

Decision of the FIBAA Accreditation and Certification Committee



6th Meeting on June 29, 2022

PROGRAMME ACCREDITATION

Project Number:	20/120
Higher Education Institution:	Narxoz University
Location:	Almaty, Kazakhstan
Study Programme:	Master in Accounting and Audit with concentration on “Corporate Governance, Compliance and Performance Appraisal” (Master in Business and Administration)
Type of Accreditation:	initial accreditation

The FIBAA Accreditation and Certification Committee has taken the following decision:

According to § 7 (6) in conjunction with § 9 (1) of the FIBAA General Terms and Conditions within the framework of procedures for the award of the FIBAA Quality Seal for Programmes from April 2020, the study programme is accredited.

Period of Accreditation: June 29, 2022, until June 28, 2027

The panel’s recommended condition in chapter 3.2 (“The University modifies the programme curriculum in such a way that also the subject “Audit” is adequately dealt with compulsory courses while adequately adapting the programme structure”) was not imposed by the FIBAA Accreditation and Certification Committee (F-ACC).

The F-ACC notes that the University changed the status of the course “International Regulation of Audit and Control” which is now a compulsory course on the subject Audit and considers that the content on Audit is sufficiently covered in other elective courses as well. However, the F-ACC follows the panel’s recommendation that it will be necessary to adequately adapt the workload of the second semester and the conditions for selecting the elective courses when the group of Major Required comprises more courses than before.

In addition, the F-ACC strongly supports the panel’s recommendation about using a short and clear programme name. With that regard, the F-ACC strongly recommends reviewing if “Audit” is not creating the impression that external “Audit” is meant. Given the curriculum the F-ACC could identify that rather internal “Audit/Auditing” is taught in the curriculum. The F-ACC is of the opinion that this must be transparently adjusted in the title of the programme.

The FIBAA Quality Seal is awarded.



Assessment Report

Higher Education Institution:

Narxoz University, Kazakhstan

Master programme:

Master in Accounting and Audit with concentration on
“Corporate Governance, Compliance and Performance
Appraisal”

Qualification awarded on completion:

Master in Business and Administration

General information on the study programme

Brief description of the study programme:

The study programme Master in Accounting and Audit with concentration on “Corporate Governance, Compliance and Performance Appraisal” of Narxoz University has a duration of two years (four semesters) and a workload of 120 ECTS credits. The programme has 20 courses (incl. internships, research and thesis). Its design is oriented at international standards following the requirements of recognised certification associations and institutions, such as CIMA¹, ACCA², CIA³ and CMA⁴. The courses are entirely offered in English. Graduates of the programme will have the chance to be employed across the private and public sectors in the fields of compliance, internal audit, finance and accounting.

Type of study programme:

Master programme

Projected study time and number of ECTS credits

2 years and 120 ECTS credits

Mode of study:

full-time

Didactic approach:

study programme with obligatory class attendance

Double/Joint Degree programme:

no

Scope (planned number of parallel classes) and enrolment capacity:

50

Programme cycle starts in:

Fall semester

Initial start of the programme:

September 2021

Type of accreditation:

initial accreditation

¹ CIMA is the Chartered Institute of Management Accountants (<https://www.cimaglobal.com>).

² ACCA is the Association of Chartered Certified Accountants, a global Chamber of Accountants (www.accaglobal.com).

³ CIA means Certified Internal Auditor.

⁴ CMA is an Institute of Management Accountants providing Certifications for Accountants and Financial Professionals in Business.

Procedure

A contract for the initial accreditation of the Master in Accounting and Audit with concentration on “Corporate Governance, Compliance and Performance Appraisal” (Master in Business and Administration) was made between FIBAA and Narxoz University on November 9, 2020. On December 3, 2021, the HEI submitted a self-evaluation report, which included a detailed description of the programme and further documents in order to prove that the criteria for programme accreditation are met.

At the same time, FIBAA appointed a review panel⁵. The HEI has agreed with the chosen experts. The panel consisted of:

Prof. Dr. Erich Barthel

Frankfurt School of Finance and Management, Frankfurt, Germany
Prof. em. for Corporate Culture and Human Resource Management

Prof. Dr. Marion Halfmann

Hochschule Rhein-Waal, Kleve, Germany
Professor for Marketing and Market-Oriented Management
Vice President for Studies, Teaching and Further Education

Prof. Dr. Irina Kohler

Hochschule Fulda, University of Applied Sciences, Fulda, Germany
Professor of Management Science and Management Accounting

Dr. Meruyert Narenova

University of International Business, Almaty, Kazakhstan
Academic Director of the MSc and PhD programmes
on Economics and Management

Dr. Loretta O’Donnell

Nazarbayev University, Nursultan, Kazakhstan
Vice Provost Academic Affairs

Maik Oneschkow

FedEx Express Germany GmbH, Frankfurt, Germany
Manager Clearance Brokerage OPS, Frankfurt Airport

Jens Weibezahn

Technical University Berlin, Germany
PhD Candidate in Industrial Engineering and Management

FIBAA project manager:

Dr. Birger Hendriks

⁵ The panel is presented in alphabetical order.

The assessment is based on the self-evaluation report, amended by further documents, as requested by the panel, and an online conference (because of the Covid-19 pandemic). The online conference took place on March 16 to 18, 2022 via the video conferencing tool *Zoom*. The same cluster included an appraisal of the study programmes Bachelor in Accounting and Audit (Bachelor in Business and Administration) and PhD in Accounting, Audit and Taxation (Doctor of Philosophy) as well as an Institutional Accreditation of Narxoz University. At the end of the online conference, the panel has given a short feedback on its first impressions to representatives of the HEI.

The assessment report based on this was delivered to the HEI for comment on May 28, 2022. The statement on the report was given up on June 3, 2022. It has been taken into account in the report at hand.

Summary

The Master in Accounting and Audit with concentration on “Corporate Governance, Compliance and Performance Appraisal” offered by Narxoz University fulfils with few exceptions the FIBAA quality requirements for master programmes and can be accredited by the Foundation for International Business Administration Accreditation (FIBAA) for five years starting on June 29, 2022 and finishing on June 28, 2027, under condition. The programme is in accordance with the national and the European Qualification Frameworks and the European Standards and Guidelines in their applicable version valid as of the time of the opening of the procedure, and with the Bologna Declaration.

The panel members identified need for improvement regarding the following aspect⁶ : Modular structure of the study programme: Courses on Audit are not obligatory. The panel members recommend the accreditation on condition of meeting the following requirement:

- **Condition:** The University modifies the programme curriculum in such a way that also the subject “Audit” is adequately dealt with compulsory courses while adequately adapting the programme structure (see chapter 3.2).

Proof of meeting this condition is to be submitted by March 28, 2023.

The panel members also identified several areas where the programme could be further developed:

- using a short and clear programme name (see chapter 3.1);
- more intensively including the use of IT (software, data protection, IT services, networking, communication) (see chapter 3.1);
- elaborating a target to include foreign academic staff (see chapter 3.4);
- raising the structure of the academic staff (see chapter 4.1);
- widening the administrative career counselling and placement service (see chapter 4.5);
- involving the alumni in the future even more in order to make use of the possibilities of implying practical experiences into the programme (see chapter 4.5).

The measures that the HEI takes in order to implement the recommendations of the panel members will have to be considered during the re-accreditation.

There are many criteria in which the programme exceeds the quality requirements:

- Methods and scientific practice (see chapter 3.1);
- Skills for employment / Employability (see chapter 3.6);
- Practical business experience of faculty (see chapter 4.1);
- Internal cooperation (see chapter 4.1);
- Student support by the faculty (see chapter 4.1);
- Cooperation with business enterprises and other organisations (see chapter 4.3).

For the overall assessment of the programme, please refer to the quality profile at the end of this report.

⁶ These aspects are asterisk criteria which means that they are essential for the study programme.

Information

Information on the Institution

Narxoz University was created in 1963 as an independent organisation building on the Economics College of Kazakh National University (now Al-Farabi Kazakh National University). Its mission at that time was to educate highly qualified specialists to support the acceleration of structural reforms and economic growth. In its early years the University had three colleges: economic planning, accounting and finance. In 1964, the Programme for Postgraduate Studies was launched for scholars and academics and the Higher School of Economics was created for part-time studies.

The University has operated under various names which are chronologically: Alma-Ata Institute of National Economy (AINE); Kazakh State University of Economics; Kazakh State Academy of Management (KSAM); Kazakh University of Economics and the New University of Economics. Nevertheless, it has always been known informally as “Narxoz” which is an abbreviation of the Russian words “Narodnoye Khozyaistvo” meaning ‘national economy’.

In 2016, the institution was formally renamed as Narxoz University. In 2020 it became a Non-Profit Joint-Stock Company (NJSC). Sole shareholder is a Kazakhstani businessman. Students have to pay tuition fees. Any operational surplus is reinvested to support improvements in education and research quality. Narxoz has the task to train specialists in business, economics, digital technologies, law and social sciences. Since its creation in 1963, over 140,000 alumni have graduated from the University. From 2022, the University will move into newly reconstructed facilities.

In 2021, Narxoz elaborated a new Strategy 2020 – 2025 which includes a stock taking of what has been achieved and at the same time a concept for future changes and developments. In this context the University’s actual mission was adopted in 2021 as part of the strategic review: to inspire, create knowledge and educate people who contribute to economic, legal, technological and social development.

The University wants to continue to serve the development of the Republic of Kazakhstan and Central Asia in general by contributing to the further modernisation of the country. As a response to the current challenges including the COVID-19 pandemic and increasing requirements from students, parents and employers in its new Strategy Narxoz describes several measures that have recently been taken:

1. The Academic Council was established as a collegial body responsible for decision making on academic issues including approval of academic policies and monitoring of their implementation.
2. Each Higher School has a Quality Assurance Committee (QAC) that makes an independent analysis of teaching quality.
3. Research and Research Ethics Committees have been established at the Academic Council to further build the standing of the University in the research community by assuring the compliance of student and faculty research activities with quality and ethical standards.

4. The Office of Academic Advising has been launched to assist students during registration and selection of courses, minors and faculty. They also support students in the preparation of their individual study schedule.
5. Research centres have become part of the higher schools to encourage the involvement of bachelor, master and doctorate students. At the same time the freedom of their activities has been secured.
6. The Office of Transformation led by the Advisor on Academic Quality to the President has been launched. The Office contributes to independent analysis of compliance with academic policies and to institutional research for relevant, effective and reasonable top management decisions on academic and other issues. Currently, the Accreditation Office conducts surveys among students and its results are discussed at Quality Assurance Committees and by the Academic Council.
7. The Higher School of Arts and Social Sciences was created with the purpose of offering first year students at other Higher Schools preparatory courses including ones on Academic Writing and Research Methodology.
8. Financial aid has recently been delegated to the Office of Student Affairs that is more closely involved in collaboration with students.

The strategic review of 2021 set four priority areas:

- Producing qualified graduates with a strong sense of ethics to build human capital capacity in key areas;
- Generating new knowledge through an applied research focus to support change processes;
- Serving as an example of how to manage a values-driven university in the region which is focused on efficiency, effectiveness and a relentless drive to raise quality;
- Attracting new students from across Central Asia to widen the reach of its impact.

By working on these goals, the intent is to deliver on the vision of the University in 2025, which is to be an internationally recognised University attracting talented youth from Central Asia with internationally accredited programmes and research that bring positive economic and social change.

Moreover, in 2021 Narxoz adopted a new Charter⁷ that describes the organisational structure of the management and its responsibilities in contrast to the private owners.

For the education of students the University comprises Higher Schools that are subdivided into departments for the subjects and programmes⁸:

- Higher School of Economics and Management (with the Accounting and Audit department),
- Higher School of Digital Technologies,
- Higher School of Law and Public Policy,
- Higher School of Arts and Social Sciences
- Graduate School of Business.

