multimedia projectors, screens and built-in computers. Interactive panels are installed in 70% of the classrooms. Academic staff use multimedia presentations, video lectures and demonstrational materials with access to the Internet and the University’s local network. Electronic courses are utilised, and remote consultations are conducted via Microsoft Teams and Zoom. The building offers free internet access. Wi-Fi. Free and convenient access to key information systems and resources necessary for effective learning and teaching is provided.

Students and teachers have access to the following resources:

- Information System *Platonus* for registration for courses, receiving grades, class schedules, access to syllabi and course materials, as well as student and teacher surveys;

- Smart ENU (smart.enu.kz) is a platform for obtaining up-to-date information about the educational process, schedules, events, announcements, etc.;
- MOOC ENU (mooc.enu.kz) is a system for taking online courses, self-studying subjects, and hosting digital educational resources. When organising the educational process using distance learning technologies, the department's teaching staff primarily utilises the capabilities of the MOODLE.enu.kz and MOOS.enu.kz platforms. Still, Microsoft Teams, Webex, as well as Moodle are available.
- Corporate email is the primary means of official communication within the University.

Furthermore, teachers have access to Directum ENU (directum.enu.kz), which is an electronic document management system used for official correspondence, approval and storage of internal documents.

All of these systems are integrated into the University's unified information space and are accessible 24/7 online using personal logins and passwords. Students and faculty are promptly provided with consultations and technical support regarding access and use of these systems.

Regarding the general principles of sustainable development in education, ENU's infrastructure and development strategy can be characterised by the following directions:

- Environmental sustainability through renovation of buildings, laboratories and equipment in line with energy efficiency and modern standards; reduction of resource consumption; implementation of "green" technologies (LED lighting, high-efficiency ventilation/air-conditioning).
- Social sustainability: ensuring equal access for all students to quality educational conditions, equipment and laboratories; creating a safe and comfortable learning environment; supporting research aimed at societal issues and sustainable development.
- Economic sustainability: efficient use of resources, strategic financial planning, infrastructure modernisation considering long-term maintenance costs.
- Institutional sustainability: continuous monitoring, updating of infrastructure, laboratories and study programmes.

4.4.2 Equipment (Literature, Magazines, Databases) for the Library (Asterisk Criterion)

All programmes

ENU's scientific library's⁷ physical infrastructure includes twelve reading rooms with 830 seats, including a specialised "Scholars' Room" and a dissertation room. The physical library is open daily from 8:00 am to 8:00 pm.

The total collection exceeds 1.4 million items, of which more than 377,000 are scientific literature. Doctoral students are provided with 100% access to the necessary literature for their respective programme. For users with special educational needs, there is an inclusive information and resource room equipped with specialised equipment and software.

⁷ <https://lib.enu.kz/en/>

Students have round-the-clock access to the electronic catalogue and subscription databases, which include scientific journals, books, and dissertations. Access to resources is available both on-campus and remotely through a secure login on the library website. During the 2024/2025 academic year, the library recorded 355,593 views of electronic documents and 910,417 search queries in the electronic catalogue.

A key element of research support is a subscription to twenty five international and national databases, providing access to up-to-date scientific information, with

- scientometric databases such as Web of Science and Scopus for citation analysis and publication search,
- international full-text databases: such as Springer Link, Cambridge Core, Wiley Online Library, JSTOR, ProQuest Dissertations & Theses Global, etc.,
- national and regional resources, such as the JURIST database, Kazakhstani and foreign electronic library systems (Elsantar.kz, Lan, Znanium.com, etc.)
-

To support research activities, the library operates a Department for Research Support and Institutional Repository, which provides researchers with up-to-date information, assists in increasing publication visibility and author metrics (including the h-index), and offers training on working with scientometric platforms and databases. Additionally, the library houses the American Corner and Maker Space, which provides resources for learning English and mastering digital technologies (3D modelling, robotics), thereby promoting the development of interdisciplinary skills. ENU provides access to programmes such as SPSS, Stata, Python (Notebook) and Project Expert, which are standard tools for economic analysis and modelling.

