

Decision of the FIBAA Accreditation and Certification Committee



6th Meeting on June 29, 2022

PROGRAMME ACCREDITATION

Project Number:	20/120
Higher Education Institution:	Narxoz University
Location	Almaty, Kazakhstan
Study Programme:	Bachelor in Accounting and Audit (Bachelor in Business and Administration)
Type of Accreditation	initial accreditation

The FIBAA Accreditation and Certification Committee has taken the following decision:

According to § 7 (6) in conjunction with § 9 (1) of the FIBAA General Terms and Conditions within the framework of procedures for the award of the FIBAA Quality Seal for Programmes from April 2020, the study programme is accredited.

Period of Accreditation: June 29, 2022, until June 28, 2027

The FIBAA Quality Seal is awarded.



**FOUNDATION FOR INTERNATIONAL
BUSINESS ADMINISTRATION ACCREDITATION**

FIBAA – BERLINER FREIHEIT 20-24 – D-53111 BONN

Assessment Report

Higher Education Institution:

Narxoz University, Almaty, Kazakhstan

Bachelor programme:

Bachelor in Accounting and Audit

Qualification awarded on completion:

Bachelor in Business and Administration

General information on the study programme

Brief description of the study programme:

The study programme Bachelor in Accounting and Audit of Narxoz University has a duration of four years (eight semesters) and a workload of 240 ECTS credits. The programme comprises 47 courses (incl. internships, research and thesis). Its design is oriented at international standards following the requirements of recognised certification associations and institutions, such as CIMA¹, ACCA², CIA³ and CMA⁴. The courses are offered in Russian and Kazakh, 25 % of the courses also in English. Graduates of the programme will have the chance to be employed across the private and public sectors in the fields of compliance, internal audit, finance and accounting.

Type of study programme:

Bachelor programme

Projected study time and number of ECTS credits

4 years and 240 ECTS credits

Mode of study:

full-time

Didactic approach:

study programme with obligatory class attendance

Double/Joint Degree programme:

no

Scope (planned number of parallel classes) and enrolment capacity:

50

Programme cycle starts in:

Fall semester

Initial start of the programme:

September 2021 (in new version)

Type of accreditation:

initial accreditation

¹ CIMA is the Chartered Institute of Management Accountants (<https://www.cimaglobal.com>).

² ACCA is the Association of Chartered Certified Accountants, a global Chamber of Accountants (www.accaglobal.com).

³ CIA means Certified Internal Auditor.

⁴ CMA is an Institute of Management Accountants providing Certifications for Accountants and Financial Professionals in Business.

Procedure

A contract for the initial accreditation of the Bachelor in Accounting and Audit (Bachelor in Business and Administration) was made between FIBAA and Narxoz University on November 9, 2020. On December 3, 2021 the HEI submitted a self-evaluation report, which included a detailed description of the programme and further documents in order to prove that the criteria for programme accreditation are met.

At the same time, FIBAA appointed a review panel⁵. The HEI has agreed with the chosen experts. The panel consisted of:

Prof. Dr. Erich Barthel

Frankfurt School of Finance and Management, Frankfurt, Germany
Prof. em. for Corporate Culture and Human Resource Management

Prof. Dr. Marion Halfmann

Hochschule Rhein-Waal, Kleve, Germany
Professor for Marketing and Market-Oriented Management
Vice President for Studies, Teaching and Further Education

Prof. Dr. Irina Kohler

Hochschule Fulda, University of Applied Sciences, Fulda, Germany
Professor of Management Science and Management Accounting

Dr. Meruyert Narenova

University of International Business, Almaty, Kazakhstan
Academic Director of the MSc and PhD programmes
on Economics and Management

Dr. Loretta O'Donnell

Nazarbayev University, Nursultan, Kazakhstan
Vice Provost Academic Affairs

Maik Oneschkow

FedEx Express Germany GmbH, Frankfurt, Germany
Manager Clearance Brokerage OPS, Frankfurt Airport

Jens Weibezahn

Technical University Berlin, Germany
PhD Candidate in Industrial Engineering and Management

FIBAA project manager:

Dr. Birger Hendriks

⁵ The panel is presented in alphabetical order.

The assessment is based on the self-evaluation report, amended by further documents, as requested by the panel, and an online conference (because of the Covid-19 pandemic). The online conference took place on March 16 to 18, 2022 via the video conferencing tool *Zoom*. The same cluster included an appraisal of the study programmes “Master in Accounting and Audit with concentration in Corporate Governance, Compliance and Performance Appraisal” (Master in Business and Administration) and “PhD in Accounting, Audit and Taxation” (Doctor of Philosophy) as well as an Institutional Accreditation of Narxoz University. At the end of the online conference, the panel has given a short feedback on its first impressions to representatives of the HEI.

The assessment report based on this was delivered to the HEI for comment on May 28, 2022. The statement on the report was given up on June 3, 2022. It has been taken into account in the report at hand.

Summary

The Bachelor in Accounting and Audit offered by Narxoz University fulfils the FIBAA quality requirements for Bachelor programmes and can be accredited by the Foundation for International Business Administration Accreditation (FIBAA) for five years starting on June 29, 2022 and finishing on June 28, 2027. The programme is in accordance with the national and the European Qualification Frameworks and the European Standards and Guidelines in their applicable version valid as of the time of the opening of the procedure, and with the Bologna Declaration.

The panel members identified several areas where the programme could be further developed:

- more intensively including the use of IT (software, data protection, IT services, networking, communication) (see chapter 3.1);
- raising the structure of the academic staff (see chapter 4.1);
- widening the administrative career counselling and placement service (see chapter 4.5);
- involving the alumni in the future even more in order to make use of the possibilities of implying practical experiences into the programme (see chapter 4.5).

The measures that the HEI takes in order to implement the recommendations of the panel members will have to be considered during the re-accreditation.

There are many criteria in which the programme exceeds the quality requirements:

- Methods and scientific practice (see chapter 3.1);
- Skills for employment / Employability (see chapter 3.6);
- Practical business experience of faculty (see chapter 4.1);
- Internal cooperation (see chapter 4.1);
- Student support by the faculty (see chapter 4.1);
- Cooperation with business enterprises and other organisations (see chapter 4.3).

For the overall assessment of the programme, please refer to the quality profile at the end of this report.

Information

Information on the Institution

Narxoz University was created in 1963 as an independent organisation building on the Economics College of Kazakh National University (now Al-Farabi Kazakh National University). Its mission at that time was to educate highly qualified specialists to support the acceleration of structural reforms and economic growth. In its early years the University had three colleges: economic planning, accounting and finance. In 1964, the Programme for Postgraduate Studies was launched for scholars and academics and the Higher School of Economics was created for part-time studies.

The University has operated under various names which are chronologically: Alma-Ata Institute of National Economy (AINE); Kazakh State University of Economics; Kazakh State Academy of Management (KSAM); Kazakh University of Economics and the New University of Economics. Nevertheless, it has always been known informally as “Narxoz” which is an abbreviation of the Russian words “Narodnoye Khozyaistvo” meaning ‘national economy’.

In 2016, the institution was formally renamed as Narxoz University. In 2020 it became a Non-Profit Joint-Stock Company (NJSC). Sole shareholder is a Kazakhstani businessman. Students have to pay tuition fees. Any operational surplus is reinvested to support improvements in education and research quality. Narxoz has the task to train specialists in business, economics, digital technologies, law and social sciences. Since its creation in 1963 over 140,000 alumni have graduated from the University. From 2022, the University will move into newly reconstructed facilities.

In 2021, Narxoz elaborated a new Strategy 2020 – 2025 which includes a stock taking of what has been achieved and at the same time a concept for future changes and developments. In this context the University’s actual mission was adopted in 2021 as part of the strategic review: to inspire, create knowledge and educate people who contribute to economic, legal, technological and social development.

The University wants to continue to serve the development of the Republic of Kazakhstan and Central Asia in general by contributing to the further modernisation of the country. As a response to the current challenges including the COVID-19 pandemic and increasing requirements from students, parents and employers in its new Strategy Narxoz describes several measures that have recently been taken:

1. The Academic Council was established as a collegial body responsible for decision making on academic issues including approval of academic policies and monitoring of their implementation.
2. Each Higher School has a Quality Assurance Committee (QAC) that makes an independent analysis of teaching quality.
3. Research and Research Ethics Committees have been established at the Academic Council to further build the standing of the University in the research community by assuring the compliance of student and faculty research activities with quality and ethical standards.

4. The Office of Academic Advising has been launched to assist students during registration and selection of courses, minors and faculty. They also support students in the preparation of their individual study schedule.
5. Research centres have become part of the higher schools to encourage the involvement of bachelor, master and doctorate students. At the same time the freedom of their activities has been secured.
6. The Office of Transformation led by the Advisor on Academic Quality to the President has been launched. The Office contributes to independent analysis of compliance with academic policies and to institutional research for relevant, effective and reasonable top management decisions on academic and other issues. Currently, the Accreditation Office conducts surveys among students and its results are discussed at Quality Assurance Committees and by the Academic Council.
7. The Higher School of Arts and Social Sciences was created with the purpose of offering first year students at other Higher Schools preparatory courses including ones on Academic Writing and Research Methodology.
8. Financial aid has recently been delegated to the Office of Student Affairs that is more closely involved in collaboration with students.

The strategic review of 2021 set four priority areas:

- Producing qualified graduates with a strong sense of ethics to build human capital capacity in key areas;
- Generating new knowledge through an applied research focus to support change processes;
- Serving as an example of how to manage a values-driven university in the region which is focused on efficiency, effectiveness and a relentless drive to raise quality;
- Attracting new students from across Central Asia to widen the reach of its impact.

By working on these goals, the intent is to deliver on the vision of the University in 2025, which is to be an internationally recognised University attracting talented youth from Central Asia with internationally accredited programmes and research that bring positive economic and social change.

Moreover, in 2021 Narxoz adopted a new Charter⁶ that describes the organisational structure of the management and its responsibilities in contrast to the private owners.

For the education of students the University comprises Higher Schools that are subdivided into departments for the subjects and programmes⁷:

- Higher School of Economics and Management (with the Accounting and Audit department),
- Higher School of Digital Technologies,
- Higher School of Law and Public Policy,
- Higher School of Arts and Social Sciences
- Graduate School of Business.

⁶ Charter of Non-profit joint-stock company “Narxoz University”.

⁷ A plan of the University’s organisational structure is attached as Annex 1

Statistical data

The undergraduate programme in Accounting and Audit started in 1963.

		2015	2016	2017	2018	2019	2020	2021
# Study Places offered by HEI		200	200	200	150	150	150	150
# Applicants	∑	256	234	269	163	178	167	198
	f	161	147	174	110	103	113	119
	m	95	87	95	53	75	54	79
Application rate		128,00 %	117,00 %	134,50 %	108,67 %	118,67 %	111,33 %	132,00 %
# First-Year Students (<i>accepted applicants</i>)	∑	142	186	191	95	62	108	111
	f	96	146	128	71	43	73	72
	m	46	40	63	24	19	35	39
Rate of female students		67,61%	78,49%	67,02%	74,74%	69,35%	67,59%	64,86%
# Foreign Students	∑	2	2	3	0	1	1	1
	f	1	0	1	0	0	0	1
	m	1	2	2	0	1	1	0
Rate of foreign students		1,41%	1,08%	1,57%	0,00%	1,61%	0,93%	0,90%
Percentage of occupied study places		71,00%	93,00%	95,50%	63,33%	41,33%	72,00%	74,00%
# Graduates	∑	123	170	145				
	f	89	136	106				
	m	34	34	39				
Success rate (<i>students who finished their studies</i>)		86,60%	91,40%	75,90%				
Dropout rate (<i>students who dropped their studies</i>)		13,4%	8,6%	24,1%				
Average duration of study		4	4	4				
Average grade of final degree		3,25	3,18	3,15				

Appraisal

The panel notes that in 2020 - 2021 the programme that had started in 1963 underwent a transition e.g., with developing 5 ECTS courses. It welcomes the impulses and processes of the change management that the President and the whole team of Narxoz have started, in particular

also with the new Strategy 2020 – 2025. During the online conference, the panel could observe a strong orientation towards further development and change of Narxoz which also means that the University needs time to make these strategic changes a reality.