⁷ Charter of Non-profit joint-stock company "Narxoz University".

⁸ A plan of the University's organisational structure is attached as Annex 1.

Statistical data

The programme Master in Accounting and Audit with concentration in Corporate Governance, Compliance and Performance Appraisal started in 2021.

Master in Accounting and Audit with concentration in Corporate Governance, Compliance and Performance Appraisal		
		2021
# Study Places		50
# Applicants	∑	12
	f	9
	m	3
Application rate		24%
# First-Year Student	∑	12
	f	9
	m	3
Rate of female students		75%
# Foreign Students	∑	1
	f	1
	m	-
Rate of foreign students		8,3%
Percentage of occupied study places		24%
# Graduates	∑	-
	f	-
	m	-
Success rate		-
Dropout rate		-
Average duration of study		-
Average grade of final degree		-

Appraisal

The panel welcomes the impulses and processes of the change management that the President and the whole team of Narxoz have started, in particular with the new Strategy 2020 – 2025. During the online conference, the panel could observe a strong orientation towards further development and change of Narxoz which also means that the University needs time to make these strategic changes a reality.

As far as the programme at hand is concerned the statistical numbers are not yet meaningful because of its recent start.

Programme Description and Appraisal in Detail

1. Objectives

1.1 Objectives of the study programme (Asterisk Criterion)

The Accounting and Audit department of the University being responsible for the programme "Accounting and Audit" at the levels Undergraduate and, Master was founded in 1963. It was recognised by accreditation agencies at the earliest stage of its existence. The department belongs to the Higher School of Economics and Management (HSEM) that in partnership with its Business Council⁹ redesigned its programmes oriented at international standards following the requirements of recognised certification associations and institutions, such as CIMA¹⁰, ACCA¹¹, CIA¹² and CMA¹³ given the competition of the business education market.

The purpose of the Master in Accounting and Audit with concentration on "Corporate Governance, Compliance and Performance Appraisal"¹⁴ programme is to prepare a new generation of professionals who will make ethically consistent management decisions based on integrated knowledge in the fields of governance, compliance, performance appraisal and provide recommendations to the board of directors or a similar decision-making body in developing strategies. These competencies correspond with the CIA 3 levels, CIMA Professional level - P1,P2 ACCA 3 Professional levels, Ethics level ACCA and CIMA, ACAMS 2-part learning outcomes.

The educational programme is oriented at flexibility, interdisciplinarity and integration. It is practice-oriented (involvement of industry experts into the academic process) and student oriented (involvement of students in the development and assessment of programme). It is structured in accordance with the Higher School of Economics and Management priorities and the University Strategy.

Students have access to the curriculum, to course content and study plans. The syllabus for each course provides information about the learning outcomes of the course, the number of ECTS credits, course content, requirements for examinations, methods of assessing student progress, scale and evaluation system, recommended and required learning resources of the course. The requirements correspond to qualification level 7 of the National Qualification Framework.

Graduates of the programme will be employed across the private and public sectors in the fields of compliance, internal audit, finance and accounting.

Appraisal:

The panel welcomes newly defined qualification objectives of the programme that are explained and convincingly presented in relation to the target group, targeted professional field and

⁹ <https://narxoz.edu.kz/sem/business-council>

¹⁰ CIMA is the Chartered Institute of Management Accountants (<https://www.cimaglobal.com>).

¹¹ ACCA is the Association of Chartered Certified Accountants, a global Chamber of Accountants (www.accaglobal.com).

¹² CIA means Certified Internal Auditor.

¹³ CMA is an Institute of Management Accountants providing Certifications for Accountants and Financial Professionals in Business.

¹⁴ Abbreviation: CGCPA.

societal context of the discipline. They embrace academic proficiency, comprehensive employability, as well as the development of the individual student’s personality.

The subject-specific and extra-curricular qualification objectives and skills to be acquired correspond with the aspired level at graduation. They take into account the requirements of the national qualification framework.

	Exceptional	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	n.r.
1.1* Objectives of the study programme (Asterisk Criterion)			X		

1.2 International orientation of the study programme design (Asterisk Criterion)

Narxoz University sees internationalisation as a strategic priority. The programme complements this. The department completely revised the curriculum to meet international standards and achieved the following results:

The Master programme is focused on developing competencies that are demanded by international employers, such as Big 4¹⁵ and other international companies operating in Kazakhstan. The programme is completely delivered in English. Moreover, it has been accredited by Association of Chartered Certified Accountants¹⁶ and Certified Institute of Management Accountants¹⁷, in both cases based on international standards for accounting and audit. In terms of international contents the programme includes courses such as Global Leadership and Organisational Development, Strategic International Leadership and Ethics, International Regulation of Audit and Control, Money Laundering Risks, and Methods and Standards.

The University tries to intensify the international mobility of students and faculty. There are 27 academic mobility programmes available for the students.

Appraisal:

The panel appreciates the international orientation of the programme. Its design with international content and accreditations based on international standards for accounting and audit appropriately promotes the graduates’ employability.

	Exceptional	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	n.r.
1.2* International orientation of the study programme design (Asterisk Criterion)			X		

¹⁵ This is the nickname referring to the four largest professional accounting networks Deloitte, Ernst & Young, KPMG and Price Waterhouse Coopers (PwC).

¹⁶ See above chapter 1.1.

¹⁷ Ibidem.

1.3 Positioning of the study programme

According to the University¹⁸ the Master in Accounting and Audit with concentration in Corporate Governance, Compliance and Performance Appraisal (CGCPA) is new and unique in Kazakhstan. The competitive landscape is mostly represented by the graduate programmes in accounting and audit of six Kazakhstani universities: Narxoz University, KIMEP University, Eurasian National University, University of International Business, Turan University and al-Farabi Kazakh National University

Main competitors of the Master programme are:

Programme Name	University	Language	Years
Master in Accounting and Audit with concentration in Corporate Governance, Compliance and Performance Appraisal	Narxoz University, Almaty	English	2
Master of Accounting and Audit	KIMEP University, Almaty	English	1,5
Accounting and Audit	L.N.Gumilyov Eurasian National University, Nur-Sultan	Russian, Kazakh, English	2
Accounting and Audit	University of International Business, Almaty	Russian, English	2
Accounting and Auditing	«Turan» University, Almaty	Russian, Kazakh	2
Accounting and Audit	Al-Farabi Kazakh National University, Almaty	Russian, Kazakh	2

Having the international accreditation in the background the programme includes internships that open up chances for finding a job. Moreover, employment opportunities are provided by

- The Big 4 auditing companies: EY, KPMG; PwC; Deloitte;
- Leading listed Industries such as JSC Aktobe Munay Gas, JSC KEGOC, JSC Forte Leasing, JSC Kazpost, JSC Eurasian Financial Company, JSC KazTransOil, JSC Rakhat, JSC Air Astana, LLP RG Brands Kazakhstan, LLP KAZ "Minerals Management", LLP Freedom Finance, LLP JTI;
- Top banks in the Republic Kazakhstan: JSC Kaspi Bank, JSC Forte Bank, JSC Halyk Bank of Kazakhstan, JSC BankCenterCredit, JSC Bank Home Credit, JSC Eurasian Bank, etc.

The Career Development and Alumni Relations Center of Narxoz University assists graduates in searching for job vacancies through its established relations with employers.

¹⁸ See Self-evaluation report (SER) p. 11.

The Master programme corresponds with the University Strategy, its mission¹⁹ and vision. It is designed with a focus on fulfilling the strategic vision: to be an internationally recognized University based on accredited programmes and research, attracting talented youth from Central Asia to support positive economic and social change.

Appraisal:

Although other universities that are offering Accounting and Audit are also located in Almaty, the competitive position of Narxoz' Master programme seems to be promising because of its special focus and its international accreditations. Therefore, the reasons given for the positioning in the educational market of this study programme are plausible.

The arguments in support of graduate employability on the basis of the stated qualification objectives are convincingly presented. The future fields of employment for graduates are plausibly set forth.

The study programme is convincingly integrated into Narxoz's overall strategic concept. The study programme's qualification goals are in line with the HEI's mission and strategic planning.

	Exceptional	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	n.r.
1.3	Positioning of the study programme				
1.3.1	Positioning of the study programme in the educational market		X		
1.3.2	Positioning of the study programme on the job market for graduates („Employability“)		X		
1.3.3	Positioning of the study programme within the HEI's overall strategic concept		X		

¹⁹ See above chapter Information.

2. Admission

In 2021, Narxoz adopted by the decision of its Academic Council a document with the title Academic Policies²⁰. It describes and regulates the main academic principles and procedures of Narxoz, inter alia those for admission. Moreover, Narxoz has installed Rules of admission for programmes of postgraduate education which include Master programmes. These internal regulations are based on and take into account the rules of admission approved by the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan (MES). In 2021, MES updated these rules²¹ which stipulate in detail the procedure, criteria and responsibilities for the admission to higher education programmes. The entrance examination was centralized across the country. HEIs no longer arrange examinations and are separated from admission except from anonymous review of candidates' research proposals by the University faculty. After documents' submission applicants have to register at the database of National Testing Center (NTC) and at the scheduled time take online (written) examinations on the NTC platform.²²

In accordance with the entry MES requirements for the admission to a Master programme the candidate must:

- have graduated from a HEI with a Bachelor degree of a workload of 240 ECTS credits;
- pass two examinations organised by MES: the entrance examination on the specialty (International Financial Reporting Standards, International Standards of Audit, Management Accounting) and an English Test

Historically, the government grants have been a primary source of the master programmes revenue. Narxoz has been welcoming fee-paying students as well. However during the pandemic the University had to shift its student recruitment strategy to attract more scholarship winners. Thus, the scholarship also covers the tuition fees that students have to pay.

Successful candidates (who passed the MES entrance examinations) apply for a government scholarship, then they select a university to study. Admission documents and applications for admission are accepted from July 10 to 30 in the higher educational institutions (HEIs). The MES entrance exams take place in the period (August 10 - 20), and student enrolment is completed by August 25. All examination appeal cases must be submitted to the Republican Commission for the Review of Appeals. Appeals commissions are formed by HEIs.

Persons who scored the highest points on entrance examinations for scientific and pedagogical magistracy with not less than 150 points are enrolled in the Master programme and awarded the state scholarship. However, as a prerequisite for getting access to the Master programme students have to pass a course "Audit and Assurance" (which has newly been introduced). This change has been made to ensure that students have an advanced practical grounding and to guarantee that they have an advanced practical knowledge-base in: Business and Technology, Financial Accounting, Management Accounting, Corporate and Business Law, and Audit and Assurance.

²⁰ Approved of NJSC "Narxoz University" dated October 19, 2021.

²¹ "Rules for Admission to Academic Programs at Higher Education Institutions.

²² [Manual from the MES of RK on organization of admission exams to PhD programs](#)

Students need to have an exemption of these courses when they passed those courses during their Bachelor programme or because of professional practice.

Persons who have international certificates of passing the foreign language test are credited with the maximum score (100 out of 100).

If the contestants have the same score, the advantage is given to those who have the highest score on the specialty exam. In case of the equal scores on the specialty exam, those with higher scores on the English test will be selected. Other academic achievements of the candidates can also be taken into account.

Narxoz University's Recruitment and Admissions Department is the unit responsible for implementing the work with prospective students/ masters in online and offline formats. All appropriate information on admission rules and procedures is available and regularly updated at the University website²³. The work on information and counselling has several directions: career guidance and live counselling; exhibitions and fairs; summer admissions; virtual admissions and online counselling. The counselling service could be reached via the Call Centre or the website online consultant or by direct email. However, the website describes the admission questions not in English.

A selection procedure is conducted insofar as Narxoz only accepts applicants who achieve a scholarship which is granted depending on the applicant's score.

Also, the preferred candidates to the programme must have at least 12 months of professional experience in a field that is close to accounting and audit.