Furthermore, students have access to the following types of software:

- Electronic libraries, archives and repositories, such as DSpace/Repository.ENU.
- Legal databases and programmes, offering access to legal information systems (legislation, case law) through the *Platonus* portal.
- Specialised tools for research activities, such as datasets, and software for statistical analysis.

Appraisal:

The quantity, quality and equipment of the facilities largely correspond to the necessities described for the programme. Sufficient IT equipment and software appropriate for the programme is available. Technical equipment is largely adequate for online learning elements as required and applied by the study programmes' concept and content. Technical support is offered to students during office hours.

The panel identified room for improvement with regard to IT equipment in classrooms. However, the institution developed and presented a coherent strategy to the panel to ensure that all programme-related classrooms are equipped with appropriate presentation media and digital teaching technologies. This strategy identifies specific technological requirements for effective teaching and learning in line with current academic and professional standards, define a clear procurement and maintenance plan with timelines, responsibilities, and sustainable budgeting, and ensure consistent equipment of all learning spaces to support digitally enhanced teaching approaches.

The requirements for students with special circumstances are adequately taken into account. A sufficient number of workplaces (individual and for study groups) is available. Aspects of sustainability and cybersecurity are taken into account for the provision of infrastructure at programme level.

A reference library is available. Literature, magazines and databases are up-to-date and current in terms of the study contents and research activities of the doctoral students. Online access for technical literature is guaranteed. Outside the HEI, doctoral students have digital access to a large section of technical literature. However; the most important databases are so far not accessible totally free of charge.

To ensure that the doctoral students in Economics as well as in Finance can conduct rigorous academic research and meet international academic standards, the University must secure access to professional financial and economic databases. Such databases are essential for empirical research, data-driven coursework, and the development of analytical competencies expected in advanced economics and finance programmes. Access may be obtained through institutional subscriptions to recognised databases such as Bloomberg, LSEG (formerly Refinitiv Eikon), S&P Capital IQ, WRDS, or comparable platforms; or formal agreements with financial institutions within the University's network that provide students and researchers with structured access to these data resources. The chosen solution must ensure reliable, continuous, and programme-wide access for both teaching and research activities. The panel therefore states the following **condition** for the Doctoral Programme in Finance and the Doctoral Programme in Economics:

The University obtains access to relevant financial and economic databases.

		Exceptional	Exceed	Meet	Does not meet	n.r.	Recommendation
4.4	Facilities and equipment						
4.4.1*	Quality of the Classrooms and Working Places (Asterisk Criterion)			X			
4.4.2*	Equipment (Literature, Magazines, Databases) for the Library (Asterisk Criterion)			DT	Con: DE, DF		

4.5 Finance Planning and Financing

4.5.1 Finance Planning and Financing of the Doctoral Programme (Asterisk Criterion)

All programmes

All programmes

As a national university, ENU is state-funded, including the costs of teaching staff, administrative staff, facilities, library and other services.

- The University's income is formed from income from educational services (both under the state order and on a paid basis), research activities, and other services:

- State budget (subsidies, grants, targeted programs);
- ENU's own funds (tuition fees, research projects, commercial activities);
- Partner investments (sponsors, business entities, foundations);
- International grants and investments, endowment fund.

Funds from the republican budget are allocated to fulfil the state order for training personnel with higher education, in accordance with the number of students and the cost of education per student (state educational grant), which is approved annually by a Resolution of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan.

The rules for the calculation of tuition fees per student for the state-funded HEIs are approved by the Ministry of Education and Science. A tuition fee per student is calculated based on the number of teaching staff involved in the programme. The total number of teachers is defined by the ratio of students to one teacher.

The purchase of technical equipment and teaching materials is carried out according to the public procurement plan, which is annually approved by a commission headed by the Rector of the University.