As far as the programme at hand is concerned the statistical numbers show that during 2015 and 2021 the rates of applicants were on average 21 % higher than the numbers of study places although the study places have been reduced from 200 to 150. In the consequence, not all study places could be occupied. The dropout and success rates were volatile but adequate. Around two thirds of the student body are female students.

Programme Description and Appraisal in Detail

1. Objectives

1.1 Objectives of the study programme (Asterisk Criterion)

The Accounting and Audit department of the University being responsible for the programme "Accounting and Audit" at the levels Undergraduate and Master was founded in 1963. It was recognised by accreditation agencies at the earliest stage of its existence. The department belongs to the Higher School of Economics and Management (HSEM) that in partnership with its Business Council⁸ redesigned its programmes oriented at international standards following the requirements of recognised certification associations and institutions, such as CIMA⁹, ACCA¹⁰, CIA¹¹ and CMA¹² given the competition of the business education market.

The purpose of the Bachelor programme Accounting and Audit is to prepare qualified, competitive, competent professional personnel in the field of accounting and auditing, capable of becoming leaders in their chosen field of professional activity and who are competitive in the labour market.

The programme has defined the learning outcomes listed below. Students graduating from the programme should be able to:

- Understand key trends which are driving socio-economic development;
- Conduct research across a range of topics in business and economics;
- Analyse financial and economic activities of companies, and formulate recommendations to improve the financial conditions of businesses;
- Prepare consolidated financial statements in accordance with the requirements of IFRS, for taxation, audit and decision-making purposes;
- Develop a foundation for professional certifications;
- Understand and apply norms of ethical behaviour.

The educational programme is oriented at flexibility, interdisciplinarity and integration. It is practice-oriented (involvement of industry experts into the academic process) and student oriented (involvement of students in the development and assessment of programme). It is structured in accordance with the Higher School of Economics and Management priorities and the University Strategy¹³.

Students have access to the curriculum, to course content and study plans. The syllabus for each course provides information about the learning outcomes of the course, the number of ECTS credits, course content, requirements for examinations, methods of assessing student progress,

⁸ <https://narxoz.edu.kz/sem/business-council>

⁹ CIMA is the Chartered Institute of Management Accountants (<https://www.cimaglobal.com>).

¹⁰ ACCA is the Association of Chartered Certified Accountants, a global Chamber of Accountants (www.accaglobal.com).

¹¹ CIA means Certified Internal Auditor.

¹² CMA is an Institute of Management Accountants providing Certifications for Accountants and Financial Professionals in Business.

scale and evaluation system, recommended and required learning resources of the course. The requirements correspond to qualification level 6 of the National Qualification Framework.

Graduates of the programme are employed across the private and public sectors, including the Big 4, other international companies, state and Kazakhstani companies. According to Narxoz’s Academic Policy, in the second and third years, having received basic knowledge and skills, students with the help of advisors have the opportunity to adjust their individual educational programme. The flexibility of the educational programme also allows students to widen their experience by taking Minors¹⁴.

Appraisal:

The panel welcomes newly defined qualification objectives of the programme that are explained and convincingly presented in relation to the target group, targeted professional field and societal context of the discipline. They embrace academic proficiency, comprehensive employability, as well as the development of the individual student’s personality.

The subject-specific and extra-curricular qualification objectives and skills to be acquired correspond with the aspired level at graduation. They take into account the requirements of the national qualification framework. The panel welcomes the flexibility of the programme structure that allows students to achieve an individual curriculum.

		Exceptional	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	n.r.
1.1*	Objectives of the study programme (Asterisk Criterion)			X		

1.2 International orientation of the study programme design (Asterisk Criterion)

Narxoz University sees internationalisation as a strategic priority. The programme complements this. The department completely revised the curriculum to meet international standards and achieved the following results:

The study programme Accounting and Audit is focused on developing competencies that are demanded by international employers, such as Big 4¹⁵ and other international companies operating in Kazakhstan.

25 % of the courses are available in English. Courses that are taught in Russian and Kazakh must use internationally recognised textbooks (e.g. ACCA, CIMA,), case studies, and other didactical materials with strong international context.

¹⁴ <https://narxoz.edu.kz/advising/catalogue2021.pdf>

¹⁵ This is the nickname referring to the four largest professional accounting networks Deloitte, Ernst & Young, KPMG and Price Waterhouse Coopers (PwC).

A double degree programme with Coventry University (UK) has been active since 2021.¹⁶

Appraisal:

The panel appreciates the international orientation of the programme. Its design with international content and accreditations based on international standards for accounting and audit appropriately promotes the graduates' employability.

	Exceptional	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	n.r.
1.2* International orientation of the study programme design (Asterisk Criterion)			X		

1.3 Positioning of the study programme

The study programme at hand has been accredited by Association of Chartered Certified Accountants (ACCA)¹⁷ as well as by the Certified Institute of Management Accountants (CIMA)¹⁸.

According to the University¹⁹ Narxoz University annually participates in the rating of the National Chamber of Entrepreneurs of the Republic of Kazakhstan "Atameken"²⁰, that accounts for the recent university graduates' career perspectives (entry salaries, employment rate, and job search duration), and the rating based on the industry representatives' assessments. In 2020, Narxoz was ranked tenth nationally. The Bachelor programme Accounting and Audit ranked fourth.

At the national level, Narxoz University is evaluated within the framework of institutional and programme accreditation and ratings conducted by the Independent Agency for Accreditation and Rating²¹(IAAR). Since 2014, the University has participated in these assessments and in each year has ranked second or third as shown below²².

IAAR Rating of the Accounting and Audit Bachelor Programme

Year	2015	2016	2017	2018	2019	2021
Rating	3rd	2nd	2nd	3rd	2nd	3rd

As part of the continuing review of the programme in 2021 new admission and academic quality requirements were adopted alongside the curriculum review discussed above. The incremental implementation of the academic quality centred policy started in the programme in 2020. After three years of declining enrolment the past two years have seen increases.

¹⁶ The double degree programmes are not part of this accreditation procedure.

¹⁷ www.accaglobal.com

¹⁸ <https://www.cimaglobal.com>

¹⁹ See Self-evaluation report (SER) p. 10.

²⁰ <https://atameken.kz/ru/services/44-rejting-obrazovatel-nyh-programm-vuzov>

²¹ <https://iaar.agency/rating/1/0/2021>

²² As mentioned above (see Information), the programme started in 1963 and underwent a revision in 2020 – 2021.

Number of first-year students 2015 – 2021

Year	2015	2016	2017	2018	2019	2020	2021
Accounting and audit	142	186	191	95	62	108	111
Narxoz University, Bachelor	1,628	2,398	1,849	1,311	422	1,125	1,367

Employability is a priority for the programme and for the University. According to Atameken research, the programme was the third largest source of employees for the Big 4 in 2020.

Accounting and Audit Employment indicators NCE “Atameken” 2019-2020

A&A	2019	2020
Average Salary (US \$)	305	315
Employment Rate, %	88,30%	79,39%
Duration of job search (in months)	2,7	1,55

According to the rating of educational programmes by Atameken, the employment of graduates of the Accounting and Audit Programme was 79 % and the average salary 138,656 tenge or 330 dollars. For 2018 the average salary for Accounting and Audit graduates was 115,442 tenge. Due to changes in the calculation methodology earlier data is not available.

The academic programme corresponds with the University Strategy and its mission²³. Its strategic priorities are:

- Education Quality and Accessibility to Promote Positive Economic and Social Change
- Recognition for Research
- Efficient University Management
- International Outlook

The focus for the department at this stage is on the first priority related to educational quality. However, as noted elsewhere in the document, efficient programme management, internationalization and research to ensure currency and relevance of the faculty and the programmes they deliver are embedded in operations.

Appraisal:

The competitive position of Narxoz’ University as a whole and the Bachelor programme in the particular seem to be improving after some difficult years. Therefore, the reasons given for the positioning in the educational market of this study programme are plausible.

The arguments in support of graduate employability on the basis of the stated qualification objectives are convincingly presented. The future fields of employment for graduates are plausibly set forth.

²³ See above chapter Information.

The study programme is convincingly integrated into Narxoz’s overall strategic concept. The study programme’s qualification goals are in line with the HEI’s mission and strategic planning.

		Exceptional	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	n.r.
1.3	Positioning of the study programme					
1.3.1	Positioning of the study programme in the educational market			X		
1.3.2	Positioning of the study programme on the job market for graduates („Employability“)			X		
1.3.3	Positioning of the study programme within the HEI's overall strategic concept			X		

2. Admission

In 2021, Narxoz adopted by the decision of its Academic Council a document with the title Academic Policies²⁴. It describes and regulates the main academic principles and procedures of Narxoz, inter alia those for admission. Moreover, Narxoz has installed rules of admission for programmes of undergraduate education which include Bachelor programmes. These internal regulations are based on and take into account the rules of admission approved by the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan (MES). In 2021, MES updated these rules²⁵ which stipulate in detail the procedure, criteria and responsibilities for the admission to higher education programmes. The entrance examination was centralized across the country. HEIs no longer arrange examinations and are separated from admission except from anonymous review of candidates' research proposals by the University faculty. After documents' submission applicants have to register at the database of National Testing Center (NTC) of the MES and at the scheduled time take online (written) examinations on the NTC platform.²⁶

In accordance with MES requirements, to be admitted to the undergraduate programme candidates must take a UNT (Unified National Test)²⁷. Performance on this test also serves as a competition for eligibility to receive a state educational grant. The test is administered and scored by the NTC²⁸ and published on their website to ensure transparency. Then, candidates apply directly to the University Admission Office with supporting documents. A full listing of these documents is published on the University website²⁹.

Admission of international students is based on an interview or admission test conducted by the University Admissions Office. Foreign students who have graduated from educational institutions in Kazakhstan can be admitted to the University based on this interview or test. Foreign students who have graduated from educational institutions outside Kazakhstan can be admitted to the University based on this interview or test and are subject to certification of qualifications prior to commencement of their studies.

Admission procedures are guided by the MES Standard Typical Admission Rules and the University Academic Policy. All information for applicants is provided on the University website.

There are various scholarships available based on merit and need. These are listed on the University website³⁰. The decision to grant scholarships is taken by the Financial Aid Commission.

In order to attract more highly qualified applicants, the HSEM has adopted additional admission requirements. Under these new rules, Accounting and Audit programme applicants should meet the following requirements:

- English level (IELTS >5.0)
- Entry major exam (Mathematics > 17 points).

²⁴ Approved of NJSC "Narxoz University" dated October 19, 2021.

²⁵ "Rules for Admission to Academic Programs at Higher Education Institutions.