As the programme is taught in English applicants have to take an English language test. As far as they have internationally recognised certificates they are exempt from the entrance examination if they meet the conditions below:

English Language Requirements

Language	Exam	Threshold score (level)
English	Test of English as a Foreign Language Institutional Testing Programme (TOEFL ITP)	not less than 460 points
	Test of English as a Foreign Language Institutional Testing Programme Internet-based Test (TOEFL IBT)	not less than 87
	International English Language Tests System (IELTS)	not less than 6.0

To support the development of the students' proficiency in English, HSEM provides course literature in English and guest lectures within the Leadership Development Programme. Also, students can achieve ACCA, CIMA, CIA exam levels in English with respective courses. CMA offers a special scholarship programme for improving subject-specific English. Finally, students get access to the Computer Based Exam Centre of ACCA.

The HSEM webpage contains relevant information for applicants on the academic programmes, teaching staff, and the Catalogue with all policies and procedures explained and contact

²³ <https://en.narxoz.kz/admission/specificity/master/>

information. The admission procedure is based on the principles of openness and transparency, the decision on the above criteria and communicated to applicants by email/phone.

Appraisal:

The admission requirements are defined and comprehensible. The national requirements are presented and taken into account.

Applicants can directly turn to the Recruitment and Admissions department which provides a student counselling service, for clarification of specific questions, of personal aptitude, of career perspectives etc. Personal dialogue between applicants and the HEI is provided by defined office hours, by telephone and via e-mail. Also, the University website answers questions on admission.

The selection procedure is transparent and ensures that qualified students are admitted.

The required professional experience must correspond to the defined qualification profile of entrants and the study programme's objectives. Certified proof of this experience must be shown at the time of the admission.

The admission requirements (required language proficiency level or required result in a concrete language test) or preparatory language courses ensure that students are able to successfully complete the study programme (courses, additional literature, utilisation of counselling services and extracurricular activities).

The admission procedure is described, documented, and accessible for interested parties. The admission decision is based on transparent criteria and is communicated in writing.

		Exceptional	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	n.r.
2.1*	Admission requirements (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
2.2	Counselling for prospective students			X		
2.3*	Selection procedure (if relevant)			X		
2.4(*)	Professional experience (if relevant; Asterisk Criterion for master programmes that require professional experience)			X		
2.5*	Ensuring foreign language proficiency (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
2.6*	Transparency and documentation of admission procedure and decision (Asterisk Criterion)			X		

3. Contents, structure and didactical concept of the programme

3.1 Contents

The Accounting and Audit programme is a two-year Master programme that offers students the opportunity to engage with subjects such as Management Accounting, Internal Audit, Internal Audit and business Data Analytics, Money Laundering Risks, Strategic Financial management as well as courses that are internationally oriented. The curriculum also includes Research Internships in all semesters as well as a Master thesis.

The curriculum overview is presented below:

Curriculum										
Master in Accounting and Audit with concentration in CGCPA										
Modul No.	Title of Module / Course Unit	Credit Points per Semester				Workload		Method of Teaching	Form and Duration of Examinations	weight of exam related to final grade
		1.	2.	3.	4.	Hours in Class	Hours Self-Study	i.e. lecture course, seminar		
1st Semester										
School Required- 20 ECTS										
ACC 5301	Global Leadership and Organizational Development	7				63	126	L/S	Exam paper (120 min)	40/100
LNG 5301	English (professional)	5				45	90	T	Exam paper (120 min)	40/100
MNGT 5301	Management	5				45	90	L/S	Exam paper (120 min)	40/100
	Pedagogical Internship	3				27	54		Report	100/100
Major Required- 6 ECTS										
ACC 5302	Management Accounting (operational level)	6				54	108	L/S	Exam paper (180 min)	40/100
Research- 4 ECTS										
RES 5301	Research Internship	4				36	72		Report	100/100
	Total	30				270	540			
2nd Semester										
Major Required- 10 ECTS										
ACC 5303	Advanced Management Accounting		5			45	90	L/S	Exam paper (180 min)	40/100
ACC 5304	Corporate Governance		5			45	90	L/S	Exam paper (120 min)	40/100
Major Electives - 10 ECTS from the list below:										
ACC 5205	International Regulation of Audit and Control		5			45	90	L/S	Exam paper (120 min)	40/100
ACC 5206	Theory and Methodology of Internal Audit		5			45	90	L/S	Exam paper (120 min)	40/100
ACC 5207	Strategic International Leadership and Ethics		5			45	90	L/S	Exam paper (120 min)	40/100
ACC 5208	Company's Strategy Development		5			45	90	L/S	Exam paper (120 min)	40/100
Research- 10 ECTS										
RES 5302	Research Internship		10			90	180		Report	100/100

		Total		30		270	540			
3d Semester										
Major Required - 5 ECTS from the list below:										
ACC 6209	Performance Management and Appraisal			5		45	90	L/S	Exam paper (180 min)	40/100
Major Electives - 20 ECTS from the list below:										
ACC 6210	Internal Audit and Business Data Analytics			5		45	90	L/S	Exam paper (120 min)	40/100
ACC 6211	Company Compliance and Control			5		45	90	L/S	Exam paper (120 min)	40/100
ACC 6212	Money Laundering Risks, Methods and Standards			5		45	90	L/S	Exam paper (120 min)	40/100
ACC 6213	Research Methodology			5		45	90	L/S	Exam paper (120 min)	40/100
ACC 6214	Strategic Financial Management			5		45	90	L/S	Exam paper (180 min)	40/100
ACC 6215	Internal Audit Practice and Strategy			5		45	90	L/S	Exam paper (120 min)	40/100
ACC 6216	Financial Reporting Process Management			5		45	90	L/S	Exam paper (120 min)	40/100
ACC 6217	IT Audit			5		45	90	L/S/Lab	Exam paper (120 min)	40/100
Research- 5 ECTS										
RES 6303	Research Internship			5		45	90		Report	100/100
		Total		30		270	540			
4th Semester										
Research- 18 ECTS										
RES 6304	Research Internship			5	45	90			Report	100/100
RES 6305	Research			13	117	234			Report	100/100
State Attestation- 12 ECTS										
ACC 6318	Master's Thesis			12	128	216			Exam Paper/Defence of the Master's Thesis	100/100
		Total		30	270	540				
		Overall Total		120	1080	2160				

The following courses have been accredited by internationally recognised professional certification bodies which means that these contents are strictly oriented at the respective criteria and fulfils the requirements of the certification bodies:

- Management Accounting (Operational level) - CIMA P1
- Advanced Management Accounting - CIMA P2, CMA
- Performance Management and Appraisal - ACCA, CMA
- Strategic International Leadership and Ethics - ACCA, CIMA
- Financial Reporting Process Management - ACCA, CIMA
- Strategic Financial Management - ACCA
- International Regulation of Audit and Control - ACCA, CIA
- Company Compliance and Control - ACAMS
- Money Laundering Risks, Methods and Standards - ACAMS
- Theory and Methodology of Internal Audit - CIA
- Internal Audit Practice and Strategy - CIA
- Internal Audit and Business Data Analytics - CIA
- IT Audit - CIA

Graduates of the programme shall be able to:

- Analyse ethical and legal responsibilities of organizations to society.
- Integrate knowledge of qualitative, quantitative, and pluralistic research approaches in developing projects.
- Critically assess the impact of business environments on risk management, considering legislative, political and sectoral factors.
- Analyse the purpose, structure and management of the organization and contribute to the process of making ethical decisions regarding strategy.
- Develop managerial and leadership competences related to performance monitoring and evaluation.
- Appraise the risk and control implications of different organizational structures.
- Recognize emerging technology control practices and their impact on information security systems.
- Understand and apply anti-money laundering best practices in leading international financial institutions.
- Assess performance based on consolidated financial statements in accordance with IFRS.
- Apply data analysis in internal audit.

The learning outcomes correspond to qualification level 7 of the National Qualification Framework.

Those students who have achieved or are in the process of achieving international certifications by ACCA, CIA, CIMA or CMA may apply for getting recognised their professional experience up to a maximum of 50 % of the curriculum. The procedure of recognition is regulated into detail in the Regulation on the Procedure for recognition of learning outcomes of formal and non-formal education (2021).

The official name of the degree awarded upon the successful graduation of the study programme is determined according to the requirements of the Classifier of training areas of higher and postgraduate education and approved by the Order of the Minister of Education and Science²⁴.

The Master programme includes practical training to consolidate theoretical knowledge. According to the “Academic Policy” of Narxoz²⁵ the University supports this implementation through embedding practice-oriented courses.

The pedagogical internships which are required by MES are aimed at developing practical skills in teaching and learning. The also required research component of the programme shall develop research skills through introducing theoretical, methodological and technological achievements of research as well as developing data processing and interpreting skills.

Moreover, the programme integrates theory and practice through implementing case studies in teaching. The professional certification-oriented courses offered by ACCA, CIMA, CIA, CMA allow students to collect practical experience. Finally, there are several research components in the curriculum that combine theory and practice.

²⁴ On October 13, 2018, № 17565, the Scientific-Pedagogical Master’s Programme, degree “Master in Accounting and Audit with concentration in “Corporate Governance, Compliance and Performance Appraisal”.

²⁵ Approved by the decision of the Academic Council of "Narxoz University" dated October 19, 2021, chapter 4.1.

Along with the academically qualified teachers there are guest lecturers who contribute to the training of students with their professional experience in a relevant field such as in the Leadership Development Programme.

The programme utilizes an interdisciplinary approach. The courses related to the fields of Accounting and Audit are combined with courses that touch other disciplines such as Management with Global Leadership and Organizational Development, Law with Corporate Governance, and Company Strategy Development.

As far as ethical aspects are concerned, the Code of Conduct of Narxoz University establishes standards of conduct that apply to all faculty, students and administration of the University. As mentioned above²⁶, the University has installed a Research Committee and a Research Ethics Committee at the Academic Council to further build the standing of the University in the research community by assuring the compliance of student and faculty research activities with quality and ethical standards. Also, Narxoz University Examination Regulations²⁷ and the course syllabi emphasise ethical thinking and behaviour.

The major elective course Strategic International Leadership and Ethics focuses on examining ethical issues within future professional activity and includes topics on recognizing and analysing ethical issues in various types of professional activity; understanding core business values and promoting ethical behaviour in accountancy; social responsibilities of businesses as well as ethics in a global context.

The curriculum includes a course on Research Methodology which aims to develop methodological competences and research skills. This course equips students with the knowledge and skills necessary to carry out research, such as methodology, quantitative analysis skills, modelling, specialised software (MS Excel, Bloomberg (BMC), Power BI, SPSS, Stata, etc.) use. Students learn how to use and collect data from EBSCO, WoS, Scopus, Emerald, Jstor and other databases and how to carry out a literature review. Along with this, the Master's thesis project requires the use of research and analytical skills and methodology and evaluates the ability to employ these skills independently under supervision.

The process of conducting interim and final assessments of students is regulated by the relevant rules of its conduct.²⁸ The exams are conducted mainly in a written form. It can be case studies, assignments, essays, but also quizzes. The syllabi reflect the assessment criteria and include information on the midterm and final exams. Courses taught according to ACCA and CIMA midterm 1, 2 and the final exam contents go through an annual verification process by ACCA Global and CIMA Global. Final examination samples must be reviewed by HSEM Academic Qualification Commission to ensure quality of the assessment and its consistency with the course learning outcomes. For the period of the examination session, the HSEM creates an appeal committee of at least three qualified faculty members.

²⁶ See chapter Information.

²⁷ (1) Regulations on conducting intermediate attestations of students at "Narxoz University", 2020.; (2) Regulation on conducting the final attestation of students at Narxoz University, 2021.

²⁸ Ibidem.

The required final exit assessment has a workload of at least 12 ECTS and be conducted in the form of writing and defending the Master Thesis (project). The goal of the final assessment is to evaluate the programme learning outcomes achieved and competencies acquired.