4.5.2 Financial Support and Scholarship Programmes

All programmes

ENU provides doctoral students with forms of financial support. There is a state grant provided through the Ministry of Science and Higher Education of the Republic of Kazakhstan. The grant covers the full cost of tuition, including tuition fees and a monthly stipend for the doctoral student. If a doctoral student does not receive a grant, they can continue their studies on a fee-paying basis at their own expense.

Doctoral students can receive financial support through other state and international grant programmes aimed at conducting scientific research and internships (for example, “Zhas Galym”, ERASMUS+, DAAD and others), as well as participation in grant research projects that provide additional remuneration for research activities within the framework of grant funding.

Additionally, the University provides doctoral students with the opportunity to be employed in part-time or full-time positions (e.g., trainee lecturer, research assistant) within the framework of scientific projects. ENU pays for participation in research projects, including participation in grant projects. All doctoral students undergo a foreign research internship in the country of their foreign advisor, with full financial support (travel, accommodation, and research).

The University also encourages the research and publication activity of doctoral students by providing allowances and bonuses for publications in Q1-Q2 journals to stimulate participation in global research projects and enhance the prestige of the programmes.

Appraisal:

In accordance with the objectives, the finance planning considers staff planning for scientific employees/doctoral positions. The necessary basic financial equipment and financing security are guaranteed so that doctoral students starting within the accreditation period can complete their doctoral degree. In accordance with the objectives, the higher education institution

guarantees the financial protection of the doctoral students. ENU supports doctoral students in their financial situation by informing them about opportunities for scholarships or grants and provides the necessary financial counselling to complete the doctoral degree.

		Exceptional	Exceed	Meet	Does not meet	n.r.	Recommendation
4.5	Finance Planning and Financing						
4.5.1*	Finance Planning and Financing of the Doctoral Programme (Asterisk Criterion)			X			
4.5.2	Financial Support and Scholarship Programmes			X			

5. QUALITY ASSURANCE

5.1 Quality Assurance in terms of Contents, Processes and Research (Asterisk Criterion)

All study programmes

ENU has established a quality assurance system working on the level of the institution as a whole, its faculties and study programmes. This system comprises several sub-systems based on different technologies, methods, and tools, and involves both internal and external stakeholders.

Quality assurance is carried out in accordance with the “Quality Assurance Policy” as well as the University’s internal documents regulating the procedures and requirements for educational, research, and training processes. All documents are posted on the Smart ENU corporate platform as well as the university website.

Each structural unit (faculty, department, division, office) is responsible for ensuring the quality of the educational process within its competence, while the overall coordination is carried out by the Department of Quality Assurance. The main objective of the Department of Quality Assurance is to maintain and improve the system of internal quality assurance and internal control, aimed at increasing the efficiency of structural divisions and developing a quality culture at the University, as well as improving the quality of educational and research activities, and increasing the satisfaction of key stakeholders by identifying and addressing their needs.

The quality assurance process is implemented in stages and includes four main steps:

- development of a regulatory framework and planning of activities in the field of quality assurance;
- collection of data reflecting the status and dynamics of quality indicators;
- analysis of the results obtained in order to identify strengths and areas for improvement;
- implementation of corrective measures and changes based on analysis and feedback from stakeholders.

Monitoring of the quality of study programmes is conducted regularly in accordance with the internal document “Regulations on Monitoring to Assess Internal Quality Assurance of ENU Study Programmes”. Feedback is provided in accordance with University-wide Survey Guidelines. As part of internal quality assurance, regular surveys are conducted in the following areas:

- employee satisfaction with working conditions (administrative and managerial personnel);
- survey of graduates;
- survey of first-year students on the reasons for choosing ENU;
- assessment of the organisation and implementation of practices;
- assessment of student satisfaction with the quality of teaching of disciplines (once every semester);

- assessment of employer satisfaction with the quality of graduate training;
- assessment of student satisfaction with learning conditions and the university ecosystem;
- assessment of the satisfaction of the teaching staff with working conditions.