²⁶ [Manual from the MES of RK on organization of admission exams to PhD programs](#)

²⁷ Secondary school leaving examination and entrance exam for HEIs

²⁸ <https://kursiv.kz/news/obrazovanie/2021-04/kakie-novovvedeniya-poyavilis-v-processe-ent-v-2021-godu>

²⁹ <https://en.narxoz.kz/admission/>

³⁰ <https://en.narxoz.kz/grants-and-discounts/>

Applicants have to pass English Placement Test (EPT). If an applicant has a IELTS score > 5, this requirement is waived. If applicants do not meet the required level of English, they can attend Intensive Classes in the Foundation programme that Narxoz is offering. If applicants score 5 to 17 UNT points in Mathematics they are determined to study in the programme compulsory preparatory courses that are provided as part of the Mathematics Foundation programme. If students do not meet the exit requirements, admission is refused.

Narxoz University's Recruitment and Admissions department is the unit responsible for implementing the work with prospective students in online and offline formats. All appropriate information on admission rules and procedures is available and regularly updated at the University website³¹. The work on information and counselling has several directions: career guidance and live counselling; exhibitions and fairs; summer admissions; virtual admissions and online counselling. The counselling service could be reached via the Call Centre or the website online consultant or by direct email. However, the website describes the admission questions not in English.

In addition to monolingual groups studying in Russian and Kazakh, the department is gradually increasing the number of students studying in multilingual and English-speaking groups. HSEM Strategy intends that by the 2023 - 2024 academic year 60 % of courses will be available in English.

The HSEM webpage contains relevant information for applicants on the academic programmes, teaching staff, and the Catalogue with all policies and procedures explained and contact information. The admission decision is made by the University Admissions Committee and communicated to applicants once the recommendations of the Committee are approved by the President of the University. The admission procedure is based on the principles of openness and transparency, the decision on the above criteria and communicated to applicants by email/phone.

Appraisal:

The admission requirements are defined and comprehensible. The national requirements are presented and taken into account.

Applicants can directly turn to the Recruitment and Admissions department which provides a student counselling service, for clarification of specific questions, of personal aptitude, of career perspectives etc. Personal dialogue between applicants and the HEI is provided by defined office hours, by telephone and via e-mail. Also, the University website answers questions on admission.

The selection procedure is transparent and ensures that qualified students are admitted.

The admission requirements (required language proficiency level or required result in a concrete language test) or preparatory language courses ensure that students are able to successfully complete the study programme (courses, additional literature, utilisation of counselling services and extracurricular activities).

³¹ <https://en.narxoz.kz/admission>

The admission procedure is described, documented, and accessible for interested parties. The admission decision is based on transparent criteria and is communicated in writing.

		Exceptional	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	n.r.
2.1*	Admission requirements (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
2.2	Counselling for prospective students			X		
2.3*	Selection procedure (if relevant)			X		
2.4(*)	Professional experience (if relevant; Asterisk Criterion for master programmes that require professional experience)			X		
2.5*	Ensuring foreign language proficiency (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
2.6*	Transparency and documentation of admission procedure and decision (Asterisk Criterion)			X		

3. Contents, structure and didactical concept of the programme

3.1 Contents

The Accounting and Audit programme is a four-year Bachelor programme. The first-year programme for all undergraduate programmes of study is administered by the Higher School of Arts and Social Sciences. It consists of courses required by MES, which are to some extent common to all majors. The programme and content of required courses were modified in the 2020/21 academic year in accordance with University Strategy.

The curriculum overview is presented below:

Bachelor Programme in Accounting and Audit , 8 Semesters

Modul No.	Title of Module / Course Unit	Credit Points per Semester								Workload		Teaching Method	Form and Duration of Examinations	Weight of exam related to final grade	
		1.	2.	3.	4.	5.	6.	7.	8.	Hours in Class	Hours Self-Study				i.e., lecture course, seminar
1st Semester															
General Education Required - 26 ECTS		26													
LNG 1105	English	5								45	90	T	Exam paper (120 min)	40/100	
LNG 1101/ LNG 1103	Kazakh (Russian) Language	5								45	90	T	Exam paper (120 min)	40/100	
GED 1101	Module of Social and Political Knowledge: Sociology	2								18	36	L/S	Exam paper (120 min)	40/100	
GED 1102	Module of Social and Political Knowledge: Political Science	2								18	36	L/S	Exam paper (120 min)	40/100	
GED 1103	Module of Social and Political Knowledge: Culturology	2								18	36	L/S	Exam paper (120 min)	40/100	
GED 1105	Informational-Communicational Technologies	5								45	90	L/Lab	Exam paper (120 min)	40/100	
GED 1106	The Modern History of Kazakhstan	5								45	90	L/S	Exam paper (180 min)	40/100	
Business Core Required- 5 ECTS		5													
ECN 1201	Introduction to Economics	5								45	90	L/S	Exam paper (120 min)	40/100	
Total		31								279	558				
2nd Semester															
General Education Required - 25 ECTS		25													
LNG 1106	English	5								45	90	T	Exam paper (120 min)	40/100	
LNG 1102/LNG 1104	Kazakh (Russian) Language	5								45	90	T	Exam paper (120 min)	40/100	
GED 1108	Philosophy	5								45	90	L/S	Exam paper (120 min)	40/100	
GED 1107	Academic Research	5								45	90	L/S	Exam paper (120 min)	40/100	
MATH 1102	Higher Mathematics and Probability Theory	5								45	90	L/T	Exam paper (120 min)	40/100	
Business Core Required-- 5 ECTS		5													
ACC 1201	Fundamentals of Financial Accounting	5								45	90	L/S	Exam paper (120 min)	40/100	
Total		30								270	540				
3^d Semester															

General Education Required - 2 ECTS				2									
GED 2104	Module of Social and Political Knowledge: Psychology			2					18	36	L/S	Exam paper (120 min)	40/100
School Business Core Required- 10 ECTS				10									
LNG 2207	English			5					45	90	T	Exam paper (120 min)	40/100
ACC 2202	Ethics and Professional Skills			5					45	90	T	Exam paper (120 min)	40/100
Business Core Required- 15 ECTS				15									
ECN 2202	Econometrics			5					45	90	L/T	Exam paper (120 min)	40/100
MGN 2201	Principles of Management			5					45	90	L/S	Exam Paper (120 min)	40/100
FIN 2201	Principles of Finance			5					45	90	L/S	Exam paper (120 min)	40/100
Major Required- 5 ECTS				5									
ACC 2303	Intermediate Financial Accounting			5					45	90	L/S	Exam paper (120 min)	40/100
Total				32					288	576			
4th Semester													
School Business Core Required- 10 ECTS				10									
LNG 2210	English for Accounting			5					45	90	T	Exam paper (120 min)	40/100
BUS 2205	Quantitative Methods in Business			5					45	90	L/S	Exam paper (120 min)	40/100
Business Core Required- 10 ECTS				10									
MRKT 2201	Principles of Marketing			5					45	90	L/S	Exam paper (120 min)	40/100
ECN 2204	Managerial Economics in Finance			5					45	90	L/S	Exam paper (120 min)	40/100
Major Required- 5 ECTS				5									
ACC 2304	Accounting for Decision Making			5					45	90	L/S	Exam paper (120 min)	40/100
Business Core Electives - 5 ECTS from the list below:				5									
ACC 2205	Cloud Accounting Technology								45	90	L/S/Lab	Exam paper (120 min)	40/100
ACC 2206	Selected Topics in Accounting			5					45	90	L/S	N/A	40/100
ACC 2207	Social and Environmental Accounting								45	90	L/S/Lab	Exam paper (120 min)	40/100
Total				30					270	540			
5th Semester													
Business Core Required- 5 ECTS				5									
ACC 3208	Corporate Business Law			5					45	90	L/S	Exam paper (120 min)	40/100
Major Required- 15 ECTS				15									
ACC 3309	Financial Reporting			5					45	90	L/S	Exam paper (180 min)	40/100
ACC 3310	Management Accounting and Control 1			5					45	90	L/S	Exam paper (180 min)	40/100
ACC 3311	Audit and Assurance			5					45	90	L/S	Exam paper (180 min)	40/100
Major Electives - 10 ECTS from the list below:				10									
ACC 3212	Taxes and Taxation			5					45	90	L/S	Exam Paper (120 Min)	40/100
ACC 3213	Accounting in Financial Institutions			5					45	90	L/S	Exam Paper (120 Min)	40/100
ACC 3214	Digital Transformation: the Role of Accountancy			5					45	90	L/S	Exam Paper (120 Min)	40/100
ACC 3215	International Taxation			5					45	90	L/S	Exam Paper (120 Min)	40/100
ACC 3227	Selected Topics in Accounting			5					45	90	L/S	N/A	40/100

- soft skills (communication skills, information gathering and processing, leadership skills, teamwork skills, identification of business values);
- hard skills (ability to understand market trends at all levels of interrelationships; to assess and to analyse problems in finance, economics, accounting and develop basic recommendations); and skills necessary for further study (basic research skills).

Elective courses offered in each semester provide students with the opportunity to build the learning path most appropriate to them. The students can contact the Office of Advising to change their individual curriculum.

With the diploma project students have the possibility to choose a topic related to their intended future professional activity. Topics for the thesis project must be approved at the HSEM QAC³². Thesis project guidelines are developed by the department and are provided to each student. The results of the research must be presented to a State Examination Board, consisting of four or five industry and/or faculty representatives. The Board has the authority to make the final decision on whether or not to award a Bachelor's degree.

The official name of the degree awarded upon the successful graduation of the study programme is determined according to the requirements of the Classifier of training areas of higher and postgraduate education and approved by the Order of the Minister of Education and Science.

The programme at the undergraduate level must include one-week of business orientation at the end of the third year, a ten-week internship, and an undergraduate diploma project in the fourth year. The internship allows students to consolidate and apply acquired knowledge and skills in the business environment.

Moreover, the programme integrates theory and practice through implementing case studies in teaching. The professional certification-oriented courses offered by ACCA, CIMA, CIA, CMA allow students to collect practical experience. Almost every major requires the course “Selected Topics in Accounting”. This course is focused on ensuring deeper understanding of the future profession through analysis of specific case problems.

Along with the academically qualified teachers there are guest lecturers who contribute to the training of students with their professional experience in a relevant field such as in the Leadership Development Programme.

In addition, there are a number of courses with syllabi at the same time reflecting internationally recognized certification programmes. For instance, the syllabi of Financial Accounting, Accounting for Decision Making, Corporate Business Law, Management Accounting and Control 1 and 2, Taxes and Taxation, Tax Reporting, Financial Reporting, Audit and Assurance, Financial Management and Ethics and professional skills provide the fundamentals for separate examination papers of ACCA. Within the current academic year, the Accounting for Decision Making course was integrated to CIMA BA2 certification level. The successful completion of this course will allow students to pass the BA2 level, and they are granted exemption from levels BA1-4.

The programme utilises an interdisciplinary approach. It includes several courses from Finance, Management, Business, Economics and Marketing. These are mainly delivered as Business Core

³² Quality Assurance Committee.

Required Courses. Moreover, in the final year of study the Strategic Management and Financial Management courses aim to develop interdisciplinary analytical thinking skills.

Interdisciplinary competencies of students are being developed also through Minors. More than 20 are available, such as “Digital Public Administration”, “International Tourism”, “Successful Communications and Leadership”, “Tax Consulting” and “Banking”.

As far as ethical aspects are concerned, the Code of Conduct of Narxoz University establishes standards of conduct that apply to all faculty, students and administration of the University. As mentioned above³³, the University has installed a Research Committee and a Research Ethics Committee at the Academic Council to further build the standing of the University in the research community by assuring the compliance of student and faculty research activities with quality and ethical standards. Also, the Narxoz University Examination Regulations³⁴ and the course syllabi emphasise ethical thinking and behaviour.