Appraisal:

The panel has the view that the curriculum adequately reflects the qualification objectives of the study programme. It shows a clear combination of contents that are well-balanced, logically connected and oriented towards the intended learning outcomes described in every syllabus. The areas of optional electives enable students to acquire additional competences and skills. The panel welcomes that Narxoz includes courses in the programme that are certified by professional bodies. During the online conference students underlined that for them these certifications are an advantage for their employability.

The contents of the courses take into account the students' prior professional experience and refer to it. They consistently reflect the strategic orientation of the study programme. They clearly meet the requirements of the job market. Additional electives enhance the graduates' employability.

The degree and programme name (Master in Accounting and Audit with concentration on "Corporate Governance, Compliance and Performance Appraisal") correspond to the contents of the curriculum and the programme objectives. In this context, the panel notes that MES has approved the name of the study programme. However, it has the view that this name is too long and when using the abbreviations not sufficiently clear. Therefore, the panel recommends using a short and clear programme name.

Theoretical questions are, where possible, explained by means of practical examples such as case studies. The panel notes that students do internships, focussed on research. However, it might also be useful for students to gather practical experience in local companies or business.

There is evidence that the programme qualifies for interdisciplinary thinking.

The panel welcomes that ethical implications (for example those of economical or juridical ways of thinking and acting) are appropriately communicated, also involving the two Committees that have been installed.

Students acquire methodological competences and are enabled to do scientific work on the required level. The panel welcomes that methodological competences and scientific practice are thoroughly trained with and for a scientific pedagogical Master programme appropriate workload of 37 ECTS credits²⁹. Students are equipped with the necessary skills for research-oriented work and for applying those skills in the respective vocational fields. However, the panel recommends more intensively including the use of IT (software, data protection, IT services, networking, communication).

²⁹ See also the following chapter 3.2.

All exams, as they are defined for the courses, are suited in format and content to ascertain the intended learning outcomes. The requirements are in accordance with the desired qualification level. The exams are characterised by a wide variety of test formats.

The final theses / projects are evaluated based on previously published and coherently applied criteria, rules, and procedures. The students prove, especially in their thesis, their ability to do scientific work and the achievement of the study programme's qualification objectives.

	Exceptional	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	n.r.
3.1 Contents					
3.1.1* Logic and conceptual coherence (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
3.1.2* Rationale for degree and programme name (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
3.1.3* Integration of theory and practice (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
3.1.4 Interdisciplinary thinking			X		
3.1.5 Ethical aspects			X		
3.1.6* Methods and scientific practice (Asterisk Criterion)		X			
3.1.7* Examination and final thesis (Asterisk Criterion)			X		

3.2 Structure

Projected study time	2 years, 4 semesters
Number of Credit Points (CP)	120 ECTS credits
Workload per CP	27 hours
Number of courses	20 (incl. internships, research and thesis)
Time required for processing the final thesis and awarded CP	2 months
Number of contact hours	1,080 hours

According to Narxoz³⁰, the programme is designed as a scientific-pedagogical Master degree. Its duration spans four semesters over a two-year period (full-time). To graduate from the programme the student must successfully complete a thesis. In the first semester students are required to participate in a course on professional English, which is credited. Moreover, they have to choose six out of twelve elective courses.

The academic year consists of academic periods, the period of examinations, research internships and vacations.

The programme has a workload of 120 ECTS credits and is structured as follows:

- School required / State compulsory courses - 20 ECTS
- Major required courses - 21 ECTS

³⁰ SER, p. 18 f.

- Major elective courses - 30 ECTS
- Research internships and research - 37 ECTS
- Master thesis - 12 ECTS.

According to Narxoz' statement on the report³¹, the current students of the Master programme are graduates of the University's ACCA accredited Bachelor in Accounting and Audit. Moreover, all of them are practicing auditors. After the online conference of this accreditation procedure the University has decided to modify the status of the course "International Regulation of Audit and Control" from a major elective to a major required.

The Master programme workload was assessed on the basis of ECTS and MES requirements. The total length of the academic year must be at least 36 weeks. The ECTS per course distribution corresponds with the ECTS Users' Guide.

The programme requirements correspond to qualification level 7 of the Qualification Framework of Kazakhstan.

The final results of the students' research and research internships go into the Master's thesis (project). Within two months of enrolment, each Master student shall be assigned a research supervisor to supervise the thesis. The supervisor and the topic of the research of the Master's thesis is approved by a decision of the Academic Council.

Students must present its main results in at least one publication and (or) one presentation at a scientific-practical conference. Narxoz University assists the students in publishing the results of the study. The thesis (project) is tested for plagiarism, the rules and procedures for which are determined by the University independently.

The Accounting and Audit programme has a syllabus for every course which serves as information for students as well as for faculty. It provides all necessary information and detailed descriptions such as the course title, credit hours, course description, information about the instructor, assessment description, semester schedule/plan, the prerequisites for the course (if applicable), intended learning outcomes, methods of assessments, recommended course readings, teaching and learning methods. The syllabus template is used by all Narxoz instructors. It seeks to ensure that all instructors appropriately develop their syllabi and include all necessary information.

There are regulations for assessments and examinations, grading, re-sits, academic standing, credit transfer and the Master thesis. As already mentioned above³², Narxoz issued regulations on the assessments for intermediate exams and separately for final examinations. They are published in full on the Narxoz website and are referred to and summarized in course syllabi.

The regulation of The Procedure for Recognition of Learning Outcomes of Formal and Non-Formal Education includes beside the recognition of practical experience³³ the recognition of degrees and of learning outcomes e.g. in terms times of studies abroad. The decision on the recognition is done by a commission that is created by order of the Provost of the University. The procedure is

³¹ These comments were made on the draft version of this report.

³² See chapter 3.1.

³³ See above chapter 3.1.

oriented at the Lisbon Recognition Convention.

The assessment regulations for the final examination describe the criteria and procedure for the single course but also for the final thesis. Instructors are required to provide detailed feedback on student assignments. No single course assessment can constitute more than 60 % of an overall course grade, except the reports on research internships and on the research work.

The grading system is outlined in each of Narxoz exams regulations. – from A to F – and includes a description of what characterizes each grade level.

Narxoz Grading System

Letter grading system	Numeric equivalent	Points (%-percentage)	Traditional grading system
A	4,0	95-100	Excellent
A-	3,67	90-94	
B+	3,33	85-89	Good
B	3,0	80-84	
B-	2,67	75-79	
C+	2,33	70-74	Satisfactory
C	2,0	65-69	
C-	1,67	60-64	
D+	1,33	55-59	
D-	1,0	50-54	Unsatisfactory
FX	0,5	25-49	
F	0	0-24	

Academic achievements (knowledge, abilities, skills and competencies) of students are assessed in points on a 100-point scale corresponding to the internationally accepted letter system with a digital equivalent (positive marks, in descending order, from “A” to “D”, and “unsatisfactory” - “FX”, “F”,) and estimates according to the traditional system.

The Academic Services Department is a key link in the collection and processing of information about the study and workload distribution process. The exams are assigned normally at the end of each semester. The courses are published on the learning management system (LMS) “Canvas”.

The student study load of 120 ECTS credits is reviewed by the HSEM Quality Assurance Committee (QAC) based on the student and faculty feedback provided through the use of such instruments as Faculty Teaching Evaluation Survey (FTES) and the Course Management Form (CMF). The FTES is completed by students at the end of each semester and used to assess quality of teaching and the study load distribution. The CMF is filled in individually by a faculty member at the end of semester. The CMF measures the percentage of the planned topics covered during the course and effectiveness of the ECTS assigned.

The results of FTES survey and CMF analysis are discussed at the HSEM QAC and communicated to faculty. During the online conference student expressed their view that the programme workload is “pretty high”. But by means of the elective courses the curriculum allows to draw up individual study plans which makes the workload feasible.

Narxoz University prohibits any acts of discrimination against members of its community – students, employees, faculty members based on the race, colour, sex, national origin, religion, social status, disability or any other individual factors. More details are described in the Narxoz “Policy of equal access to education for students with disabilities” (2021) such as: Based on the principle of equal access students with disabilities are provided with academic support throughout the entire period of study.

Students with special needs are encouraged to visit the Student Affairs department. The LMS Canvas allows students to apply distantly on various inquiries serving as a means supporting communication among students and administration.

Appraisal:

The panel considers it as being positive that the content of several courses has been defined as prerequisites by the external professional bodies such as ACCA and CIMA. This can be obviously an advantage for the students’ employability and outweighs the insofar limited impact of the University on the course contents. The programme structure supports the smooth implementation of the curriculum and helps students to reach the defined learning outcomes. The programme consists of courses and assigns Credit-Points (CP) per course on the basis of the necessary student workload. Practical components such as the internships are designed and integrated in such a way that CP can be acquired.

The panel notes that according to Narxoz the current students are graduates of the ACCA accredited Bachelor programme in Accounting and Audit and that all of them are practicing auditors. With these comments Narxoz makes clear that these students are already well trained in auditing and that programme courses on auditing could be elective ones as they were before. Nevertheless, a study programme should not be cut out for a maybe unique situation, because in future years the student body may also include students or graduates from other national or international universities, who may not have the same proficiency in auditing. Therefore, the panel welcomes that the University changed the status of the course “International Regulation of Audit and Control” which is now a compulsory course on the subject Audit³⁴. Nevertheless, it is the only course on this subject. The other courses on the subject Audit, such as Theory and Methodology of Internal Audit, Internal Audit and Business Data Analytics, and Internal Audit Practice and Strategy still belong to the group of “Major Electives” in the curriculum. The panel forms the view that a study programme on Accounting and Audit should adequately cover the two subjects – taking into account the concentration on “Corporate Governance, Compliance and Performance Appraisal”. Just one course on Audit may not be sufficient. Also, it will be necessary to adequately adapt the workload of the second semester and the conditions for selecting the elective courses when the group of Major Required comprises more courses than before.

Therefore, the panel recommends the following **condition**:

- The University modifies the programme curriculum in such a way that also the subject “Audit” is adequately dealt with compulsory courses while adequately adapting the programme structure.

³⁴ See also above chapter 2: Future students have to pass a course “Audit and Assurance” as part of the admission procedure.

The course syllabi provide detailed descriptions of intended learning outcomes and the information defined in the ECTS Users' Guide.

There are legally binding study and exam regulations which contain all necessary rules and procedures and take into account, where applicable, national requirements. The study programme is designed so that students can study for a certain time at other HEIs or do internships without any extension of their overall study time. The recognition of degrees and periods of study at other HEIs is regulated in accordance with the Lisbon Recognition Convention; the recognition of periods of practical work – insofar intended – is also clearly defined. The final grade is supplied with an ECTS grading table.

The feasibility of the study programme's workload is ensured by a suitable curriculum design, by a plausible calculation of workload, by an adequate number and frequency of examinations, by appropriate support services as well as academic and general student counselling.

The HEI ensures gender equality and non-discrimination. Students with disabilities are provided with affirmative actions concerning time and formal standards/requirements throughout the programme and examinations. Students in special circumstances, such as single parents, foreign students, students with a migration background and/or from so-called non-academic backgrounds, are particularly assisted.

	Exceptional	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	n.r.
3.2 Structure					
3.2.1* Modular structure of the study programme (Asterisk Criterion)				Condition	
3.2.2* Study and exam regulations (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
3.2.3* Feasibility of study workload (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
3.2.4 Equality of opportunity			X		

3.3 Didactic concept

The didactical concept of the programme is shaped by a commitment to academic freedom and increasing the role of faculty in the academic decision-making process. The faculty's choice of appropriate teaching and learning methodology is outlined in the syllabus. Moreover, the concept aims to achieve a balance between the acquisition of knowledge and skills on the one the other. This means that various teaching methods are used to communicate knowledge and skills so that students can engage with them reflectively and critically. To fulfil its aims, the course employs a variety of teaching methods such as lectures, case studies and discussions, group discussions and presentations.