The results of surveys and monitoring are discussed at staff meetings, meetings of the Academic and Methodological Council, the Academic Council, and the University's Academic Council. Following these discussions, reports are sent to the faculty for further analysis, discussion with the faculty and students, and corrective action. All reports are posted on the Smart ENU corporate platform.

5.2 Inclusion of Quality Assurance in a Superordinate Quality Concept (Asterisk Criterion)

All study programmes

The doctoral programmes' quality assurance system is integrated into ENU's institutional quality concept "Quality Assurance Policy" and aligns with the priorities defined in the "ENU Development Strategy for 2021-2026" through planning, standardised internal and external control procedures, and the development of a culture of academic responsibility, transparency, and continuous improvement.

According to these documents, quality assurance is an important area aimed at achieving ENU's mission of creating a competitive, academically free, and research-oriented educational environment. The internal quality assurance system is regulated by the "Regulations on Monitoring and Evaluating the Quality of Doctoral programmes" and the "Guidelines for Internal Quality Assurance Standards".

Developing an academic culture based on the principles of integrity, transparency, and equal access is deemed important. At the faculty and department levels, faculty and doctoral students are actively involved in self-evaluation processes, discussing monitoring results, and developing proposals to improve programme delivery quality.

5.3 Evaluation by Doctoral Students

All study programmes

An important tool for quality assessment is the student feedback system, implemented through surveys. In the Platonus automated academic management system, under the "Surveys" tab, the "Student Satisfaction with the Quality of Teaching" surveys are available. The surveys are anonymous, and respondents' personal data is encrypted. Students evaluate programmes twice a year, in December and April. Based on the results, the Department of Quality Assessment analyses and interprets the data. Results are discussed at meetings of the Academic Council, Methodological Council, and University Senate. At the faculty level, survey results are reviewed at department meetings, and corrective actions are taken.

Students participate in the following surveys:

- first-year student motivation survey;
- student satisfaction with learning conditions and the ENU ecosystem, which evaluates the teaching quality of programme disciplines (theoretical level), use of diverse

teaching methods, development of skills and competencies, as well as overall satisfaction with disciplines within the programme;

- evaluation of internship organisation;
- evaluation of satisfaction with the quality of teaching.

Furthermore, at the end of each academic period, the departments hold discussions with students on the content of the study programmes, the quality of courses, workload, and the topics of final projects. Student suggestions are taken into account in the development of the study programmes and documented in the minutes of department meetings.

ENU also has a system for responding to student complaints, which is aimed at ensuring and improving the quality of the educational process, as well as providing support in cases where students encounter problems. A number of effective practices and mechanisms are used for this purpose.

If necessary, students can contact the university administration directly. Personal appeals can be made in the following ways:

- In person at a meeting with the University management or department heads.
- By email, sending a message to the official university addresses.
- Through the official university website, using the available feedback forms.

5.4 Evaluation by Supervisors and Faculty

All study programmes

The Department of Quality Assurance conducts an annual survey of teaching staff to assess working conditions and analyses the results to identify key issues and areas for improvement. Based on the analysis, recommendations are made to the university management and structural units to increase faculty satisfaction, improve their working conditions and stimulate academic motivation.

The quality of the educational process is assessed by the teaching staff at department meetings through open classes, mutual visits as well as working groups. These forms facilitate the exchange of pedagogical experience, the identification of teaching strengths, and the determination of areas for improvement in methodological approaches. The results of inspections are documented, analysed and used to make improvements in the study programmes.

5.5 Evaluation by Third Parties (Graduates, and other external Stakeholders)

All study programmes

ENU establishes and maintains continuous cooperation with labour market representatives and employers. They participate in the development and evaluation of educational programmes, professional internships, expansion of practice bases, development of final thesis topics, activities of the state attestation commission, joint research projects, and assistance in graduate employment.