Academic integrity issues such as honesty, plagiarism, and examination rules are embedded in the Regulations on Conducting Intermediate Attestation and Regulations on Conducting the Final Attestation, and every course syllabus. Additionally, courses like Organisational Behaviour, Corporate Business Law, Introduction to Financial Accounting, Introduction to Finance, Introduction to Management and Strategic Management integrate ethical thinking into decision-making frameworks.

The curriculum includes courses which develop methodological competences and research skills, including ICT, Academic Research, Econometrics, Quantitative Methods for Business. Elective Topics offered within the programme also build these skill sets and include Conducting Financial Analysis, Business Valuation and Risks and Producing and Reporting Projections. These courses equip students with the knowledge and skills necessary to carry out research, such as research methodology practice, quantitative analysis skills and modelling using specialised software (such as MS Excel, Bloomberg (BMC), Power BI.).

Within the revision of the academic programme in 2020 thesis requirements were also reconsidered. The Diploma Project (CIMA Case Study) Guidance is developed following University rules and procedures.

At the beginning of the eighth semester of study, the department organises a Research Orientation Week for all students to introduce them to their academic supervisors, present the Diploma Project (CIMA Case study) Guidance, and provide initial advice on data collection. The Bachelor Diploma Project requires the use of research and analytical skills and evaluates students’ ability to employ these skills. Students meet regularly with their academic supervisors to discuss issues related to their thesis project. Students study how to use and collect data from EBSCO, WoS, Scopus, Emerald, Jstor and other databases and how to write a literature review. The Diploma Project Guidance presents directions on how to develop research and write the thesis.

The process of conducting interim and final assessments of students is regulated by the relevant

³³ See chapter Information.

³⁴ (1) Regulations on conducting intermediate attestations of students at “Narxoz University”, 2020.; (2) Regulation on conducting the final attestation of students at Narxoz University, 2021.

rules of its conduct.³⁵ It can be case studies, assignments, essays, but also quizzes. The syllabi reflect the assessment criteria and include information on the midterm and final exams. Courses taught according to ACCA and CIMA midterm 1, 2 and the final exam contents go through an annual verification process by ACCA Global and CIMA Global. For the period of the examination session, the HSEM creates an appeal committee of at least three qualified faculty members.

Appraisal:

The panel has the view that the curriculum adequately reflects the qualification objectives of the study programme. It shows a clear combination of contents that are well-balanced, logically connected and oriented towards the intended learning outcomes described in every syllabus. The areas of optional electives enable students to acquire additional competences and skills. The panel welcomes that Narxoz includes courses in the programme that are certified by professional bodies. During the online conference students underlined that for them these certifications are an advantage for their employability.

The contents of the courses take into account the students' prior professional experience and refer to it. They consistently reflect the strategic orientation of the study programme. They clearly meet the requirements of the job market. Additional electives enhance the graduates' employability.

The degree and programme name (Bachelor in Accounting and Audit) correspond to the contents of the curriculum and the programme objectives. In this context, the panel notes that MES has approved the name of the study programme.

Theoretical questions are, where possible, explained by means of practical examples such as case studies. The panel notes that students do internships that allow them to consolidate and apply acquired knowledge and skills in the business environment.

There is evidence that the programme qualifies for interdisciplinary thinking.

The panel welcomes that ethical implications (for example those of economical or juridical ways of thinking and acting) are appropriately communicated, also involving the two Committees that have been installed.

Students acquire methodological competences and are enabled to do scientific work on the required level. The panel welcomes that methodological competences and scientific practice are conveyed to students. They are equipped with the necessary skills for research-oriented work and for applying those skills in the respective vocational fields. However, the panel recommends more intensively including the use of IT (software, data protection, IT services, networking, communication).

³⁵ Ibidem;

All exams, as they are defined for the courses, are suited in format and content to ascertain the intended learning outcomes. The requirements are in accordance with the desired qualification level. The exams are characterised by a wide variety of test formats.

The final theses are evaluated based on previously published and coherently applied criteria, rules, and procedures. The students prove, especially in their thesis, their ability to do scientific work and the achievement of the study programme's qualification objectives.

	Exceptional	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	n.r.
3.1 Contents					
3.1.1* Logic and conceptual coherence (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
3.1.2* Rationale for degree and programme name (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
3.1.3* Integration of theory and practice (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
3.1.4 Interdisciplinary thinking			X		
3.1.5 Ethical aspects			X		
3.1.6* Methods and scientific practice (Asterisk Criterion)		X			
3.1.7* Examination and final thesis (Asterisk Criterion)			X		

3.2 Structure

Projected study time	4 years, 8 semesters
Number of Credit Points (CP)	240 ECTS credits
Workload per CP	27 hours
Number of courses	47 (incl. internships and thesis)
Time required for processing the final thesis and awarded CP	2 months
Number of contact hours	2,058 hours

The duration of the Accounting and Audit programme is four years. The programme having a workload of 240 ECTS credits is structured as follows:

- General Education Required - 53 ECTS;
- School Required - 15 ECTS;
- School Business Core Required- 10 ECTS;
- Business Core Required- 45 ECTS;
- Major Required- 40 ECTS;
- Business Core Electives - 13 ECTS;
- Major Electives - 20 ECTS;
- HSEM Minors - 20 ECTS;
- Internship- 12 ECTS;
- Writing and defending a thesis (project) or preparing and passing a comprehensive exam- 12 ECTS.

The total length of the academic year must be at least 36 weeks. The ECTS per course distribution corresponds with the ECTS Users' Guide.

Curricula, course content and study plans are given to students. The Accounting and Audit programme has a syllabus for every course which serves as information for students as well as for faculty. It provides all necessary information and detailed descriptions such as the course title, credit hours, course description, information about the instructor, assessment description, semester schedule/plan, the prerequisites for the course (if applicable), intended learning outcomes, methods of assessments, recommended course readings, teaching and learning methods. The syllabus template is used by all Narxoz instructors. It seeks to ensure that all instructors appropriately develop their syllabi and include all necessary information.

There are regulations for assessments and examinations, grading, re-sits, academic standing, credit transfer and the thesis. As already mentioned above³⁶ Narxoz issued regulations on the assessments for intermediate exams and separately for final examinations. They are published in full on the Narxoz website and are referred to and summarised in course syllabi.

The Accounting and Audit undergraduate programme allows students to study in another university for a certain period of time. The regulation of The Procedure for Recognition of Learning Outcomes of Formal and Non-Formal Education includes beside the recognition of practical experience³⁷ the recognition of degrees and of learning outcomes e.g. in terms of times of studies abroad. The decision on the recognition is done by a commission that is created by order of the Provost of the University. The procedure is oriented at the Lisbon Recognition Convention.

The assessment regulations for the final examination describe the criteria and procedure for the single course but also for the final thesis. Instructors are required to provide detailed feedback on student assignments. No single course assessment can constitute more than 40 % of an overall course grade, except the reports on research internships and on the research work.

The grading system is outlined in each of Narxoz exams regulations - from A to F - and includes a description of what characterizes each grade level.

Narxoz Grading System

Letter grading system	Numeric equivalent	Points (%-percentage)	Traditional grading system
A	4,0	95-100	Excellent
A-	3,67	90-94	
B+	3,33	85-89	
B	3,0	80-84	Good
B-	2,67	75-79	
C+	2,33	70-74	
C	2,0	65-69	Satisfactory
C-	1,67	60-64	
D+	1,33	55-59	
D-	1,0	50-54	

³⁶ See chapter 3.1.

³⁷ See above chapter 3.1.

FX	0,5	25-49	Unsatisfactory
F	0	0-24	

Academic achievements (knowledge, abilities, skills and competencies) of students are assessed in points on a 100-point scale corresponding to the internationally accepted letter system with a digital equivalent (positive marks, in descending order, from “A” to “D”, and “unsatisfactory” - “FX”, “F”,) and estimates according to the traditional system.

The Academic Services Department is a key link in the collection and processing of information about the study and workload distribution process. The exams are assigned normally at the end of each semester. The courses are published on the learning management system (LMS) “Canvas”.

The student study load of 240 ECTS credits is reviewed by the HSEM Quality Assurance Committee (QAC) based on the student and faculty feedback provided through the use of such instruments as Faculty Teaching Evaluation Survey and the Course Management Form. The Faculty Teaching Evaluation Survey (FTES) is completed by students at the end of each semester and used to assess quality of teaching and the study load distribution. The Course Management Form (CMF) is filled in individually by a faculty member at the end of semester. The CMF measures the percentage of the planned topics covered during the course and effectiveness of the ECTS assigned.

The results of the FTES survey and CMF analysis are discussed at the HSEM QA Council and communicated to faculty. During the online conference student expressed their view that the programme workload is “pretty high”. But by means of the elective courses the curriculum allows to draw up individual study plans which makes the workload feasible.

Narxoz University prohibits any act of discrimination against members of its community – students, employees, faculty members based on the race, colour, sex, national origin, religion, social status, disability or any other individual factors. More details are described in the Narxoz “Policy of equal access to education for students with disabilities” (2021) such as: Based on the principle of equal access students with disabilities are provided with academic support throughout the entire period of study. The adviser provides advisory support for academic needs and, together with the students, develops an individual curriculum (hereinafter - IC), and then submits it for discussion by the Council of the Higher School. The school board approves the IC. Students with special needs are encouraged to visit the Student Affairs department. The LMS Canvas allows students to apply distantly on various inquiries serving as a means supporting communication among students and administration.

Appraisal:

The panel considers it as being positive that the content of several courses has been defined as prerequisites by the external professional bodies such as ACCA and CIMA. This can be obviously an advantage for the students’ employability and outweighs the insofar limited impact of the University on the course contents. The programme structure supports the smooth implementation of the curriculum and helps students to reach the defined learning outcomes. The programme consists of courses and assigns Credit-Points (CP) per course on the basis of the necessary

student workload. Practical components such as the internship are designed and integrated in such a way that CP can be acquired.

The course syllabi provide detailed descriptions of intended learning outcomes and the information defined in the ECTS Users' Guide.

There are legally binding study and exam regulations which contain all necessary rules and procedures and take into account, where applicable, national requirements. The study programme is designed so that students can study for a certain time at other HEIs or do internships without any extension of their overall study time. The recognition of degrees and periods of study at other HEIs is regulated in accordance with the Lisbon Recognition Convention; the recognition of periods of practical work – insofar intended – is also clearly defined. The final grade is supplied with an ECTS grading table.

The feasibility of the study programme's workload is ensured by a suitable curriculum design, by a plausible calculation of workload, by an adequate number and frequency of examinations, by appropriate support services as well as academic and general student counselling.

The HEI ensures gender equality and non-discrimination. Students with disabilities are provided with affirmative actions concerning time and formal standards/requirements throughout the programme and examinations. Students in special circumstances, such as single parents, foreign students, students with a migration background and/or from so-called non-academic backgrounds, are particularly assisted.

		Exceptional	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	n.r.
3.2	Structure					
3.2.1*	Modular structure of the study programme (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
3.2.2*	Study and exam regulations (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
3.2.3*	Feasibility of study workload (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
3.2.4	Equality of opportunity			X		

3.3 Didactic concept

The didactical concept of the programme is shaped by a commitment to academic freedom and increasing the role of faculty in the academic decision-making process. The faculty's choice of appropriate teaching and learning methodology is outlined in the syllabus. Moreover, the concept aims to achieve a balance between the acquisition of knowledge and skills on the one the other. This means that various teaching methods are used to communicate knowledge and skills so that students can engage with them reflectively and critically. To fulfil its aims, the course employs a variety of teaching methods such as lectures, case studies and discussions, group discussions and presentations.