According to Narxoz³⁵, course materials are developed in accordance with the learning outcomes that are presented in the syllabus. Study materials are constantly updated in accordance with the

³⁵ See SER p. 21.

development of new didactic concepts. No later than one month before the beginning of each semester, the HSEM QAC reviews and approves all course syllabi, and the examination materials are reviewed and approved no later than one month before the exam.

According to the Narxoz “Academic Policy”, instructors are required to upload all course materials (syllabi, lectures’ presentations/notes, textbook or book link to the library access, case-studies, assignments, tests etc.) to the LMS "Canvas.narxoz". There are no strict regulations and requirements regarding all course materials’ structure and content. The literature recommended by the instructor shall be issued at least during the last five years.

Thus, the didactic concept is focused on achieving the goals of the programme.

As already mentioned above³⁶, the HSEM invites guest lecturers within the framework of Leadership Development Programme launched in 2021. The list includes guest lecturers representatives of companies and public authorities as well as professors from areas related to the students’ fields of study.

For example, guest lecturers in the course Leadership Development Programme (September-November 2021) were by their positions from:

Position
Deloitte, Senior Auditor
PWC, Human Capital Senior Specialist
PWC, Recruitment Specialist
Chairman of the Board of Astana International Exchange (AIX, Exchange)
ACCA Global, Business Relationship Manager
EY, Employer Brand and HR Communications
Co-Founder of QBI Analytics
Deputy of the Maslikhat of Almaty, Chairman of the Board of JSC “Social-Entrepreneurial Corporation "Almaty”

The guest lecturers mostly represent employers. Through bringing fresh and first-hand experience into the classroom, they can enhance master students’ industry insights and contribute to their professional development and employability.

Appraisal:

The didactical concept of the study programme is described, plausible, and oriented towards the programme objectives. It allows for the application of different teaching and learning methods, such as, for instance, case studies or practical projects. Students are encouraged to take an active role in creating the learning process. Additionally, the didactical methods are systematically derived from the study programme objectives and are oriented towards the intended learning outcomes of each module/course, for instance by regularly using case studies and/or practical projects. However, the panel has the view that the subject audit as part of the study programme

³⁶ See chapter 3.1.

must be dealt with more intensively, content wise and didactically (see the condition in chapter 3.1).

The accompanying course materials are oriented towards the intended learning outcomes and correspond to the required qualification level. They are up to date and digitally accessible for the students. They are user-friendly and encourage students to engage in further independent studies.

Guest lecturers are invited and contribute to the students' qualification process with their special experience, either from professional practice or scientific work, but also, for example, from culture and politics.

	Exceptional	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	n.r.
3.3 Didactic concept					
3.3.1* Logic and plausibility of the didactical concept (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
3.3.2* Course materials (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
3.3.3 Guest lecturers			X		
3.3.4 Lecturing tutors					X

3.4 Internationality

As already mentioned above³⁷ the Master programme is focused on developing competencies that are demanded by international employers, such as the Big 4³⁸ and other international companies operating in Kazakhstan. Therefore, the programme is completely delivered in English, and it is designed in accordance with internationally recognised standards. Several courses offered are aimed at stimulating discussions on intercultural and multinational business environments.

In terms of international and intercultural contents the programme includes courses such as Global Leadership and Organisational Development, Strategic International Leadership and Ethics, International Regulation of Audit and Control, Money Laundering Risks, and Methods and Standards. Moreover, it has been accredited by the Association of Chartered Certified Accountants³⁹ and the Certified Institute of Management Accountants⁴⁰, in both cases based on international standards for accounting and audit.

In the 2021-2022 academic year the programme student body is represented only by one master student from Tajikistan. To promote internationalisation the department of Accounting and Audit has developed cooperation and academic mobility programmes with the partner institutions listed below:

List of Academic partners (Universities) with concentration in Accounting and Audit

³⁷ See chapter 1.2.

³⁸ This is the nickname referring to the four largest professional accounting networks Deloitte, Ernst & Young, KPMG and Price Waterhouse Coopers (PwC).

³⁹ See above chapter 1.1.

⁴⁰ Ibidem.

1	Baltic International Academy, Lithuania, Riga
2	Coventry University, United Kingdom, Coventry
3	Cracow University of Economics, Poland, Krakow
4	East Asia Institute of Management, Singapore
5	Girne American University, Cyprus, Girne
6	Kangnam University, South Korea, Yongyin
7	Lahore University of Management Sciences, Pakistan, Lahore
8	Nagoya University of Commerce & Business, Japan, Nagoya
9	O.P. Jindal Global University, India, Sonipat Haryana
10	Oxford Brookes University, United Kingdom, Oxford.
11	University of Massachusetts Amherst, U.S., Massachusetts.
12	University of West Attica, Greece, Egaleo
13	Xi'An University of Finance and Economics, China, Xi'an
14	Don State Technical University, Russian Federation, Rostov-on-Don
15	Kyrgyz State University named after Arabaev, Kyrgyzstan, Bishkek
16	Kyrgyz National University named after Balasagyn, Kyrgyzstan, Bishkek
17	Kyrgyz-Russian Slavic University, Kyrgyzstan, Bishkek
18	Moscow State University named after Lomonosov , Russian Federation, Moscow
19	National Research Nizhny Novgorod State University named after Lobachevsky, Russian Federation, Novgorod
20	Novosibirsk State Technical University, Russian Federation, Novosibirsk
21	Osh State University, Kyrgyzstan, Osh
22	Russian-Tajik (Slavic) University, Tajikistan, Dushanbe
23	RUDN, Russian Federation, Moscow (Bachelor's, Master's, doctoral studies)
24	Saratov State National Research University named after N.G. Chernyshevsky, Saratov, Russian Federation
25	Tajik State University of Commerce, Tajikistan, Dushanbe
26	Ural State University of Economics, Yekaterinburg, Russian Federation

To fulfil the University's strategic objectives the programme will have to increase the number of international students to 5 % of the total by 2025.

The number of faculty members with international academic and professional experience has been increasing since 2020. Currently, there are four full time instructors with international background out of 15 (26 %) at the Department of Accounting and Audit: They have received a degree from foreign universities.

As the whole programme is offered in English, the HSEM seeks to ensure that its graduates are capable of working effectively in an international environment in English. Therefore, and following the MES requirements, Narxoz University allocates five ECTS to a course on English (Professional) in the first semester.

Appraisal

The panel welcomes that international contents are an integral part of the curriculum. Students are thus prepared for the challenges in an international working environment. Through practical examples, students are enabled to act in an intercultural environment.

As the programme has just started it is hardly possible to achieve an international composition of the student body which would be corresponding to the programme concept. But the University has taken measures to gain students from other countries for the programme. The panel is fully supportive of these endeavours.

The international composition of the faculty in terms of teachers with international academic and professional experience promotes the acquisition of international competences and skills. The measures taken are goal-oriented. However, the panel has the view that the intended international orientation of the Master programme⁴¹ can be even more supported by international members of staff. Therefore, the panel recommends the University elaborating a target to include foreign academic staff.

The proportion of foreign language courses and required foreign language materials corresponds with the qualification objectives of the study programme.

		Exceptional	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	n.r.
3.4	Internationality					
3.4.1*	International contents and intercultural aspects (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
3.4.2	Internationality of the student body			X		
3.4.3	Internationality of faculty			X		
3.4.4	Foreign language contents			X		

3.5 Multidisciplinary competences and skills (Asterisk Criterion)

In addition to the interdisciplinary elective courses⁴², students are provided with training in communication, and public speaking skills. Students are assigned oral presentations in several courses, in which they describe their research projects and review academic texts from a multidisciplinary perspective. In this connection, courses such as Global Leadership and Organisational Development, Management, English (Professional), Corporate Governance are aimed at acquiring skills and confidence to deal with a range of challenging and unexpected communication situations, focusing on proven tools and techniques, how to remain calm under pressure, overcome common obstacles, and get message across with style and impact by developing students' multidisciplinary approach. Individual and group assignments, discussions, case-studies, within listed courses promote students to be effective communicators, especially when asked to respond in the moment in a clear, concise, and ethical manner.

Moreover, there are various student organisations at Narxoz University that aim to develop multidisciplinary competencies and skills of students and to improve students as individuals and professionals in management life activities, such as: Debate club "Dispute Narxoz", "Financial

⁴¹ See above chapter 3.1.

⁴² See above chapter 3.1.

club", "Adrenaline", "Medialab", "Narxoz Pride"⁴³ and others.

Appraisal:

The students acquire communication and public-speaking skills as well as cooperation and conflict handling skills in accordance with the descriptions of several courses. This is supported by means of suitable didactical and methodological measures. The acquisition of further multidisciplinary competences, such as leadership skills and broad contextual knowledge, is ensured.

		Exceptional	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	n.r.
3.5*	Multidisciplinary competences and skills (Asterisk Criterion)			X		

3.6 Skills for employment / Employability (Asterisk Criterion)

As the majority of courses offered in the Master programme Accounting and Audit has been accredited by internationally recognised professional certification bodies the students can achieve an ensured basis of professionalism for their future.

In addition, to be successful and competitive in the workforce, employees must possess an essential set of personal and professional skills which are conveyed to the students:

- Major numerical skills include understanding relationships between numbers, calculation skills, logical thinking, ability to organize information, data analysis;
- Skill for time management goes hand-in-hand with the organisational requirements;
- To pay attention to detail;
- Computer skills include decent working knowledge of different types of accounting software, besides the basic computing abilities for Microsoft Office;
- The need for business awareness;
- Leadership competencies which can be demonstrated through strategic thinking and long-term planning.

This is accompanied by an intensive training in research, theoretically and practically.

Appraisal:

The promotion of employability – for instance through the integration of theory and practice and through the promotion of multidisciplinary competences and skills – runs as a common thread of the study programme through all its courses.

⁴³ <https://narxoz.edu.kz/student-life/organizaczii/>

In addition, the programme enables the students to actively apply the acquired skills in new areas of work and to develop them further. This supported by a strong component on research in the programme. Also, it is systematically oriented towards meeting the anticipated requirements of the dynamic job market and makes use of the results of graduate evaluations.

		Exceptional	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	n.r.
3.6*	Skills for employment / Employability (Asterisk Criterion)		X			

4. Academic environment and framework conditions

4.1 Faculty

There are 15 faculty members who give the courses of the programme, They have different academic background and are professionally and / or academically qualified: Ten of them hold a PhD and nine of them have achieved professional certificates from CIMA, ACCA or others.

14 of the faculty members work full-time, one of them part-time. In addition, the department regularly includes visiting professors from abroad, such as in 2021 two professors from Poland and UK. Narxoz has proved with a template on the integration of its teaching capacity that all courses given are covered by the capacity of the available academic staff.

The composition of faculty in terms of qualifications in the fields needed complies with the requirements of the courses. Each of the faculty members in the Accounting and Audit Master programme, as experts in their respective fields, are expected to carefully give their own courses in accordance with the policies and guidelines of Narxoz.

The level of professional competencies of the faculty is regulated by the state document - the order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan from June 17, 2015, No 391 "On approval of qualification requirements for educational activities and the list of documents confirming their compliance". The faculty recruitment process follows the University Hiring Policy and Faculty Grading Policy⁴⁴.

Hiring full-time is carried out by competition with qualification requirements⁴⁵, announced on the Narxoz University website⁴⁶. The University has installed hiring committees with members drawn from the administrative and academic staff. After a successful selection, the hired employee is assigned a certain grade based on the meeting of the Grading Committee which is comprised of senior academic managers under the Provost.

The qualifications for full-time academic staff must correspond to the requirements for study, teaching and research. The number of full-time professors should match in the proportion of a ratio 1 professor / 16 students according to state requirements. When applying for faculty positions, competences considered include:

- the presence of an academic degree;
- knowledge of a foreign language;
- work experience;
- research achievements;
- administrative experience;
- references from prior employment;
- motivations of the candidate.