External parties, including graduates, employers and practice partners, regularly evaluate the study programmes. Graduate surveys are conducted to assess satisfaction with the quality of the educational process, including the teaching of disciplines, the level of methodological support, and the availability of educational literature. Once every year, researchers and practitioners are invited to review the goals, content, and structure of the study programmes. Additionally, employers' opinions and suggestions are recorded during regular job fairs and round tables organised by the University and the Departments.

Appraisal:

ENU has set up a quality assurance and development procedure, which systematically and continuously monitors and develops the quality of the doctoral programmes with respect to the processes, to its contents and intended learning outcomes as well as to the didactics and included research. It takes into account the evaluation results. The responsibilities are clearly defined. The University ensures that necessary measures and developments are implemented and documented.

Even though the University has included a workload question asking students how much time they allocate to a course, the panel wishes to make the following recommendation: Instead of relying on the current Likert scale, which measures only the perceived workload (e.g., whether it feels too high or too low), the panel recommends collecting more precise and quantitative information. Asking students to indicate the exact number of hours spent on course preparation, revision, and independent study would provide the Quality Assurance system with more meaningful and comparable data. For example, a student may need to spend ten hours per week revising for a course but perceive even five hours as already demanding. As a result, the student might report the workload as "too high," even if, in relation to the expected learning outcomes and the scope of the material, the actual time investment may not yet be sufficient. Collecting real numerical values would therefore enable a more accurate assessment of whether the intended workload aligns with the actual workload. The panel **recommends** complementing the existing workload survey by systematically collecting quantitative data on students' actual time investment in order to enable a more accurate, comparable, and outcome-oriented assessment of whether the intended workload aligns with the real study demands

The quality assurance of the doctoral programmes is systematically embedded in the quality concept for the research of the faculty and the concept for research of the entire higher education institution. An evaluation by the doctoral students of each study programme, learning, teaching and research is carried out on a regular basis and in accordance with a prescribed procedure. The results are documented and communicated to the students and provide input for the quality development process.

Quality control of the doctoral programmes by supervisors and faculty of doctoral candidates is carried out on a regular basis and in accordance with a prescribed procedure; the outcomes are documented and adequately communicated to all involved personnel including students and provide input for the quality development process. An external evaluation is carried out on a regular basis and in accordance with a prescribed procedure; the outcomes are communicated and provide input for the quality development process. The panel **recommends** establishing a continuous and systematic process for monitoring the employment outcomes and work placements of graduates in order to better assess labour market relevance and inform ongoing programme development.

		Exceptional	Exceed	Meet	Does not meet	n.r.	Recommendation
5.1*	Quality Assurance in terms of Contents, Processes and Research (Asterisk Criterion)			X			X
5.2*	Inclusion of Quality Assurance in a Superordinate Quality Concept (Asterisk Criterion)			X			
5.3	Evaluation by Doctoral Students			X			
5.4	Evaluation by Supervisors and Faculty			X			
5.5	Evaluation by Third Parties (Graduates, and other external Stakeholders)			X			X

Appendices

Doctoral Programme in Economics

1 st Semester												
Modul No.	Title of Module / Course Unit + Compulsory or elective?	Credit Points per Semester						Workload		Method of Teaching i.e. lecture course, seminar	Form and Duration of Examinations	FIBAA ... of exam related to final grade
		1.	2.	3.	4.	5.	6.	Hours in Class	Hours Self-Study			
M1	Module 1 Module scientific-research work and internship	5						45	105			
M 1.1	Academic writing	5						45	105	L,S	Exam (60 Min)	
M2	Module 2 Analys of the economic system (choice one)	5						45	105			
M 2.1	Econometrics and modeling of economic processes	5						45	105	L,S	Exam (60 Min)	
M 2.2	Statistical analysis in economics											
M3	Module 3 Module scientific-research work and internship	20										
M 3.1	Doctoral research work, including internships and doctoral dissertations	20									Report	
	Total in CGES SC	30						90	210			
2 nd Semester												
M1	Module 1 Module scientific-research work and internship	5						45	105			
M 2.1	Science research methods	5						45	105	L,S	Exam (60 Min)	
M2	Module 2 Methods of teaching economics	5						45	105			
M 2.1	Organization and methods of teaching economics disciplins	5						45	105	L,S	Exam (60 Min)	
M3	Module 3 National economy (choice one)	5						45	105			
M 3.1	Comprehensive analysis of the economic system	5						45	105	L,S	Exam (60 Min)	
M 3.2	Knowledge-intensive economy											
M4	Module 4 Module scientific-research work and internship	15										
M 4.1	Doctoral research work, including internships and doctoral dissertations	15									Report	
	Total in CGES SC	30						135	315			
	Total for 1 course	30	30					225	525			