According to Narxoz³⁸, course materials are developed in accordance with the learning outcomes that are presented in the syllabus. Study materials are constantly updated in accordance with the development of new didactic concepts. No later than one month before the beginning of each semester, the HSEM QAC reviews and approves all course syllabi, and the examination materials are reviewed and approved no later than one month before the exam.

According to the Narxoz “Academic Policy”, instructors are required to upload all course materials (syllabi, lectures’ presentations/notes, textbook or book link to the library access, case-studies, assignments, tests etc.) to the LMS "Canvas.narxoz". There are no strict regulations and requirements regarding all course materials’ structure and content. The literature recommended by the instructor shall be issued at least during the last five years.

Thus, the didactic concept is focused on achieving the goals of the programme.

As already mentioned above³⁹, the HSEM invites guest lecturers within the framework of Leadership Development Programme launched in 2021. The list includes guest lecturers representatives of companies and public authorities as well as professors from areas related to the students’ fields of study.

For example, guest lecturers in the course Leadership Development Programme (September-November 2021) were by their positions from:

Position
Deloitte, Senior Auditor
PWC, Human Capital Senior Specialist
PWC, Recruitment Specialist
Chairman of the Board of Astana International Exchange (AIX, Exchange)
ACCA Global, Business Relationship Manager
EY, Employer Brand and HR Communications
Co-Founder of QBI Analytics
Associate Professor of political science at Nazarbayev University (Astana, Kazakhstan)
Associate Professor in the Graduate School of Public Policy at Nazarbayev University
Associate Professor of Economics in the Graduate School of Public Policy at Nazarbayev University
Samruk Kazyna Corporate University, Project Manager
co-founder and CEO of the brand Heybaby.kz
LLP KAR-Tel, expert on planning and consolidation of the Department of Budget Control and Analysis
Eurasian Resources Group, project coordinator

The guest lecturers mostly represent employers. Through bringing fresh and first-hand experience into the classroom, they can enhance Bachelor students’ industry insights and contribute to their professional development and employability.

³⁸ See SER p. 26.

³⁹ See chapter 3.1.

Appraisal:

The didactical concept of the study programme is described, plausible, and oriented towards the programme objectives. It allows for the application of different teaching and learning methods, such as, for instance, case studies or practical projects. Students are encouraged to take an active role in creating the learning process. Additionally, the didactical methods are systematically derived from the study programme objectives and are oriented towards the intended learning outcomes of each module/course, for instance by regularly using case studies and/or practical projects.

The accompanying course materials are oriented towards the intended learning outcomes and correspond to the required qualification level. They are up to date and digitally accessible for the students. They are user-friendly and encourage students to engage in further independent studies.

Guest lecturers are invited and contribute to the students' qualification process with their special experience, either from professional practice or scientific work, but also, for example, from culture and politics.

	Exceptional	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	n.r.
3.3	Didactic concept				
3.3.1*	Logic and plausibility of the didactical concept (Asterisk Criterion)		X		
3.3.2*	Course materials (Asterisk Criterion)		X		
3.3.3	Guest lecturers		X		
3.3.4	Lecturing tutors				X

3.4 Internationality

As already mentioned above⁴⁰ the programme Accounting and Audit is focused on developing competencies that are demanded by international employers, such as the Big 4⁴¹ and other international companies operating in Kazakhstan. Therefore, the programme is designed in accordance with internationally recognised standards. Several courses offered are aimed at stimulating discussions on intercultural and multinational business environments.

The programme is active in academic mobility programmes with partner universities. 27 of the 68 mobility agreements that Narxoz is a signatory to cover Accounting and Audit. In Fall 2021 four students were on exchange programmes and two participate in the Erasmus+ exchange programme in Spring 2022.

⁴⁰ See chapter 1.2.

⁴¹ This is the nickname referring to the four largest professional accounting networks Deloitte, Ernst & Young, KPMG and Price Waterhouse Coopers (PwC).

In terms of international and intercultural contents the programme includes courses such as Anti Money-Laundering Foundations and International Taxation.

The department requires academic staff to base all courses on internationally recognized textbooks and other materials. The academic programme is designed in accordance with internationally recognized professional standards (ACCA, CIMA, CMA). The Department plays a full role in academic mobility and other internationalization efforts as part of the University development strategy⁴².

Over the last seven years, small numbers of international students have studied on the programme. In the current academic year there are four students. They come from Uzbekistan, Tajikistan, Russia, and Austria.

To promote internationalisation, the programme is increasing the number and quality of the courses offered in English and is active in cooperation with academic mobility programmes. The charts below show the number of Accounting and Audit students studying on academic mobility programmes.

The number of faculty members with international academic and professional experience has been increasing since 2020. Currently, there are five full time instructors with international background out of 18 (28 %) at the Department of Accounting and Audit: They have received a degree from foreign universities. These faculty members deliver 30 % of the courses taught within the programme.

As 25 % of the programme are available in English, the HSEM seeks to ensure that its graduates are capable of working effectively in an international environment in English. Therefore and following the MES requirements, Narxoz University allocates five ECTS to a course on English (Professional) in the first semester.

Appraisal

The panel welcomes that international contents are an integral part of the curriculum. Students are thus prepared for the challenges in an international working environment. Through practical examples, students are enabled to act in an intercultural environment.

As the programme has just started it is hardly possible to achieve an international composition of the student body which would be corresponding to the programme concept. But the University has taken measures to gain students from other countries for the programme. The panel is fully supportive of these endeavours.

The international composition of the faculty in terms of teachers with international academic and professional experience promotes the acquisition of international competences and skills. The measures taken are goal-oriented. The proportion of foreign language courses and required foreign language materials corresponds with the qualification objectives of the study programme.

⁴² See Standard V of the Institutional SAR

		Exceptional	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	n.r.
3.4	Internationality					
3.4.1*	International contents and intercultural aspects (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
3.4.2	Internationality of the student body			X		
3.4.3	Internationality of faculty			X		
3.4.4	Foreign language contents			X		

3.5 Multidisciplinary competences and skills (Asterisk Criterion)

In addition to the interdisciplinary elective courses⁴³, students are provided with training in communication, and public speaking skills. Students are assigned presentations in several courses for verbal descriptions of their research projects and a review of academic texts from a multidisciplinary perspective. In this connection, courses such as Business Communications, Organizational Behaviour and Academic Research are aimed at acquiring skills and confidence to deal with a range of challenging and unexpected communication situations, focusing on proven tools and techniques, how to remain calm under pressure, overcome common obstacles, and get message across with style and impact by developing students' multidisciplinary approach. Individual and group assignments, discussions, case-studies, within listed courses promote students to be effective communicators, especially when asked to respond in the moment in a clear, concise, and ethical manner.

Moreover, there are various student organisations at Narxoz University that aim to develop multidisciplinary competencies and skills of students and to improve students as individuals and professionals in management life activities, such as: Debate club "Dispute Narxoz", "Financial club", "Adrenaline", "Medialab", "Narxoz Pride"⁴⁴ and others.

Appraisal:

The students acquire communication and public-speaking skills as well as cooperation and conflict handling skills in accordance with the descriptions of several courses. This is supported by means of suitable didactical and methodological measures. The acquisition of further multidisciplinary competences, such as leadership skills and broad contextual knowledge, is ensured.

		Exceptional	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	n.r.
3.5*	Multidisciplinary competences and skills (Asterisk Criterion)			X		

⁴³ See above chapter 3.1.

⁴⁴ <https://narxoz.edu.kz/student-life/organizaczii/>

3.6 Skills for employment / Employability (Asterisk Criterion)

As described above⁴⁵, in the courses theoretical questions are, where possible, explained by means of practical examples such as case studies and role plays. This is part of almost every course. Moreover, the Bachelor programme must include a one-week of business orientation at the end of the third year as well as a ten-week internship with a workload of 12 ECTS credits. This training helps students gain more practical experience, explore career options prior to graduation and develop communication, interpersonal and other critical skills in the job interview process.

In addition to the programme itself being designed to enhance employability, the department works with the Career Development and Alumni Relations on internship provision through liaison with employers to create internship agreements for students in leading companies. This is a high priority issue given the crucial role of practical experience in enhancing employability. Before students begin their internship, training is provided to prepare them to maximize the benefit of the experience.

Some teaching staff have professional experience.⁴⁶ This helps maintain the theory-practice relationship and thereby increases employability. The Leadership Development Programme further contributes to this goal.

The academic programmes are reviewed by external stakeholders, for instance the programme in Accounting and Audit is considered by members of the HSEM Business Council.⁴⁷

All work on the preparation of the educational programme includes adjustment of the content of lectures, of practical material and assignments and is updated and improved continuously. This work is carried out with the direct participation of employers and stakeholders.

Appraisal:

The promotion of employability – for instance through the integration of theory and practice and through the promotion of multidisciplinary competences and skills – runs as a common thread of the study programme through all its courses.

In addition, the programme enables the students to actively apply the acquired skills in new areas of work and to develop them further. This supported by a strong component on research in the programme. Also, it is systematically oriented towards meeting the anticipated requirements of the dynamic job market and makes use of the results of graduate evaluations.

	Exceptional	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	n.r.
3.6* Skills for employment / Employability (Asterisk Criterion)		X			

⁴⁵ See chapter 3.1.

⁴⁶ About 30 % of faculty members of the department of “Accounting and Audit” faculty have practical experience currently occupying the positions in public companies and business.

⁴⁷ <https://en.narxoz.kz/sem/business-council>

4. Academic environment and framework conditions

4.1 Faculty

There are 18 faculty members who give the courses of the programme, They have different academic background and are professionally and / or academically qualified: Ten of them hold a PhD and nine of them have achieved professional certificates from CIMA, ACCA or others.



The composition of faculty in terms of qualifications in the fields needed complies with the requirements of the courses. Each of the faculty members in the Accounting and Audit programme, as experts in their respective fields, are expected to carefully give their own courses in accordance with the policies and guidelines of Narxoz.

Seven faculty are working on the ACCA exams each quarter, scholarship from ACCA Global. In the next two years HSEM plans to increase PQ to 8 new academics.

The level of professional competencies of the faculty is regulated by the state document - the order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan from June 17, 2015, No 391 "On approval of qualification requirements for educational activities and the list of documents confirming their compliance". The faculty recruitment process follows the University Hiring Policy and Faculty Grading Policy⁴⁸.

Hiring full-time is carried out by competition with qualification requirements⁴⁹, announced on the Narxoz University website⁵⁰. The University has installed hiring committees with members drawn from the administrative and academic staff. After a successful selection, the hired employee is assigned a certain grade based on the meeting of the Grading Committee which is comprised of senior academic managers under the Provost.

⁴⁸ Faculty Grading Policy NJSC "NARXOZ UNIVERSITY", September 2021.

⁴⁹ in accordance Article 45 paragraph 1 of the Law on Education.

⁵⁰ Vacancies: <https://narxoz.edu.kz/jobs>

The qualifications for full-time academic staff must correspond to the requirements for study, teaching and research. The number of full-time professors should match in the proportion of a ratio 1 professor / 16 students according to state requirements. When applying for faculty positions, competences considered include:

- the presence of an academic degree;
- knowledge of a foreign language;
- work experience;
- research achievements;
- administrative experience;
- references from prior employment;
- motivations of the candidate.

During the academic year all professors should implement activities of research, teaching, administrative service and support for recruitment and marketing.

The recruitment of part-time academic staff is carried out based on the recommendation of the Head of the relevant department, agreed by the Director of the Higher School and approved by the Provost of the University. The applicant must have the same competences as staff hiring for full-time.