During the academic year all professors should implement activities of research, teaching, administrative service and support for recruitment and marketing.

⁴⁴ Faculty Grading Policy NJSC "NARXOZ UNIVERSITY", September 2021.

⁴⁵ in accordance Article 45 paragraph 1 of the Law on Education.

⁴⁶ Vacancies: <https://narxoz.edu.kz/jobs>

The recruitment of part-time academic staff is carried out based on the recommendation of the Head of the relevant department, agreed by the Director of the Higher School and approved by the Provost of the University. The applicant must have the same competences as staff hiring for full-time.

The following grades are possible (1st Grade is the best one):

- Professor 3rd, 2nd or 1st Grade,
- Associate Professor of 3rd, 2nd or 1st Grade,
- Assistant Professor of 3rd, 2nd or 1st Grade,
- Senior Lecturer of 3rd, 2nd or 1st Grade,
- Lecturer.

The grading in this structure is performance related, especially dependent on publications.

The faculty profile has also been reviewed. Following this review, efforts have been made to attract staff with international qualifications. Currently 26 % of teaching staff have degrees from internationally accredited universities⁴⁷, 50 % of faculty are academically qualified and 25 % are either fully professionally qualified or in the process of achieving professional qualification.

According to the MES qualification requirements the Master theses supervisors must be academically qualified and have at least three years of research and pedagogical work experience, be authors of at least publications over the past five years and their publications have to be entered into the List of Scientific Publications Recommended for Publication of Main Results of Scientific Activities approved by the authorized body in the field of education and science. In addition, they must have published one article in an international peer-reviewed journal. The teaching staff of the programme fully meets the qualification requirements.

The goal of ensuring the quality of the pedagogical and didactical methods used by professors is accomplished in three ways:

First, HSEM established higher than the MES teaching qualification requirements.

Second, faculty members are encouraged to take part in and pass internationally recognised professional certification programmes and training on pedagogic qualification development.

HSEM QAC members regularly (at least twice per semester) conduct peer review through attending selected classes and providing feedback to the faculty and the Department Chair. In addition, each instructor is encouraged to provide an open-door class once a year where all faculty members are invited.

Finally, HSEM promotes open discussions on teaching methods and other pedagogically related issues in the form of round tables and workshops organised by faculty.

As far as practical business experience is concerned, faculty members have industry experience and further master their professional skills through participation in the training programmes. As mentioned above, many of the faculty members hold certificates of international professional bodies for accounting and/or audit. Management and teaching staff carry out ongoing work to

⁴⁷ See above chapter 3.4.

attract leading experts in the field of accounting and audit for master classes, lectures, seminars, review of educational programmes.

Cooperation among faculty members is taking place to review the programme specification and refine interrelated courses to achieve the learning outcomes. Faculty members meet regularly to discuss the content and topics taught in courses. In addition to the coordination at the course level, faculty members cooperate in supervising student theses, either as consultants on specific topics or as examiners. The interdependence of the competence approach and the modular principle of learning is determined by the fact that the courses are focused on achieving the appropriate planned learning outcomes.

Faculty members in the formation of the educational programme cooperate with employers and each other, which allows to enrich the content of the programme with relevant and practice-oriented disciplines. Also, the faculty members' cooperation results in joint publications.

Support for students is an integral part of the work of teachers of the Master programme and is carried out in cooperation with the Office of Academic Advising⁴⁸. Faculty conduct scheduled office hours which are indicated in every syllabus. Additional consultancy might be provided by the faculty by appointment if needed. Consultations via email, ZOOM, Google meet and Canvas could also be provided.

Moreover, as each student is assigned an academic adviser from admission to graduation, these academic advisers are required to meet with academic advisees each semester to provide guidance on course registration and other academic matters. Thesis supervisors are also required to meet regularly with their students. Beyond these formal meetings and required interactions, faculty members work closely with students on research projects and help assist them in picking up new skills and competencies.

During the online conference students confirmed that most of them are fully content with the support that they received in particular from lecturers and academic advisers.

Appraisal:

Even when their teaching assignments in other study programmes are taken into account, the structure and number of the faculty correspond to the programme requirements and ensure that the students reach the intended qualification objectives. The faculty's composition, consisting of full-time and part-time visiting lecturers, guarantees that both the academic standards and the requirements of professional practice are fully satisfied.

The academic qualification of the faculty corresponds to the requirements and objectives of the study programme. The HEI verifies the qualifications of the faculty members by means of an established procedure. Specific measures for the further qualification of the faculty members are implemented. Taking into account the grading policy of Narxoz the panel recommends the University raising the structure of the academic staff. The faculty should include full professors which could increase the research and the scientific reputation of the department.

⁴⁸ <https://narxoz.edu.kz/advising>. not in English available

The pedagogical and didactical qualification of the faculty correspond to the requirements and objectives of the study programme. The HEI verifies the qualifications of the faculty members by means of an established procedure. The HEI ensures that assessors are familiar with existing testing and examination methods and receive support in developing their own skills in this field. Specific measures for the further qualification of the faculty members are implemented.

The practical business experience of the faculty corresponds to the requirement of the programme to integrate theory and practice. The panel welcomes that the faculty members have above-average business experience and use them in their teaching activities.

The panel notes that the faculty members cooperate with each other for the purpose of tuning the modules/courses towards the overall qualification objectives. Meetings of all those teaching in the programme take place regularly. In addition, projects and/or courses are conducted cooperatively in many respects.

Student support is an integral part of the services provided by the faculty. It is offered on a regular basis and serves to help students study successfully. The faculty members are available for the students outside the specified office hours as well. During the online conference students showed that they were “fully content” with the support they receive.

		Exceptional	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	n.r.
4.1	Faculty					
4.1.1*	Structure and quantity of faculty in relation to curricular requirements (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
4.1.2*	Academic qualification of faculty (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
4.1.3*	Pedagogical / didactical qualification of faculty (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
4.1.4	Practical business experience of faculty		X			
4.1.5*	Internal cooperation (Asterisk Criterion)		X			
4.1.6*	Student support by the faculty (Asterisk Criterion)		X			
4.1.7(*)	Student support in distance learning (only relevant and an Asterisk Criterion for blended learning/distance learning programmes)					X

4.2 Programme management

The responsible person for programme development is the Head of the Accounting and Audit department who in coordination with HSEM manages and monitors the Master Programme. The purview includes inter alia advisor assignments, thesis supervisor assignments, leading programme meetings, planning programme events and representing the programme within the University. At least once a year, the Head of department ensures regular updating of training

programmes based on market trends and recommendations of the HSEM Business Council⁴⁹ and developments in accounting and audit.

Moreover, the Department Chair interacts with employers and the expert community to further develop and update the programme.

In the educational activities and the implementation of the programme faculty and students are supported by the administration and structural units of the university in several respects:

In terms of administrative support Narxoz University has a clear distribution of powers and responsibilities for the educational management, for scientific and information support, international development and partnership, personnel issues, security department, legal department, record keeping and archive department. The Head of department plays a significant role in the organisation of the programme, facilitating communication and assisting students and faculty members. Other administrative units within Narxoz also help students and faculty with registration, course materials (including the online course management programme), information technology, library resources, and obtaining Institutional Review Board approval, among other things. The University gives support to teaching staff and employees when it comes to achieve scientific internships on the programme "Bolashak" in foreign organisations engaged in education and research activities that are in the list of top 300 leading universities in the world.

Advisors and the department "Accounting and Audit" management carry out explanatory work with students on the choice of elective disciplines, during the established terms of study and provide them with advice on the implementation of Master's individual educational plans.

An automated Student Help Desk has been created known as Student Help Desk, which allows applications and appeals of students on any issue.

Moreover, the department annually holds an orientation week for first-year Master students. This is aimed at familiarising students with the organisation of the educational process at the university and its structural units, which have a direct involvement in ensuring accessibility, transparency and openness of educational services. In order to ensure that students are informed, each of them is given a "Catalogue", which provides information about the university, academic policy of the university, rights and obligations of students and the specifics of education in terms of credit technology.

Students are members of the HSEM QAC, along with the teaching staff, which shows their involvement in the decision-making process related to their areas of activity. Narxoz has student self-governing bodies that have a say in committees of higher education institutions and the Academic Council. A Memorandum between Narxoz University and the Alliance of Students of Kazakhstan has been concluded, which commits to purposeful joint work to promote the principles of higher education and students' freedom of choice of disciplines. Narxoz has established an Endowment Fund, which will provide ongoing financial support for youth projects: scientific conferences, Olympiads, forums, etc.

⁴⁹ <https://en.narxoz.kz/sem/business-council>

Appraisal:

The Head of the Accounting and Audit department programme in coordination with HSEM organises the activities of everyone involved in the programme and ensures that the programme runs smoothly.

Faculty members and students are supported by the administration in the organisation of the study programme. Sufficient administrative staff is available. Decision-making processes, authority, and responsibilities are clearly defined. Teachers and students are included in the decision-making processes where their areas of work are involved.

The opportunities of electronic service-support are used and supplement personal one-to-one counselling. The HEI offers the administrative staff opportunities for continuous professional development.

	Exceptional	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	n.r.
4.2	Programme management				
4.2.1*	Programme Director (Asterisk Criterion)		X		
4.2.2	Process organisation and administrative support for students and faculty		X		

4.3 Cooperation and partnerships

Partnership with academic institutions has become a high-profile issue engaging an increasing number of students and staff. Narxoz University has signed several partnership agreements with HEI abroad. Some of them gave grounding to develop double degree and academic mobility. The double degree with the University of Coventry (GB) started in 2014, currently ten students study in the programme⁵⁰. The main partners for academic mobility are:

- University of Lodz, (Poland)
- University of Tsukuba, (Japan)
- IESEG School of Management, (France)
- National Louis University (Poland)
- Shoreline Community College (USA)
- University of Ferrara (Italy)
- FH Joanneum University of Applied Sciences, (Austria)
- Solbridge International Business School (South Korea)
- Plekhanov Russian University of Economics, (Russia)

The academic mobility is one-way mobility so far, but the increasing number of courses offered in English as well as the attractive location of the city encourage its future alignment.

The agreements that have been presented to the panel in writing also aim to promote exchanging

⁵⁰ The double degree programme is not subject of this accreditation.

expertise through consulting opportunities for the faculty members, researchers, and specialists. Moreover, they facilitate collaborative research projects and co-organized conferences and seminars.

One of the Narxoz University goals according to its Strategy is improving Employer/University cooperation. Following this goal strengthens cooperation with companies which are considered to be the key employers and business partners. Memoranda of understanding for developing long-term mutually beneficial partnership, future implementation of joint programmes and projects in the field of education and research, as well as specific short-term agreements for designing students' internship were signed and were shown to the panel. The list is provided below:

List of Top 20 Accounting and Audit Business Partners

#	Partner name	Duration
1	LLP Ernst & Young	>5 years
2	LLP KPMG	>5 years
3	LLP Deloitte	>4 years
4	LLP PriceWaterhouseCoopers	>2 years
5	LLP RG Brands Kazakhstan	>3 years
6	LLP KAZ "Minerals Management"	>5 years
7	LLP Freedom Finance	>2 years
8	LLP JTI	>5 years
9	JSC Aktobe Munay Gas	>5 years
10	JSC Halyk Bank of Kazakhstan	>5 years
11	JSC KEGOC	>5 years
12	JSC Kaspi Bank	>5 years
13	JSC Forte Bank	>5 years
14	JSC Forte Leasing	>5 years
15	JSC Bank Home Credit	>5 years
16	JSC Kazpost	>5 years
17	JSC Eurasian Financial Company	>5 years
18	JSC Bank CenterCredit	>5 years
19	JSC KazTransOil	>5 years
20	JSC Rakhat	>10 years

In 2021 several events were organised in cooperation with partners mentioned in this list, such as the "BIG 4 days" and with ACCA "How to pass exams". HSEM involves employers, business partners and other stakeholders in curricula review and takes into consideration feedback from them.