3rd Semester												
M1	Module 1	Module scientific-research work and internship			10							
M 1.1	Teaching practice				10						Report	
M2	Module 2	Module scientific-research work and internship			20							
M 2.1	Doctoral research work, including internships and doctoral dissertations				20						Report	
Total in CGES SC					30							
4th Semester												
M1	Module 1	Module scientific-research work and internship			10							
M 1.1	Research internship				10						Report	
M2	Module 2	Module scientific-research work and internship			20							
M 2.1	Doctoral research work, including internships and doctoral dissertations				20							
Total in CGES SC												
Total for 2 course					30	30						
5th Semester												
M1	Module 1	Module scientific-research work and internship				30						
M 1.1	Doctoral research work, including internships and doctoral dissertations					30					Report	
Total in CGES SC						30						

6nd Semester											
M1	Module 1 Module scientific-research work and internship						18				
M 1.1	Doctoral research work, including internships and doctoral dissertations						18				Report
M2	Module 2 Module scientific-research work and internship						18				
M 2.1	Accomplishment and defense a doctoral dissertation						12				DDD
	Total in CGES SC						30	30			
	Total for 3 course						30	30			
total		30	30	30	30	30	30	225	525		

Doctoral Programme in Finance

Example 1 st Semester												FIBAA
Modul No.	Title of Module / Course Unit + Compulsory or elective?	Credit Points per Semester						Workload		Method of Teaching i.e. lecture course, seminar	Form and Duration of Examinations	weight of exam related to final grade
		1.	2.	3.	4.	5.	6.	Hours in Class	Hours Self-Study			
University component		25						45	105			
M1	SRWG 82001 Module scientific-research work and internship											
M1.1	AW 7201 Academic writing	5						45	105	S, L	Exam, oral (35min)	2,8
M1.2	DRWD 7401 (1) Doctoral research work, including internships and doctoral dissertations	20									Report	11,1
Components of choice		5						45	105			
M2	FINC 82003 Financial Risk Regulation module											
M2.1	RBRFM 7203 Risk-based regulation in financial markets	5						45	105	S, L	Exam, essay (50min)	2,8
M3	FINC 82004 Financial Research Module											
M3.1	MMFR 7203 Methods and models in financial research	5						45	105	S, L	Exam, essay (50min)	2,8
Example 2 nd Semester												
University component		25						90	210			
M4	SRWG 82001 Module scientific-research work and internship											
M4.1	SRM 7202 Science research methods	5						45	105	S, L	Exam, oral (35min)	2,8
M1.2	DRWD 7401 (2) Doctoral research work, including internships and doctoral dissertations	15									Report	8,2
Components of choice		5						45	105			
M5	FINC 82005 Informatization of the financial sector											
M5.1	IFS 7301 Informatization of the financial sector	5						45	105	S, L	Exam, essay (50min)	2,8
Components of choice		5						45	105			
M6	FINC 82006 Module of investment design											
M6.1	ID 7303 Investment design	5						45	105	S, L	Exam, oral (35min)	2,8
Components of choice		5						45	105			
M7	FINC 82007 Financial Stability Module											
M7.1	FSAM 7303 Financial stability: assessment methods	5						45	105	S, L	Exam, oral (35min)	2,8
Total in CGES SC		30	30					225	525			