The following grades are possible:

- Professor 3rd, 2nd or 1st Grade,
- Associate Professor of 3rd, 2nd or 1st Grade,
- Assistant Professor of 3rd, 2nd or 1st Grade,
- Senior Lecturer of 3rd, 2nd or 1st Grade,
- Lecturer

The grading in this structure is performance related, especially dependent on publications.

The faculty profile has also been reviewed. Following this review, efforts have been made to attract staff with international qualifications. Currently 26 % of teaching staff have degrees from internationally accredited universities⁵¹, 50 % of faculty are academically qualified and 25 % are either fully professionally qualified or in the process of achieving professional qualification.

The Department and HSEM promote open discussions on teaching methods and other pedagogically related issues in the form of round tables and workshops organised by faculty.

To improve the qualifications of teaching staff the University employs various methods such as foreign internships and internships within Kazakhstan, and internal courses related to enhancing professionalism in the field of information and computer technology and improving the pedagogical skills of teachers.

The goal of ensuring the quality of the pedagogical and didactical methods used by professors is accomplished in three ways:

⁵¹ See above chapter 3.4.

- First, HSEM established higher than the MES teaching qualification requirements.
- Second, faculty members are encouraged to take part in and pass internationally recognised professional certification programmes and training on pedagogic qualification development. HSEM QAC members regularly (at least twice per semester) conduct peer review through attending selected classes and providing feedback to the faculty and the Department Chair. In addition, each instructor is encouraged to provide an open-door class once a year where all faculty members are invited.
- Finally, HSEM promotes open discussions on teaching methods and other pedagogically related issues in the form of round tables and workshops organised by faculty.

About 30 % of faculty members of the department of “Accounting and Audit” faculty have practical experience currently occupying the positions in public companies and business. Management and teaching staff of the Department carry out ongoing work to attract experts in the field of accounting and auditing for lectures and seminars.

Cooperation among faculty members is taking place to review the programme specification and refine interrelated courses to achieve the learning outcomes. Faculty members meet regularly to discuss the content and topics taught in courses. In addition to the coordination at the course level, faculty members cooperate in supervising student theses, either as consultants on specific topics or as examiners. The interdependence of the competence approach and the modular principle of learning is determined by the fact that the courses are focused on achieving the appropriate planned learning outcomes.

Also, faculty members in the formation of the educational programme cooperate with employers and each other, which allows to enrich the content of the programme with relevant and practice-oriented disciplines. Also, the faculty members’ cooperation results in joint publications.

Support for students is an integral part of the work of teachers of the Bachelor programme and is carried out in cooperation with the Office of Academic Advising⁵². Faculty conduct scheduled office hours which are indicated in every syllabus. Additional consultancy might be provided by the faculty by appointment if needed. Consultations via email, ZOOM, Google meet and Canvas could also be provided.

Moreover, as each student is assigned an academic adviser from admission to graduation, these academic advisers are required to meet with academic advisees each semester to provide guidance on course registration and other academic matters. Thesis supervisors are also required to meet regularly with their students. Beyond these formal meetings and required interactions, faculty members work closely with students on research projects and help assist them in picking up new skills and competencies.

During the online conference students confirmed that most of them are fully content with the support that they received in particular from lecturers and academic advisers.

⁵² <https://narxoz.edu.kz/advising>. not in English available

Appraisal:

Even when their teaching assignments in other study programmes are taken into account, the structure and number of the faculty correspond to the programme requirements and ensure that the students reach the intended qualification objectives. The faculty's composition, consisting of full-time and part-time visiting lecturers, guarantees that both the academic standards and the requirements of professional practice are fully satisfied.

The academic qualification of the faculty corresponds to the requirements and objectives of the study programme. The HEI verifies the qualifications of the faculty members by means of an established procedure. Specific measures for the further qualification of the faculty members are implemented. Taking into account the grading policy of Narxoz the panel recommends the University raising the structure of the academic staff. The faculty should include full professors which could increase the research and the scientific reputation of the department.

The pedagogical and didactical qualification of the faculty correspond to the requirements and objectives of the study programme. The HEI verifies the qualifications of the faculty members by means of an established procedure. The HEI ensures that assessors are familiar with existing testing and examination methods and receive support in developing their own skills in this field. Specific measures for the further qualification of the faculty members are implemented.

The practical business experience of the faculty corresponds to the requirement of the programme to integrate theory and practice. The panel welcomes that the faculty members have above-average business experience and use them in their teaching activities.

The panel notes that the faculty members cooperate with each other for the purpose of tuning the modules/courses towards the overall qualification objectives. Meetings of all those teaching in the programme take place regularly. In addition, projects and/or courses are conducted cooperatively in many respects.

Student support is an integral part of the services provided by the faculty. It is offered on a regular basis and serves to help students study successfully. The faculty members are available for the students outside the specified office hours as well. During the online conference students showed that they were "fully content" with the support they receive.

		Exceptional	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	n.r.
4.1	Faculty					
4.1.1*	Structure and quantity of faculty in relation to curricular requirements (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
4.1.2*	Academic qualification of faculty (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
4.1.3*	Pedagogical / didactical qualification of faculty (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
4.1.4	Practical business experience of faculty		X			
4.1.5*	Internal cooperation (Asterisk Criterion)		X			
4.1.6*	Student support by the faculty (Asterisk Criterion)		X			
4.1.7(*)	Student support in distance learning (only relevant and an Asterisk Criterion for blended learning/distance learning programmes)					X

4.2 Programme management

The responsible person for programme development is the Head of the Accounting and Audit department who in coordination with HSEM manages and monitors the Bachelor Programme. The purview includes inter alia advisor assignments, thesis supervisor assignments, leading programme meetings, planning programme events and representing the programme within the University. At least once a year, the Head of department ensures regular updating of training programmes based on market trends and recommendations of the HSEM Business Council⁵³ and developments in accounting and audit.

Moreover, the Department Chair interacts with employers and the expert community to further develop and update the programme.

In the educational activities and the implementation of the programme faculty and students are supported by the administration and structural units of the university in several respects:

In terms of administrative support Narxoz University has a clear distribution of powers and responsibilities for the educational management, for scientific and information support, international development and partnership, personnel issues, security department, legal department, record keeping and archive department. The Head of department plays a significant role in the organisation of the programme, facilitating communication and assisting students and faculty members. Other administrative units within Narxoz also help students and faculty with registration, course materials (including the online course management programme), information technology, library resources, and obtaining Institutional Review Board approval, among other things. The University gives support to teaching staff and employees when it comes to achieve scientific internships on the programme "Bolashak" in foreign organisations engaged in education

⁵³ <https://en.narxoz.kz/sem/business-council>

and research activities that are in the list of top 300 leading universities in the world.

Advisors and the department “Accounting and Audit” management carry out explanatory work with students on the choice of elective disciplines, during the established terms of study and provide them with advice on the implementation of Bachelor’s individual educational plans.

An automated Student Help Desk has been created known as Student Help Desk, which allows applications and appeals of students on any issue.

Students are members of the HSEM QAC, along with the teaching staff, which shows their involvement in the decision-making process related to their areas of activity. Narxoz has student self-governing bodies that have a say in committees of higher education institutions and the Academic Council. A Memorandum between Narxoz University and the Alliance of Students of Kazakhstan has been concluded, which commits to purposeful joint work to promote the principles of higher education and students' freedom of choice of disciplines. Narxoz has established an Endowment Fund, which will provide ongoing financial support for youth projects: scientific conferences, Olympiads, forums, etc.

Appraisal:

The Head of the Accounting and Audit department programme in coordination with HSEM organises the activities of everyone involved in the programme and ensures that the programme runs smoothly.

Faculty members and students are supported by the administration in the organisation of the study programme. Sufficient administrative staff is available. Decision-making processes, authority, and responsibilities are clearly defined. Teachers and students are included in the decision-making processes where their areas of work are involved.

The opportunities of electronic service-support are used and supplement personal one-to-one counselling. The HEI offers the administrative staff opportunities for continuous professional development.

		Exceptional	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	n.r.
4.2	Programme management					
4.2.1*	Programme Director (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
4.2.2	Process organisation and administrative support for students and faculty			X		

4.3 Cooperation and partnerships

Partnership with academic institutions has become a high-profile issue engaging an increasing number of students and staff. Narxoz University has signed several partnership agreements with HEI abroad. Some of them gave grounding to develop dual degree and academic mobility.

The dual-degree with Coventry (GB) started in 2014, currently ten students study in the programme⁵⁴. The main partners for academic mobility are:

- University of Lodz, (Poland)
- University of Tsukuba, (Japan)
- IESEG School of Management, (France)
- National Louis University (Poland)
- Shoreline Community College (USA)
- University of Ferrara (Italy)
- FH Joanneum University of Applied Sciences, (Austria)
- Solbridge International Business School (South Korea)
- Plekhanov Russian University of Economics, (Russia)

The academic mobility is one-way mobility so far, but the increasing number of courses offered in English as well as the attractive location of the city encourage its future alignment.

The agreements that have been presented to the panel in writing also aim to promote exchanging expertise through consulting opportunities for the faculty members, researchers, and specialists. Moreover, they facilitate collaborative research projects and co-organized conferences and seminars.

One of the Narxoz University goals according to its Strategy is improving Employer/University cooperation. Following this goal strengthens cooperation with companies which are considered to be the key employers and business partners. Memoranda of understanding for developing long-term mutually beneficial partnership, future implementation of joint programmes and projects in the field of education and research, as well as specific short-term agreements for designing students' internship were signed. And were shown to the panel. The list is provided below:

List of Top 20 Accounting and Audit Business Partners

#	Partner name	Duration
1	LLP Ernst & Young	>5 years
2	LLP KPMG	>5 years
3	LLP Deloitte	>4 years
4	LLP PriceWaterhouseCoopers	>2 years
5	LLP RG Brands Kazakhstan	>3 years
6	LLP KAZ "Minerals Management"	>5 years
7	LLP Freedom Finance	>2 years
8	LLP JTI	>5 years
9	JSC Aktobe Munay Gas	>5 years
10	JSC Halyk Bank of Kazakhstan	>5 years
11	JSC KEGOC	>5 years
12	JSC Kaspi Bank	>5 years
13	JSC Forte Bank	>5 years
14	JSC Forte Leasing	>5 years
15	JSC Bank Home Credit	>5 years

⁵⁴ The dual-degree programme is not subject of this accreditation.

16	JSC Kazpost	>5 years
17	JSC Eurasian Financial Company	>5 years
18	JSC Bank CenterCredit	>5 years
19	JSC KazTransOil	>5 years
20	JSC Rakhat	>10 years

In 2021 several events were organised in cooperation with partners mentioned in this list, such as the “BIG 4 days” and with ACCA “How to pass exams”. HSEM involves employers, business partners and other stakeholders in curricula review and takes into consideration feedback from them.

Appraisal:

The scope and nature of cooperation with HEI, other academic institutions and networks relevant for the programme are plausibly presented. The agreements forming the basis of the cooperation are documented. The cooperation is actively pursued and has a clear impact on the conception and implementation of the study programme. All such activities contribute to the development of the students’ qualification and skills.

The scope and nature of cooperation with business enterprises and other institutions relevant to the programme are plausibly presented. The agreements forming the basis of the cooperation are documented. The cooperation is actively pursued and has a clear impact on the conception and implementation of the study programme. All such activities contribute to the development of the students’ qualification and skills.

Moreover, cooperation with business enterprises and other professional organisations is actively promoted for example by means of meetings of those who are involved in the study programme in responsible positions, in order to discuss the further development of the programme. Such cooperation has a formative impact on the contents of the programme and on the profile of the graduates. By means of specific measures (e.g. cooperation in projects, provision of traineeships, appointment of professionals in teaching), they significantly contribute to the development of qualifications and skills and to the quality of the final theses.