There is an active scientific cooperation with international professional accounting and auditing communities and organisations from Russia, Kyrgyzstan, Tajikistan, Uzbekistan. Moreover, faculty members of the department take an active part in international scientific events held by foreign partners. Colleagues from international universities are supervisors of doctoral students. The Chartered Institute of Management Accountants (CIMA, UK) allocated five seats for faculty development and exams of the accredited training programme.

Appraisal:

The scope and nature of cooperation with HEI, other academic institutions and networks relevant for the programme are plausibly presented. The agreements forming the basis of the cooperation are documented. The cooperation is actively pursued and has a clear impact on the conception and implementation of the study programme. All such activities contribute to the development of the students' qualification and skills.

The scope and nature of cooperation with business enterprises and other institutions relevant to the programme are plausibly presented. The agreements forming the basis of the cooperation are documented. The cooperation is actively pursued and has a clear impact on the conception and implementation of the study programme. All such activities contribute to the development of the students' qualification and skills.

Moreover, cooperation with business enterprises and other professional organisations is actively promoted for example by means of meetings of those who are involved in the study programme in responsible positions, in order to discuss the further development of the programme. Such cooperation has a formative impact on the contents of the programme and on the profile of the graduates. By means of specific measures (e.g. cooperation in projects, provision of traineeships, appointment of professionals in teaching), they significantly contribute to the development of qualifications and skills and to the quality of the final theses.

	Exceptional	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	n.r.
4.3 Cooperation and partnerships					
4.3.1(*) Cooperation with HEIs and other academic institutions or networks (Asterisk Criterion for cooperation programmes)			X		
4.3.2(*) Cooperation with business enterprises and other organisations (Asterisk Criterion for educational and vocational programmes, franchise programmes)		X			

4.4 Facilities and equipment

As the on-site visit had to be replaced by an online conference because of the Covid-19 pandemic Narxoz made available to the panel numerous photos of its building, rooms, and the library as well as descriptions in the self-evaluation report thereof.

In the 2021/2022 academic year, the University's computer park has 1,483 personal computers (PCs), of which 744 are used in the educational process, which is 50.1 % of the total number of computer equipment. There are 25 computer classrooms and 11 specialized laboratories, 73 classrooms in the ULK-2 building, 12 classrooms in the business school. After the completion of the reconstruction of the main educational building, additional 26 computer classrooms will be

put into operation with 508 seats, equipped with new equipment for conducting classes. Wi-Fi is accessible to all students and faculty on the whole campus.

The infrastructure also includes office equipment, projection equipment, network and telecommunications equipment, including MFDs, copiers, printers, scanners (340 pieces), projectors (205 pieces), servers (15 pieces), network equipment (328 pieces), and Telecommunication equipment (154 pieces). Lecturers and students at the University have access to all PCs (free from classes) in the computer classrooms of the DIT.

In the educational process of the University, computer classrooms, multimedia classrooms are used. Multimedia audiences belong to the linguistic center. To carry out laboratory work in specialized disciplines, there are “1C Laboratory”, “Electronic Learning Laboratory” in the direction of Finance and Data Analytics. Also “Data Science Lab”, “Newton Lab”, “Cybersecurity Lab”, “Graphics & Media Lab” and “Cloud Computing Lab” for students.

There is a Bloomberg laboratory with 12 terminals, which is also used as a classroom for courses that involve mastering of Bloomberg functionality. The Bloomberg terminal can also be used via remote access, which further enhances its effect in the learning process. In addition, the University offers dormitories to students.

The Academic Library Foundation contributes to meeting the needs of both educational and research activities of students in the programme "Accounting and Audit". In total, today the fund of the Academic Library has 912,022 units of publications in national, Russian and foreign languages, including educational and methodical literature – 411,456 units of publications, scientific literature – 500,566 units of publications, out of which 6,452 units related to accounting and audit.

Students have access to International scientific databases:

- EBSCO “E-book business collection” www.search.ebscohost.com offers over 21,000 book titles for students and academics doing research in a variety of business areas. The collection includes books from Oxford University Press, Business Expert Press, University of Chicago Press, Entrepreneur Press and American Management Association, as well as summaries of all the most recent Harvard Business Review, books, and press reviews available in the eBook Business Collection.
- JSTOR (The Scholarly Journal Archive) - full-text base of English-language scientific journals, is included in the top 10 scientific bases in the world scientific space. The JSTOR collections are composed of reputable international periodicals. The JSTOR ESSENTIAL collection covers 694 titles in 45 disciplines, including economics, business, finance, political science, law, education and other social disciplines (according to the profile of the university). JSTOR's archival collections contain over 2,400 scientific journals in 60 disciplines. JSTOR works with 1,200 publishers from over 57 countries.

During the academic year, 18 webinars were held for students and teachers at the University, dedicated to the use of information resources of the library and research topics.

Comfortable conditions for independent work have been created for all categories of users, including for students with disabilities. In accordance with the policy of ensuring equal access to

education for students with disabilities of the university, students with disabilities have equal access to the information base of the scientific library.

Each year the Department “Accounting and Audit” requests new textbooks (Kaplan Publishing, Wiley Publishing, BPP, etc.) according to certifications by ACCA, CIMA, CIA, etc.

Appraisal:

Since the online conference was conducted replacing an on-site visit, the panel did not have the opportunity to visit the University’s buildings. Instead, Narxoz University provided photos and descriptions of its premises and facilities. Based on the materials provided, the panel formed the view that a smooth running of programmes is ensured regarding the capacities for teaching, research, studies, and administration.

The panel got the impression that the quantity, quality, media and IT facilities of the teaching rooms meet the standards required for the programme, even taking into account the resource needs of other study programmes. The rooms are properly equipped for disabled students and give them barrier-free access. Access to the internet through laptops via wireless LAN is provided free of charge. A sufficient number of group rooms is available.

The opening hours of the library take students’ needs sufficiently into account. Access to the literature and journals as well as to digital media (e.g. electronic media, databases) is ensured. The literature expressly required for the study programme is available in the library and also kept up to date.

		Exceptional	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	n.r.
4.4	Facilities and equipment					
4.4.1*	Quantity, quality, media and IT equipment of teaching and group rooms (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
4.4.2*	Access to literature (Asterisk Criterion)			X		

4.5 Additional services

To support the transition to employment the Career Development and Alumni Relations Centre was established in 2005. The focus is on interaction with companies on practical training, internships and employment. A key area of activity is the management of a vacancy website which seeks to match students with opportunities. Partners include the Big Four companies, leading oil and gas and financial service companies. This includes career guidance and skills development services that – beside the support by faculty⁵¹ - are a key to successful professional and business life.

Also, Narxoz has put up a Public Association “Narxoz Alumni Association”. Its activities are:
 creating a professional alumni community that promotes effective communication among

⁵¹ See above chapter 4.1.

alumni and students of Narxoz University, as well as assistance in their professional growth;

1. combining the efforts of its members to ensure the activities of the Association to attract graduates of the University on the basis of close cooperation with public and other organizations, whose activities meet the objectives of the Association;
2. assisting the University administration in the implementation of the adopted University Development Strategy in terms of the implementation of measures to attract graduates of the University.

To achieve these goals, the Association carries out activities such as:

1. using the potential of the University graduates for the development and implementation of innovative (research and social) projects in the educational and research area of the University, related to the University Development Strategy;
2. assistance in improving the qualifications of the University staff, mastering new forms and methods of socio-economic and management activities, advanced domestic and foreign experience;
3. assistance to future graduates of the University in the selection of a place of work in accordance with their qualifications and abilities;
4. conducting conferences, symposia, seminars, round tables, discussions, competitions, trade missions and other events at the University.

Appraisal:

The panel welcomes that Narxoz provides career counselling and placement services for the students and graduates to promote their employability, in addition to the efforts that faculty members offer. The HEI provides sufficient resources. However, the panel gained the impression that administratively there is room for improvement. Therefore, the panel recommends widening the administrative career counselling and placement service.

The panel also welcomes that an alumni organisation has been set up with the aim of developing an alumni network. It recommends the University involving the alumni in the future even more in order to make use of the possibilities of implying practical experiences into the programme.

	Exceptional	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	n.r.
4.5 Additional services					
4.5.1 Career counselling and placement service			X		
4.5.2 Alumni Activities			X		

4.6 Financing of the study programme (Asterisk Criterion)

Funding for academic programmes is provided by the receipt of financial resources in the form of tuition fees, both from the state budget, and at the expense of students.

Cost structure	Accounting and Audit Department
Total number of ECTS	706
Full Time Equivalent Faculty	17.65
Direct costs (Faculty Payroll)	127,080

Revenue structure	Masters level Accounting and Audit
Bachelor	541,951
Master, 1 year	27,360
Master, 2 year	20,160
Total Revenue	589,471

Narxoz University forwarded a letter to the panel confirming that the sole shareholder of Narxoz University NJSC, the Kazakh businessman Mr. Bubat Utemuratov, intends and is able to provide the University with necessary funds to enable it to continue its operational activities for educating and conducting research for at least the following five years until December 2027.

Appraisal:

The panel is convinced that the study programme is funded for the entire accreditation period (until 2027) so that students will definitely be able to complete their studies.

		Exceptional	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	n.r.
4.6*	Financing of the study programme (Asterisk Criterion)			X		

5. Quality assurance and documentation

Narxoz's Quality Assurance (QA) system is based on a quality management strategy. Its task is supporting the overall strategy and the University's profile through enhancing the quality of teaching, research; improving key stakeholders' satisfaction and improving operational effectiveness. The QA system includes both (academic and non-academic) areas of University functioning. The task of quality management is to review and coordinate the University units' related activities that are critical in terms of achieving quality requirements. The internal QA documents are publicly available on the University's website.⁵²

The quality management strategy takes into account Narxoz University Strategy 2020-2025 (revised in 2021), the European Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area (ESG 2015)⁵³, the Ministry of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan (MES) policies and regulations⁵⁴, Narxoz's Quality Assurance Policy and the University Quality Assurance Handbook.

Both the QA Policy and the QA Handbook describe explicitly and in detail the internal QA system with objectives, procedures and mechanisms, key parameters and include external assessments as a tool.

The quality management process is intended to create system-wide mechanisms that enable the University to monitor and improve its operations and to enhance quality. The quality management is focused on core activities (education, research and administration) and on resources (human resource and infrastructure) that are required to ensure quality provision of core activities. The University designs the QA process as a dynamic process that shall continuously follow the Plan-Do-Check-Act Cycle. Thus, it consists of four stages: (1) developing regulatory background and plan, (2) collecting quality data, (3) analysing findings and (4) making revisions or changes based on data analyses.

Narxoz University has established a framework for quality assurance that includes the mechanisms for institutional, departmental, and programme quality assurance. It is embedded in each Higher School and all university departments and utilises both quantitative and qualitative data. The results of this continuous QA process are communicated via Academic Quality Committees and the Academic Council and serve to benefit all internal and external stakeholders in their decision-making.

As far as the competencies, responsibilities and interactions of academic and administrative quality management staff and departments are concerned structural divisions and collegial bodies of the University participate in the process of continuous provision of the academic quality: the Academic Council, committees under the AC, councils of the Higher Schools and of the PhD department.

⁵² <https://en.narxoz.kz/quality-assurance>

⁵³ [Standards and Guidelines for Quality Assurance in the European Higher Education Area](#)

⁵⁴ <https://www.gov.kz/memleket/entities/edu?lang=en>

The University community members (students, teaching and administrative staff) are part of collegial committees at the Higher School and University level. According to Narxoz⁵⁵, their participation in all areas of discussions and decision-making processes takes place regularly and systematically. Corporate partners and external stakeholders are also involved in different committees and play an active role within the quality management system.