Example 3 rd Semester															
University component															
M8	SRWG 82001 Module scientific-research work and internship														
M8.1	TP 8202 Teaching practice							10						Report	5,6
M8.2	DRWD 8401 (3) Doctoral research work, including internships and doctoral dissertations							20						Report	11,1
Example 4 rd Semester															
University component															
M9	SRWG 82001 Module scientific-research work and internship														
M9.1	RI 8302 Research intership								10					Report	5,6
M9.2	DRWD 8401 (4) Doctoral research work, including internships and doctoral dissertations								20					Report	11,1
Total in CGES SC								30	30						
Example 5 th Semester															
University component															
M10	SRWG 82001 Module scientific-research work and internship														
M10.1	DRWD 9401 (5) Doctoral research work, including internships and doctoral dissertations									30				Report	16,7
Example 6 th Semester															
University component															
M11	SRWG 82001 Module scientific-research work and internship														
M11.1	DRWD 9401 (5) Doctoral research work, including internships and doctoral dissertations										18			Report	10
M12	MFA 82002 Module final attestation														
M12.1	Accomplishment and defense a doctoral dissertation										12			DDD	6,6
Total in CGES SC										30	30				
total						30	30	30	30	30	30	225	525		100%

Doctoral Programme in Tourism

Modul No.	Title of Module / Course Unit + Compulsory or elective?	Credit Points per Semester						Workload		Method of Teaching	Form and Duration of Examinations	weight of exam related to final grade
		1	2	3	4	5	6	Hours in Class	Hours Self-Study	i.e. lecture course, seminar		
	1st Semester											
M1	Module 1							45	105			
M 1.1	Academic writing (Compulsory)	5						45	105	L,S	Project Essay / Presentation, from 35 minutes-till 60 minutes	
M 1.2	Doctoral research work, including internships and doctoral dissertations	20									Report	
M2	Module 2							45	105			
M 2.1	Theory and methodology of scientific research in tourism (elective)	5						45	105	L,S	Project Essay / Presentation, from 35 minutes-till 60 minutes	
	Total in CGES SC	30										
	2nd Semester											
M3	Module 3							45	105			
M 3.1	Science research methods (Compulsory)		5					45	105	L,S	Project Essay / Presentation, from 35 minutes-till 60 minutes	
M 3.2	Doctoral research work, including internships and doctoral dissertations		15								Report	
M4	Module 4							45	105			
M 4.1	Business Climate research in the tourism sector of the Republic of Kazakhstan (Compulsory)		5					45	105	L,S	Exam, till 35 minutes	
M5	Module 5							45	105			
M 5.1	Sustainability tourism & Circular Economy (elective)		5					45	105	L,S	Exam, till 35 minutes	
	Total in CGES SC		30									
	Total for 1 course	30	30					225	525			

	3rd Semester												
M6	Module 6												
M 6.1	Teaching practice (Compulsory)			10							Practice	Report	
M 6.2	Doctoral research work, including internships and doctoral dissertations			20								Report	
	Total in CGES SC			30									
	4th Semester												
M7	Module 7												
M 7.1	Research practice (Compulsory)			10							Practice	Report	
M 7.2	Doctoral research work, including internships and doctoral dissertations			20								Report	
	Total in CGES SC			30									
	Total for the 2nd course			30	30								
	5th Semester												
M8	Module 8												
M 8.1	Doctoral research work, including internships and doctoral dissertations				30							Report	
	Total in CGES SC				30								

	6th Semester												
M9	Module 9												
M 9.1	Doctoral research work, including internships and doctoral dissertations						18					Report	
M 9.2	Accomplishment and defense a doctoral dissertation						12					DDD	
	Total in CGES SC						30						
	Total for the 3rd course					30	30						
	total	30	30	30	30	30	30	225	525				