		Exceptional	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	n.r.
4.3	Cooperation and partnerships					
4.3.1(*)	Cooperation with HEIs and other academic institutions or networks (Asterisk Criterion for cooperation programmes)			X		
4.3.2(*)	Cooperation with business enterprises and other organisations (Asterisk Criterion for educational and vocational programmes, franchise programmes)		X			

4.4 Facilities and equipment

As the on-site visit had to be replaced by an online conference because of the Covid-19 pandemic Narxoz made available to the panel numerous photos of its building, rooms, and the library as well as descriptions in the self-evaluation report thereof.

In the 2021/2022 academic year, the University's computer park has 1483 personal computers (PCs), of which 744 are used in the educational process, which is 50.1% of the total number of computer equipment. There are 25 computer classrooms and 11 specialized laboratories, 73 classrooms in the ULK-2 building, 12 classrooms in the business school. After the completion of the reconstruction of the main educational building, additional 26 computer classrooms will be put into operation with 508 seats, equipped with new equipment for conducting classes. Wi-Fi is accessible to all students and faculty on the whole campus.

The infrastructure also includes office equipment, projection equipment, network and telecommunications equipment, including MFDs, copiers, printers, scanners (340 pieces), projectors (205 pieces), servers (15 pieces), network equipment (328 pieces), and Telecommunication equipment (154 pieces). Lecturers and students at the University have access to all PCs (free from classes) in the computer classrooms of the DIT.

In the educational process of the University, computer classrooms, multimedia classrooms are used. Multimedia audiences belong to the linguistic center. To carry out laboratory work in specialized disciplines, there are “1C Laboratory”, “Electronic Learning Laboratory” in the direction of Finance and Data Analytics. Also “Data Science Lab”, “Newton Lab”, “Cybersecurity Lab”, “Graphics & Media Lab” and “Cloud Computing Lab” for students.

There is a Bloomberg laboratory with 12 terminals, which is also used as a classroom for courses that involve mastering of Bloomberg functionality. The Bloomberg terminal can also be used via remote access, which further enhances its effect in the learning process. In addition, the University offers dormitories to students.

The Academic Library Foundation contributes to meeting the needs of both educational and research activities of students in the programme "Accounting and Audit". In total, today the fund of the Academic Library has 912 022 units of publications in national, Russian and foreign languages, including educational and methodical literature - 411 456 units of publications, scientific literature - 500 566 units of publications, out of which 6 452 units related to accounting and audit.

Students have access to International scientific databases:

- EBSCO “E-book business collection” www.search.ebscohost.com offers over 21,000 book titles for students and academics doing research in a variety of business areas. The collection includes books from Oxford University Press, Business Expert Press, University of Chicago Press, Entrepreneur Press and American Management Association, as well as summaries of all the most recent Harvard Business Review, books, and press reviews available in the eBook Business Collection.

- JSTOR (The Scholarly Journal Archive) - full-text base of English-language scientific journals, is included in the top 10 scientific bases in the world scientific space. The JSTOR collections are composed of reputable international periodicals. The JSTOR ESSENTIAL collection covers 694 titles in 45 disciplines, including economics, business, finance, political science, law, education and other social disciplines (according to the profile of the university). JSTOR's archival collections contain over 2,400 scientific journals in 60 disciplines. JSTOR works with 1200 publishers from over 57 countries.

During the academic year, 18 webinars were held for students and teachers at the university, dedicated to the use of information resources of the library and research topics.

Comfortable conditions for independent work have been created for all categories of users, including for students with disabilities. In accordance with the policy of ensuring equal access to education for students with disabilities of the university, students with disabilities have equal access to the information base of the scientific library.

Each year the Department “Accounting and Audit” requests new textbooks (Kaplan Publishing, Wiley Publishing, BPP, etc.) according to certifications by ACCA, CIMA, CIA, etc.

Appraisal:

Since the online conference was conducted replacing an on-site visit, the panel did not have the opportunity to visit the University’s buildings. Instead, Narxoz provided photos and descriptions of its premises and facilities. Based on the materials provided, the panel formed the view that a smooth running of programmes is ensured regarding the capacities for teaching, research, studies, and administration.

The panel got the impression that the quantity, quality, media and IT facilities of the teaching rooms meet the standards required for the programme, even taking into account the resource needs of other study programmes. The rooms are properly equipped for disabled students and give them barrier-free access. Access to the internet through laptops via wireless LAN is provided free of charge. A sufficient number of group rooms is available.

The opening hours of the library take students’ needs sufficiently into account. Access to the literature and journals as well as to digital media (e.g. electronic media, databases) is ensured. The literature expressly required for the study programme is available in the library and also kept up to date.

	Exceptional	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	n.r.
4.4 Facilities and equipment					
4.4.1* Quantity, quality, media and IT equipment of teaching and group rooms (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
4.4.2* Access to literature (Asterisk Criterion)			X		

4.5 Additional services

To support the transition to employment the Career Development and Alumni Relations Centre was established in 2005. The focus is on interaction with companies on practical training, internships and employment. A key area of activity is the management of a vacancy website which seeks to match students with opportunities. Partners include the Big Four companies, leading oil and gas and financial service companies. This includes career guidance and skills development services that – beside the support by faculty⁵⁵ - are a key to successful professional and business life.

The main areas of work of the Department of Career and Alumni Relations are:

- assisting students and graduates of the university in employment and career development;
- assistance in the organization of educational, industrial, pre-diploma and research internships of students;
- establishing partnerships between students and the business community of Kazakhstan through round tables with employers, and promotion of entrepreneurship among graduates of Narxoz University;
- organizing master classes, guest lectures, online webinars for students.

On the website of the University in the section "Career and Employment" students of the programme can get advice on employment, internships and professional practice. Currently, the Department of Career and Alumni Relations provides advice to students and graduates on career and employment by conducting master classes and training with large and international recruiters (such as KPMG, E&Y); posting information about vacancies and events on employment, internships and internships on social networks processing vacancies; creating a database of graduates; organizing job fairs; compiling job databases and monitoring placement of graduates; monitoring career expectations of graduates and monitoring employment dynamics.

Also, Narxoz has put up a Public Association "Narxoz Alumni Association". Its activities are:

1. creating a professional alumni community that promotes effective communication among alumni and students of Narxoz University, as well as assistance in their professional growth;
2. combining the efforts of its members to ensure the activities of the Association to attract graduates of the University on the basis of close cooperation with public and other organizations, whose activities meet the objectives of the Association;
3. assisting the University administration in the implementation of the adopted University Development Strategy in terms of the implementation of measures to attract graduates of the University.

To achieve these goals, the Association carries out activities such as:

1. using the potential of the University graduates for the development and implementation of innovative (research and social) projects in the educational and research area of the University, related to the University Development Strategy;
2. assistance in improving the qualifications of the University staff, mastering new forms and methods of socio-economic and management activities, advanced domestic and foreign experience;

⁵⁵ See above chapter 4.1.

3. assistance to future graduates of the University in the selection of a place of work in accordance with their qualifications and abilities;
4. conducting conferences, symposia, seminars, round tables, discussions, competitions, trade missions and other events at the University.

Appraisal:

The panel welcomes that Narxoz provides career counselling and placement services for the students and graduates to promote their employability, in addition to the efforts that faculty members offer. The HEI provides sufficient resources. However, the panel gained the impression that administratively there is room for improvement. Therefore the panel recommends widening the administrative career counselling and placement service.

The panel also welcomes that an alumni organisation has been set up with the aim of developing an alumni network. It recommends the University involving the alumni in the future even more in order to make use of the possibilities of implying practical experiences into the programme.

	Exceptional	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	n.r.
4.5 Additional services					
4.5.1 Career counselling and placement service			X		
4.5.2 Alumni Activities			X		

4.6 Financing of the study programme (Asterisk Criterion)

Funding for academic programmes is provided by the receipt of financial resources in the form of tuition fees, both from the state budget, and at the expense of students.

Cost structure	Accounting and Audit Department
Total number of ECTS	706
Full Time Equivalent Faculty	17.65
Direct costs (Faculty Payroll)	127,080

Revenue structure	Masters level Accounting and Audit
Bachelor	541,951
Master, 1 year	27,360
Master, 2 year	20,160
Total Revenue	589,471

The department receives support for materials, equipment and other costs through the university budgeting and spending allocation process. Payroll is the largest direct cost. All financial

operations are managed through the central administration in consultation with the relevant departments.

Narxoz University forwarded a letter to the panel confirming that the sole shareholder of Narxoz University NJSC, the Kazakh businessman Mr. Bulat Utemuratov, intends and is able to provide the University with necessary funds to enable it to continue its operational activities for educating and conducting research for at least the following five years until December 2027.

Appraisal:

The panel is convinced that the study programme is funded for the entire accreditation period (until 2027) so that students will definitely be able to complete their studies.

		Exceptional	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	n.r.
4.6*	Financing of the study programme (Asterisk Criterion)			X		

5. Quality assurance and documentation

Narxoz's Quality Assurance (QA) system is based on a quality management strategy. Its task is supporting the overall strategy and the University's profile through enhancing the quality of teaching, research; improving key stakeholders' satisfaction and improving operational effectiveness. The QA system includes both (academic and non-academic) areas of University functioning. The task of quality management is to review and coordinate the University units' related activities that are critical in terms of achieving quality requirements. The internal QA documents are publicly available on the University's website.⁵⁶

The quality management strategy takes into account Narxoz University Strategy 2020-2025 (revised in 2021), the European Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG 2015)⁵⁷, the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan (MES) policies and regulations⁵⁸, Narxoz's Quality Assurance Policy and the University Quality Assurance Handbook.

Both the QA Policy and the QA Handbook describe explicitly and in detail the internal QA system with objectives, procedures and mechanisms, key parameters and include external assessments as a tool.

The quality management process is intended to create system-wide mechanisms that enable the University to monitor and improve its operations and to enhance quality. The quality management is focused on core activities (education, research and administration) and on resources (human resource and infrastructure) that are required to ensure quality provision of core activities. The University designs the QA process as a dynamic process that shall continuously follow the Plan-Do-Check-Act Cycle. Thus, it consists of four stages: (1) developing regulatory background and plan, (2) collecting quality data, (3) analysing findings and (4) making revisions or changes based on data analyses.

Narxoz University has established a framework for quality assurance that includes the mechanisms for institutional, departmental, and programme quality assurance. It is embedded in each Higher School and all university departments and utilises both quantitative and qualitative data. The results of this continuous QA process are communicated via Academic Quality Committees and the Academic Council and serve to benefit all internal and external stakeholders in their decision-making.

As far as the competencies, responsibilities and interactions of academic and administrative quality management staff and departments are concerned structural divisions and collegial bodies of the University engage in the process of continuous provision of the academic quality: the Academic Council, committees under the AC, councils of the Higher Schools and of the PhD department.

⁵⁶ <https://en.narxoz.kz/quality-assurance>.

⁵⁷ [Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area](#)

⁵⁸ <https://www.gov.kz/memleket/entities/edu?lang=en>

The University community members (students, teaching and administrative staff) are part of collegial committees at the Higher School and University level. According to Narxoz⁵⁹, their participation in all areas of discussions and decision-making processes takes place regularly and systematically. Corporate partners and external stakeholders are also involved in different committees and play an active role within the quality management system.

Faculty and staff of the University are informed about quality management measures and the results obtained at the meetings of the Academic Council, the QA Councils of the Higher Schools, regular meetings, and faculty general assemblies with the President and Provost of the University.