Faculty and staff of the University are informed about quality management measures and the results obtained at the meetings of the Academic Council, the QA Councils of the Higher Schools, regular meetings, and faculty general assemblies with the President and Provost of the University.

The University carries out on a regular basis a systematic assessment and discussion of the quality of all aspects of the academic process and educational programs. The assessments are based on monitoring the quality of teaching and surveys of students, teachers, alumni and employers. Based on the results obtained, the University management, the University QA Committees under the Academic Council, the Higher Schools Committees, the Heads of the Departments / Centers and structural divisions are provided with the reports. The structural units provide feedback in the form of a "Progress Report", which is then provided to the trainees and other target groups of the survey.

The University has developed an organisational structure, established a division of responsibility for quality assurance, reflected in the regulations on structural divisions and job descriptions, as well as the delineation of the functions of collegial bodies. This can contribute to the development of a culture of quality in which each structural unit / employee of the University could efficiently respond to emerging problems.

Narxoz University students, faculty and staff, and external stakeholders (employers, alumni) are involved in the QA system and are given the opportunity to take an active role in the quality management. Their opinions are asked in various surveys.

Evaluation by students is carried out through a number of regular and on-request institutional research activities. The key instrument is the Faculty Teaching Evaluation Survey (FTES) that is conducted primarily to provide a measure of assurance of the teaching quality at the University level. The FTES collects the opinions of all undergraduate and postgraduate students on their perceptions of instructional effectiveness, quality of teaching and their learning experience for each subject in which they are enrolled.

The questionnaire consists of 18 multiple choice and open-ended questions relating to the quality of teaching in three important fields: 1) faculty, 2) class Sessions and 3) course. The first section consists of questions about instructional delivery and professional attitude towards students while the second part covers questions about management of class sessions and the learning environment. The third part incorporates questions about student understanding of the course requirements, syllabus and availability of course materials. Summary questions 19 and 20 identify the overall level of satisfaction with the course and teaching quality. Two open-ended

⁵⁵ See SER for the Institutional Accreditation, p. 35

questions soliciting general comments and remarks about instructors and workload are also included in the questionnaire.

At the end of the academic year, the faculty submit a completed Course Management form. Assessment covers key aspects of teaching. This form must be accompanied by the final exam sample and submitted to the Department Chairs at the end of the semester.

Higher Schools QA Committees analyse the results of the surveys and develop recommendations accordingly. The results of the teaching evaluation survey are used in the Faculty Grading system to assess the performance of a faculty member.

After the evaluation the departments submit the reports on the survey. The Higher Schools Quality Assurance Committees provide a Progress Report and feedback to the recommendations of survey participants. Students are informed via the Student Senate.⁵⁶

Faculty members are involved in assessment processes through regular and on-request activities. The Faculty Satisfaction Survey is the mechanism for feedback on working conditions, professional development, and quality of management at Narxoz University.

The Narxoz Alumni Survey⁵⁷ aims to assure the quality of professional preparation of graduates by collecting their feedback about work experience, job performance and level of satisfaction with the quality of Narxoz University's education, which allows identification of areas for improvement. The survey is conducted each summer among the Narxoz Alumni (one year after graduation) via e-mails, phone interviews and online questionnaires. The Alumni answer questions including 5-point scale, multiple choice and open-ended questions that touch upon details of their current employment (company, salary, position, etc.) and/or further studies, contribution of the Narxoz programme to their career, satisfaction with/suggestions for Narxoz services and ways to get involved with the University.

The survey results are reported to the top management and shared with Narxoz University employees and alumni. To facilitate programme assessment efforts data are broken down by programmes. The key messages are taken as the basis for the further enhancement of the University's programmes, services and environment.

The Alumni Employers' Satisfaction Survey seeks the opinion of employers on levels of Narxoz graduates' professional preparedness in terms of knowledge, skills and attitudes. The survey is conducted through different channels: electronic mail, fax, post, social networks (Instagram, Facebook, Telegram, WhatsApp, YouTube); phone calls and visits. The survey results are placed on the website. They can illustrate employers' perception of Narxoz graduates' professional quality and help to determine ways of further improvement of academic programmes.

The official website of Narxoz University contains information about the University's governance structure and organisational structure, its strategy, about quality assurance, national ranking results, professional certifications of the study programmes, institutional and programme accreditations, and programme descriptions. Moreover, the website provides interactive communication with potential applicants. Each school of the University has its own page on the

⁵⁶ Student Senate <https://narxoz.edu.kz/student-life/stud-sovet>

⁵⁷ Narxoz Alumni Survey <https://alumni.narxoz.kz/ru/page/statistics-and-reports>

website⁵⁸. Also, information on the composition of the commission on academic quality and various advice is available and it is possible to ask the dean a question through the Internal regulatory documents of the University are published, updated and stored on the corporate portal of the University. On the main page of the portal, it is possible to review local news, useful videos, and visit thematic fora. The portal menu is a transition to the necessary pages, depending on the status and interests of the user.

In a specialized section, readers can familiarise themselves with the following documents:

1. The academic calendar, is posted in three languages: Russian, Kazakh, and English.
2. The current exam schedule is presented on the website. Course registration Instructions for students with teaching quality evaluation are also posted in this section.
3. Policies and regulations are presented, such as: transfer policy, President of the Republic of Kazakhstan scholarship policy, policies of academic leave and course registration, information on grants and dormitories, as well as sample applications.

All students have access to the digital resources of the University. At the moment, the core consists of Banner Student as well as LMS CANVAS. All course related information is placed on Canvas and available for students and the course administrators. Other information such as tuition payment reports, transcripts, class registration and schedules are available on Banner Student.

The University interacts with partners through social networks, fairs, joint projects, mailing list and digests. Thus, partners are in the information field of the University and receive information. To build effective communication with the general public, the University is actively working through the media and social networks through broadcasting such as interviews with the president, provost, deans, and delivering expert opinions from teachers and University staff. The University adheres to the policy of building long-term and fruitful cooperation with a number of media outlets, in particular, the creation of dialogue platforms and platforms for interaction with the public. In addition, the university provides free legal advice to the population through the media zakon.kz and Informburo.kz and provides a legal clinic⁵⁹ based on international experience.

Appraisal:

A quality assurance and development procedure, which systematically and continuously monitors and develops the quality of the programme with respect to its contents, processes, and outcomes, has been set up. It takes into account the evaluation results and the analysis on student workload, success rate, and graduate employment as well as the profile of the student population. Faculty members and students participate in the respective committees to plan and assess the quality assurance and development procedures. Responsibilities are clearly defined.

⁵⁸ <https://narxoz.edu.kz/sem/>, <https://narxoz.edu.kz/slpp/>, <https://narxoz.edu.kz/ste/>, <https://narxoz.edu.kz/hhs/>, <https://narxoz.edu.kz/gsb/>

⁵⁹ <https://en.narxoz.kz/slpp/law-clinic/>

Evaluation by the students is carried out on a regular basis and in accordance with a prescribed procedure; the outcomes are communicated to the students and provide input for the quality development process.

Quality control by the faculty is carried out on a regular basis and in accordance with a prescribed procedure; the outcomes are communicated and provide input for the quality development process.

An external evaluation is conducted on a regular basis and in accordance with a prescribed procedure; the outcomes are communicated and provide input for the quality development process.

The study programme's content, curriculum and examination scheme have been suitably documented and published.

The HEI regularly publishes current news and information – both quantitative and qualitative – about the study programme.

	Exceptional	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	n.r.
5.1* Quality assurance and quality development with respect to contents, processes and outcomes (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
5.2 Instruments of quality assurance					
5.2.1 Evaluation by students			X		
5.2.2 Evaluation by faculty			X		
5.2.3 External evaluation by alumni, employers and third parties			X		
5.3 Programme documentation					
5.3.1* Programme description (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
5.3.2 Information on activities during the academic year			X		

Quality profile

HEI: Narxoz University, Kazakhstan

Master programme: Master in Accounting and Audit with concentration on “Corporate Governance, Compliance and Performance Appraisal”

		Exceptional	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	n.r.
1	Objectives					
1.1*	Objectives of the study programme (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
1.2*	International orientation of the study programme design (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
1.3	Positioning of the study programme					
1.3.1	Positioning of the study programme in the educational market			X		
1.3.2	Positioning of the study programme on the job market for graduates („Employability“)			X		
1.3.3	Positioning of the study programme within the HEI's overall strategic concept			X		
2	Admission					
2.1*	Admission requirements (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
2.2	Counselling for prospective students			X		
2.3*	Selection procedure (if relevant)			X		
2.4(*)	Professional experience (if relevant; Asterisk Criterion for master programmes that require professional experience)			X		
2.5*	Ensuring foreign language proficiency (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
2.6*	Transparency and documentation of admission procedure and decision (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
3	Contents, structure and didactical concept					
3.1	Contents					
3.1.1*	Logic and conceptual coherence (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
3.1.2*	Rationale for degree and programme name (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
3.1.3*	Integration of theory and practice (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
3.1.4	Interdisciplinary thinking			X		
3.1.5	Ethical aspects			X		
3.1.6*	Methods and scientific practice (Asterisk Criterion)		X			
3.1.7*	Examination and final thesis (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
3.2	Structure					
3.2.1*	Modular structure of the study programme (Asterisk Criterion)				Condition	

		Exceptional	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	n.r.
3.2.2*	Study and exam regulations (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
3.2.3*	Feasibility of study workload (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
3.2.4	Equality of opportunity			X		
3.3	Didactic concept					
3.3.1*	Logic and plausibility of the didactical concept (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
3.3.2*	Course materials (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
3.3.3	Guest lecturers			X		
3.3.4	Lecturing tutors					X
3.4	Internationality					
3.4.1*	International contents and intercultural aspects (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
3.4.2	Internationality of the student body			X		
3.4.3	Internationality of faculty			X		
3.4.4	Foreign language contents			X		
3.5*	Multidisciplinary competences and skills (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
3.6*	Skills for employment / Employability (Asterisk Criterion)		X			
4.	Academic environment and framework conditions					
4.1	Faculty					
4.1.1*	Structure and quantity of faculty in relation to curricular requirements (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
4.1.2*	Academic qualification of faculty (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
4.1.3*	Pedagogical / didactical qualification of faculty (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
4.1.4	Practical business experience of faculty		X			
4.1.5*	Internal cooperation (Asterisk Criterion)		X			
4.1.6*	Student support by the faculty (Asterisk Criterion)		X			
4.1.7(*)	Student support in distance learning (only relevant and an Asterisk Criterion for blended-learning/distance learning programmes)					
4.2	Programme management					
4.2.1*	Programme Director (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
4.2.2	Process organisation and administrative support for students and faculty			X		
4.3	Cooperation and partnerships					
4.3.1(*)	Cooperation with HEIs and other academic institutions or networks (Asterisk Criterion for cooperation programmes)			X		

		Exceptional	Exceeds quality requirements	Meets quality requirements	Does not meet quality requirements	n.r.
4.3.2(*)	Cooperation with business enterprises and other organisations (Asterisk Criterion for educational and vocational programmes, franchise programmes)		X			
4.4	Facilities and equipment					
4.4.1*	Quantity, quality, media and IT equipment of teaching and group rooms (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
4.4.2*	Access to literature (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
4.5	Additional services					
4.5.1	Career counselling and placement service			X		
4.5.2	Alumni Activities			X		
4.6*	Financing of the study programme (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
5	Quality assurance and documentation					
5.1*	Quality assurance and quality development with respect to contents, processes and outcomes (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
5.2	Instruments of quality assurance					
5.2.1	Evaluation by students			X		
5.2.2	Evaluation by faculty			X		
5.2.3	External evaluation by alumni, employers and third parties			X		
5.3	Programme documentation					
5.3.1*	Programme description (Asterisk Criterion)			X		
5.3.2	Information on activities during the academic year			X		