The University carries out on a regular basis a systematic assessment and discussion of the quality of all aspects of the academic process and educational programs. The assessments are based on monitoring the quality of teaching and surveys of students, teachers, alumni and employers. Based on the results obtained, the University management, the University QA Committees under the Academic Council, the Higher Schools Committees, the Heads of the Departments / Centers and structural divisions are provided with the reports. The structural units provide feedback in the form of a "Progress Report", which is then provided to the trainees and other target groups of the survey.

The University has developed an organisational structure, established a division of responsibility for quality assurance, reflected in the regulations on structural divisions and job descriptions, as well as the delineation of the functions of collegial bodies. This can contribute to the development of a culture of quality in which each structural unit / employee of the University could efficiently respond to emerging problems.

Narxoz University students, faculty and staff, and external stakeholders (employers, alumni) are involved in the QA system and are given the opportunity to take an active role in the quality management. Their opinions are asked in various surveys.

Evaluation by students is carried out through a number of regular and on-request institutional research activities. The key instrument is the Faculty Teaching Evaluation Survey (FTES) that is conducted primarily to provide a measure of assurance of the teaching quality at the University level. The FTES collects the opinions of all undergraduate and postgraduate students on their perceptions of instructional effectiveness, quality of teaching and their learning experience for each subject in which they are enrolled.

The questionnaire consists of 18 multiple choice and open-ended questions relating to the quality of teaching in three important fields: 1) faculty, 2) class Sessions and 3) course. The first section consists of questions about instructional delivery and professional attitude towards students while the second part covers questions about management of class sessions and the learning environment. The third part incorporates questions about student understanding of the course requirements, syllabus and availability of course materials. Summary questions 19 and 20 identify the overall level of satisfaction with the course and teaching quality. Two open-ended

⁵⁹ See SER for the Institutional Accreditation, p. 35

questions soliciting general comments and remarks about instructors and workload are also included in the questionnaire.

At the end of the academic year, the faculty submit a completed Course Management form. Assessment covers key aspects of teaching. This form must be accompanied by the final exam sample and submitted to the Department Chairs at the end of the semester.

Higher Schools QA Committees analyse the results of the surveys and develop recommendations accordingly. The results of the teaching evaluation survey are used in the Faculty Grading system to assess the performance of a faculty member.

After the evaluation the departments submit the reports on the survey. The Higher Schools Quality Assurance Committees provide a Progress Report and feedback to the recommendations of survey participants. Students are informed via the Student Senate.⁶⁰

Faculty members are involved in assessment processes through regular and on-request activities. The Faculty Satisfaction Survey is the mechanism for feedback on working conditions, professional development, and quality of management at Narxoz University.

The Narxoz Alumni Survey⁶¹ aims to assure the quality of professional preparation of graduates by collecting their feedback about work experience, job performance and level of satisfaction with the quality of Narxoz University's education, which allows identification of areas for improvement. The survey is conducted each summer among the Narxoz Alumni (one year after graduation) via e-mails, phone interviews and online questionnaires. The Alumni answer questions including 5-point scale, multiple choice and open-ended questions that touch upon details of their current employment (company, salary, position, etc.) and/or further studies, contribution of the Narxoz programme to their career, satisfaction with/suggestions for Narxoz services and ways to get involved with the University.

The survey results are reported to the top management and shared with Narxoz University employees and alumni. To facilitate programme assessment efforts data are broken down by programmes. The key messages are taken as the basis for the further enhancement of the University's programmes, services and environment.

The Alumni Employers' Satisfaction Survey seeks the opinion of employers on levels of Narxoz graduates' professional preparedness in terms of knowledge, skills and attitudes. The survey is conducted through different channels: electronic mail, fax, post, social networks (Instagram, Facebook, Telegram, WhatsApp, YouTube); phone calls and visits. The survey results are placed on the website. They can illustrate employers' perception of Narxoz graduates' professional quality and help to determine ways of further improvement of academic programmes.

The official website of Narxoz University contains information about the University's governance structure and organisational structure, its strategy, about quality assurance, national ranking results, professional certifications of the study programmes, institutional and programme accreditations, and programme descriptions. Moreover, the website provides interactive communication with potential applicants. Each school of the University has its own page on the

⁶⁰ Student Senate <https://narxoz.edu.kz/student-life/stud-sovet>

⁶¹ Narxoz Alumni Survey <https://alumni.narxoz.kz/ru/page/statistics-and-reports>

website⁶². Also, information on the composition of the commission on academic quality and various advice is available and it is possible to ask the dean a question through the Internal regulatory documents of the University are published, updated and stored on the corporate portal of the university. On the main page of the portal, it is possible to review local news, useful videos, and visit thematic fora. The portal menu is a transition to the necessary pages, depending on the status and interests of the user.

In a specialized section, readers can familiarise themselves with the following documents:

1. The academic calendar, is posted in three languages: Russian, Kazakh, and English.
2. The current exam schedule is presented on the website. Course registration Instructions for students with teaching quality evaluation are also posted in this section.
3. Policies and regulations are presented, such as: transfer policy, President of the Republic of Kazakhstan scholarship policy, policies of academic leave and course registration, information on grants and dormitories, as well as sample applications.

All students have access to the digital resources of the university. At the moment, the core consists of Banner Student as well as LMS CANVAS. All course related information is placed on Canvas and available for students and the course administrators. Other information such as tuition payment reports, transcripts, class registration and schedules are available on Banner Student.

The university interacts with partners through social networks, fairs, joint projects, mailing list and digests. Thus, partners are in the information field of the university and receive information. To build effective communication with the general public, the university is actively working through the media and social networks through broadcasting such as interviews with the president, provost, deans, and delivering expert opinions from teachers and university staff. The University adheres to the policy of building long-term and fruitful cooperation with a number of media outlets, in particular, the creation of dialogue platforms and platforms for interaction with the public. In addition, the university provides free legal advice to the population through the media - zakon.kz and Infomburo.kz and provides a legal clinic⁶³ based on international experience.

Appraisal:

Within the frame of a comprehensive quality assurance system Narxoz has installed a quality assurance and development procedure, which systematically and continuously monitors and develops the quality of the study programme with respect to its contents, processes, and outcomes. It takes into account the evaluation results and the analysis on student workload, success rate, and graduate employment as well as the profile of the student population. Faculty

⁶² <https://narxoz.edu.kz/sem/>, <https://narxoz.edu.kz/slpp/>, <https://narxoz.edu.kz/ste/>,
<https://narxoz.edu.kz/hhs/>, <https://narxoz.edu.kz/gsb/>

⁶³ <https://en.narxoz.kz/slpp/law-clinic/>

members and students participate in the respective committees to plan and assess the quality assurance and development procedures. Responsibilities are clearly defined.

The evaluation by the students is carried out on a regular basis and in accordance with a prescribed procedure; the outcomes are communicated to the students and provide input for the quality development process.

Quality control by the faculty is carried out on a regular basis and in accordance with a prescribed procedure; the outcomes are communicated and provide input for the quality development process.

An external evaluation by alumni and employers is conducted on a regular basis and in accordance with a prescribed procedure; the outcomes are communicated and provide input for the quality development process.

The study programme's content, curriculum and examination scheme have been suitably documented and published (e.g. course plan and exam regulations).

The HEI regularly publishes current news and information – both quantitative and qualitative – about the study programme.

	Exceptional	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	n.r.
5.1* Quality assurance and quality development with respect to contents, processes and outcomes (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
5.2 Instruments of quality assurance					
5.2.1 Evaluation by students			X		
5.2.2 Evaluation by faculty			X		
5.2.3 External evaluation by alumni, employers and third parties			X		
5.3 Programme documentation					
5.3.1* Programme description (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
5.3.2 Information on activities during the academic year			X		

Quality profile

HEI: Narxoz University, Kazakhstan

Bachelor programme: Accounting and Audit

		Exceptional	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	n.r.
1	Objectives					
1.1*	Objectives of the study programme (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
1.2*	International orientation of the study programme design (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
1.3	Positioning of the study programme					
1.3.1	Positioning of the study programme in the educational market			X		
1.3.2	Positioning of the study programme on the job market for graduates („Employability“)			X		
1.3.3	Positioning of the study programme within the HEI's overall strategic concept			X		
2	Admission					
2.1*	Admission requirements (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
2.2	Counselling for prospective students			X		
2.3*	Selection procedure (if relevant)			X		
2.4(*)	Professional experience (if relevant; Asterisk Criterion for master programmes that require professional experience)			X		
2.5*	Ensuring foreign language proficiency (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
2.6*	Transparency and documentation of admission procedure and decision (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
3	Contents, structure and didactical concept					
3.1	Contents					
3.1.1*	Logic and conceptual coherence (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
3.1.2*	Rationale for degree and programme name (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
3.1.3*	Integration of theory and practice (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
3.1.4	Interdisciplinary thinking			X		
3.1.5	Ethical aspects			X		
3.1.6*	Methods and scientific practice (Asterisk Criterion)		X			
3.1.7*	Examination and final thesis (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
3.2	Structure					
3.2.1*	Modular structure of the study programme (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
3.2.2*	Study and exam regulations (Asterisk Criterion)			X		

		Exceptional	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	n.r.
	Criterion)					
3.2.3*	Feasibility of study workload (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
3.2.4	Equality of opportunity			X		
3.3	Didactic concept					
3.3.1*	Logic and plausibility of the didactical concept (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
3.3.2*	Course materials (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
3.3.3	Guest lecturers			X		
3.3.4	Lecturing tutors					X
3.4	Internationality					
3.4.1*	International contents and intercultural aspects (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
3.4.2	Internationality of the student body			X		
3.4.3	Internationality of faculty			X		
3.4.4	Foreign language contents			X		
3.5*	Multidisciplinary competences and skills (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
3.6*	Skills for employment / Employability (Asterisk Criterion)		X			
4.	Academic environment and framework conditions					
4.1	Faculty					
4.1.1*	Structure and quantity of faculty in relation to curricular requirements (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
4.1.2*	Academic qualification of faculty (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
4.1.3*	Pedagogical / didactical qualification of faculty (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
4.1.4	Practical business experience of faculty		X			
4.1.5*	Internal cooperation (Asterisk Criterion)		X			
4.1.6*	Student support by the faculty (Asterisk Criterion)		X			
4.1.7(*)	Student support in distance learning (only relevant and an Asterisk Criterion for blended-learning/distance learning programmes)					X
4.2	Programme management					
4.2.1*	Programme Director (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
4.2.2	Process organisation and administrative support for students and faculty			X		
4.3	Cooperation and partnerships					
4.3.1(*)	Cooperation with HEIs and other academic institutions or networks (Asterisk Criterion for cooperation programmes)			X		
4.3.2(*)	Cooperation with business enterprises		X			

		Exceptional	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	n.r.
	and other organisations (Asterisk Criterion for educational and vocational programmes, franchise programmes)					
4.4	Facilities and equipment					
4.4.1*	Quantity, quality, media and IT equipment of teaching and group rooms (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
4.4.2*	Access to literature (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
4.5	Additional services					
4.5.1	Career counselling and placement service			X		
4.5.2	Alumni Activities			X		
4.6*	Financing of the study programme (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
5	Quality assurance and documentation					
5.1*	Quality assurance and quality development with respect to contents, processes and outcomes (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
5.2	Instruments of quality assurance					
5.2.1	Evaluation by students			X		
5.2.2	Evaluation by faculty			X		
5.2.3	External evaluation by alumni, employers and third parties			X		
5.3	Programme documentation					
5.3.1*	Programme description (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
5.3.2	Information on activities during the academic year			X		